



July 19, 2017
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved September 20, 2017

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, July 19, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle and Joan Hodges; Clem Malot, Borough Code Official; and Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation. Board member Phil Goble was absent. Also in attendance were: Daniel and Elizabeth Fetter representing 142 East Middle Street; and Melva Cockle, Linda Cockle, and Jose Barrera from Alam B Roofing, all representing 168 Carlisle Street.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were a few additional administrative approvals added to the current meeting agenda.

Mr. Malot made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the June 21, 2017 meeting as submitted. Seconded by Ms. Lingle. Motion carried 6-to-0.

Election of Recording Secretary

Mr. Shaffer requested that Council consider funding a Recording Secretary to the Board; but asked the Board to elect a Secretary to fill the position in order to take the minutes and do research. The Board discussed the position and the duties of the Secretary. Ms. Gustafson asked that Council recognize the importance of this position to the Board, the importance of accurate minutes, and that the Borough should finance it. Mr. Shaffer indicated that the Board has always had a Recording Secretary doing the minutes.

Ms. Lingle made the **motion** that the Board through its Chair meet with the Borough Manager to formally hire a part-time professional Administrative Assistant to assist the HARB Board with the recording of their meeting minutes. Seconded by Mr. McCabe. Motion carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer asked the Board rotate assuming the role as Secretary to record the minutes until the position is filled. He offered to take the minutes at the August 2017 meeting. He said that the intent of the HARB minutes is to create a legal record to support any decisions that are made during the meetings. Mrs. LaBarre said that she could continue to provide the background information to the Board.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, August 14, 2017.

A. COA-16-0068, Daniel and Elizabeth Fetter – 142 East Middle Street.

CRITICA PROJECT: Removal of existing two-over-two late nineteenth century replacement windows on stone house, restore mid-nineteenth century appearance of façade by installing new six-over-six wood windows as documented by historic photograph.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the property is located in the Historic District and is a sensitive structure over 50 years old. The home owner intends to replace windows and enclose the rear stairs, which is a design change since the approval at the last Council meeting.

Mr. Fetter gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He discussed the history of the house, and the depiction of both six-over-six and two-over-two window styles in the structure since the 1880s. He stated that he preferred using the earlier six-over-six style.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 142 E. Middle Street is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application, even though it has been considerably modified, and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles. The main building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District. He said that six-over-six windows were prevalent in a story-and-a-half structure, and that the proposal is consistent with the character of the house; but said that the two-over-two windows are currently in place.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the six-over six replacement windows at 142 East Middle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated May, 25, 2017. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-1.

Mr. Fetter discussed the enclosed stairwell in the rear addition on the structure. He said that the shingles will remain asphalt and that he would like to enclose the rear stairwell that is four-foot wide to match the building, and provide access for furniture to the second floor. Mrs. LaBarre said that any new additions like an additional window would require the submission of a new set of plans for approval. He presented the decking for the front steps. He said that the railings would match the siding or look like wood, but not vinyl material.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He that there is photographic evidence of a wood porch on the front of the building with steps to the side; and that the rear stairwell would match the structure, has limited visibility from the street, and that the outward appearance falls into the purview of the Board.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council amend a Certificate of Appropriateness previously approved to allow the enclosure of the rear stair with the addition of a window and a door matching the style in the rest of the addition; and that the front steps be approved in the presented configuration with a railing replicating a traditional wood design and not of a contemporary rail design at 142 East Middle Street. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

The Board agreed to provide Mr. Fetter with a picture for style reference, and was recommended to the Historic Gettysburg Adams County Architectural Salvage Warehouse on South Washington Street at Zerfing Alley for materials.

B. COA-17-0070, Melva Cockle – 168 Carlisle Street.
CRITICAL PROJECT: Removal of historic tin shingle roof, replacement with alternative material with similar appearance.

Mr. Shaffer acknowledged a letter from the Structural Engineering Resources, LLC provided by the applicant referencing the structural condition of the roof, noting that the roof was reported to have several leaks and was in extensive need of repair.

Ms. Linda Cockle on behalf of her mother, Melva Cockle, gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. She described the dire condition of her mother's leaking roof and the cost to repair it. Mr. Barrera, contractor for the applicant, detailed his plan to install a 28-gauge EVERLAST Corrugated Metal roof, including the removal and installation of roof materials, decking, and a new gutter system. Mr. Shaffer described the history of their structure with a multi-ribbed tin roof and those of other historic tin roofs in town; and he presented a pictorial presentation of Gettysburg's historical roofs relative to their preservation. Mr. Barrera intended to use a charcoal

gray color metal roof panel. The applicant would be open to installing asphalt shingles to save cost. Mr. Barrera said that he would use gray GAF architectural shingles with snow guards over a half-inch plywood decking if this substitute material was accepted.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the existing tile tin roof has a very flat appearance; and with age and painting, the tiles have become a very uniform plane leaving no strong vertical element. The applicant has provided evidence of roof tile failure and need to be replaced to protect the long-term viability of the structure. The owner and her representative have agreed to use architectural GAF style shingles that have been previously approved by the Board to save cost, and that the asphalt shingle pattern would reflect the character of the roof.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the tin tile roof at 168 Carlisle Street and replaced with an asphalt shingle roof. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson and carried 6-to-0.

New Business: Applications for Review

There were no applications eligible for full Board review submitted this month.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-17-0057, Monahan Funeral Home, COA-17-0057— 131 Carlisle Street**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing flat roof at rear of building, replace with new Firestone RubberGard EPDM SA rubber roofing system
- **COA-17-0059, Eduard Dias—262 South Washington Street**
CRITICAL PROJECT: Retroactive approval of residential re-roof; removal of existing shingles, install insulation board and new rubber roof at rear of sensitive building, not visible from public way
- **COA-17-0060, Gettysburg Investors LLC— 26 York Street**
SIGN: Erection of 7.5 SF (36" x 30") portable A-frame sign for sidewalk
- **COA-17-0061, Gettysburg Antiques & Militaria—13 Baltimore Street**
SIGN: Erection of 7.5 SF (36" x 30") portable A-frame sign for sidewalk
- **COA-17-0062, Loyal Order of the Moose Lodge #1526—414 York Street**
SIGN: Erection of 10'-7" freestanding sign with 13.32 SF (40" x 48") double-sided face, illuminated externally by awning above
- **COA-17-0063, Gettysburg United Methodist Church—34 West High Street**
SIGN: Erection of a 36 SF (76" h x 96" w) double-sided monument sign of foam core/expanded polystyrene (EPS) on two steel poles, installed without footer, mounted on landscape stone base

- **COA-17-0064, Board & Brush Gettysburg (Zachary & Erika Lease)—100 Buford Avenue, Suite E**
SIGN: Erection of four (4) business signs totaling 33.9 sf; 6 sf insert for existing wall-mounted business sign, three (3) 9.3 SF window decals
- **COA-17-0067, Sixeas Premier Marketing—346 York Street**
MINOR PROJECT: Removal of existing asphalt driveway, replace with concrete
- **COA-17-0071, Roy Coldsmith – 325 York Street**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new 4 ft high chain link fence at rear of property along southwestern boundary and Hudson Alley (southeast)
- **COA-17-0072, Harry Stokes – 38 West Middle Street**
MINOR PROJECT: Repair/stabilization of approx. 2'-0" high stone wall (former foundation of demolished carriage house) located at rear of property; dig and pour new footer, reinstall stone per historic configuration, and tuck point.
- **COA-17-0073, Times Square LLC – 19 Baltimore Street**
SIGN: Erection of 7.5 SF (24" wide x 45" high) portable A-frame sign for sidewalk
- **COA-17-0074, Brewery Products Company – 571 Steinwehr Avenue**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0075, Brewery Products Company – 217 Steinwehr Avenue**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0076, Brewery Products Company – 105 Steinwehr Avenue**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0077, Brewery Products Company – 89 Steinwehr Avenue**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0078, Brewery Products Company – 44 Steinwehr Avenue**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0079, Brewery Products Company – 401 Baltimore Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0080, Brewery Products Company – 2 Baltimore Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0081, Brewery Products Company – 35 Chambersburg Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0082, Brewery Products Company – 13 Chambersburg Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0083, Brewery Products Company – 28 Carlisle Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0084, Brewery Products Company – 402 York Street**
BANNER: Erection of 3' x 10' banner for Bike Week
- **COA-17-0085, 10 Hanover Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture

- **COA-17-0086, 400 Baltimore Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0087, 101 York Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0088, 99 Chambersburg Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0089, 1 Springs Avenue – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0090, 199 Carlisle Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0091, 101 Baltimore Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0092, 199 Baltimore Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0093, 511 Baltimore Street – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0094, 200 Steinwehr Avenue – Verizon Wireless**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of new antenna, radio box and fiber box/attach to existing traffic signal structure to create small cell site; all painted black to match fixture
- **COA-17-0095, 309 Baltimore Street – Shriver House Museum**
BANNER: Erection of a 24 SF (3' x 8') banner on principle façade
- **COA-17-0096, 141 W. Middle Street – Patrick & Sandra Luckenbaugh**
MINOR PROJECT: Change of use from two-family dwelling unit to one (1) tourist home/transient rental unit and one (1) long-term rental unit (RRUO); alterations not visible from public way - reconfigure porch, replace exterior stair to second floor, upgrade life-safety systems

- **COA-17-0097, 140 Baltimore Street – Adams County Library System**
MINOR PROJECT: Installation of two 8' long black metal benches at bottom of Baltimore Street stairs, ADA table on concrete slab on grass at High Street
- **COA-17-0098, 523 Baltimore Street – Erian Associates, Limited**
SIGN: Erection of two business signs for The Primitive Daughter; 1) 2 SF (23" x 24") wooden wall sign, and 2) (24" x 52") portable sign
- **COA-17-0099, 778 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Municipal Authority (GMA)**
MINOR PROJECT: Removal and replacement in-kind of six (6) Verizon Wireless telecommunications antenna on existing water tank
- **COA-17-0100, 501 York Street – Daniel Barnhart**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Install new asphalt shingles over existing shingle roof system
- **COA-17-0101, 150 North Third Street – Timely Place (Americana Souvenirs & Gifts)**
MINOR PROJECT: Removal of existing wood loading dock; construct new masonry dock with metal hand rail, repair existing masonry as needed
- **COA-17-0102, 329 Baltimore Street – Wendy Allen & Elaine Henderson (Lincoln into Art)**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of deteriorated shale and brick veneers on concrete steps, replace with material-in-kind

B. Pending Administrative Approvals

- **COA-17-010, Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center) – 297 Steinwehr Avenue**
SIGN: Erection of memorial wayside marker at southwest corner of property commemorating 1922 plane crash
- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**
SIGN: Erection of SF business sign
- **COA-17-0058, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards — 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112**
SIGN: Erection of 8 SF portable business sign

C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer had no report. Ms. Lingle said that there will be an educational speaker at the GAR Hall through the HGAC on August 15th discussing “Barns, Barns, Barns”, and on October 17th discussing “Boroughs, Towns and Villages of Adams County”. She inquired if attending those events would meet the HARB educational requirements. Mrs. LaBarre said that those events would meet the annual educational requirements needed by HARB members for SHIPO. Ms. Lingle also said that Ross Hetrick, President of the Thaddeus Stevens Society, will give a presentation on November 20th on the second Abolitionist Day; and other events by the HGAC appear on their website.

D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre discussed the following:

1. Highlights from the PS Statewide Conference on Heritage, June 14-16, 2017

Mrs. LaBarre attended the event on June 14th – 16th in Carlisle with three other Board members, and described the multifaceted aspect of historic preservation, building-sensitive materials, and their funding.

2. Updates on 2017 HARB CLG Training and Public Programming Schedule

Ms. LaBarre discussed the upcoming training and programming and encouraged Board members to attend those events in town. She said that members could email her with event details to provide to SHIPO for Board credit.

3. Nominations for 2017 HARB Historic Preservation Awards

The Board discussed the HARB Historic Preservation Awards and asked to table them for 2017, and present them in 2018. She said that she will prepare a list for Board review in January.

Other Business

Mrs. LaBarre said that she is reviewing the following items:

- A. Review of existing literature related to the Gettysburg Historic District, i.e. brochures. Mrs. LaBarre is currently reviewing the brochures, bilingual capability, and their mailing.
- B. Promoting advocacy and awareness; serialize the Gettysburg Design Guide in newspaper? Ms. Gustafson said that she would look into the possibility and the article size permitted for print.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:10 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant