



**March 15, 2017**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved April 19, 2017*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, March 15, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle and Joan Hodges; Clem Malot, Borough Code Official; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Howard S. Rosen, representing 345 Buford Avenue; Jim Biesecker, Director of Facilities Planning and Management of Gettysburg College, and Stuart Christenson of Noelker and Hull Associates, Inc., representing 75 West Stevens Street; Kathy and David Reid of Reid's Orchard Winery, representing 400 Baltimore Street; Linda Atiyeh of Gettysburg Moose, LLC, representing 19 York Street; Nancy and Kurt Kramer, representing 12 Wade Avenue; Drew and Wade Leedy, Owners of Tommy's Pizza, 105 Steinwehr Avenue; Scott Pitzer, 59 York Street; Steve LaBarre, 613 Baltimore Street; and Jim Hale, representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the January 18, 2017 meeting. Seconded by Ms. Hodges. Motion carried 4-to-0 with 3 abstentions. There was no meeting in February, 2017.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

**Old Business**

**COA-16-77 Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc. – 789 Baltimore Street**

TABLED - No review or update at this time.

## New Business

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, April 10, 2017.

## Applications for Review

**A. COA-17-006, 345 Buford Avenue, Biet PA (Howard Rosen), 345 Modern Gift Shop. Alteration-Critical Project. Change of use from residential to retail. Construction of 20' x 20' addition to the rear elevation, clad in HardiePlank lap siding in "German Up" design and ADA ramp of with weather-treated exterior lumber. Erection of signage on principle elevation in 9" aluminum "Ruffee" font letters to be attached to the building mortar joints.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description (no memo was prepared for this application). She said that the building was estimated to be constructed around 1920-1925, and that there are no other COAs in the property file.

Mr. Rosen gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that there are railroad tracks behind the property, so there is very little public view of the property. Ms. Hodges asked if any windows or doors would be added. Mr. Rosen said that the new exterior door would approximately match the existing door. He said that a ramp will lead to the expanded porch addition. Ms. Gustafson asked if aluminum letters would be on the board background. Mr. Rosen said that 6" letters will be affixed by prongs to the mortar joint under the mailbox light.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 345 Buford Avenue as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated January 1, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 7-to-0.

**B. COA-17-008, 75 West Stevens Street, Gettysburg College. Alteration-Critical Project. Alteration of existing front porch to accommodate ADA access, and alterations to an existing side porch, pending a change of use variance from the Zoning Hearing Board.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description (no memo was prepared for this application). She said that the property is located in the Historic District, and is a sensitive structure that is over 50 years old. The proposed work is necessary to support the institutional needs of the College.

Mr. Christenson and Mr. Biesecker gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Christenson said the College is looking to create ADA access to the building by raising the porch floor 7" plus or minus to match the existing floor level. He said that the floor would be reinstalled in concrete with the same scoring pattern as the existing porch. He said that the columns would be shortened at the base and base caps restored to match the original base caps. He said that the interior floor of the former garage (now a living space) will be raised to match the level of the main floor. He also said that a new door, window and patio will be installed at the West Stevens Street elevation at the location of the former garage door, and will be 20" plus or minus above the existing grade. He said that there will be regrading of the site to accommodate new sidewalks for ADA access; and that all existing 8" exposed aluminum siding will remain except where required for the previous mentioned new elements. He said that the windows would be wood six over six; and that the applicant is adding one window and a door, but not changing any existing fenestration. He noted that the entry is in the front of the building where the reception area is located.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 75 West Stevens Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated February 28, 2017, conditioned that a special exception is granted by the Zoning Hearing Board on March 22, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 7-to-0.

**C. COA-17-015, 400 Baltimore Street, Reid's Orchard Winery (Dave and Kathy Reid). Alteration-Critical Project. Paint a large scale decorative word art "REID's WINERY" directly on the brick at the rear (east) façade.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated March 15, 2017 (see attached). She said that the word art is visible to the public view from School House Alley, and Baltimore and Lefever Streets. She said that the former residence was constructed sometime between 1912 and 1924, and has been well-maintained. She did state that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* under

the rehabilitation of exterior masonry recommends against coating previously uncoated brick including paint.

Mr. and Mrs. Reid gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Gustafson asked if the sign could be placed on a wood substrate, and inquired about the size of the lettering. Ms. LaBarre said that the sign could be attached to the mortar joints and that it meets the definition of a business sign as stated in Section 19-103 of the Sign Ordinance; and that the provision of the Sign Ordinance limits activity to 50 square feet. Mr. Shaffer said that the wording directly relates to the functionality of the business, and to attract pedestrian attention. Ms. Reid said that the property faces two avenues of traffic, and that she wants the public to see her sign from both the front and back of her business. Mr. Shaffer said that business signs that comply with the Sign Ordinance can be administratively approved; but if the sign was painted directly on the building, then it would be reviewable by HARB. He said that he could ask a strict interpretation of the Sign Ordinance regarding total square footage from the solicitor.

The Reids withdrew their application COA-17-015 as submitted (direct painting on the masonry), and will re-submit, seeking administrative approval as a sign.

- D. COA-17-016, 400 Baltimore Street, Reid's Orchard Winery (Dave and Kathy Reid). Alteration-Critical Project. Paint a large scale decorative word art "CIDER HOUSE" directly on the brick at the side (south/Lefever Street) façade and remove a non-historic wrought iron railing from the roof line along the Baltimore and Lefever Street facades and visible from School House Alley.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated March 15, 2017 (see attached). She said that the word art is visible to the public view from School House Alley, and Lefever Streets. Mrs. LaBarre said that the iron railing, probably added in the mid-twentieth century, is not historic does not contribute to historic style of the building.

Mr. and Mrs. Reid gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. The Reids withdrew their request to paint "CIDER HOUSE" on the building as part of this COA as submitted, and said that they will seek administrative approval as a sign. Mr. Reid said that removing the railing would only require removing the lag bolts and filling the holes with plastic cement.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 400 Baltimore Street as

submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 1, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble. The motion carried 7-to-0.

**E. COA-17-016, 400 Baltimore Street, Reid's Orchard Winery (Dave and Kathy Reid). Alteration-Critical Project. Install of LARSON Signature Full-View Tempered Glass Aluminum Storm Door in brown colorway at the Baltimore Street entrance.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated March 15, 2017 (see attached). She said that Borough Council approved the installation of exterior storm windows on May 12, 2014; and approved the construction of an accessible ramp, the installation of an entry door accessible entrance, removal of a south-side sun room door, and the installation of a new window with a "wood/PVC" panel and other alterations on March 10, 2014.

Mr. and Mrs. Reid gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Gustafson asked if there would be infill above the door, and would the transom match the same color as the door. Mr. Reid affirmed the color and infill consistent with the Secretary of the Interior guidelines.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project with a physical attachment alteration, and will be visible from the public view.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 400 Baltimore Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 1, 2017 conditioned that the transom meet the Secretary of the Interior guidelines. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 7-to-0.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary with the following applicants, whereby Mr. Goble will assume the role as Chair.*

**F. COA-17-020, 19 York Street, Gettysburg Moose, LLC (Linda Atiyeh). Alteration-Critical Project. Rehabilitate the former Gettysburg Moose Lodge; change of use to commercial building with proposed restaurant, bar/tavern, and retail space.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description (no memo was prepared for this application). The applicant proposed removal of both pairs of entrance doors and the installation of aluminum front entrance doors with full glazed lites (doors and side panel); removal of existing brick and concrete masonry (CMU) between the structural columns at the street façade and installation of roll-up overhead doors with full vision glazing in openings; and to repair the existing overhead "canopy" to ensure structural soundness and clad in aluminum sheathing to match storefront and

overhead door frames with the canopy, new door and window jambs/framing to be black in color.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the applicant. He said that the building will have larger glass openings, but did not currently because the Moose was a private institution. The applicant would like to open the front façade to the street, clean the existing masonry, and to install a glass door in the openings. Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant wanted to maintain the rhythm of the openings. He said that the deteriorated concrete canopy would have to be structurally repaired to match the color of the store front (perhaps black). He said that the east entrance to the building would be compliant with ADA standards for existing ramps, with the inside door ramp rising to 16". Ms. Hodges inquired about lighting. Ms. Atiyeh said that she would like to use lighting similar to the lighting at Kennies Market. Ms. Gustafson suggested using screens to prevent insects. Mr. Shaffer said that non-permanent screens could be used if needed.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project with a physical attachment alteration, and will be visible from the public view.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 19 York Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 1, 2017 conditioned that any other exterior changes must require additional Board approval. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0 with 1 abstention.

**G. COA-17-021, 12 Wade Avenue, Kurt and Nancy Kramer. Addition of sun room to the western end of the residence; construction materials to include stone to match existing aluminum clad windows and asphalt shingles to match existing roof.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description (no memo was prepared for this application). The applicant proposed adding a sun room to the western end of their residence per their submitted application. She said that this is a critical project located in the Historic District and is visible from the public view. The property has had several previous Certificates of Appropriateness approved by Council including replacement of windows, roof material and stairs.

Mr. and Mrs. Kramer gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions.

Mrs. LaBarre presented the *Findings of Fact*. She said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project with a physical attachment alteration, and will be visible from the public view. The plans will show that all necessary setbacks and percentages have been met, and that there are no zoning issues.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 12 Wade Avenue as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 1, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0 with 1 abstention.

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.*

## Reports

### A. Administrative Approval

- **COA-17-003, 301 Steinwehr Avenue, Best Western, S & W Development Corporation (Paul Witt).** SIGN: Erection of two signs: *S-17-003* Two-sided vertical flag-mounted sign 2.6" w x 12' h (30SF); mounted to east façade (Steinwehr Avenue) and illuminated with flood lights and *S-17-004* 19.65SF painted wall sign w/ foam face panels; mounted on south elevation above third floor windows.
- **COA-17-004, 247 Baltimore Street, Escape Games, Heit Holdings LLC (Dan Heit).** SIGN: Erection of two (2) double-sided projecting signs on existing bracket: *S-17-005* 6.46SF (31" h x 30" w) and *S-17-006* 2.08SF (10" h x 30" w) hung from bottom of other.
- **COA-17-005, 619 Baltimore Street, Subway, Erian Associates Limited.** REPLACEMENT IN KIND: Repair and replace porch materials recently damaged in vehicular collision with same: painted treated wood decking, white PVC railing, PVC lattice panels.
- **COA-17-007, 54 & 56 E. Water Street, Residential Garage, Waldo Hartman.** MAJOR PROJECT: Removal of original wood doors with single pane windows on non-sensitive Concrete Masonry Unit (CMU) garage not visible from public right-of-way; replace with non-insulated steel raised panel door manufactured by C.H.I Overhead Doors.
- **COA-17-009, 110 N. Washington St, Gettysburg College.** MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Replace three doors in same material; remove existing concrete sidewalk/replace with 5' wide sidewalk and raise grade of paving in front of entrance to provide ADA access.
- **COA-17-011, 69 E. Middle Street, Adams Abstract Associates, Inc.** SIGN: Erection of 16 SF metal sign *S-17-11* hung from existing decorative wrought ironwork on porch at north (E. Middle St) elevation.
- **COA-17-012, 412 York Street, La Bella Italia Restaurant (Giovanni Cucuzza).** MINOR PROJECT/ RETROACTIVE APPROVAL: Demolition of existing non-sensitive corrugated metal storage shed on residential property.

- **COA-17-013, 19 Baltimore Street, Times Square LLC (Jim Ekdahl).** SIGN: *S-17-008* 16 SF painted wood sign for “The Gettysburg Tourist” to be erected at top third of storefront window to right of door on principal (Baltimore St) façade.
  - **COA-17-014, 110 Baltimore Street, Ronald J. Hagarman, Attorney at Law.** MINOR PROJECT: Relocation of existing fire egress stair; shift approximately 12”-14” to allow access to adjacent wall.
  - **COA-17-018, 400 Baltimore Street, Reid’s Orchard Winery (Dave & Kathy Reid).** SIGN: Erection of two signs; *S-17-009* New pole sign on picket fence at rear of Property and *S-17-010* Replace existing projecting sign on front (Baltimore St) façade.
  - **COA-17-019 26 York Street (Gallery 30), Gettysburg Investors, LLC.** MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing flat tab asphalt shingles on roof over lower half of primary/south façade (York St) and replacement with diamond-shaped asphalt shingles to mimic existing material on main portion of roof.
- B. Pending Administrative Approval
- **COA-17-010, 297 Steinwehr Avenue, Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center).** SIGN: Erection of memorial wayside marker at southwest corner of property commemorating 1922 plane crash.
- C. Report of Director of Planning and Historic Preservation – Mrs. LaBarre
1. TABLED – Pennsylvania State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) Public Input Session on 1/31
  2. TABLED – Updates on 2017 HARB Training and Public Programming Schedule
- D. Report of Chair – Mr. Shaffer
- Mr. Shaffer said that Code Enforcement Weaver will help Mrs. LaBarre resolve the sign issue, and that the sign review will be removed from Board review. She said that she will consult the Solicitor for clarification.

### **Other Business**

There was no other business.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 9:20 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant