



October 18, 2017
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
Approved November 15, 2017

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, October 18, 2017. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Philip Goble, Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Board member Joan Hodges was absent. Also in attendance were: Christopher Delaney, Vice President of Finance for Gettysburg College and Mark Weaver, Architect for Noelker and Hull, both representing 6 York Street; Steve LaBarre, as a member of the public; and Jim Hale, representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections added to the current meeting agenda.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the September 20, 2017 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe, and carried 6-to-0. The meeting minutes from August 16, 2017 were tabled.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business

There were no tabled applications for review at this time.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicant's presentation. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that

meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, November 13, 2017.

A. COA-17-0134, 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors (Starbucks)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alteration to an existing replacement storefront entrance of a sensitive building to include: removing the existing exterior divided-lite double vestibule doors; removing the existing interior full-lite double vestibule doors; extending the depth of recessed entry into the interior of the existing commercial space; installing new vestibule doors at the sides of the new enclosure to create an “entrance” and “exit” path; and painting black the new glass and aluminum materials and the existing metal storefront elements.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that the only exterior alterations planned as a replacement are the removal of the outer vestibule doors and the relocation of the inner vestibule doors to the sides to create an ‘entrance’ and ‘exit’ path. She said that the architect plans to maintain the exterior elevation of the building facing York Street. She said that the following proposed signs would be reviewed administratively under COA-17-0135: a 36” diameter shingle style non-illuminating business sign hung from a bracket immediately to the east of the existing storefront, a 24” diameter disk business sign hung inside the west section of the storefront, and the name “Starbucks” vertically etched in glass to the rear entry door primarily used by Hotel guests.

Mr. Delaney introduced Mr. Mark Weaver as the architect of record for the project. He gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the Gettysburg Hotel. He outlined the minor modifications to the front vestibule area to include moving the existing doors to improve accessibility, and commented on the proposed signage. He said that both the front and rear entries will be handicapped accessible.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 6 York Street is a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances*, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application, even though it has been considerably modified, and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles. The main building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District, and is of high architectural integrity. He said the proposed alterations are viewable by the public, and that the doorways comply with ADA requirements by providing a level area in front of the doors.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed minor exterior modifications at 6 York Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated September, 25, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the next applicant; whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair.

B. COA-17-0136, 49 Steinwehr Avenue – Susan Saum-Wicklein (Regimental Quartermaster/Jeweler’s Daughter)

MAJOR PROJECT: Alterations and repairs to the exterior finishes on a non-sensitive building to include: removing the failing EIFS (stucco) on the front portion of the building and installing thin brick veneer; removing the large picture window and transom windows on the north elevation, infilling with solid exterior wall construction without windows; removing the existing asphalt shingle roofing on the front portion of the building, and the multi-ribbed (agricultural style) metal panel roofing on the rear roof **ONLY** with no visibility from the public way via Steinwehr Avenue; and installing a warm range recessed LED downlights in the “porch” roof overhang.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description. She said that this is a major project, defined as major alterations and repairs to a non-sensitive building about 25 years old to include the removing stucco, installing thin brick veneer, removing the asphalt shingles and replacing them with multi-ribbed agricultural style metal panel roofing on the rear roof only, and installing LED downlights.

Mr. Shaffer, architect of record, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that water issues stemmed from the south-side vent and not directing from the windows. He said that he wanted to use a thin stone near the ground to give a base effect. He noted that none of the materials currently on the building are historic. He said that red brick will be used similar to the brick that was recently use on the Best Western Hotel, 301 Steinwehr Avenue. He said that the building at 49 Steinwehr Avenue used to be the old Avenue Cleaners, which burnt down. He said that this is a Major Project, defined as new construction or a major alteration to a non-sensitive structure in the Historic District and come under review right by the Board.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. The main structure at 49 Steinwehr Avenue is not a sensitive building as defined in Chapter 11 of the *Borough Code of Ordinances*, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance) as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of the application, even though it has been considerably modified, and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles. The main building is a non-sensitive building located in the Historic District, will have major alterations and repairs, and is located within the public view; and therefore is reviewable by the Board.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations and repairs at 49 Steinwehr Avenue as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated September, 27, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

Gary resumed his role as chair.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-17-0129, 297 Steinwehr Avenue – Future Stake (Gettysburg Heritage Center)**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing rubber roof system from

sensitive building, replace with material-in-kind; mechanically fasten 2" ISO roof insulation (R=12.5) over existing roof insulation and install 60-mil fully adhered black EPDM rubber roof

- **COA-17-0131, 305 N. Stratton Street – Stacy Chronister**
MINOR PROJECT/FENCE: Replace existing metal fence with 4ft. high vinyl fence and install vinyl fence at rear of property
- **COA-17-0132, 75 W. Stevens Street – Gettysburg College**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing asphalt shingles, add new ice/water shield, felt paper, drip edge and replace with GAF Timberline high definition shingles in charcoal color with GAF high-traction synthetic roofing felt and water barrier
- **COA-17-0139, 33 York Street – Just Jennifer, Inc. (Mason Dixon Militaria)**
SIGN: Erection of a 12 SF (3' w x 4' h) wood projecting business sign for Mason Dixon Militaria on existing bracket

B. Pending Administrative Approvals

- **COA-17-0039, Tastie-Teas – 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 100**
SIGN: Erection of ____ SF business sign
- **COA-17-0058, Buddy Boy Winery & Vineyards— 777 Baltimore Street, Suite 112**
SIGN: Erection of 8 SF portable business sign
- **COA-17-0108, Artworks—30 York Street**
SIGN: Erection of projecting ____SF business sign
- **COA-17-0133, 304 York Street-Suite B – Quin Terra LLC**
SIGN: Install three (3) new business signs - 8" x 24" insert for existing monument sign; 8"x 64" projecting sign; and 24"x 32" wall sign.
- **COA-17-0135, 6 York Street – Gettysburg Hotel Investors (Starbucks)**
SIGN: Install a 36" diameter shingle bracket non-illuminated projecting sign to the east of the existing storefront; install a 24" diameter hanging disk sign inside the west section of storefront window; and vertically etch 'Starbucks' into the glass to the left of the rear entry door (used primarily by Hotel guests).
- **COA-17-0137, 21 Steinwehr Avenue – Jessica Haung Yu & Tim May (May's Avenue Restaurant)**
SIGN: Erection of 21.36 SF (3' x 7.12') window business sign
- **COA-17-0138, 789 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.**
SIGN: Erection of three projecting business signs: 1) 11.72 SF (8.83' x 3/06') for Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises, Inc.; 2) 7.74 SF (3.83' x 2.02') for National Civil War Memorial; and 3) 2.75 SF (3.83' x 0.72') for Gary Casteel, Sculptor.

C. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer discussed the following topics with the Board:

- **2018 Historic District Awards**
He discussed the timeline for Board nominations, the selection of winners, and sending the invitations. He outlined the following proposed nominating selection categories: Protection, Stabilization, Preservation, Rehabilitation, and Restoration. He said that classifying projects can be discerned by how a project's definition is worded. He recommended that Board members should start exploring their nominating list at the November meeting.

D. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre discussed the following topics with the Board:

- **CLG Training Opportunity for the Board**

Mrs. LaBarre reminded Board members to email her with both on-line and Borough event training details (including one off-site training) to provide to SHIPO to satisfy required Board continuing education training credits; and that on-line webinars can be viewed for credit.

- **HARB Monthly Fun Fact**

Mrs. LaBarre said that staff learned that out of 1,942 Borough parcels, a total of 965 are located in the Historic District – that's 49%. She said that half of Gettysburg is therefore subject to a COA review process, which helps to ensure that the Borough's unique historic character is maintained. She said that it also demonstrates the Borough's serious commitment to historic preservation work.

Other Business

Mrs. LaBarre updated the Board on the following items:

A. The process for the monthly HARB newspaper feature - Peggy Gustafson

Ms. Gustafson updated the Board on the proposed *Gettysburg Times* monthly HARB newspaper serial historic property feature, and the desired monthly content promoting historic advocacy and property awareness in the Gettysburg Borough Historic District. Mrs. LaBarre said that members would select topics of interest, and email their drafts between 400 to 600 words in length to her by December 1st.

B. HARB Reading Assignments

Mrs. LaBarre discussed with the Board their reading assignment: Chapters 2-3 of *A Manual for Pennsylvania Historical Architectural Review Boards and Historical Commissions*; noting that HARB can review all demolitions in the Historic District, and must be purposeful in using language to describe the significance of structures located in the district.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. McCabe made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:50 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant