



**December 20, 2017**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved January 17, 2018*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, December 20, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Joan Hodges, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe and Phil Goble; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Board members Colleen Lingle and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot were absent. Also in attendance were: Levi Fisher of Loysville Structures as agent for property owners Michael and Simone McCaffrey, representing 55 West Middle Street; Greg Reaver of Reaver Real Estate Investments, representing 60 East Middle Street; Joe Edgar, Jr. of Shaffer Design Associates, PC, and David Petters, Owner of the Blue & Gray Bar & Grill and of Kadell LLC, both representing 2 Baltimore Street; Wade and Drew Leedy, owners of Tommy's Pizza as agents for property owner William D. Small, and Jill Rohrbaugh, architect from Architecture Workshop, Inc., all representing 603 South Washington Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

Mrs. LaBarre stated that there were two additions/corrections to the current meeting agenda: change the Meeting Minutes Approval date in 3A under 'Review of Agenda' on page 1 from "November 16, 2017" to "November 15, 2017"; and change the text in 6B under 'New Business' on page 1 from "visible from the public way via High Street" to "visible from the public way via *Middle Street*".

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the November 15, 2017 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson, and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention by Mr. Goble due to his absence at the November 15<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

**Old Business**

There were no tabled applications for review at this time.

## **New Business: Applications for Review**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, January 8, 2018.

**A. COA-17-0145, 55 West Middle Street – Michael A. and Simone B. McCaffrey, Levi Fisher of Loysville Structures acting as owners' agent**

**CRITICAL PROJECT: Construction of a new 22' x 28' garage at the rear of the property, visible from the public way via Zerfing Alley; proposed in the same location as the former garage demolished by vehicular damage (see COA-17-000, issued via administrative approval on 1/9/2017); clad in white vinyl siding with a dark gray metal roof.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the proposed construction is a critical project visible from the public way via Zerfing Alley. She provided the Board with an aerial view and a picture view of the former garage for context comparison. She said that the applicant would like to construct a 22' x 28' two-car frame building to the rear of their property along Zerfing Alley in the same location using white vinyl siding with a dark gray metal roof, four-over-four divided lite windows, two (2) 8-foot wide overhead vinyl garage doors with windows, and a steel two-paneled divided lite man door.

Mr. Shaffer introduced Mr. Fisher of Loysville Structures, contractor for the applicant, who gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that Mr. McCaffrey intended to replace the former garage damaged by a vehicle, and that the structure would be a little smaller than what was depicted in the submitted picture due to property setbacks. He said that the owner wanted the structure to match the style of his house, have a 29-guage non-standing seam standard agricultural roof, and be located on the same footprint as the former garage. He said that the owner intended to remove the existing concrete pad in the front of the structure and redo it.

Mr. Shaffer presented the ***Proposed Findings of Fact***. The main structure at 55 West Middle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that it is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances, Gettysburg Historic Districts* (Historic District Ordinance); and that the proposed garage is new construction, viewable from the public way from Zerfing Alley, and would require a certificate of occupancy to build in the Historic District. He noted that the Board took no exception to the application as presented.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed construction of a rear garage at 55 West Middle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated December, 13, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 5-to-0.

Mrs. LaBarre instructed the applicant that he would still need a building permit.

**B. COA-17-0150, 60 East Middle Street – Reaver Real Estate Investments**

**CRITICAL PROJECT: Removal of twelve (12) historic windows on the eastern and northern facades visible from the public way via Middle Street, South Stratton Street, and Zerfing Alley; existing windows are of a combination of double hung wood two-over-two and metal divided lite casement windows; replace all windows with vinyl one-over-one double hung windows within existing openings.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that this is a critical project, with an alteration to a sensitive building over 50 years old and is visible from public way. She said that the proposed windows for removal are on the eastern (Stratton Street) and northern (Zerfing Alley) facades. She noted that the Sanborn Map from 1953 shows the rear portion of the building where the majority of the casement windows are located is concrete block with stucco on top. She said that the front portion of the building is brick, which dates to the mid-nineteenth century. The tall two-over-two wood windows are most likely contemporary to the last quarter of the nineteenth century, c.1880s.

Mr. Shaffer introduced Mr. Reaver who gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that none of the windows considered for replacement are operable and pose a life safety/security issue. He stated that he does not intend to change the façade of the building, and that he could match the existing window openings. He said that there is no thermal value to the current windows, and he wants to correct that aspect without changing the building. He said that the proposed windows would meet existing code.

Mr. Shaffer presented the ***Proposed Findings of Fact***. The structure at 60 East Middle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that it is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances, Gettysburg Historic Districts* (Historic District Ordinance) as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg National Register Historic District, and is of high architectural integrity with many original features intact. He said that the proposed work is considered a critical project, altering the existing building with new windows to be viewable from the public way via Middle Street, Stratton Street, and Zerfing Alley. He noted that the windows are not part of the original construction, are currently not functional, and therefore must be replaced for safety reasons.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of twelve windows at 60 East Middle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated November, 22, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer instructed the applicant that he would still need a commercial building permit because it is a rental property.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the next two applicants, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair.*

- C. **COA-17-0149, 2 Baltimore Street (13 Lincoln Square Entry) – Kadell LLC (David and Lynn Petters)**  
**CRITICAL PROJECT: Removal of the existing wood and glass double doors on the north façade facing Lincoln Square; replace with new solid four-paneled metal double doors for private residential entry, Traditions Steel Model #TS214.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that it is a critical project, but with a minor change. She stated that the owner wishes to remove the existing wood and glass double doors, and install an upgraded four-panel solid double door system.

Mr. Goble introduced Mr. Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC representing the applicant/owner, Mr. Petters. Mr. Edgar said that since submission, conversations with design and preservation professionals has led the owner to amend the application to keep the existing wood doors. The scope of work would now include only removal of the glass and hardware, with the addition of flat wood panels in the arched window openings and weather stripping around the doors. Mr. Edgar said that Mr. Petters wanted to maintain the existing design, but make the doors more secure for his private residence upstairs.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations to the existing wooden double doors at the 13 Lincoln Square entry of 2 Baltimore Street as amended during this presentation, modified from the plans depicted in the application dated November, 29, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 4-to-0 with one abstention.

*Gary resumed his role as chair.*

- D. **COA-17-0151, 603 South Washington Street – William D. Small, Wade and Drew Leedy acting as owner's agents**  
**CRITICAL PROJECT: Exterior alterations to an existing sensitive building to prepare for a new use as a restaurant/brew pub; requesting recommendation for conditional approval pending enactment of the zoning amendment ordinance to reclassify the parcel as TC Tourist Commercial.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the building, made of concrete block with a brick façade facing South Washington Street, has always been a commercial structure. She said that it was previously used as a beer distributor, and an auto parts store prior to zoning being enacted in the 1970s when it was classified R-1 Low Density Residential District along with homes in the area. She said that the proposed conversion to a restaurant/brew pub is contingent upon the enactment of a pending zoning amendment ordinance to reclassify the parcel as TC Tourist Commercial which would allow the use of a restaurant by right. She said that the current owner (Small) and future owners (Leedys) are preparing the project, and are requesting conditional approval pending that zoning reclassification.

Mr. Shaffer introduced Ms. Rohrbaugh from Architectural Workshop and the Leedys, acting agents for the owner, who gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Rohrbaugh provided a detailed description of the proposed work: remove the small mansard roof and posts and replace with a black metal trellis with interior support grid and 6-inch maximum thickness horizontally along Washington and Gettys Streets to minimize view and accommodate the seasonal display/growing of hops; install three windows on the front (Washington Street) elevation; install two new entry doors and two new windows on the Gettys Street elevation; clean the existing brick on the front elevation; repair the existing CMU on all side and rear elevations; relocate the existing overhead door in the south wood-framed garage wing; install siding similar to the existing siding to accommodate a new door; erect a new six foot dumpster enclosure adjacent to the existing wood-framed side garage that will coordinate with the existing neighboring fence; install a similar fence on Gettys street adjacent to the existing residential neighbor; and remove/replace the existing parking lot and interior sidewalks per plan. The Board discussed the plan elements with the owner's architect and agents. Ms. Rohrbaugh said that the existing roof is agricultural metal grade, and that the proposed windows would be vertical bi-fold windows like the ones previously approved for 19 York Street (see COA-17-0020, HARB minutes of March 15, 2017). She said that outside seating in the grassy area located at the northwest corner of the lot could be considered in these plans. This would be defined by a short wooden fence to match the wood residential privacy fence at the western lot line. Mrs. LaBarre said that the wood fence on the corner must not exceed four feet and have a 1-to-1 solid-to-void ratio per zoning regulations.

Mr. Shaffer presented the ***Proposed Findings of Fact***. The main structure at 603 South Washington Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District as extended in 1999. He said that it is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances, Gettysburg Historic Districts* (Historic District Ordinance) as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg National Register Historic District; but is a non-descript commercial building that has been altered several times over the years. He said that the proposed work is considered a critical project, altering the existing building and will be viewable from the public way via Washington and Gettys Streets, and therefore comes under the review right of this Board. Mrs. LaBarre said that any added fixtures not presented in the application, to include outdoor lighting, would have to come before the Board.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness contingent upon the zoning issues being resolved for the proposed alterations at the 603 South Washington Street as submitted in the in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated December 15, 2017, and that any significant deviation from the proposed design plans to include outdoor lighting would be presented to the Board and for new approval by Council. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson and carried 5-to-0.

## **Reports**

### **A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting**

- **COA-17-0058, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards— 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112**  
SIGN: Erection of 8 SF portable business sign
- **COA-17-0133, 304 York Street-Suite B – Quin Terra LLC**

HARB Minutes

December 20, 2017

Page 5 of 7

SIGN: Install three (3) new business signs - 8" x 24" insert for existing monument sign; 8"x 64" projecting sign; and 24"x 32" wall sign.

- **COA-17-0137, 21 Steinwehr Avenue – Jessica Haung Yu & Tim May (May's Avenue Restaurant)**  
SIGN: Erection of 21.36 SF (3' x 7.12') window business sign
- **COA-17-0146, 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**  
BANNER: Erection of 27 sq. ft (3' x 9') yellow temporary 30-day banner on railing on E. High Street for church Christmas Bazaar on 12/1/17 and 12/2/17.
- **COA-17-0147, 1 Lincoln Square – Gettysburg Hotel Investors**  
BANNER: Erection of 40 sq. ft (4' x 10') temporary 30-day banner on south façade front porch of Hotel steps facing Lincoln Square for promotion of Annual Breakfast with Santa event beginning 11/26/2017 through 12/2/2017.
- **COA-17-0148, 60 E. Middle Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**  
BANNER: Erection of a 40 SF (4' h x 10' l) banner advertising Christmas Eve Service, in place from 12/2-12/26/2017

#### **B. Pending Administrative Approval**

- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**  
SIGN: Erection of \_\_\_\_ SF business sign
- **COA-17-0108, Artworks—30 York Street**  
SIGN: Erection of projecting \_\_\_\_SF business sign
- **COA-17-0135, 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors (Starbucks)**  
SIGN: Install a 36" diameter shingle bracket non-illuminated projecting sign to the east of the existing storefront; install a 24" diameter hanging disk sign inside the west section of storefront window; and vertically etch 'Starbucks' into the glass to the left of the rear entry door (used primarily by Hotel guests).
- **COA-17-0138, 789 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.**  
SIGN: Erection of three projecting business signs: 1) 11.72 SF (8.83' x 3/06') for Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.; 2) 7.74 SF (3.83' x 2.02') for National Civil War Memorial; and 3) 2.75 SF (3.83' x 0.72') for Gary Casteel, Sculptor.

#### **C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

Mr. Shaffer discussed the **2018 Historic District Awards** with the Board. He recommended that the Board continue to review the projects eligible for the 2018 Historic District Award nominations referencing the various selection category definitions from the *Manual of PA Historic Architectural Review Boards*: Protection, Stabilization, Preservation, Rehabilitation, and Restoration. He said that classifying projects this way aligns with the categories defined in the *Manual of PA Historic Architectural Review Boards*. Board members agreed to submit and discuss their top 10 applicants from their nominating list at the January meeting.

#### **D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation**

Mrs. LaBarre reminded the Board to submit their **CLG Training Reports for 2017**. Mrs. LaBarre said that Board members could email her with both on-line and Borough event training details (including one off-

site training) to provide to SHIPO to satisfy required Board continuing education training credits; and that on-line webinars can be viewed for credit.

### **Other Business**

Mrs. LaBarre updated the Board on the following items:

#### **A. HARB Reading Assignments**

Mrs. LaBarre said that the Board will table continued discussion of the Reading Assignment: Chapter 4 – “Building Community Support for Historic Preservation” of *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions* until the January HARB meeting. She also suggested that the Board review “Preservation Brief 13: The Repair and Thermal Upgrading of Historic Steel Windows” as a follow-up to its discussions related to COA-17- 0150 – 60 E. Middle Street, should alterations to significant/high integrity steel windows ever come up for review.

#### **B. Monthly HARB Newspaper Feature**

Mr. Shaffer suggested that members do a series of five articles to submit to the *Gettysburg Times* for “Historic Preservation Week” (the second week in May, 2018). He said that the topic of the articles should generate community interest in Historic Preservation.

### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Shaffer. The motion passed 5-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant