



**April 19, 2017**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved May 17, 2017*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, April 19, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Colleen Lingle and Joan Hodges; Clem Malot, Borough Code Official; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. HARB Member, Jim McCabe was absent. Also in attendance were: Terrance Shanahan, Church Trustee and Preacher's Steward for St. Paul A.M.E. Zion Church at 269 South Washington Street; Linda Atiyeh of Gettysburg Investors, LLC, Joel B. Wiener, Attorney at Law of Wiener and Wiener, LLP, Michael Weiss, Debbie Westmoreland, and John J. Davis all representing 26 York Street; Robin Fitzpatrick, President, Adams County Economic Development Corporation (ACEDC); Chad-Alan Carr, 49 York Street; Scott Pitzer, 59 York Street; Caroline Smith, 34 East Lincoln Avenue; Steve LaBarre, 613 Baltimore Street; and Jim Hale, representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the March 15, 2017 meeting. Seconded by Ms. Lingle. Motion carried 6-to-0.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

*Chad-Alan Carr, 49 York Street* expressed his full support for Gallery 30 specifically as a land owner and business owner on York Street. He commented on the vibrant display of artwork on the walls, and recommended that a Certificate of Appropriateness be issued as presented.

*Caroline Smith, 34 East Broadway* gave her full support for this business and its display of artwork. She noted that the Retail Merchants, especially Gallery 30 on York Street, contribute to the historic distinction of the second out of 500 considered places, the most historic value for people to come to visit Gettysburg.

## Old Business

### **COA-16-77, Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc. – 789 Baltimore Street.**

**TABLED** - No review or update at this time.

## New Business

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, May 8, 2017.

## Applications for Review

- A. COA-17-027, St. Paul A.M.E. Zion Church – 269 South Washington Street. Alteration/Rehabilitation – Critical Project. Removal of historic wood windows, installation of vinyl replacement windows, and the retroactive approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the work that was completed in early 2017.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from her Board memorandum dated April 19, 2017 (see attached). She said that, according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, windows should be retained for historic reference and significance. She said that, while property owners are required by ordinance to apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work to be done in the Historic District and failure to do so is a serious code violation, the congregation of St. Paul's is now informed and seeking voluntary compliance. She said staff recommends the retroactive approval for this project, since the old windows were removed.

Mr. Shanahan gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that birds had broken the attic window gaining access to the attic and exposing the interior structure to weather. He said that the windows were boarded-up for protection from the elements, and that the Church had to replace the windows immediately to prevent further damage to the structure of the church. The damage was captured in pictures and proved that the windows could not be salvaged. He noted that the basement windows also needed replacing. Mr. Shaffer said that the Church had appeared before HARB for prior approvals of vinyl windows in 2004. He noted that some of that work was accomplished, but transition in Church staff made the project difficult to complete. Mr. Shanahan said that the Church has approximately 10 active members, and that the local Gettysburg Eagles lodge has donated funding for repairs. Mrs. LaBarre said that are resources available for grant funding.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is a sensitive building over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view. He said that the church is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Borough Historic District, and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the completed project at 269 South Washington Street as presented in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 10, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion carried 6-to-0.

- B. COA-17-0031, Doug and Morgan Miller – 43-45 East Middle Street. Alteration-Critical Project. Removal of existing horizontal fence; erection of six foot wood slat fence to be installed along the east side of the property beside the G.A.R. Hall at 53 East Middle Street; and that the design will closely match the existing fence at the west side of the property near the Gas Light Inn at 33 East Middle Street.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description (no memo was prepared for this application). She said that the property is located in the Historic District, and is a sensitive structure that is over 50 years old. The proposed work is necessary because the look is very different from the existing fence, and therefore reviewable by the Board.

Ms. Miller responded to Board questions; noting that the existing location of the posts will remain while erecting the new fence in order to not disturb the existing shrubbery. She said that she had obtained a Land Use permit.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view. He noted that the adjoining properties are very prominent structures in the Historic District, and meets all of the requirements.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 43-45 East Middle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated April 5, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary with the following applicants, whereby Mr. Goble will assume the role as Chair.*

- C. COA-17-0031, Gettysburg Investors, LLC (Linda Atiyeh) – 26 York Street (Gallery 30). Alteration-Critical Project. Erect large scale decorative Americana artwork on the west (side) and north (rear) façades.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated April 19, 2017 (see attached). She said that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* does not address merchandise, but discusses the attachment of decorative items on masonry should be drilled into mortar joints rather than the masonry itself. She also stated that this same recommendation is addressed in the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. She said that staff recommends the approval for this project as presented, noting that the Americana merchandise does not detract from and is in keeping with the character of the Historic District. She recommended that any signs erected should be fastened into the mortar and not the brick.

Mr. Wiener gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of his client. He discussed the merchandise to be erected, and said that each one was researched for historical appropriateness. He said that the example merchandise on reclaimed wood presented tonight is representative of old businesses from Gettysburg for that building, maintaining the historic character of the district. Ms. Atiyeh said that the Race Horse Alley façade will have larger signs; and as merchandise sells, they will be replaced by historically appropriate signs by Gallery 30 staff. She is seeking permission to place this type of merchandise along the full length of both the west and north walls.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 26 York Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 31, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention.

**E. COA-17-0033, Harry Stokes – 38 West Middle Street. Alteration/Rehabilitation - Critical Project. Construct a new 20' by 20' German lap wood siding framed garage at the rear of the property in two phases to include an open-sided carport.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the submitted HARB application (no memo was prepared for this application).

Mr. Shaffer said that a Certificate of Appropriateness for the garage was previously approved by Borough Council in 2013, but that the work was not completed before the land use permit expired. The structure would be built in two phases; first as a carport with sidewalls left open, but fully enclosed in the fall. He said that the structure is slightly repositioned since 2013; and that there is a 25 foot side yard, and is located 20 feet off of Legion Alley positioned in the center of the yard. Mrs. LaBarre said that a new Land Use permit was submitted.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 38 West Middle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 31, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention.

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.*

- D. COA-17-0032, John and Gina LeVan – 101 Chambersburg Street. Alteration-Critical Project. Removal of existing storm windows on the east and south facades at the second and third stories, replace with *LARSON Low-E Aluminum Storm Window Item #201135, Model #L20143255E*; removal of existing one-over-one wood windows on the west façade ONLY, install *7evolution 7800 Series* vinyl replacement windows.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated April 19, 2017 (see attached). She said that this is an excellent example of diapering brickwork, and that the paint was removed in 1987. She said that the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* advocates for window rehabilitation and original windows should be retained if possible.

Mr. and Mrs. LeVan gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. LeVan said that the storm windows on the south and east side will match existing paint color on the sashes, and he will replace any rotted wood windows on the west side that were worn by weather. He noted that this would reduce weather-related energy cost borne by his tenants.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, and will be visible from the public view on two sides. He noted that the windows proposed for replacement are not historically significant windows.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 101 Chambersburg Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated April 5, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble. The motion carried 6-to-0.

## Reports

### A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-17-0022, Joaquin P. Villarreal – 236 E. Middle Street**  
MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Non-structural alterations to existing enclosed porch at rear elevation, not visible from the public way; removal of exterior cladding to open up porch as originally constructed, removal of existing floorboards, replacement with pressure-treated lumber
- **COA-17-0023, PG & SE Corporation (Paul Witt) – 380 Steinwehr Avenue (Quality Inn)** MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing concrete pool deck, replace with same material to match
- **COA-17-0024, David & Carol Rathburn – 106 E. Middle Street**  
MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove and replace four (4) existing vinyl replacement windows in kind, two in kitchen and two in basement

- **COA-17-0025, Lisa Angstadt – 636 York Street**  
MINOR PROJECT/FENCE: Removal of existing rear yard fence not visible from the public way; replacement with 3'-0" high wood picket fence of pressure treated lumber and enlargement of fenced area to about 400 square feet
- **COA-17-0026, Andrew Young – 69-71 E. Stevens Street**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/FENCE: Removal of existing 6' wood picket privacy fence east side of lot along Stratton Street, replacement with 4'-0" high open picket fence in pressure-treated lumber
- **COA-17-0028, Times Square LLC – 19 Baltimore Street (The Gettysburg Tourist)**  
SIGN: Installation of two signs; 1) window sign at 10 SF, vinyl lettering (approx. 3" high) stair-stepped to cover only corners of bottom windows and a third of the middle bottom and 2) portable sign to measure 8 SF
- **COA-17-0030, Gettysburg Investors LLC – 26 York Street, Gallery 30**  
SIGN: Erection of two wall signs; 1) 20.5 SF wooden business sign to be affixed on northerly side of west wall and 2) 20.5 SF wooden business sign to be affixed on southerly side of west wall
- **COA-17-0034, Kazimierz & Maria Pukownik – 252-254 Chambersburg Street**  
MAJOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing asphalt roof shingles
- **COA-17-0035, Kosh Enterprises – 224 Baltimore Street (Gettysburg Dime Museum)** SIGN: Erection of 12 SF portable sign
- **COA-17-0036, Michele Agapakis & Keith George – 13 Steinwehr Avenue , The Purple Piggy** SIGN: Erection of two business signs; 10 SF projecting sign and 9 SF portable sign
- **COA-17-0038, White Orchid Enterprise – 55 Zerfing Alley, Brafferton Inn Parking Lot** SIGN: Erection of a metal private parking sign measuring 6 SF on a 9 ft metal high pole at Brafferton Inn Parking Lot, corner of York Street and Zerfing Alley
- **COA-17-0037, Jamie Miller – 44 Steinwehr Avenue , O'Rourke's Family Eatery & Spirits** MAJOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing deteriorated wood pergola, replace with new construction in same material and location

## **B. Pending Administrative Approval**

- **COA-17-010, Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center) – 297 Steinwehr Avenue**  
SIGN: Erection of memorial wayside marker at southwest corner of property commemorating 1922 plane crash. Mrs. LaBarre said that she is still waiting on the marker for the memorial.
- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**  
SIGN: Erection of \_\_\_\_ SF sign. Mrs. LaBarre said that she is still waiting on the sign dimensions.

### **C. Report of Chair – *Mr. Shaffer, Chair***

Mr. Shaffer said that Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) involving fences and sheds do not need a Research Memo because the background information is not guiding the Board's decision.

### **D. Report of Staff – *Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation***

1. *Sign Area Determination by Borough Solicitor.* Solicitor Eastman clarified that a business owner can utilize as much signage as there is façade square footage, which is up to 50 square footage on any façade that has exposure to public view on any street or alley.
2. *Pennsylvania State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) Public Input Session on 1/31.* The office is soliciting feedback for the state historic preservation plan.
3. *Updates on 2017 HARB Training and Public Programming Schedule.* Mrs. LaBarre asked the Board for available dates to schedule a date for the training, "What the Heck is HARB", and noted that the Borough of Litiz is interested in this training.
4. *Nominations for Preservation Pennsylvania's 2017 Historic Preservation Awards.* The Board discussed the nomination process and the determination of possible candidates.

The Board discussed upcoming meeting attendance availability by members regarding the summer schedule, and its effect on a quorum and the establishment of meeting dates.

### **Other Business**

There was no other business.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant