

November 15, 2017 Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes Borough of Gettysburg

Approved December 20, 2017

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, November 15, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Joan Hodges, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Board member Philip Goble was absent. Also in attendance were: Roger Lund, Owner of The Christmas Haus, representing 11-13 Baltimore Street; and John Buchheister, Owner of the Maryland Sutler, representing 250 Baltimore Street.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections added to the current meeting agenda.

Ms. Lingle made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the August 16, 2017 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe, and carried 6-to-0.

Ms. Lingle made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the October 18, 2017 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot, and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

There were no tabled applications for review at this time.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to

HARB Minutes
November 15, 2017
Page 1 of 5

enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, December 20, 2017.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the next two applicants, whereby Ms. Gustafson assumed the role as Chair.

A. COA-17-0142, 11-13 Baltimore Street – Roger Lund (The Christmas Haus) CRITICAL PROJECT: Rehabilitation of historic storefront on a sensitive building, visible from public way via Baltimore Street

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the building maintains very good architectural integrity, showcasing the bay windows. She stated that the scope of work would include: removing the aluminum canopy and skirting on the storefront; removing and installing insulated glass and etched glass; covering the storefront structure with a simulated wood casing; installing wood doors and restoring the historic arched transom above the entrance door; removing the thin brick veneer and other storefront vestiges and restoring the brick; and installing new lanterns; and reconstructing the replicated kickplate/lower bulkhead as needed.

Mr. Shaffer introduced Mr. Lund, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that Mr. Lund intended to restore the traditional store front, the diamond glass transom, the traditional bulkhead/kickplate, and the mansard; and to install a cloth awning, displaying "The Christmas Haus" logo on it. He noted that the thin brick veneer will be removed to unveil the original brick and archway at 11 Baltimore Street. He said that the black glass from the old Rea and Derrick Drugstore circa 1920s, would be removed from above the air conditioning unit. Mr. Lund said that the building was originally built in the 1860s with a peaked roof, and subsequently added a third floor; and that the arch dated from the 1180s/1890s. He indicated that he would like to remove all of the air conditioning units and avoid using them. He said that the focus is to restore the building storefront at 11-13 Baltimore Street, using sconces made in Germany and stained glass made by a Baltimore artist.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 11-13 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. She said that it is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances, Gettysburg Historic Districts* (Historic District Ordinance): A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application, even though it has been considerably modified, and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles. She said that the main building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District, and is of high architectural integrity despite mid-twentieth alterations to its principle facade. She said the proposed work is considered a critical project with alterations to a sensitive building including the rehabilitation of an existing storefront, and is viewable from the public way via Baltimore Street. She noted that the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* both stress that storefronts are character-defining features of commercial buildings, and recommend that any alterations maintain or enhance the character through the use of traditional materials, appropriate scale, and rhythm.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior storefront modifications at 11-13 Baltimore Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated October, 25, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention.

B. COA-17-0143, 250 Baltimore Street – John Buchheister (The Maryland Sutler)
CRITICAL PROJECT: Addition to the rear of a sensitive building, to be visible from the public way via
Baltimore Street, Wade Avenue, and Schoolhouse Alley.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that this is a critical project, with an addition to a sensitive building over 50 years old and is visible from public way. She said that the building is clad in aluminum, which covers a 1850s brick saddlery that was later converted into a residence. She noted that the building had once housed the Shriver family while their house was under construction.

Mr. Shaffer introduced Mr. Buchheister, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the building remains a simple structure with the original windows intact. He said that the two-story wood-frame 20' x 24' rear addition would include two rooms on each floor. He said that the north elevation facing Wade Avenue would have a lower eave height than that of the existing building, and therefore would delineate the new addition from the older dwelling. He said the proposed roof would be a ribbed standing seam metal roof resembling gray or patina green tin, and that the second-floor non-wood siding would be offset from the first floor. He said that the rear addition would have six-over-six wood-clad windows, and no exterior lighting. He said that rear parking would be maintained, and that there is no proposed fencing at this time.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 250 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. She said that it is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances*, *Gettysburg Historic Districts* (Historic District Ordinance) as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application. She said that the building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg National Register Historic District, and is of high architectural integrity with many original features intact. She said that the proposed work is considered a critical project, with a new addition to a sensitive building to expand an existing live-work unit which will be viewable from the public way via Baltimore Street, Wade Avenue, and Schoolhouse Alley. She noted that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for Rehabilitation* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* both advise that new construction be compatible with nearby historic buildings, not visually overpower or duplicate them, and maintain a distinctive contemporary appearance.

Ms. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed new addition at 250 Baltimore Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated October, 25, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention.

Mrs. LaBarre instructed the applicant that he would still need a building permit.

Gary resumed his role as chair.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

• COA-17-0140, 1 Baltimore Street – HOB, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT: Install removable copper/sheet metal tray caps on the top of the brick masonry chimney structures to reduce moisture infiltration.

• COA-17-0141, 9 Steinwehr Avenue – WWWT Ventures, LLC

SIGN: Erection of three (3) new business signs for Rosie's Collection: 12 SF wall sign (2' x 6'), 2 SF wall sign (1' x 2'), and 6 SF portable sign (2' x 3')

COA-17-0144, 60 E. Middle Street – Reaver Real Estate Investment, LLC CRITICAL

PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Replace roof on main house: remove existing 3 tab asphalt shingles and damaged EPDM; install new autumn brown 30-year Tamko Heritage Architectural asphalt shingles and EPDM as needed.

B. Pending Administrative Approval

• COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100

SIGN: Erection of ____ SF business sign

COA-17-0058, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards—777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112

SIGN: Erection of 8 SF portable business sign

COA-17-0108, Artworks—30 York Street

SIGN: Erection of projecting _____SF business sign

• COA-17-0133, 304 York Street-Suite B - Quin Terra LLC

SIGN: Install three (3) new business signs - 8" x 24" insert for existing monument sign; 8"x 64" projecting sign; and 24"x 32" wall sign.

• COA-17-0135, 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors (Starbucks)

SIGN: Install a 36" diameter shingle bracket non-illuminated projecting sign to the east of the existing storefront; install a 24" diameter hanging disk sign inside the west section of storefront window; and vertically etch 'Starbucks' into the glass to the left of the rear entry door (used primarily by Hotel guests).

- COA-17-0137, 21 Steinwehr Avenue Jessica Haung Yu & Tim May (May's Avenue Restaurant) SIGN: Erection of 21.36 SF (3' x 7.12') window business sign
- COA-17-0138, 789 Baltimore Street Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.

SIGN: Erection of three projecting business signs: 1) 11.72 SF (8.83' \times 3/06') for Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.; 2) 7.74 SF (3.83' \times 2.02') for National Civil War Memorial; and 3) 2.75 SF (3.83' \times 0.72') for Gary Casteel, Sculptor.

C. Report of Chair - Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer discussed the following topics with the Board:

• 2018 Historic District Awards

He discussed the projects eligible for the 2018 Historic District Award nominations, and the various selection category definitions: Protection, Stabilization, Preservation, Rehabilitation, and Restoration. He said that classifying projects this way aligns with the categories defined in the *Manual of PA Historic Architectural Review Boards*. Board members discussed developing their nominating list.

HARB Minutes

November 15, 2017

D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre discussed the following topics with the Board:

CLG Training Reports for 2017

Mrs. LaBarre reminded Board members to email her with both on-line and Borough event training details (including one off-site training) to provide to SHIPO to satisfy required Board continuing education training credits; and that on-line webinars can be viewed for credit.

Proposed Revisions to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Certified Local Governments Program in Pennsylvania

She said that Board members currently need 8 hours of training annually according to the *Guidelines for Implementation of the Certified Local Governments Program in Pennsylvania* by the PA State Historic Preservation Office (SHIPO) but that number is under review. She noted the following proposed changes to the 2009 guidelines under consideration: reduce the number of required training hours from eight to four; reduce the training requirements and share resources between municipalities; and introduce "branding" to encourage Historic District preservation. She said that SHIPO is taking public comment for the new guidelines via email or letter through December, 2017; and that any new guidelines would be implemented beginning in March, 2018. She said that Historic Districts must be inventoried every 10 years, and the tools required by SHIPO to conduct this inventory. She said that there are 45 HARBS in the state of Pennsylvania, and 9 are located in Central PA.

Other Business

Mrs. LaBarre updated the Board on the following items:

A. Monthly HARB newspaper feature

Mrs. LaBarre said that members would select topics of interest, and email their drafts between 400 to 600 words in length to her by December 1st.

B. HARB Reading Assignments

Mrs. LaBarre tabled the discussion of the Board Reading Assignment: Chapter 4 of *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions* – "Building Community Support for Historic preservation until the December HARB meeting".

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher Borough Management Assistant

HARB Minutes
November 15, 2017
Page 5 of 5