



December 19, 2018
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved January 16, 2019

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, December 19, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of five (5) members were present. Those in attendance were **Board members:** Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Phil Goble, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Members:** Peggy Gustafson, and Colleen Lingle; **Others in Attendance:** Katherine Crandall and Reuben Kline representing 217 N. Stratton Street; Connor and Randy Phiel of the Gettysburg Anniversary Committee (GAC), representing 344 Baltimore Street; and Greg Pitzer of Greg N. Pitzer Builder, representing 127 N. Washington Street.

Call the Meeting to Order

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will not be used during tonight's meeting to enhance the presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at the previous meeting (11/28) can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, January 14, 2019.

Review of Agenda

There was one correction to the revised December 19, 2018 Business Meeting Agenda as presented which Chair Gary Shaffer noted that application COA-18-0117: 196 S. Stratton Street – Survivors for a storage frame addition in Part A Under **Old Business** was tabled until the January 16, 2019 HARB Business Meeting.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the November 28, 2018 Business Meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 5-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

A. COA-18-0016, 340 Baltimore Street – Future Stake, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Demolition of a sensitive building and foundation with grading and temporary stabilization of the site in preparation for new construction (separate application to follow).

The application was tabled until January 16, 2019 due to the absence of any representatives for the project.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

A. COA-18-0119: 344 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Anniversary Committee

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to rear elevation of a sensitive building, visible from the public way via School House Alley, to include: construction of a new ADA-compliant entrance with wood ramp to terminate a new brick landing pad, extension of existing concrete walkway, and replacement of two (2) existing windows.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project at 344 Baltimore Street as noted in her December 19, 2018 Business Meeting agenda. She noted that the building is a sensitive building in the public view way, and that the proposed materials are keeping with the standards set forth in the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and the *Secretary of the Interior Standards*. She said that it is a sensitive addition to a rear elevation that would allow public accessibility.

Mr. Connor Phiel and Mr. Randy Phiel represented the property on behalf of the owner, Gettysburg Anniversary Committee (GAC); and they gave a brief project presentation, presented drawings, and answered Board questions. Mr. Randy Phiel said that the Gettysburg Anniversary Committee (GAC) wanted to add an ADA wood access ramp to the rear of their office building with appropriate slope and handrails to accommodate access to patrons with mobility issues. He said that the GAC would like to remove two rear windows on the existing enclosed porch and create a new half-lite rear door with a glass panel in an existing color scheme relative to the rear access ramp that would give patrons with mobility issues and wheelchairs easier access to the building. Mr. Connor Phiel said that the existing walkway would be extended, and that the landscape around the walkway would be enhanced with plantings to semi-mask the ramp that would terminate at a new brick paver pad for rear parking at Schoolhouse Alley.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 344 Baltimore Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed permanent ramp installation is a critical project that would remove two rear windows and add a new door with materials that are not original to the structure.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed new rear door and ADA accessible ramp at 344 Baltimore Street as indicated with proposed materials in the application dated December 4, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 4-to-0, with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

B. COA-18-0120: 217 N. Stratton Street – Katherine Crandall & Reuben Kline

CRITICAL PROJECT: Construction of a new two-story, two-car detached garage at rear of lot, visible from the public way via Hazel Alley. Exterior to be clad in untreated natural cedar shakes with metal roof, either Classic Rib steel roof panel in "Charcoal" colorway or galvanized steel corrugated roof panel, white vinyl sliding windows at first floor and casement windows at clerestory, white carriage house-style steel paneled garage door, and half lite paneled man door.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project at 344 Baltimore Street as noted in her December 19, 2018 Business Meeting agenda. She said that the rear two-story detached garage is a new construction and would face Hazel Alley and be visible from the public view way. The exterior of the structure is to be clad in traditional cedar shakes with no color finish applied, will have a classic rib metal roof panel system in charcoal gray or galvanized steel, standard white vinyl casement windows and trimmed in semi-gloss white paint. The owners provided very detailed drawings, and their property was awarded a preservation award this past May.

Mr. Reuben Kline and Ms. Katherine Crandall, owners of the property, gave a brief project presentation and answered Board questions. He said that their current garage is full, and that they needed more space. He said that after careful consideration, he decided that an addition to the existing structure would be difficult and opted for a new construction. Mr. Shaffer said that even that the proposed building is new, the scope and design of the proposed project comes under the review right of this Board for historic compatibility to the neighborhood. Mr. Kline said that the proposed free-standing garage is approximately 50-70 feet from the house, and is slated to be 25 feet high. Mr. Kline said that he would like to improve the existing garage that is five feet away from the proposed building with a small matching shed roof. He said that the proposed building will be a nice structure consistent with the historic nature of the neighborhood.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project is a new free-standing detached building, and meets the zoning and height requirements of the zoning district. He said that the proposed project uses contemporary materials consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for new structures, and is relevant to other structures in the Hazel Alley neighborhood. Mrs. LaBarre asked the Board to consider the choice of roof styles: classic rib steel roof panel system or a galvanized steel corrugated roof panel system when contemplating their motion. Mr. Kline said that the choice of material would depend on cost, and said that the color way would be natural galvanized steel or charcoal gray.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 217 N. Stratton Street for the new construction of a detached rear garage that will face Hazel Alley for the design as presented with the understanding that the roof materials will be either multi-ribbed metal in a flat charcoal gray or the corrugated metal roof in the galvanized steel as submitted in the application dated November 28, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 5-to-0.

C. COA-18-0125: 127 N. Washington Street – Apex Holdings, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include removal of all but nine (9) historic two-over-two wood windows, install custom-sized vinyl replacement windows in existing openings with similar center mullion configuration; remove single one-over-one wood window from rear elevation at kitchen, replace with vinyl one-over-one window; rehabilitate historic wood windows visible from the public way via North Washington Street and install new storms as needed: five (5) on primary façade, two (2) located closest to the public way via North Washington Street at first and second floors on both the north and south facades for a total of nine (9) to be retained.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project at 127 N. Washington Street as noted in her December 19, 2018 Business Meeting agenda. She said that the proposed project would repair the original windows that are in plain view from the street, and to replace if needed the existing storm windows on the front façade. She said that the structure is from the late nineteenth century (1870s-1880s), of good integrity, and that a lot of the original features have been retained. She said that this is a rental property, and that most of the windows are operable; but that the applicant is seeking to replace the windows that are not viewable from the public view-way for energy efficiency. She said that the contractor had already purchased the windows in custom sizes for the project, and then inquired about building permits.

Mr. Greg Pitzer of Greg N. Pitzer Builder represented the property on behalf of the owner, Barry Cockley of Apex Realty Holdings LLC. He gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Pitzer said that the front windows are operable, but failing and not energy efficient. He said that the thirty-year-old storm windows are just old and should be replaced. Mr. Shaffer said that this type of window project is consistent with the window design elements on other structures in that neighborhood located in the Gettysburg Historic District; and that the application reflects what the Board is trying to achieve in the district: to maintain the design feature elements of historic windows of those buildings in the public view way. Mrs. LaBarre asked the Board to consider adding a munnion to the two over two windows to replicate the historic look of the divided lites of the Italianate structure.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project would be a permanent change to a sensitive Italianate building that is over 50 years old with Italianate window features from the late 19th Century, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District; and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 127 N. Washington Street is of good integrity with a few alterations to include the original windows and is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and therefore the proposed window installations on the front façade would replace a the materials that are original to the structure. He said that the proposed window project does follow the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for window maintenance; and that the application also asked for replacement windows for sections of the building that are not in the public view way and are consistent with other window projects approved by the Board in the Historic District.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 127 N. Washington Street for the proposed window installation project with the proposed materials as submitted in the application dated December 10, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 5-to-0.

Reports

Mr. Shaffer allowed the Board to review the administrative approvals made by the Department of Planning and Historic Preservation since HARB's last meeting on November 28, 2018, and answered related questions.

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-18-0111: 363 Buford Avenue – John R. & Sue A. Tanon**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system on sensitive building, replace w/ new GAF Timberline HD architectural shingles in "Hickory" colorway, install required underlayment, flashing, edges, ice/water shield, etc.
- **COA-18-0121: 322 Baltimore Street – Rodney G. Simpson**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof, replace with new GAF

Timberline HD architectural shingle system in "Charcoal" colorway with all required synthetic underlayments, flashings, edges, ice/water shields, vents, etc.

- **COA-18-0122: 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
BANNER: Erection of a 40sf (4' h x 10' l) vinyl banner on High Street side of church "Join Us! Christmas Eve 8:00pm" to be displayed for 10 days from 12/17-12/26/2018
- **COA-18-0123: 234 Chambersburg Street – Paul Caplener**
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of 16 linear feet of 6'-0" dog-eared pressure treated privacy fencing with one gate located beyond exist. parking pad approx. 15' from alley, visible from the public way via West Zerfing Alley

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer thanked Board members and staff for their attendance at the two HARB trainings this past month.

C. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre updated Board Members on the upcoming **CLG Training Opportunities at Borough Hall:**

- Traditional Building Webinar "Past, Present, and Future Uses of Exterior Shutters" on Tuesday December 4, 2018 from 2:00pm-3:00pm
- Webinar for Existing CLGs on Friday December 7, 2018 at 1:00pm-2:00pm

Mrs. La Barre is compiling information for her CLG report to include Board trainings. Mr. Shaffer told the Board that Holiday Tours also count toward their training credits.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed 5-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant