



October 21, 2020

Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes

Borough of Gettysburg

(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, October 21, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation. **Absent Board Members:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant. **Others in Attendance:** Reyna Fallon and Alam and Jose Barrera of Alam B. Roofing, and Property Owner Debbie Kauffman representing 344 S. Washington Street; Adams County Commissioner Randy Phiel, Adams County Director of Building & Maintenance Larry Steinour, Adams County Principal Planner Rob Thaeler, and Ezra M. Gliksman of Houcks Services, all representing 111 Baltimore Street-Adams County Courthouse.

Call Meeting to Order

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Building Code Official Clem Malot. **Absent** Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant and Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, November 9, 2020.

HARB Business Meeting

October 21, 2020

Page 1 of 7

Review of Agenda

Mr. Goble asked the Board to remove from full HARB Review Item C: COA-20-0080, 1 Baltimore Street – House of Bender, Replace Historic Basement Doors from the October 21, 2020 Meeting Agenda; and to have the project reviewed through the administrative process as a Minor Project. After Board discussion, Mr. Shaffer called for a motion.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to amend the October 21, 2020 HARB Meeting Agenda Item C: COA-20-0078, 1 Baltimore Street – House of Bender, Replace Historic Basement Doors from full HARB review, and to have the project reviewed through the administrative process. The motion was seconded by Clem Malot. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

There were no other additions or corrections to the October 21, 2020 meeting agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the September 16, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Goble asked the Board to switch the order of the Applications for Review since the first project for consideration under agenda item A at 344 Washington Street may comprise a much longer discussion; and suggested starting with agenda item B at 111 Baltimore Street. The Board agreed, and Mr. Shaffer moved agenda item B at 111 Baltimore Street as first item under consideration for review on the agenda.

B. COA-20-0080 MAJOR PROJECT: 111 Baltimore Street – Adams County Courthouse

Replacement of asphalt shingled roof with new architectural asphalt shingles that mimic slate style roof; and replacement of the red metal rubber coated roof on the historic courthouse clock tower with a black metal rubber coated roof.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 21, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace the existing shingled roof on the Historic Adams County Courthouse with an architectural asphalt shingled roof that mimics a slate-style roof. She said that the applicant would also like to replace the Historic Adams County Courthouse clock tower roof with its current red metal rubber coated roof, and replace it with a black metal rubber roof; and to also fix the damaged wood in the structure as deemed necessary. She said that this project will also include installing a new air handling unit to be removed and replaced through the main roofing system and to repair any holes when complete. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick structure with a slate/tin roof and a frame clock tower.

Representatives from Adams County representing the Historic Courthouse project gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. The Board noted the change in materials using the existing standard shingles to the architectural asphalt shingles that mimicked a slate roof and considered it as an improved change that would be more consistent with the original slate roof of this structure. The Board discussed the original roofing material of the historic clock tower and noted that the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicated a slate/tin roof on the clock tower that is currently coated with a rubber coating. The HARB Board asked the County representatives if they knew what was under the rubber coating and what was the original material of the clock tower roof. Mr. Goble asked Commissioner Randy Phiel about the history of the roof, who in turn directed that question to County Planner Rob Thaeler, who did not know the history of the roofing material on the clock tower; but said that it currently appears to be a tin roof with a rubber coating that is failing and requiring water proofing for structural integrity. County Maintenance Director Larry Steinour noted that there are currently issues with decayed wood in the clock tower structure, and that the rotted wood in the clock will be replaced in conjunction with the roofing replacement. Mr. Thaeler also noted that an amended COA was submitted to include a replacement air handling unit that will need to be removed through the roof, a new unit installed, and any holes repaired. Ms. English noted that this amendment will not affect HARB review and will require a PMCA/UCC permit for this work.

Mr. Malot noted that there was no mention of the ice and water shields on the roof which is a requirement of the building code and should be installed as required in the State of Pennsylvania.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the historic structure at 111 Baltimore Street is not viewable from the public view way but is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure has significant historical significance and predates 1886 and is a key building and anchor to the National Battlefields Historic District. He said that the original slate/tin roof was re-shingled and the proposed new roofing asphalt material will mimic the original slate style roof; and that the

original tin roof of the clock tower was rubber coated due to water damage and will be replaced with in-kind materials. He noted that construction will be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for COA-20-0080 for the replacement of the shingled roof and clock tower roof on the Adams County Historic Courthouse located at 111 Baltimore Street as presented in the application dated October 16, 2020. The motion was seconded by Jim McCabe.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

A. COA-20-0076 Major Project: 344 S. Washington Street - Debbie Kauffman / Alam Roofing, Reyna Fallon, Alam and Jose Barrera

Mr. Shaffer said that the project at 344 S. Washington Street was tabled from the September 16, 2020 HARB Meeting so that Board members could re-visit the site once the aluminum clad was removed from the windows/frames for inspection.

Ms. English updated the Board on the status of this tabled project. She said that photos were emailed to all HARB members on October 10, 2020 showing that all of the aluminum clad had been removed from the windows; and that several HARB members (Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Phil Goble, Jim McCabe and Clem Malot) were able to visit the site prior to our scheduled meeting. She said that all HARB members agreed that the wood casings are in good shape as noted by their physical site inspection and the visual review of the site photos; and that they all agreed that the windows were not in bad shape requiring cladding and should be restored.

Mr. Alam Barrera of Alam B. Roofing, as contractor representing the owner, said that he and his brother Jose would answer Board questions. He said that the wood around the windows was not in good shape, and in some instances, rotted beyond repair. Mr. Jose Barrera asked the Board if they had a chance to review the material samples that were provided to the Board. Mr. Shaffer noted that alternative products provided by Alam B. Roofing would only be approved if the wood window casings were not repairable, and that HARB is not in a position to approve new materials for windows that are repairable (not rotted). Mr. Malot of PMCA said he would meet with the contractor on-site to review which windows are rotted, and that the PMCA inspection will make the determination if the windows are not repairable. Mr. Goble agreed that the on-site inspector should make that determination. Mr. Goble noted that there was a J-channel gap between the windows and the newly installed siding and asked the contractor how he planned on closing that gap while restoring the existing window frames. Mr. Malot noted that the current siding work as constructed with the J-channel gap will not pass inspection. Mr. Barrera said that he will address that issue.

Ms. Debbie Kauffman, owner of the property, said that she was not aware that her house was located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and that she was not aware of

these Historic District requirements. She said she should be able to do what she wants to her house, and that she never would have purchased this house if she knew of these requirements. Ms. Lingle said that relators are required to disclose that information to all buyers of properties located within a historical preservation area such as the Gettysburg Historic District; and that there should have been something in her sales contract noting that she had purchased a home located within the Historic District boundaries. Mr. Goble said that this issue is between the owner, the contractor, and the realtor; and that “not knowing” will not negate the requirements of the HARB application review per the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, and the *Department of Interiors Standards for Historic Restoration*.

Mr. Shaffer noted that the crown molding was cut off to clad the windows at the top of the casings and may not match-up with the siding as installed. He said that the original storefront moldings and all wood window frames should be restored; and that the J-channel issue should be resolved with this restoration project and the completion of the siding work.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 344 S. Washington Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public view way, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that construction for this siding/window project will be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented in the application dated July 28, 2020.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to deny the application for the roof/window/vinyl siding project at 344 S. Washington Street as presented in the application dated September 11, 2020 unless the existing windows are restored. Ms. Lingle seconded the motion.

The Board discussed the motion on the table and agreed to restate the original motion; whereby Mr. Goble withdrew his motion. The Board determined through their discussion to allow the applicant to continue with siding portion of their project and to restore the existing wood windows unless some are noted by the inspector that they are beyond repair.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 344 S. Washington Street to replace the aluminum siding with vinyl siding, restore the all existing architectural wood features, repair all windows of the structure unless determined through PMCA inspection not to be repairable, and to mitigate (owner, contractor, realtor) the weather tightness between the existing siding and the wood trim as presented in the application dated July 28, 2020. Ms. Lingle seconded the motion.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe (with reservations), Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Mr. Malot stressed to the contractor and the applicant that the current siding work as constructed with the J-channel gap will not pass inspection; and encouraged the contractor to contact PMCA to make an appointment for an on-site visit to address any further concerns. He said that any rooted would be replaced in-kind.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 20-0062 MINOR PROJECT: 204 Chambersburg Street – Joel Desotelle**

Two signs 16'x1.5" black wall sign with white lettering centered above the entrance door and a 14"x22.5" directory to be mounted to the left side of the main entrance door. All signs should use either existing hardware or anchor all new hardware through the mortar of the building following The Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehab and Sustainability for Rehabbing Historic Buildings.

- **COA 20-0072 MINOR PROJECT: 223 Chambersburg Street – Warren G and Ray H Rudisill**

Replacing existing shingled roof to shingled roof in kind replacement gray in color.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the September 16, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Joan Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0. (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Mr. Goble noted that Ms. English has done a good job orchestrating items for both HARB full review and for HARB administrative review providing the Board with more critical projects that fit their criteria for review. He said that this enables the Board to focus on the substantial changes needed for larger critical projects within the Historic District; and that during his time on HARB, he noted that the Board Administrative Approval Review Process has never been smoother than it has been now. Ms. Lingle agreed and thanked Ms. English as well.

B. Report of Chair – *Gary Shaffer*

- Mr. Shaffer had no report at this time. He noted that he has been working on the HARB Historic Preservation Awards list provided by Ms. English and found the excel spreadsheet very helpful to the review process, and for narrowing down projects based on project qualifications.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

- Ms. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2018, 2019 and 2020 for the Annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to

email her with any recommendations to revise and finalize the current list. She said that she emailed each member a copy of the list to mark as they see fit; and that once the review is completed, she will collect all data and revise the master copy.

- Ms. Mary Tate with The Pennsylvania Downtown Center is working on a Solar Panel/Satellite Dish Draft for review at the November/December HARB meeting in order to update the *Gettysburg Borough Design Guide* with stronger language. Mr. Goble questioned the usage of tents within the Historic District relevant to the CDC guidelines for tents with enclosed sides and heat. Mr. Malot said that the Building Code requires inspections of tent structures over a certain square footage when sided and heated with electricity. Mr. Goble questioned CDC Guidelines for outdoor tents and capacities noting that there are safety concerns for tents with sides and unapproved heating devices. Mr. Shaffer noted the HARB Board is required to only review architectural designs and renovations.
- Ms. English said that she would meet with Mr. Shaffer next week to finalize the CLG survey and complete its submittal.
- Ms. English said that if any Board member receives a bill for the Tacoma Coast to Coast Historical Seminar that they should ignore those bills, and that she is waiting on an invoice for all six (6) attendees to complete the payment. She said that the Borough will be reimbursed with grant funds for the webinar to pay for the six attendees in the amount of \$600.00.

Other Business

There was no other business

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodge. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:21 PM. (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Respectfully submitted,

Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation
c/o Karen M. Mesher, Planning Management Assistant

HARB Business Meeting

October 21, 2020

Page 7 of 7