



**May 17, 2017**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved June 21, 2017*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 17, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe and Joan Hodges; Clem Malot, Borough Code Official; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. HARB Member, Colleen Lingle was absent. Also in attendance were: Brandon Stone representing 61 West High Street; Josef Krug and Steve Hemler of the Loyal Order of the Moose Gettysburg Lodge #1526, representing 414 York Street; Dave and Kathy Reid, Reid's Orchard Winery, representing 400 Baltimore Street; James Gardner of the Gettysburg Presbyterian Church and Wendy Brubaker, Maddie Brubaker, of Roxanne Kahn, Mirena Kahn, Khloe Reaver, and Kim Short of Girl Scout Junior Troop #80096 all representing the Gettysburg Presbyterian Church at 208 Baltimore Street; and Steve LaBarre, 613 Baltimore Street.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

There were two additions to the meeting agenda: *D. Reid's Orchard and Winery at 400 Baltimore Street – Dave and Kathy Reid*, and *E. Gettysburg Presbyterian Church at 208 Baltimore Street – Wendy Brubaker and Girls Scout Junior Troop #80096*. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the April 19, 2017 meeting as submitted. Seconded by Mr. Malot. Motion carried 6-to-0.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Old Business**

**COA-16-77, Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc. – 789 Baltimore Street.**

Mr. Shaffer updated HARB members on the status of this Certificate of Appropriateness. He said that the historic appearance is becoming apparent now that the colonnade was removed, and pocket doors within the wall were discovered. Aerial photos of the structure were provided as photographic evidence. The applicant was interested on restoring the Queen Ann features above the bay window.

## **New Business**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 12, 2017.

## **Applications for Review**

- A. COA-17-0045 & COA-17-0046, Brandon and Valerie Stone – 61 West High Street. Alteration/ Rehabilitation – CRITICAL PROJECT. Removal of existing PVC door lintel above primary entrance on High Street and installation of new door surround, more appropriate in appearance for period of building; FYPON brand "Combination Acorn Pediment with Fluted Pilasters" polyurethane in white colorway.**

**COA-17-0045:** Mr. Stone gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he wanted to install a Larson Williamsburg full-view Aluminum storm door that would be white in color. As this particular model of storm door has been previously approved by the Board at several locations in the Gettysburg Historic District, it was assigned a separate application number (COA-17-0045) by Mrs. LaBarre with a request for permission to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness administratively.

**COA-17-0046:** Mr. Stone also proposed removing the existing PVC lintel and rosettes above the primary entrance on High Street, replacing them with a *Fypon* PVC Colonial Style door surround consisting of two fluted pilasters and decorative door hood consisting of a broken/open pediment with separate acorn finial. He presented photographs of similar surrounds at 65 W. High Street and 262 S. Washington Street and as examples of what he'd like to install at his property.

He explained that the door surround at 262 S. Washington has a similar styling to what he is proposing, but recognized it is not original to that structure. He said that there are rosettes above the windows at his property at 61 W. High Street which would remain. He said that all existing decorative materials on the heavily renovated building are made of PVC and that the cement plank siding was in place prior to his acquiring the building. He said that the proposed pediment will fill the gap between the door and the second floor, adding balance to the house, noting that the existing door was salvaged.

Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant is recreating a look that is typical of a style found in the Borough Historic District and thus is reviewable by the Board. This style, and the two

examples provided by Mr. Stone are, however, are either later twentieth century additions to mid-nineteenth century facades or contemporary to structures built during the long period of Colonial Revival architecture which dated from the 1890s through the 1960s. He said that he was not aware of any prior approvals regarding an acorn style broken pediment on a house of this period (1850s), but had previously approved subtle, simpler detailing that was typical of this type of townhouse and its period of construction. These surrounds include geometric millwork elements, like hoods and pilasters, with flush faces and simple beaded moldings and/or reveals, devoid of overt ornamentation. Original extant examples include 53-55 W. High Street and 201 S. Washington Street.

Mr. Stone said that the house was built in 1858, but that the front façade has been so extensively altered that it is now an historical interpretation. He asked if the Board would not approve the broken acorn pediment, would just the fluted pilasters be acceptable. Mr. Shaffer said that there were many examples of simple pilasters throughout the Borough, but that fluted pilasters are not typical of what was used in Gettysburg at the time this home was constructed. Both the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and the Gettysburg Design Guide advise against introducing new elements inconsistent with extant examples of the historic building stock, or what is documented to have existed, in the local community. Gettysburg's mid-nineteenth century townhomes did not employ Colonial-Style door surrounds. Those that currently exist on homes of this period in the Historic District are a direct result of the popularity of the Colonial Revival and the use of this style of door surround at 61 W. High Street would deliberately create a false sense of architectural history.

The general consensus of the Board was to use a simple door surround which emulates extant examples from the period of the home's construction with flat pilasters on the sides and a modest rectangular feature or closed pediment with visual weight above the door. Ms. LaBarre thanked the applicant for the submission of his application, explained the Department of the Interior's position on replacing historic elements, and offered to work with the applicant.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is a sensitive building over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Borough Historic District, and is therefore reviewable by the Board. Mr. Shaffer noted that the alterations are not supported by evidence of preexisting elements.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-17-0045) for the approval of the storm door via administrative approval, but deny the application (COA-17-0046) dated May 1, 2017 as submitted pending the resubmission and administrative approval of the project of the door surround and pediment prior to the June 12, 2017 Borough Council. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary with the following applicants, whereby Mr. Goble will assume the role as Chair.*

- B. COA-17-0047, Gettysburg Loyal Order of Moose Lodge #1526, – 414 York Street. Alteration - CRITICAL PROJECT.** In preparation for the change of use from retail to tavern/social club, reconfigure large picture window on the east elevation by decreasing the length of the window by a third; fill in a single window (east side rear) that is not original to the structure in the new kitchen prep area; and remove the exterior walls of the rear entry vestibule to create an enlarged “covered porch” as the rear entry to include a vertical lift as part of the accessible route to the “lodge area”.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the property is located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and is a sensitive structure that is over 50 years old. It is representative of the 20<sup>th</sup> century American Foursquare style, but has moderate to poor architectural integrity.

Ms. Shaffer and Mr. Hemler responded to Board questions on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Shaffer said that the large picture window would be shortened or blacked out. The rear porch will be extended across the back to include a vertical ADA lift that will serve as an accessible entry to the Lodge. He said that the kitchen windows may remain or filled-in. Mr. Hemler said that a T111 wood product, made with a plastic coating over top to resist moisture into the wood, would replicate the existing siding material.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the building is over 50 years old and is a critical project, because there will be significant changes to the building from the public view.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 414 York Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated May 2, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot, and carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention.

- C. COA-17-0048, Mike LeGay – 33 South Street. Alteration-CRITICAL PROJECT.** Perform exterior alterations to include: Remove existing storm windows and window sashes; replace existing windows with wood exterior windows; remove storm windows on front porch and install wood double hung windows; add side porch approximately 42 feet from the house with *Timbertek* brand decking and composite vinyl railing; add aluminum fencing between the new side porch and the garage; and remove the large side window and patio door and replace with new painted wood window and door.

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no representatives present for this application at this time, so it will be moved to the end of the agenda pending representation.

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.*

- D. COA-17-0054, Dave and Kathy Reid – 400 Baltimore Street, Reid’s Orchard Winery. Alteration-CRITICAL PROJECT. Erect a grapevine trellis at the rear of the property, begun without prior approval or permits but currently paused for appropriate review, to train existing plantings and provide shade to patrons.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and an update on permits for the grapevine trellis that would provide shade to patrons.

Mr. and Mrs. Reid gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mrs. Reid stated that they would erect a grape trellis decorated with lights to provide privacy and shade for their patrons. Mrs. LaBarre requested that this project be approved administratively.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend administrative approval of the trellis as a minor project by the Planning Director for the proposed work at 400 Baltimore Street as submitted in the materials and plans depicted in the application dated May 11, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

- E. COA-17-0056, Wendy Brubaker & Girl Scout Junior Troop #80096 – 208 Baltimore Street. Alteration – CRITICAL PROJECT. Retroactive approval of the erection of a “Blessing Box” kiosk, installed without prior approval or permits, to provide non-perishable food and toiletries items for the needy/homeless in the area, located on West High Street at the north side of the parking lot near the sidewalk.**

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and explained the application/COA approval process to Girl Scout Junior Troop #80096.

Ms. Brubaker gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that there are 11 girls in the Junior Girl Scout troop from Franklin Township Elementary School, and that they were looking for a sustainable project for their girls to provide to the community. She said that they began the “Agent of Change Journey” as their project by creating a “Blessing Box”, as seen on NBC Nightly News, to provide needed items to be retrieved by the homeless or struggling individuals in the community. She said that the girls presented their project to the Church Board and indicated an appropriate location. The troop members performed all of the labor including: weeding and prepping the flower bed, securing the materials, describing the construction process, and securing the donated items (pet food hygiene supplies, books, and canned food that are not provided at a food bank). She said that Schmuck’s Lumber donated the wood, and Gettysburg Glass discounted the Plexiglas. She said that Len Dick would provide lettering for the door, and the Gettysburg Presbyterian Church would provide a place to store the donated items. She noted that the box was constructed with pretreated lumber and covered with polyurethane. She said that troop members would mulch and place flowers around the box, and clean up the surrounding area and parking lot. She said that the girls provided over 20 hours of service, and that donations (excluding glass

items) could be made through the church earmarked for the “Blessing Box”. She introduced Mr. Gardner, and stated that the box through the local missions community.

Mr. Malot asked if the box was built within the right-of-way, and Mr. Shaffer said that it was built on the edge of the build-to-line and does not extend over eight feet in height.

Ms. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend administrative approval for the proposed project at 208 Baltimore Street as submitted in the materials and plans depicted in the application dated May 16, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

Mrs. LaBarre explained to Ms. Brubaker and troop members that both a Land Use Permit and Sign Permit are required, and must be submitted by May 19, 2017. Mr. Malot said that his company, the Pennsylvania Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA) has supported both Boy Scout and Girl Scout troops throughout the Commonwealth, and will donate the cost of the permits. Ms. Brubaker said that the cost of project supplies are raised through Girl Scout Cookie money.

#### **C. COA-17-0048, Mike LeGay – 33 South Street. Alteration-CRITICAL PROJECT**

Mr. Shaffer said that the application is still not represented at the end of the New Business portion of the meeting.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to deny COA-17-0048, Mike LeGay at 33 South Street, because the application dated April 21, 2017 as submitted was not represented at the meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried. 6-to-0.

### **Reports**

#### **A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting**

- **COA-17-0040, Adams County Farmers Market Association – 103 Carlisle Street , Transit Center SIGN/BANNER:** Non-structural alterations to existing enclosed porch at rear elevation, not visible from the public way; removal of exterior cladding to open up porch as originally constructed, removal of existing floorboards, replacement with pressure-treated lumber
- **COA-17-0041, Andrea Reichert – 154 E. Middle Street**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/FENCE: Erection of 6-foot high wood picket fence at west side of property, not visible from public right of way, in same materials as previously approved via Certificate of Appropriateness COA-16-0020 issued 4/8/2016
- **COA-17-0042, Teeter, Teeter & Teeter – 108 W. Middle Street**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT IN KIND: Removal of existing asphalt shingles on mansard roof, replacement with GAF SlateLine Limited Lifeline architectural fiberglass shingles in Antique Slate colorway

- **COA-17-0043, National Soldier Factory – 1 Steinwehr Avenue**  
SIGN: Erection of two business signs; 8.1 sf (43" w x 25"h) projecting sign on existing bracket and 6.7 SF (2.3' w x 2.8" h) two-sided portable sign for sidewalk
- **COA-17-0044, Gettysburg College – 209 N. Washington Street**  
MAJOR PROJECT/ REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of all existing rubber roofs, not visible from the public right of way; install 1" ISO insulation, Firestone .060 completely adhered EPDM roof system with all necessary flashings, .032 edgings and terminations. Remove existing built-in gutter on two sides, install 16 oz. copper w/ soldered joints.
- **COA-17-0045, Brandon & Valerie Stone – 61 W. High Street**  
CRITICAL PROJECT: Installation of LARSON Signature Full-View Tempered Glass Aluminum Storm Door in white colorway at High Street entrance; exact same door as previously approved by HARB for entrances at 333 and 400 Baltimore Street
- **COA-17-0049, Gettysburg Scattered Sites – 32 N. Stratton Street**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of rotted wood siding on dormer located at third floor on west elevation; replace with new Dutchlap wood siding and paint to match existing
- **COA-17-0050, Gettysburg College – 239 N. Washington Street, Intercultural Resource Center** CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal dormer soffits, fascia, and siding on principal façade - replace all with materials in-kind; removal of existing shingles at principal facade and metal roof at rear elevation (not visible from public way), replace all with GAF Timberline HD architectural shingles and related roofing accessories.
- **COA-17-0051, Rebecca Brown – 783-785 Baltimore Street, Civil War Tails Museum**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repair of porch roof to include:
  - Replace porch roof (roll-roofing) with same or equivalent materials (TAMKO SACAP-Shadow Grey [PN:52045] and TAMKO SA BASE [PN:52046])
  - Replace damaged framing with same or equivalent materials: 2 x 6 rafters, double 2 x 12 beam
  - Replace sheathing with 3/4" exterior plywood as preparation for the roll-roofing to provide a smooth base
  - Replace existing K-gutter with 5" or 6" half-round gutter, painted white
- **COA-17-0052, Aaron Re – 11 Steinwehr Avenue, Jenni's Funhouse**  
SIGN: Erection of 6 sf (21" h x 36" w) hanging wall sign, mounted on existing hardware located on beam between porch posts.
- **COA-17-0053, Timbrel Wallace – 10 York Street, Nerd Herd**  
SIGN: Erection of 32 sf (8' w x 4'h) wall sign at center of front façade above entrance
- **COA-17-0055, William Lee Warner – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards** SIGN: Erection of two (2) wall-mounted business signs of commercial grade vinyl, 12 sf and 7.8 sf. Removal of wood portion of non-conforming roof sign at west, metal brackets to remain. Removal of existing signs on east gable.

**B. Pending Administrative Approvals**

- **COA-17-010, Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center) – 297 Steinwehr Avenue**  
SIGN: Erection of memorial wayside marker at southwest corner of property commemorating 1922 plane crash
- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**  
SIGN: Erection of \_\_\_\_ SF business sign

**C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

Mr. Shaffer discussed the “Drop Box” procedure and email notifications with the Board. Mrs. LaBarre advised the Board to add invite email to contacts and to follow the Drop Box steps, and that it would be an instant update.

**D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation**

Mrs. LaBarre discussed Board preparation and how HARB applications are processed.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that Historical Architectural Review Board change their operating procedure that requires that HARB applications be submitted three (3) weeks prior to the HARB monthly meeting date based on both the amount of time required and the lack of personnel needed to properly process applications. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

**1. Updates on 2017 HARB CLG Training and Public Programming Schedule**

Ms. LaBarre discussed the upcoming training and said that Board members could choose to attend the one- or two-day sessions on June 14-16, 2017 in Carlisle. She noted that scholarship money is available, and that members should let her know and could register online. She tabled the programming schedule.

**2. Nominations for 2017 HARB Historic Preservation Awards**

The Board discussed the upcoming awards and decided to present them in the fall of 2017. They discussed the possibility of considering painting projects.

**Other Business**

Mrs. LaBarre said that the following items will be tabled for next meeting:

- A. Review of Preservation Briefs/Technical Leaflets related to New Applications**
- B. Review of January 2017 Reading Assignment: *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions* by Michel R. Lefevre (1998) – Introduction & Chapter 1**



## Public Comment

**Steve LaBarre, 613 Baltimore Street**, suggested ways to highlight decisions, procedures and activities of HARB. He said to consider and clarify safety issues when considering HARB applications and streamline the review process. He suggested promoting public awareness of the application process so that the applicant is aware of what steps are needed in order to submit their application in a timely manner (brochures, website, and news article). He said that the Board needs to clarify its public perception.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant