



April 18, 2018
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved May 16, 2018

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, April 18, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Joan Hodges, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble and Colleen Lingle; Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant;. Board member Jim McCabe was absent. Also in attendance were: Tammy Myers, President of Gettysburg Heritage Center, representing 297 Steinwehr Avenue; Joe Edgar, Associate AIA of Shaffer Design Associates, PC, representing 778 Baltimore Street; Josh Austin of Mark Austin Building and Remodeling, representing 778 Baltimore Street; William Chantelau, Chair of the Property Committee for Christ Lutheran Church, representing 44 Chambersburg Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Review of Agenda

Mrs. LaBarre made one revision to the published meeting agenda: on page one under **Old Business, Part 6A for COA-18-0003**: the calculated square feet should read 1500 and not 960; and under **New Business, Part 7C for COA-18-00027** change the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) permit number from COA-18-00027 to COA-18-0027. There were no additions or corrections to the April 18, 2018 Business Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the February 21, 2018 Business meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson, and carried 5-to-0 with 2 abstentions (Board Members absent at that meeting were C. Malot and P. Goble). Mr. Shaffer noted that the meeting of March 21, 2018 had been cancelled due to poor weather conditions, so no minutes were available for review.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were

present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, May 14, 2018.

Old Business

A. COA-18-0003, 297 Steinwehr Avenue – Future Stake, Inc.

MAJOR PROJECT: Construction of new 30' x 50' (960sq ft) pre-fabricated temporary accessory building (barn) for storage of Victorian Carriage Company carriages and GettyPeds motorized touring vehicles; located at northwest corner of lot, partially on existing macadam and partially on grass, visible from public way via Johns Avenue and Steinwehr Avenue; clad with metal siding overlaid with rough-cut vertical boards, cross-buck style wooden doors, aluminum gutters, and metal roof sheathed with asphalt shingles as presented in revised application submitted April 3, 2018.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her April, 18, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that this project was prompted by the needs of two vendors that needed storage for their touring vehicles. She said that the current COA was a reconfiguration of the previously approved COA for that address, noting that the proposed shed would take up less green space, and would shift the structure further south on the parcel, resting it half on the grass and the other half on the macadam in the existing footprint of the current shed.

Ms. Myers, President of the Gettysburg Heritage Center at that address, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the property owner, Mr. Tim Shields of Future Stake, Inc. Ms. Myers said that the new proposed shed building would be 19 percent smaller than the original proposed structure. She said that it would be a temporary shed with a metal interior, and barn-like exterior. She said that the proposed shed would not have a sewer connection; and that only tour vehicles would be housed inside. Previous plans had proposed resting stalls for the carriage horses, but Ms. Myers explained that the animals will continue to rest outside between tours as they have always done.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed building at 297 Steinwehr Avenue is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and is in the public view shed via Steinwehr Avenue, Queen Street, and Johns Avenue. This proposed project has had previous Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) reviewed by this Board, and should be treated as a modification to the previously submitted COAs. This design is compatible with the character of the Historic District, but in a much smaller scale in a similar area.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Mrs. LaBarre approve administratively the Certificate of Appropriateness as an amendment to a previously approved COA for the proposed shed at 297 Steinwehr Avenue as submitted in the application dated April 2, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to his fiduciary role with the next four applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as chair.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-18-0015, 778 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Tours, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Repairs to primary façade of a sensitive building to include removal of existing porch roof, columns, and north and south stairs off porch; re-shingle exposed area with in-kind metal shake shingles; add new painted wood deck to north side; add compliant wood guard rail and railings.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description on this Critical Project as noted in her April 18, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that the proposed repairs to the primary facade of a sensitive building at 778 Baltimore Street is depicted in the February 22, 2018 application. Mr. Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC, spoke on behalf of the applicant, Max Felty. He said that there were issues with the existing porch with three different stairs that needed to be addressed, and indicated that both the north and south set of steps would be removed. He said that a new deck will be added on the north side to make the entry way symmetrical. He said that the existing stairs, stair railing, and deck guard rail will be made code compliant; and noted that all deck materials would be painted wood. He said that the handicapped entrance is to the rear of the building, and would take into consideration the 20 percent compliancy of the ADA entrance located in the rear when configuring the front entrance. Mrs. LaBarre noted that the structure has a distinctive mid-twentieth century Mansard roof which is significant, and that removing the existing porch overhang would have minimal impact on the existing structure's architectural integrity.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 778 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive buildings over 50 years old. He said that the repairs to the primary façade is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building located in the public view way from Baltimore Street and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project to include repairs to the porch (roof and columns, stairs and deck) at 778 Baltimore Street as submitted in the application dated February 27, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

B. COA-18-0016, 340 Baltimore Street – Future Stake, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Demolition of a sensitive building and foundation with grading and temporary stabilization of the site in preparation for new construction (separate application to follow).

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her April 18, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a frame vernacular residence that can be dated from approximately 1880-1890 on the Sanborn Map, and has relatively poor architectural integrity with many alterations. She said that the structure has been racked in two directions by shifting soil, but is currently considered stable per structural reports submitted with previous applications for Certificates of Appropriateness at this location.

Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Austin gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Austin said that the intent of the owner was to demolish the existing structure and prepare the site for a new structure at future date that would keep with the character of Baltimore Street. He said that the building is in poor shape and neglected over time by previous owners; and that any basic rehabilitation to the building would be extensive (jacking of the building, reframing, etc.) and estimated at \$344,260. He said that the site would be rehabilitated with grass until a new structure to match the streetscape could be built. The Board had asked about salvaging any useable architectural items, and the contractor agreed to salvage any items. The Board asked that the applicant review the demolition requirements in the Historic District as defined in the Chapter 11 Historic District Ordinance. Ms. Myers spoke on behalf of the owner for Future Stake, and said that the property was acquired to be a part of the Baltimore Street Revitalization Project. Mr. Shaffer said that the amount of capital needed to remedy all of the structural challenges needed to make the building functional would not justify the owner's investment and thus be considered an economic hardship as defined by the Historic District Ordinance. Mr. Malot said that the owner's application is incomplete because the property owner did not meet all the application requirements outlined in the Historic District Ordinance Section 11-1103.A, and suggested that the owner table the application until it is complete. Mrs. LaBarre asked the Board that when considering preservation and adaptive reuse, to also consider that at times, it may be acceptable to eliminate a building that is not economically viable or contributing to the community in favor of new construction that will benefit the community overall as provided for in the Historic District Ordinance, Section 11-1103.B(2C) Criteria.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board table the submitted application dated March 7, 2018 for the demolition of an existing structure at 340 Baltimore Street until the application is complete. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

C. COA-18-0027, 30 Chambersburg Street – Christ Evangelical Lutheran Church

CRITICAL PROJECT: Repairs and replacement of deteriorated materials on a sensitive building to include:

- Removal of existing stair risers and porch decking on principal facade, replace with substitute material: dyed PVC with grained finish manufactured by Wolf Decking in "Cinnamon" colorway;
- Removal of existing stair risers in same location, replace with substitute material: white PVC with smooth finish by same manufacturer;
- Removal of existing railing within arched openings of cupola, replace with rounded, extruded white PVC to replicate existing profile;
- Cladding of existing columns on cupola in white PVC and;
- Infill of stone wall at sidewalk to match existing stone wall.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her April 18, 2018 Meeting Agenda. Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Chantelau, Chair of the Property Committee, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Chantelau said that this multi-stage project to replace materials on this historic building would: improve the safety of the deteriorating church cupola damaged by insects, and the front wooden steps and porch decking that are rapidly deteriorating necessitating immediate repair; infill the stone wall where the rotted witness trees had been removed; and refurbish the sidewalk with red colored pavers that would retain the differentiation to enhance the existing streetscape. He said that the railing

would be sandblasted / powder coated to avoid changing the look during restoration of the front of the church. Mr. Shaffer said that the railing is historic and not representative of an ADA accessible route into the church. Mr. Malot said that the railings would be reviewed for safety compliancy.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 30 Chambersburg Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive buildings over 50 years old. He said that the proposed repairs to the primary façade represents a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building located in the public view way from Chambersburg Street. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Borough Historic District and is of high architectural integrity, and is therefore reviewable by the Board. He also noted that the support under the steps would be corrected to create a safe, solid step structure.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed multi-stage project at 30 Chambersburg Street, the Christ Evangelical Lutheran Church, for the repairs of the church cupola, porch decking, steps and railing, and the wall infill; and an administrative approval for the brick sidewalk repair pending date of the existing bricks as submitted in the application dated April 3, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

D. COA-18-0030, 19 Baltimore Street – Times Square, LLC

MAJOR PROJECT: Erection of an enclosure on the existing parking lot behind a sensitive building; enclosure to be of extruded vinyl chain link security fence with privacy slats and is required by the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania for operating license of medical dispensary. Fence to be completely screened from Baltimore Street by the building. Visible from the public way via West Middle Street but will be located as far away from Middle Street as possible. Fence will have black posts with grey inserts (slats) to minimize visibility as it should blend in with the neighboring warehouse. Construction also includes a new door (with limited visibility) and a new stair which will be completely screened by the fence.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her April 18, 2018 Meeting Agenda. Mrs. LaBarre said that the applicant is seeking an administrative approval for this project.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation on behalf of the applicant, Times Square LLC, and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the proposed enclosure, new steel door and new stairway will be completely enclosed by a fence enclosure is required by the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania for the delivery of this medicinal product. He said that the placement of heavy steel fence posts in the concrete as opposed to wood fence posts would be more secure; and that the chain link fence with grey insert slats will fit-in more with the character of the neighborhood and still ensure privacy. He said that parking will be reconfigured to accommodate handicapped parking.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Mrs. LaBarre approve administratively the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 19 Baltimore Street as submitted

in the application dated March 27, 2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

Reports

Mrs. LaBarre allowed the board to review the administrative approvals made by the Department of Planning and Historic Preservation since HARB's last meeting on February 21, 2018, answering related questions.

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-18-0011, 19 Baltimore Street – Times Square, LLC**
SIGN: Erection of two (2) business signs; 1) 14sf (4' h x 3.5' w) wall-mounted business sign of plywood and aluminum located at rear elevation; and 2) 14sf (4' h x 3.5' w) window sign of vinyl decal located at primary façade.
- **COA-18-0012, 52 York Street – James & Bonita Wentz/Kevin Soliday (Sleep Apnea Solutions)**
SIGN: Erection of two (2) window business signs for "Sleep Apnea Solutions Gettysburg"; 4 sf vinyl decal of telephone number on transom and 12.5 sf vinyl logo decal on main window.
- **COA-18-0013, 24 Chambersburg Street – ML & G, LLC/ T & S Clothing and Gifts**
SIGN: Erection of 13 sf (2' h x 6.5' w) business sign for "T & S Clothing and Gifts" affixed to face of awning
- **COA-18-0014, 150 N. Third Street – Timely Place, LLC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing rubber roofs down to deck, install 1" ISO insulation with a new Firestone 0.060 mil completely adhered roof system.
- **COA-18-0017, 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
BANNER: Erection of a 40 SF banner (4' h x 20' l) on primary E. High Street façade "Join Us! Easter Sunday 8:15 & 10:30 am" from 3/19-4/2/2018
- **COA-18-0018, 74 Racehorse Alley – Borough of Gettysburg**
MAJOR PROJECT: Construction of a new 6' h 12' w x 12' l shared dumpster enclosure of dog-eared wooden pickets for municipal and business use at westernmost end of metered parking on north side of Racehorse Alley; to encompass two (2) existing parking spaces
- **COA-18-0019, 135 York Street – Sean Gannon**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system, replace with GAF Timberline HD Architectural shingles in "Pewter Gray" with all necessary underlayments, ice/water shields, flashings, etc.
- **COA-18-0020, 297 Steinwehr Avenue – Future Stake, Inc. (Gettysburg Heritage Center)**
CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove existing exterior doors, frames and hardware on west and north facades; replace with new Republic DE Series 18 gage Polystyrene Core Six-Panel Embossed Door with hardware as presented in application submitted 3/13/2018
- **COA-18-0021, 297 Steinwehr Avenue – Future Stake, Inc. (Gettysburg Heritage Center)**
Amendment of CRITICAL PROJECT: Installation of four (4) HB&G PermaCast Columns with "Round Plain" shaft and "Ionic" capital; previous COA approved on 3/10/2014 had called for "Doric" capital (see LU-14-0005, expired 7/2/2016)

- **COA-18-0022, 412 York Street – La Bella Italia/ACNB Bank**
BANNER: Erection of a 32 sf banner (4' w x 8' h) "Project financed by ACNB Bank, Anthony Spangler 717.339.5012" to be displayed from Monday 3/26 - Monday 4/23/2018.
- **COA-18-0023, 548 Baltimore Street – Erian Associates Limited Partnership/Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.**
SIGN: Replace a deteriorated hanging sign on a pole with a new hanging sign of 18 sf mounted on a pole for "Jennie Wade House Museum & Gift Shop".
- **COA-18-0024, 62 Chambersburg Street – Redd Up Properties**
SIGN: 17.72 sf (4.25' w x 4.17' h) window business sign, vinyl decal, for "Gettysburg Craft Beer & Artisan Spirits/ Spirits of Gettysburg Distillery/battlefield Brew Works"
- **COA-18-0025, 380 Steinwehr Avenue – PG & JE Corporation (Quality Inn of Gettysburg)**
MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing 22 x 30 concrete pad; replace with 6 x 9 dyed concrete paver by Hanover Architectural Products on concrete pad, sand and polymer in same location.
- **COA-18-0028, 410 S. Washington Street – John Donmoyer, Jr.**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingles from main roof and front; re-sheet main roof with 7/16 OSB sheathing; install synthetic underlayment, new aluminum drip edge; new chimney flashings and where roof meets the siding; install GAF Timberline HD architectural limited lifetime shingles. Remove the existing flat roof and install 1/2" fiber board underlayment, .060 fully adhered rubber roof complete with flashings and .032 aluminum edge metal; repoint brick chimney.
- **COA-18-0029, 249 York Street – Frank C. Pizzuto/Edward Jones Investments**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system, replace with GAF Timberline HD shingles with all necessary underlayments, flashings, and ridge vent.
- **COA-18-0031, 54 E. Middle Street – Mary Dooly**
MAJOR PROJECT: Erection of a 6'-0" high wood privacy fence
- **COA-18-0032, 531 Baltimore Street – Tony Strickland/ Cricket Attractions, LLC (Christine Baummer)** MAJOR PROJECT: Erection of 6'-0" high wood privacy fence along western boundary of lot; adjacent to Inn at Cemetery Hill parking lot (613 Baltimore Street)
- **COA-18-0033, 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system over Parsonage, replace with GAF Timberline HD Architectural shingles with all necessary underlayments, ice/water shields on all eaves and valleys, synthetic felt underlayment flashings, new edgings and GAF Snow Country ridge vent.
- **COA-18-0034, 0 South Franklin Street – Frederick Douglass Townhouses Homeowners Association** MINOR PROJECT: Replacement in-kind of exist. vinyl picket fencing/gate and exist. vinyl privacy fence partitions between residential units, install new vinyl post caps - no alterations to structural members/posts; re-surface parking lot
- **COA-18-0035, 271 Baltimore Street – Mark V. Nesbitt**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to historic metal roof on a sensitive building to include realignment of panels to seal off exposed hole on roof, scrape loose/deteriorated paint, secure loose panels with rubberized screws; apply base coat/top

coat. Repairs to roof of rear building to include inspection, sealing, and reflashings of existing skylights and ridge vent.

- **COA-18-0036, 25 Railroad Street – Gettysburg College**
MAJOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing reddish brown shingle roof on non-sensitive building, replace with GAF HD Timberline architectural shingles in grey colorway to match surrounding dwelling units at "College Apartments"
- **COA-18-0037, 218 Carlisle Street – Gettysburg College**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Temporarily remove slate shingles adjoining existing metal roof ledges around perimeter, cover in 1/2" fiberboard, and re-install slate as before; new edging, copper drop-outs, white aluminum downspouts, and flashings.

B. Pending Administrative Approval

There were no pending Administrative Approvals to date.

C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer reviewed the **2018 Historic District Awards** with the Board, discussing the top ten choices for the award categories: Certificate of Exceptional Merit, Certificate of Merit, and Certificate of Honorable Mention, as prepared by himself and Ms. Gustafson for the May Council presentations on May 14th at their Business Meeting. Mr. Shaffer also discussed with the Board the Historic District Ordinance and accompanying checklist; and how it relates building demolition in the Borough's Historic District.

D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre she had no report.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant

HARB Minutes

April 18, 2017

Page 8 of 8