



October 17, 2018
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved November 28, 2018

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 18, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of five (5) members were present. Those in attendance were **Board members:** Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board members:** Jim McCabe, and Colleen Lingle; **Absent Staff member:** Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; **Others in Attendance:** Donald C. Walsh (Consistory Chairman) of the Trinity United Church of Christ representing 141 S. Stratton Street (Parsonage); Josh Gastley representing 19-21 Hanover Street; David Petters (Owner), Debbie Westmoreland (Designer), and Joe Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates (Architect), representing 2 Baltimore Street; Mike McKay and Anthony C. Barbera (Contractors) of Pyramid Construction Services, Inc., representing 343 Carlisle Street.

Call the Meeting to Order

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will not be used during tonight's meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at the previous meeting (8/15) can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Tuesday, November 13, 2018.

Review of Agenda

There were no additions or corrections to the October 17, 2018 Business Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the August 15, 2018 Business Meeting as submitted with the following correction: Change "Mr. Gustafson" to "Ms. Gustafson" in the 128 Chambersburg Street motion on page 4. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 5-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

HARB Minutes

October 17, 2018

Page 1 of 8

A. COA-18-0016, 340 Baltimore Street – Future Stake, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Demolition of a sensitive building and foundation with grading and temporary stabilization of the site in preparation for new construction (separate application to follow).

Mr. Shaffer said that there was no additional information regarding the proposed demolition at this time.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-18-0090, 141 S. Stratton Street – Trinity United Church of Christ (Parsonage)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include removal of twenty (20) deteriorated windows (some are old replacement windows, some are historic) and storms; replace all with new custom-sized Simonton 5500 white vinyl double-hung windows with grid on top to emulate existing divided lites; applicant is willing to replace windows on front façade with Marvin Ultimate wood clad if requested by Board.

Mr. Shaffer gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project as noted in October 15, 2018 Meeting Agenda. He noted that this sensitive structure known as the Parsonage was built sometime between 1924 and 1931; and had first appeared on the Borough's 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. He said that there had been additions to the building, but it had retained most of its original appearance. He said that the window replacement is a permanent change to the building, and is therefore reviewable by the Board. He noted that the Board considered a previous application for the replacement of windows in 2013; but after careful consideration by the Board, the application was withdrawn.

Mr. Donald Walsh gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the Church wanted to replace the 90-year old windows, and that the addition of aluminum storm windows in the 1950s contributed to their deterioration. He said that the current windows are warped with rotting sashes, rendering the windows inoperable. He proposed replacing all 20 reproduction windows with top-light only Simonton Pro Finish 5500 white vinyl windows, or clad-wood Mann windows. He said that the current storms trap moisture, and had contributed to their deterioration. The Church prefers the Simonton windows because they would fit into the existing window openings; and they have "weep holes" that would permit water drainage. He noted that the Simonton windows have the divided lights between the two panes of glass. He said that the condition of the east-facing windows (viewable from S. Stratton Street) are inoperable and rotting. He said that the goal of the Church is to replace all of the existing windows at once to reduce inconvenience to the Parsonage residents.

Mr. Shaffer said that the Board would consider replacement of windows on the north, west and south facades; but that the east façade would have to be restored. He noted that vinyl windows have a sharper edge and do not provide the shadow line of wood or clad windows with exterior muntins. He did not approve of the six-inch fill required by the Marvin window, composed of vinyl-clad wood. Mr. Malot said that the six-inch infill padding of the proposed Marvin windows could create a potential fire hazard.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view-way in the Gettysburg Historic District, and is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building at 141 S. Stratton Street is a contributing structure to the National Register Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed replacement windows would exchange materials for those not original to the structure, and is a critical project that is not in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of the existing windows on the north, south, and west facades and on porches with Simonton ProFinish 5500 white vinyl windows as submitted in the application dated September 20, 2018; and approving only reconstruction of the east-side front windows. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0.

B. COA-18-0095, 19-21 Hanover Street – Michael J. and Vickie V. Gastley

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove existing failing architectural shingle roof system on a sensitive building replace with multi-ribbed ABM metal panel system in “Ash Gray” colorway; building is a triplex, divided into three separate parcels (23 Hanover Street is owned by another party).

Mr. Shaffer gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project on a structure circa early 1920s and with a mixed degree of integrity with several additions including vinyl siding. He said that the structure is a three-unit building, and that the Gastleys own two of the units. He said that the structure is located in the Historic District, and that the proposed roof project includes a change of materials viewable from the public way, and is therefore reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Josh Gastley, son of the applicant, represented the property on behalf of the owner. He gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the current roof was replaced approximately 15 years ago, and that a metal roof was recommended to preserve the integrity of the structure. He said that the proposed multi-ribbed metal panel Galvalume roof system in “Ash Gray” colorway will be water tight from the neighboring shingle roof system; and would provide an easy transition if the neighbor wants to switch to a metal roof system in the future. He said that the existing damaged roof is causing interior damage to the structure. He noted that similar metal roof systems were installed in the Historic District on S. Washington Street and Steinwehr Avenue.

Mr. Gary Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public way in the Gettysburg Historic District, and is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 19-21 Hanover Street is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed permanent roof installation would replace a roof with materials that are not original to the structure.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of the existing metal roof system with the

proposed materials to include “Ash Gray” colorway as submitted in the application dated September 25, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 5-to-0.

C. COA-18-0096, 2 Baltimore Street – Kadel, LLC (Blue & Gray, Bar & Grill)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include construction of a new ADA ramp and stairs to access restaurant entrance at the corner of Lincoln Square and Baltimore Street (2 Baltimore Street); install decorative wrought iron railings at new ramp/stairs; basement stairs and residential entry at 13 Lincoln Square on north elevation, replacing non-compliant existing three-bar railing system.

Mr. Shaffer gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project on a structure that was built in 1854, has undergone numerous alterations to a historic Civil War structure, and has a long history as a restaurant and commercial building. He said that the proposed changes to this sensitive building is a permanent change to a structure in the public view way, and therefore is reviewable by the Board.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair.

Mr. Joe Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates, and Ms. Westmoreland represent the property on behalf of the owner, Mr. Petters. He gave a brief presentation, and along with Mr. Petters, answered Board questions. He said that Mr. Petters would like to install an ADA accessible ramp on the Baltimore Street side with a new landing, decorative railing and stairs to access the main entrance of the restaurant; and also proposed replacing the front double doors with a compliant single door with side light. He also proposed the replacement of the three-bar railing to the basement with a decorative railing to match the proposed ramp railing. He said that the proposed ramp is located in the Penn DOT right-of-way, but will relinquish review of construction to the Borough under direction of the Borough Engineer for the proposed work between the Baltimore Street curb and the building façade. Mr. Malot said that any permits would have to go through the Penn DOT approval process. Ms. Hodges asked if there was a less intricate “scroll” railing, and Ms. Westmoreland, an interior designer, replied that the scroll work was carefully selected for the proposed railing to maintain the architectural presence of the building. Mr. Petters said that the proposed ramp would be heated to facilitate ice and snow removal in the winter months.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 2 Baltimore Street is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed ADA entry ramp with railings and door installation would replace a the materials that are not original to the structure.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 2 Baltimore Street for the proposed addition of the ADA access ramp with decorative railing and the replacement of the existing double doors with the proposed

materials as submitted in the application dated September 26, 2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 4-to-0 with 1 abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

D. COA-18-0097, 343 Carlisle Street – Phi Sigma Kappa Fraternity

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include replacement of existing deteriorated wood porch floorboards with Trex composite decking, temporarily removing historic wood columns during work; remove and replace historic wood railings and balusters with substitute material like Trex or similar low-maintenance product.

Mr. Shaffer gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project on a structure that was built in 1917, and was the former home of local Baseball Hall-of-Famer, Eddie Plank; and that Phi Kappa Sigma Fraternity purchased the home in 1925 and it remains a fraternity to date. He said the proposed changes to the existing porch decking, hand railings, and porch pillars constitute a permanent change to a sensitive building, and therefore is reviewable by this Board.

Mr. Mike McKay of Pyramid Construction and Mr. Anthony Barbera are both Gettysburg College alumni and Phi Kappa Sigma Fraternity brothers represented the property on behalf of the fraternity. Mr. Barbera gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that Gettysburg College had just rented the building from the fraternal organization this year, and that the porch desperately needs to be repaired due to water damage and rotting. He said that the proposed porch project includes: replacing the existing porch decking with Battleship Grey Aeritus Heritage Porch Flooring; replacing the existing hand railings and balusters with white Pyramid hand rails and balusters; and to patch and repaint in white the existing pillars, but would like to replace them with synthetic wood to prevent rot. He said that he is interested in donating the existing pillars and railings to the Architectural Warehouse.

Mr. Gary Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view-way in the Gettysburg Historic District, and is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 343 Carlisle Street is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed permanent porch project would replace materials that are not original to the structure.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 343 Carlisle Street-Phi Sigma Kappa Fraternity for the proposed replacement of the existing porch as amended to indicate replacement columns and natural wood railings as submitted in the application dated September 28, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 5-to-0.

Reports

Mr. Shaffer allowed the Board to review the administrative approvals made by the Department of Planning and Historic Preservation since HARB's last meeting on August 15, 2018, and answered related questions.

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-18-0080: 34 W. Middle Street – PR Properties**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing rubber roof system, replace with 0.60 mil EPDM rubber roofing system and all related edges, flashings, etc
- **COA-18-0081: 51 Chambersburg Street – Gilbert Pringle/Tim Thammavongsa (Tim Thai 2)** SIGN: Replace existing 5.3sf (24" x 32") double-sided projecting wood business sign mounted on existing bracket in-kind with new restaurant name "Tim Thai 2"
- **COA-18-0082: 619 Baltimore Street – Erian Assoc. Ltd. Partnership/Jeff Jurkowski (The Hoof, Fin & Fowl)** SIGN: Erection of a new 16 sf (4' x 4') MDO wall sign for "The Hoof, Fin, & Fowl" mounted directly to CMU on primary façade.
- **COA-18-0083: 687 York Street – Kenneth E. Cline (K & W Tire)**
CRITICAL PROJECT: Expand existing garage door opening and add windows around warehouse space as presented in application submitted 8/24/2018
- **COA-18-0084: 125-127 Chambersburg Street – PA United General Contractors, Inc.**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing shingle roof system, replace with GAF Timberline architectural shingles in "Heather Blend" colorway with all necessary underlayments, flashings, edges, vents, etc.
- **COA-18-0085: 22 Carlisle Street – 22 Carlisle Street Gettysburg, LLC**
MINOR PROJECT: Installation of two (2) ductless mini-split A/C units through exterior wall on rear elevation, mounted between existing porches
- **COA-18-0086: 131 S. Washington Street – Suzanne K. Merkey & Gary Casteel**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing deteriorated shingle roof system, replace with GAF Timberline HD 30-year architectural shingles in "Williamsburg Slate" colorway with all necessary underlayments, flashings, edges, vents, etc.
- **COA-18-0089: 369 York Street – Spontaneous Holdings, LLC**
SIGN: Erection of a 10.26 SF (1.71'h x 6' w) monument sign for "Keller Williams Keystone Realty" in front yard of York Street elevation
- **COA-18-0093: 37 South Street – Jon R. & Karen H. Shultz**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing shingle porch roof, floorboards, gutters, and corrugated vinyl skirting on a sensitive building; replace roof with new GAF Timberline HD shingle system in similar colorway, install new white half round gutter, painted mahogany 1 x 4 decking, and vinyl lattice. Build new bases around existing columns. Wood porch sides to be temporarily removed during work then re-installed.
- **COA-18-0094: 19 Hanover Street – Michael J. & Vickie V. Gastley**
CRITICAL PROJECT/ REPLACEMENT IN-KIND: Remove brittle/deteriorated white vinyl siding on a sensitive building - west elevation ONLY, replace with material in-kind
- **COA-18-0098: 46 York Street – White Orchid Enterprise, LLC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Replace rubber and shingle roof on a

sensitive building with Firestone 0.60 mil EDPM rubber membrane and GAF Timberline HD architectural shingles in similar colorway as existing

- **COA-18-0099: 122 Baltimore Street – Donahue & Doll Property Management Group**
CRITICAL PROJECT: Installation of required emergency lighting above exterior doors on west, south and east elevations, visible from the public way via Baltimore Street and East Legion Alley; three (3) Econolight E-XHL Series LED double-head remote fixtures in grey colorway.
- **COA-18-0100: 603 S. Washington Street – 2FGB, LLC (Foursquare Beer Company)**
BANNER: Erection of a 42.25sf (6.5f h x 6.5f l) vinyl promotional banner "Coming Soon - Fourscore Beer Co." to be displayed on Gettys Street façade for 90 consecutive days from 9/28/2018-12/28/2018
- **COA-18-0102: 131 Carlisle Street – Monahan Realty Company et al**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing flat roof at rear of building, replace with new Firestone RubberGard EPDM SA rubber roofing system
- **COA-18-0103: 165-167 N. Stratton Street – AJY Properties, LLC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove deteriorated porch floorboards, replace with tongue and groove 1x4 Asian mahogany-type wood decking manufactured by Blue Shield
-

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer said that a live webinar on "Historic Shutters" by *Traditional Building and Period Home* will be held on December 4, 2018; and that the next HARB Business Meeting will be held on the fourth Wednesday, November 28, 2018 at 7 PM to avoid interference the Thanksgiving holiday travel. Ms. Gustafson discussed window restoration with the Board, and said that the video that could be used as a training tool for HARB members and the public.

C. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

No report.

Other Business

- A.** Mr. Shaffer updated the Board on the proposed Revisions to the Chapter 27, Zoning Ordinance including Section 8A: Residential Office Redevelopment District (ROR), which have been published for review. A **Public Hearing is scheduled for Monday October 22, 2018 at 6:30 PM in Council Chambers.** Proposed changes from original draft ordinance language include:
- Retaining of 45 feet maximum building height in R-1, R-1A and R-2 zoning districts
 - Removal of Single-family attached dwellings, Single-family semidetached dwellings, and Two-family dwelling from list of uses permitted by right in Section 27-8A02
 - Change maximum height with incentives in the ROR District to 72 feet plus 12 feet for mechanicals with 24 feet granted for internal parking, 12 feet for relocation of transit

center/public restrooms, 24 feet for public green space, and 12 feet for Gettysburg Inner Loop.

He encouraged Board members to write or email any considerations to Council prior to the scheduled hearing.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed 5-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:05 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant