



**August 16, 2017**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
*Approved November 15, 2017*

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 16, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, Vice-Chair Philip Goble and Colleen Lingle; and Gettysburg Building Code Official, Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA); Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation. Also in attendance were: Tim Mummert of Gary L. Mummert Builder, Inc. – Mummert Enterprises and owner Steven Garvick, both representing 55 Chambersburg Street; and Everette Tallent of 811 Johns Avenue.

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

There were two additions to the meeting agenda under Item 8, Reports D, Report of Staff: a reappointment item, and an item related to the Certified Local Government Program was amended.

The minutes from the July 19, 2017 meeting were tabled pending completion and submission for review.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 11, 2017.

**Old Business**

There were no tabled applications for review at this time.

- A. COA-17-0112, 53-55 Chambersburg Street – Steven and Deborah Garvick**  
**CRITICAL PROJECT:** Removal of six (6) existing one-over-one windows on the principal (south) façade at second story only; install one-over-one Marvin Integrity aluminum-clad wood replacement windows in original openings; restore central bay window by removing A/C unit and replicating missing millwork in wood and substitute PVC materials *Versatex* and *Fypon*; paint all to match; repair soffit, fascia, and downspouts as needed.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the work on the two-story brick masonry structure will include: replace six (6), single pane one-over-one second-floor windows on the front principal façade; reconstruct the second-floor windows with aluminum clad wood windows of a similar configuration and install in the original openings; replace the existing awning; repair the millwork on the center bay window, repair/replace the deteriorated wood trim with a wood substitute alternate material; remove the through-wall A/C unit; repair to the soffit, fascia, gutters and downspouts as needed; paint all woodwork and trim pieces as needed upon completion. She said that this building was adjacent to the former Eagle Hotel, and had shared a “party wall” with that establishment as depicted in pictures/postcard from the 1920s provided by the applicant. She said that the building was constructed sometime between 1891 and 1896 according to the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, depicting a two-story brick building set back from Chambersburg Street. She said that the building’s current configuration is shown in the 1896, 1902, 1907, 1912, and 1924 Sanborn Fire Maps, and has not changed from its depiction for decades. She said that the building is classified as a sensitive structure (being more than 50 years of age), and has moderate to good architectural integrity. She said that the building had been changed over the years, noting: the party wall shared with the former Eagle Hotel is clad with fiber cement, and that the current brick is mid-20<sup>th</sup> century veneer that had been painted.

Mr. Mummert and Mr. Garvick gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Mummert said that pooling water had damaged the structure and especially the bay over time, and that the spouting must be addressed to address the water damage. He emphasized that all architectural alterations will be historically correct, noting that the window moldings are painted shut; but their work will uncover a beautiful building. He will also remove the through-wall A/C unit, and replace the windows with architecturally correct Marvin windows, used most recently by the Gettysburg Hotel. He said that they plan to reverse the color schemes of the building with the windows and the bay painted white, and façade painted a contrasting off-white color. He said that the detail work on the soffits and molding will be preserved and enhanced. He said that they plan to eliminate the two top 1960s-style vents; noting that they do not serve a purpose (providing for the in-out movement of air, especially regarding bathroom ventilation), but would use a *Versatex* soffit if needed to reduce moisture and provide complete circulation. He said that they would implement a historic downspout. He said that the current awnings would be replaced by canvas awnings, perhaps using two-color striped awnings. He said that a pedestrian scaffolding system would be used during construction, and requested that the front tree be trimmed to facilitate work. He said that the job would be completed in 28 days from start to finish.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 53-55 Chambersburg Street is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of*

*Ordinances*, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application, even though it has been considerably modified, and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles. The main building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District, and is of high architectural integrity. He said the proposed alterations are needed to restore elements of the structure that are deteriorated beyond repair, and that the alterations are consistent with the character of the building.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 53-55 Chambersburg Street as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0.

## **Reports**

### **A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting**

- **COA-17-0103, 53 E. Middle Street – Historic Gettysburg Adams County (HGAC)**  
MINOR PROJECT: Remove two (2) existing A/C units on roof, replace with one (1) Goodman 5 ton unit 16 see model GSX160611F, etc.; construct platform/catwalk of pressure treated wood encased in metal/rubberized; related mechanical/plumbing/electrical work
- **COA-17-0104, 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Christian Church**  
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of a 30" h x 36" w x 12" d "Blessing Box" on High Street (south) façade; constructed of T-11 plywood with shingle roof and Plexiglas doors, two (2) interior shelves
- **COA-17-0105, 137 S. Washington Street – Paula Olinger**  
MINOR PROJECT/FENCE: Erection of 5' high black aluminum fence w/ two (2) gates in rear yard at south side of house, design is "Bunting" by On Guard Fence Systems
- **COA-17-0106, 155 S. Washington Street—Paula Olinger**  
MINOR PROJECT/FENCE: Removal of existing chain link fence at rear (west) end of lot, install 6' high pressure treated 1 x 6 dog ear privacy fence to shield view of adjacent parking lot
- **COA-17-0107, 156 York Street—Lynn Smallwood**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing asphalt shingles, replace in-kind with Timberline HD architectural in similar colorway; install new synthetic underlayment, ice/water shield, drip edge, vent system, collars, flashing, etc.
- **COA-17-0109, 317-319 N. Stratton Street—Burnell Meckley**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing asphalt shingles on house and garage roofs (excluding porch), replace in-kind with Timberline HD High Definition Shingles in "Slate" colorway; install new felt paper underlayment, ice/water shield, drip edge, vent system, chimney and pipe boots, flashing, etc.
- **COA-17-0110, 51 E. Stevens Street—SPG Capital, LLC**  
MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove approx. 6' of deteriorated porch floorboards, replace with material in-kind (pine tongue-and-groove) and paint to match surrounding floor

- **COA-17-0113, 55 Chambersburg Street—Steven & Deborah Garvick**  
MINOR PROJECT: Erection of pedestrian-accessible scaffolding over sidewalk for restoration work at second floor; vendor is Safeway Services, LLC

**B. Pending Administrative Approval**

- **COA-17-0010, Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center) – 297 Steinwehr Avenue**
- SIGN: Erection of memorial wayside marker at southwest corner of property commemorating 1922 plane crash
- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**  
SIGN: Erection of \_\_\_\_ SF business sign
- **COA-17-0058, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards— 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112**  
SIGN: Erection of 8 SF portable business sign
- **COA-17-0108, Artworks—30 York Street**  
SIGN: Erection of projecting \_\_\_\_SF business sign
- **COA-17-0111, Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc.— 89 Steinwehr Avenue (ROW)**  
MINOR PROJECT/SIGN: Install custom vinyl wrap for municipal electrical box w/ branding for Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Business Improvement District

**C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

Mr. Shaffer had no report.

**D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation**

Mrs. LaBarre discussed the following topics with the Board:

- **HARB Reappointments for Terms Expiring August 2017**
  - Clem Malot re-appointed 8/14/2017, new term to expire August, 2022
  - Colleen Lingle re-appointment tabled for one month, vote to take place on 9/11/2017
- **Brief Review of Certified Local Government Meeting**  
She said that the meeting with Zach Bolitho, Chief, Resource Management for Gettysburg National Military Park and Eisenhower National Historic Site, took place on 8/16/2017.

**Other Business**

Mrs. LaBarre updated the Board on the following items:

**A. The process for Serializing the *Gettysburg Design Guide in the Times* - Peggy Gustafson**

Ms. Gustafson updated the Board on the proposed *Gettysburg Times* monthly HARB newspaper serial historic property feature, and the desired monthly content promoting historic advocacy and property awareness in the Gettysburg Borough Historic District. She said that she had contacted Holly Fletcher, Assistant Editor/Newspapers in Education Coordinator, to discuss the possibility of tackling basic structural projects encountered by property owners in the Historic District in a monthly news article format. She said that each article would capture step-by-step the “How to Do’s” exemplified in the Gettysburg Design Guide for the

“Do-It-Your-Selfer” in a 400 to 600 word limit format with a one-to-two week publication deadline. She suggested that the first article could introduce the Historic District ordinance and the responsibilities of the HARB Board. Ms. Gustafson said that she would further update the Board as information becomes available.

**B. Discussion of HARB Reading Assignment: Introduction & Chapter 1 of *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions***

Mrs. LaBarre tabled the discussion of the board reading assignment: Chapters 2-3 of *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions* until the next meeting.

**Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:25 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant, and  
Gary Shaffer  
Gettysburg Borough HARB Chair