



**May 16, 2018**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved June 20, 2018*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 16, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of five (5) members were present. Those in attendance were Board members: Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant;. Board members Joan Hodges and Colleen Lingle were absent. Also in attendance were: Tammy Myers, President of Gettysburg Heritage Center, and Josh Austin of Mark Austin Building and Remodeling, both representing 340 Baltimore Street; Ian and Ashley Miller, representing 105 E. Middle Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

**Review of Agenda**

There were no additions or corrections to the May 16, 2018 Business Meeting Agenda as presented.

**Review of Minutes**

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the April 18, 2018 Business meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot, and carried 5-to-0.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 11, 2018.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to his fiduciary role with the next three applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as chair.*

**Old Business**

HARB Minutes

May 16, 2017

Page 1 of 6

**A. COA-18-0016, 340 Baltimore Street – Future Stake, Inc.**

CRITICAL PROJECT: Demolition of a sensitive building and foundation with grading and temporary stabilization of the site in preparation for new construction (separate application to follow).

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her May 16, 2018 Meeting Agenda, and reviewed previously presented information. She said that this is a frame vernacular residence that can be dated from approximately 1880-1885 on the Sanborn Map, and has relatively poor architectural integrity with many alterations. She said that the structure had been racked in two directions by shifting soil, but was currently considered stable per structural reports submitted with previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness at this location. She said that the application was tabled at last month's meeting so that the applicant could prepare and submit additional materials requested by the Board. She said that the new materials submitted in the current meeting packet included: Contract of Sale of the Real Estate, Boundary Site Plat, and two written proposals: one for residential use and one for the Preliminary Design and Project Costs for a Historical / Interpretative Facility and Gift Shop at 340 Baltimore Street. She said that a current Structural Engineer's Report is still needed.

Mr. Austin gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Austin said that the intent of the owner was to demolish the existing structure and prepare the site for a new structure at a future date that would keep with the character of the neighborhood. He said that the proposed design would include: a proposed Baltimore Street Welcome Center with first floor ADA compliant public restrooms, future office space, and exterior cedar or wood composite siding. He said that an effort would be made to salvage and reuse any existing materials. He said that the building is in poor shape and was neglected over time by previous owners; and that any basic rehabilitation to the building would be extensive (jacking of the building, reframing, etc.) and estimated at \$344,260. He said that a restoration could possibly uncover hidden issues that would be more costly and challenging. He said that the "bones are great, but the tendons and muscles that hold it together are failing." He said that the site would be rehabilitated with grass until a new structure to match the streetscape could be built for public use.

Mrs. LaBarre discussed with the Board the demolition requirements from the Historic District Ordinance (Chapter 11-110) which addresses demolition versus new construction; and whether structural restoration of 1500 square feet was economically feasible to the applicant. She said that there is not a need to discuss the proposed materials of a new structure at this point. Mr. Austin said that he would provide a current Engineer's structural evaluation, and a written cost estimate to demolish the existing building (approximately \$22,000 to include disassembling the building by hand and salvaging the pieces) to complete the demolition requirements needed for Board review. He said that the owner would probably not consider investing the amount of money necessary to bring the existing structure to code. Mrs. LaBarre said there are other factors to consider beside cost, including contributing historical factors of the building and whether the community wants to save it.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board table the submitted application dated March 7, 2018 for the demolition of an existing structure at 340 Baltimore Street until the application is complete. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

**New Business: Applications for Review**

**B. COA-18-0046, 105 E. Middle Street – Ian and Ashley Miller**

CRITICAL PROJECT: Repairs and renovations to a sensitive building as presented in the application received 4/27/2018:

- *Front:* Remove front steps at storefront doors; install a railing at the double doors; replace steps to porch; restore masonry at porch and cover concrete with thin-set stone paving; add three (3) additional columns to entry porch; add suspended lantern at porch ceiling
- *West Side:* Remove and infill two (2) window openings with brick masonry (recesses  $\frac{3}{4}$ "); if windows are not removed, they will be blocked out from the interior (windows have limited visibility from the public way)
- *Rear (South) Elevation:* Remove existing CMU wall at infilled rear porch (not visible because of wood shed addition which is to be removed); construct new bearing wall at kitchen with brick face and tripartite window; construct/restore rear patio and add trellis as shown on drawings submitted with application.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description on this Critical Project as noted in her May 16, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that this commercial building first appeared on the 1891-1896 Sanborn Map, and is representative of Second Empire architecture.

Mr. Shaffer and the owners, Mr. and Mrs. Miller, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the house was built by the Stallsmith Brothers, and designed by M. E. Stallsmith for a family who had operated a plumbing business on the left side of the structure, and had a residence on the right side. He said that the Millers intend to balance structurally the appearance of the front columns, finish the front porch, redo the front steps and rail, and extend the front pilasters on each side of the front porch cap to complete the storefront windows. He said that the front entrance would be maintained as a safety feature for their residence, but not open as a public entrance. Mr. Miller indicated that he would like to redo the front steps in brick. Mr. Shaffer said that the existing CMU wall would be removed at the infilled rear porch, and a new bearing wall at the kitchen would be constructed with a brick face and tripartite window. He said that a rear patio and trellis would be constructed and restored. He said that two windows on the west side would be infilled with recessed brick, and are not visible from the public view way. Mrs. LaBarre spoke regarding the applicants' request to extend the pilasters below the existing "over-scaled" window hood. She reminded the Board how the placement of undocumented design features on a historic building is not recommended according to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and that what appears clunky or inappropriate to our modern eyes may have been intentional by the historic designer. She further explained that even if unintentional, the feature has been in place for the life of the building and has architectural merit, further cautioning that this may be a rare example of this type of storefront window treatment in the borough. She advised the Board not to recommend extension of the pilasters with new material. The Board was in favor of the extension as it seemed to several members that their eye "wanted the line to continue to the bottom".

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the main structure at 105 E. Middle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old. He said that the repairs to the primary façade is a critical project, because there will

be significant changes to the building located in the public view way from E. Middle Street, and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 105 E. Middle Street as submitted in the application dated April 25, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

**A. COA-18-0045, 105 E. Middle Street, Garage/Carport – Ian and Ashley Miller**

CRITICAL PROJECT: Repairs and renovations to a sensitive building as presented in application received 4/27/2018:

- *Alley Elevation*: Remove “arch” from above double glass doors and remnants of existing balcony; replace garage door with insulated steel door of similar design; cover concrete masonry unit (CMU) of entire structure with stucco finish system
- *East Elevation (New Carport)*: Construct new, open carport along east side; carport to have small deck on roof (house end) to serve as landing area for access stair to roof deck being added to garage roof; construct flight of stairs from lower carport roof to garage roof along exterior of east façade
- *North Elevation*: Restore porch roof over door; infill lower windows with CMU; construct flight of stairs from entry door to carport roof along exterior

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description on this Critical Project as noted in her May 16, 2018 Meeting Agenda.

Mr. Shaffer and the owners, Mr. and Mrs. Miller, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the Millers intend to renovate the existing CMU garage that was originally slated for demolition, and add a carport, roof deck, and existing stair. He said that plumbing supplies were originally kept in this building, and that the Millers intend to repurpose the cinder block building as a functional stucco garage/carport.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the rear structure at 105 E. Middle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive buildings over 50 years old. He said that the repairs to the primary façade is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building located in the public view way from Legion Alley, and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 105 E. Middle Street as submitted in the application dated April 25, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.*

## **Reports**

HARB Minutes

May 16, 2017

Page 4 of 6

Mrs. LaBarre allowed the board to review the administrative approvals made by the Department of Planning and Historic Preservation since HARB's last meeting on April 18, 2018, answering related questions.

**A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting**

- **COA-18-0028, 410 S. Washington Street – John Donmoyer, Jr.**  
CRITICAL PROJECT: Removal of existing shingles from main roof and front; re-sheet main roof with 7/16 OSB sheathing; install synthetic underlayment, new aluminum drip edge; new chimney flashings and where roof meets the siding; install GAF Timberline HD architectural limited lifetime shingles. Remove the existing flat roof and install 1/2" fiber board underlayment, .060 fully adhered rubber roof complete with flashings and .032 aluminum edge metal; repoint brick chimney.
- **COA-18-0031, 54 E. Middle Street – Mary Dooley**  
MAJOR PROJECT: Erection of new 5' high wood privacy fence along east and west property lines; "Wyngate" style flat top vertical pickets; not visible from public way
- **COA-18-0038, 1 Lincoln Square – Gettysburg Hotel Investors, LLC**  
BANNER: Erection of a 40 sf banner (4' high x 10' long) on primary façade to "Welcome to Commencement Weekend/ Congratulations Graduates & Families", in place from Thursday 5/17 - Monday 5/21/2018
- **COA-18-0039, 53 E. Middle Street – Historic Gettysburg Adams County (HGAC)**  
BANNER: Erection of a 24 sf banner (3' high x 8' long) on primary façade for "Barn Art Show", in place from Thursday 5/24 - Sunday 6/10/2018
- **COA-18-0044, 414 York Street – Loyal Order of the Moose, Lodge 1526**  
SIGN: Erection of a 12 SF (3' x 4') double-faced aluminum business sign mounted on two poles, measuring 69.32" high above grade

**B. Pending Administrative Approval**

There were no pending Administrative Approvals to date.

**C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

Mr. Shaffer said that he had no report.

**D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation**

- Mrs. LaBarre recapped the 2018 Borough of Gettysburg Historic Preservation Awards for the Board, stating that 12 of the 15 invited recipients appeared at the May 14, 2018 Council Business Meeting to accept their awards for Exceptional Merit, Certificate of Merit and Honorable Mention. She said that HARB Chair, Gary Shaffer, introduced and presented the awards for projects completed over the last two years. She suggested that next year's annual awards ceremony be held at the May HARB meeting so that more time could be afforded to the recipients and their projects.

- Mrs. LaBarre discussed with the Board the *Gettysburg Times* HARB article for Historic Preservation Month, noting Ms. Gustafson's article on window repair.
- Mrs. LaBarre suggested that the Board consider participating in the Adams County Fun Fest in June for next year.

#### **Other Business**

There was no other business.

#### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant