



August 15, 2018
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved October 17, 2018

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 18, 2018. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) members were present. Those in attendance were **Board members**: Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble, and Colleen Lingle; Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager for PA Municipal Code Alliance, participating as a non-voting advisory role; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board member**: Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance. **Others in Attendance**: Borough Code Enforcement Officer John Gereny from PA Municipal Code Alliance; Todd Mickley of Bases Loaded (Gettysburg Souvenir Shop) representing 213 Steinwehr Avenue; and Tyler Shaffer of SPG Capital representing 128 Chambersburg Street.

Call the Meeting to Order

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 10, 2018.

Review of Agenda

There were no additions or corrections to the August 15, 2018 Business Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the July 18, 2018 Business Meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle, and carried 5-to-0 (Ms. Gustafson was not present at this time due to a prior commitment).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

A. COA-18-0016, 340 Baltimore Street – Future Stake, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Demolition of a sensitive building and foundation with grading and temporary stabilization of the site in preparation for new construction (separate application to follow).

Mrs. LaBarre said that there was no additional information regarding the proposed demolition at this time; but that the project contractor, Mr. Austin, had informed her that property owner Mr. Shields had advised him to take a “month off because of the intensity of the issue” before proceeding with any more work. Mrs. LaBarre hopes to have more to report next month.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-18-0056, 213 Steinwehr Avenue – Bases Loaded (Gettysburg Souvenir Shop)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Full roof overlay to cover the existing-shingle roof system with a 0.26 gage Galvalume corrugated powder-coated metal roof panel system in a “Charcoal” colorway

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project as noted in her August 15, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the structure is a sensitive building of moderate historical integrity, and is a contributing structure in the National Historic District. She noted that the building had housed the past “Conflict Theater”. She said that it had appeared as a residential duplex on the Sanborn Fire Maps in 1931, and that the existing materials are not original to the structure. She said that the Secretary of the Interior frowns on removing historic metal roofs unless they are deteriorated to the point rendering them not serviceable. She said that the applicant had requested replacing the existing roof on this structure with alternate materials due to the roof’s deteriorating conditions.

Mr. Mickley gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that high winds removed a large section of shingles on the roof followed by a rain storm, causing damage to the roof. He said that his roofing contractor had advised him to replace the entire aging roof system; and he looked to replace the existing shingle roof system with a more durable 0.26.gage Galvalume corrugated powder-coated charcoal-color metal roof system to prevent further water damage. He said that there are other buildings with metal roofs on Steinwehr Avenue, and that this type of roof has a life-time guarantee. He said that his roofer proposed a metal overlay over existing shingles affixed over batton boards to allow the roof to breathe; and that the roof would include snowbirds.

Mr. Shaffer said that the windows on the first floor were not original to the structure. He said that the portico roof addition on the front portion of the pyramidal roof was probably constructed during the 1963 Civil War Battle Anniversary year, and was not part of the original roof that appeared on the duplex structure that was evident on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Maps. He did say that the change in roof materials is what makes this project reviewable by the Board. Mrs. LaBarre said that the purview of this critical project by the Board is consistent with the Historic District ordinance.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view-way in the 1999 Extension of the Gettysburg Historic District, and is reviewable by

this Board. He said that the structure at 213 Steinwehr Avenue is a contributing structure to the National Register Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed permanent roof work that would exchange materials for those not original to the structure is a critical project done in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of the existing shingle roof system with a corrugated powder-coated metal panel roof system at 213 Steinwehr Avenue-the Bases Loaded (Gettysburg Souvenir Shop), as submitted in the application dated July 12, 2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0.

Mrs. LaBarre said that once the COA is approved by Borough Council, the roof project would undergo Uniform Construction Code (UCC) review from PMCA for renovations to a commercial building.

B. COA-18-0087, 128-130 Chambersburg Street – SPG Capital, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT / REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Restoration of two (2) historic two-over-two wood windows at the eastern end of the primary façade on the first and second stories; removal of the remaining four (4) deteriorated windows, and replace in-kind with new double pane wood windows

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description of this critical project that is also a replacement-in-kind as noted in her August 15, 2018 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the structure is a sensitive building of Italianate architectural style, possibly built sometime between the years 1872-1886. She said that it appeared on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Map, and had a rear carriage house at that time. She said that the structure probably had shutters with two-over-two Italianate-style windows; and that the current windows could be original or very close to it. She said that the current state of the Chambersburg Street facade retains much of its integrity, but noted that the applicant will address the deterioration of the existing windows.

Mr. Tyler Shaffer, applicant, represents the property on behalf of the owner, SPG Capital. He gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the current condition of the entire building, particularly the wood windows is due to neglect by prior owners, and that they have sustained severe water damage. He said that the applicant would like to restore the two wood windows on the second and third stories on the far-left east front façade of the building with new in-kind materials; and remove/replace the four deteriorated double pane two-over-two wood windows on the far west side on those same levels with new Marvin two-over-two in-kind style wood windows. He said that the windows is Phase One of the total building restoration project. Mrs. LaBarre said that the applicant is returning the building, which had been previously divided into five apartments, back into a luxury single-family home.

Mr. Gary Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view-way in the Gettysburg Historic District, and is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 128 Chambersburg Street is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed permanent

window project, that would replace wooden windows with materials that are not original to the structure, is a critical project done in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed restoration of two historic two-over-two wood windows at the eastern end of the primary façade on the second and third stories; and the removal of the remaining four deteriorated wood windows, and replace them with in-kind two-over-two Marvin wood or clad wood windows at 128 Chambersburg Street, as submitted in the application dated August 7, 2018.

The Board discussed their motion, reviewing the historic appropriateness of wood windows vs. wood-clad windows on the front facades of structures in the Historic District. After careful discussion, Ms. Gustafson withdrew her motion as presented, noting the intent to eliminate “clad wood”. Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant would consider using wood replacement windows that replicated the existing windows.

Mr. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed restoration of two historic two-over-two wood windows at the eastern end of the primary façade on the second and third stories; and the removal of the remaining four deteriorated wood windows, and replace them with in-kind two-over-two Marvin wood windows at 128 Chambersburg Street, as submitted in the application dated August 7, 2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-1 (with Chairman Gary Shaffer dissenting).

Chairman Shaffer explained his reason for dissenting. He said that wood windows carry no guarantee from many of the major window manufacturers today, with no recourse for the owner should they need to be replaced; and that the Board has allowed wood-clad windows and vinyl windows in the Historic District if not located on the front façade and viewable from the streetscape.

Reports

Mrs. LaBarre allowed the Board to review the administrative approvals made by the Department of Planning and Historic Preservation since HARB's last meeting on July 18, 2018, and answered related questions.

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-18-0071: 102 W. Middle Street – Bardo Duncan, LLC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to historic porch on a sensitive building to include lifting sagging porch roof back to proper elevation/re-securing to building façade, cut out and replace rotted section of wood on post, repair existing railings and balusters, and repair damaged soffit and gutter.
- **COA-18-0072: 144 W. Middle Street – Suzanne Snook**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system; replace with GAF Timberline HD shingle system in similar gray colorway with all related underlayments, ice/water shields, edges, vents, flashings, etc. as presented.

- **COA-18-0073: 120-122 Carlisle Street – SPC Capital, LLC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to porch of sensitive building to include removal of two (2) 3'-0" wide sections of deteriorated floorboards; replace with pine tongue-and-groove and paint to match existing.
- **COA-18-0074: 146 Breckenridge St – Aaron & Beth McKinley**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to porch of sensitive building to include removal of deteriorated floorboards; replace with 1 x 4 pine tongue-and-groove and paint to match existing; other repairs to porch components as needed; repairs to existing fence and gate.
- **COA-18-0075: 49 Steinwehr Avenue – L & SW Enterprises, Inc.**
MAJOR PROJECT: Paving and striping of an existing gravel parking lot at rear of parcel; beautification of walkway to the south, between sensitive buildings, 49 and 51 Steinwehr Avenue, to include paving, new plantings, installation of lighting, small section of 68" wood fencing, ADA ramp, and (3) benches; install two (2) bike racks on abandoned driveway at curb.
- **COA-18-0076: 62 Chambersburg Street – Redd Up Properties**
SIGN: Erection of a 40sf (4' x 10') 0.63 aluminum wall sign for "Battlefield Brew Works" on west façade, visible from the public way via North Washington Street.
- **COA-18-0077: 316 N. Stratton Street – Corinna A. Matijevic**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing shingle roof system; replace with GAF Timberline HD Shingles in similar colorway with all necessary underlayments, flashings, edges, vents, etc.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer discussed with the Board his presentation to Borough Council at their August 13, 2018 Public Hearing that addressed the proposed increased building height in the ROR Residential Office Redevelopment zoning district. He said that Evan Keyser, a rising junior student at Gettysburg Senior High School, assisted with the building height graphics. Mr. Shaffer's presentation captured the building height disparity in the Carlisle Street/North Stratton Street Historic District corridor where the parcel intended for development is located; and explained how the increased building height would jeopardize the historical integrity and character of the town. Ms. Gustafson recounted from that meeting the depiction by Borough resident Roger Goodacre of the building height increase by visualizing a second International Church of the Four Square Gospel located at 344 W. Middle Street on top of itself. Mrs. LaBarre said that Borough Council is still accepting comments relative to the suggested height changes in the official draft proposal for the ROR zoning district; that the document is currently available for review on the Borough's website.

C. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre encouraged the Board to aggressively complete their training hours prior to the end of the year. She said that Board members can access more training opportunities by viewing webinars either as a group or individually on their home personal computers. The Board discussed various training webinars from both the *Preservation Leadership Forum* and the *Traditional Building and Period Home* that would fulfill those training requirements.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant