



February 21, 2018
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved April 18, 2018

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, February 21, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, and Colleen Lingle; Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PA Municipal Code Alliance, participating in a non-voting advisory role; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant;. Board members Philip Goble and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot were absent. Also in attendance were: Linda Atiyeh of Lincoln Square LLC and owner, Michael Weiss of Gallery 30, Lynda Taylor, Robert Krummerich, Cathy Harner, Kathy Shirey, and Sharon Monahan, all representing 1-3-5-7 Chambersburg Street; Jay Mackie of Twin Bridges Farm LLC and Open Minds, representing 15 Lincoln Square; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Review of Agenda

There were no additions or corrections to the February 21, 2018 meeting agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the minutes from both the Business meeting of January 17, 2018 and the Special Meeting of January 31, 2018 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle, and carried 5-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, March 12, 2018.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to his fiduciary role with the next three applicants, whereby Ms. Gustafson assumed the role as chair in the absence of Vice-Chair Goble.

Old Business

A. COA-17-0142, 11-13 Baltimore Street – The Christmas Haus

CRITICAL PROJECT: Request for an amendment to the existing Certificate of Appropriateness via Administrative Approval by the Historic Preservation Officer. Additions to the previously approved COA issued on December 12, 2017 to include: the installation of a new approximately 10" wide, extruded PVC piers and bases on either side of the display windows, capped by an extruded PVC crown/fascia piece above the transom windows in traditional styling as encouraged by *The Gettysburg Design Guide*; cleaning/repainting of the previously tar-coated historic brownstone in deteriorated condition at the storefront level then coat with dark red/brown masonry paint; and the installation of a new extruded PVC base on an existing concrete masonry unit (CMU) wall and high profile paneled bulkhead below the display windows.

Ms. Gustafson introduced this application stating that there was more information available regarding the north façade. Ms. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building history as noted in her February 21, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that this was a request for an addition or addendum to a previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness by Borough Council on December 12, 2018.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the property and business owner, Mr. Roger Lund. Mr. Shaffer distributed the components of the traditional historic store front from page 73 of *The Gettysburg Design Guide* to the Board for their reference. He said that upon removal of the current façade, there was less original material and historic brownstone intact after cleaning; and said that masonry paint will be used to match the historic brownstone bands above. The design was altered to reflect more traditional components, replicating a traditional storefront bulkhead, and a secondary crown.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that amendments and additions to COA 17-0142 for 11-13 Baltimore Street (The Christmas Haus) be approved administratively as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-18-0009, 1-3-5-7 Chambersburg Street – Lincoln Square, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT: Restoration and rehabilitation of the historic façade to include: the removal of the wooden sign boards on the corner of the store fronts and the restoration of the transom windows; replacement of the existing aluminum door and frame with new; the removal of the masonry infill and the restoration of the door/transom facing Lincoln Square; the removal of the wood paneling on 5 Chambersburg Street; the restoration of the storefront to reflect the historic storefront on 7 Chambersburg Street; and the restoration of the second-story wrap-around balcony as presented in the application submitted on February 1, 2018.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 21, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that the proposed restoration and rehabilitation at 1-3-5-7 Chambersburg Street as depicted in the January 31, 2018 application shows the existing

conditions of two buildings built at two different time periods with both Italianate and Victorian styling. She said that 1-3 Chambersburg Street was the Amos Eckert Store Building circa 1885 and was closest to Lincoln Square, and also housed Ben's Clothing Store. She said that 5-7 Chambersburg Street was the Boyer Eckert Building that was constructed in 1878. She said that the owner, Ms. Atiyeh, is proposing to restore/rehabilitate these historic storefronts and facades, and reconstruct the historic front façade balcony as depicted in submitted historic pictures. She commented that the Order of the Redman had once met there; and that the balcony had appeared in 1896 pictures, and that 1918 photographs shows people on the balcony with the railing. She stated the Secretary of the Interior favors restoring historic lost features of structures, and that this proposal is consistent with that finding.

Mr. Shaffer and Ms. Atiyeh gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the Borough owns the Square up to the building. He said that Ms. Atiyeh would like to operate a restaurant on the first two floors with limited seating on the balcony. He reiterated that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* favors the reconstruction of lost historic features that is depicted in the submitted historic photographs. He said that the multipane transoms would be replicated but not restored; and that he is unsure what lies beneath the existing siding. He said that the proposed balcony would not cover the glass of the current Sunset Soap Company at 7 Chambersburg Street; and that there would be a recessed doorway at the current Rusty's Vitamins at 5 Chambersburg Street. He noted that both the PA Department of Transportation (Penn DOT) and Borough rights-of-way would not impact the proposed design, but just the size of the details, limiting how closed construction would be to the curb on the south façade. Mrs. LaBarre said that a motion by the Board could capture the right-of-way limitations and Penn DOT approval. He said that the design of the railing would most likely be aluminum, but that the beams and posts would either be steel or wood. He said that a door and transom existed where plaques are currently mounted on the square, and would be restored. He stated that the stairs to the second floor balcony comprised of powder-coated aluminum rails would be located in front of the windows on the Lincoln Square façade; and that a railing would be installed per code in front of the stair elevation to prohibit pedestrian traffic under the stairway. He said that all materials used in the construction would be sensitive to historic buildings.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Findings of Fact*: She said that the buildings at 1-3-5-7 Chambersburg Street are located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, are sensitive buildings over 50 years old, and that the restoration/rehabilitation is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the buildings located in the public view way from both Chambersburg Street and Lincoln Square. She said that the buildings are contributing structures to the Gettysburg Borough Historic District and are of high architectural integrity, and are therefore reviewable by the Board.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed restoration/rehabilitation of the historic façade at 1-3-5-7 Chambersburg Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated January 31, 2018 with any additional consideration pending minor items discovered for Administrative Approval, and that any major right-of-way changes requiring Penn DOT / Borough approval be resubmitted for Board recommendation. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

B. COA-18-0010, 15 Lincoln Square – Twin Bridges, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove and replace the existing front door and the replace the entrance door with a wider kickplate, and diamond-pattern glass sidelights with more traditional detailing; install two additional lamp posts (replicating the Lincoln Square fixtures to the frame door and provide emergency lighting as presented in the application submitted on February 1, 2018.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 21, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a critical project, with alterations to a sensitive building over 50 years old and is visible from public way via Lincoln Square. She said that the proposed alterations would remove and replicate an existing front door package with a taller eight-foot two-over-three light door with two additional lamp posts to provide emergency lighting, replicating those existing on Lincoln Square.

Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Mackie gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the intent of the owner was to restore prominence to the main entrance door located at 15 Lincoln Square on the east façade. He said that the door had served as the main door for the former Odd Fellows Lodge, and is currently the main entrance to the second floor offices of Open Minds. He said that the door would be replaced with a new door exhibiting more traditional features, and that the historic transom featuring a diamond pattern remains and would be restored. He said that adding a second lamp post to the original existing lamp post, replicating those on Lincoln Square, would provide emergency lighting that would enhance security. He said that tempered safety glass may cover the historic glass for added protection to the historic feature.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Findings of Fact*: She said that the building at 15 Lincoln Square is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old, and that the restoration of a non-historic entrance is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building located in the public view way from Lincoln Square. She said that the building is contributing structure to the Gettysburg Borough Historic District and is of high architectural integrity, and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 15 Lincoln Square to restore the non-historic entranceway and install an additional lamp post to enhance safety and security as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the submitted application. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

Gary resumed his role as chair.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals

HARB Minutes

February 21, 2017

Page 4 of 6

- **COA-18-0008, Gettysburg College — 75 W. Stevens Street**
SIGN: Erection of a 2.5 SF (2' w x 1.25' h) single-sided two-pole sign of painted aluminum and reflective vinyl for "The Office of Religious and Spiritual Life"
- **COA-18-0012, James & Bonita Wentz/Kevin Soliday (Commercial Tenant) – 52 York Street**
SIGN: Erection of two (2) window business signs for "Sleep Apnea Solutions Gettysburg"; 4 sf vinyl decal of telephone number on transom and 12.5 sf vinyl logo decal on main window.

B. Pending Administrative Approvals

- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**
SIGN: Erection of ____ SF business sign
- **COA-17-0108, Artworks—30 York Street**
SIGN: Erection of projecting ____SF business sign
- **COA-17-0135, 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors (Starbucks)**
SIGN: Install a 36" diameter shingle bracket non-illuminated projecting sign to the east of the existing storefront; install a 24" diameter hanging disk sign inside the west section of storefront window; and vertically etch 'Starbucks' into the glass to the left of the rear entry door (used primarily by Hotel guests).

C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer asked the Board to continue their review for the **2018 Historic District Awards**, referencing the top ten choices prepared by himself and Ms. Gustafson, for their final recommendation in April in advance of the May presentations. He also reminded the Board to write their Historic Preservation news articles on the importance of historic preservation of not more than 400-600 words for the "Historic Preservation Week" news series in May, 2018.

D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre she had no report.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed 5-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant