



June 15, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, June 15, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Paul Witt, Justin Harman, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, and Suzanne Christianson; **Others in Attendance:** Owner Kevin McCready from Orchard County Realty LLC and Designer Alison Freesland from Freesland Design, representing 51 E Stevens Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of five (5) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness; and in the case of a split-vote decision tonight due to only four members constituting a quorum, HARB would not recommend that project to Council at this time. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, July 11, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to remove Agenda Item B from the agenda tonight because it would be moved to the July 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda; and to accept the June 15, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the June 15, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Mr. Harman made a **motion** to accept the May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and **carried 3-to-0 by roll call vote with two abstentions.**

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 22-0057 CRITICAL PROJECT: 51 E. Stevens Street – Orchard County Realty LLC

Construction of a support retaining wall extending along alleyway to the front of the property using Gettysburg gray masonry block addition to previously permitted COA for wall and patio construction. Replace broken concrete steps in front of property (in-kind). Demolition of shed/garage to the rear of the property. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her June 15, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story split residence 49 and 51 E. Stevens with a frame structure with a one-story front frame porch, two-story rear matching side porches on the side rear with a composition roof on main structure and porches. She said that the property at 51 E. Stevens has a single-story frame outbuilding with a composition roof labeled as 'A' Auto building. The permit history shows 2017 repair/replace porch floor boards; 2019 fence permit; 2019 installation of 14' x 14' patio to the rear of house, add block retaining wall along the side of the property with a 6' high privacy fence; 2021 replace 300sf patio in rear yard; and 2022 this current application. She said that a Notice of Violation (NOV) was issued on June 10, 2022 for the removal of wood columns and railings that was approved in a previous COA for the restoration of wood features; and those wood columns were removed and in the process of being replaced with PVC Plastic columns.

Mr. Kevin McCready of Orchard County Realty LLC, and Alison Freesland from Freesland Design, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. McCready said that he had to evaluate the front steps and run the retaining wall along the alley (Barbehenn Alley) and in the front of the house to level of the yard for this project. He said that the gray steps to the front porch should be constructed out of wood, and that the front porch railings on both sides of the duplex do not match in style (spacing for the railing posts is too wide and that the height should be 36" for a private residence). He said that he would like the front steps to match the style used in the retaining wall, and to widen the steps to both houses. Chair Shaffer discussed the demolition of the rear outbuilding with the applicant, asking him to consider withdrawing that part of the current application for demolition pending an engineering report deeming it unrepairable and presenting that part of the application at the July 20th HARB Meeting. He said that any structure over 50 years old is considered a sensitive building, and that HARB has a process to review the demolition of structures in the Historic District. Mr. McCready said that the shed was compromised when it was previously struck by a backhoe, and that he would like to remove it; but agreed to remove the demolition of the structure from this current application.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Critical Project at 51 E. Stevens Street. He said that the front structure and the rear garage has significant integrity, are both contributing

structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, are sensitive buildings over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and are visible from the public view way via E. Stevens Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the front structure has many original features, and that the proposed work to the front steps leading to the structure would be done in-kind, and that the proposed addition of a retaining wall is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He said that more information is needed to review the proposed demolition of the rear garage, and therefore agrees with the applicant to withdraw that part of the application pending an engineering report.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the front steps leading to the structure, construct a retaining wall extending along the alleyway to the front of the property, and to repair the front porch using wood materials as presented in the application at 51 E. Stevens Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated May 2, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 22-0058 MINOR PROJECT: 160 Seminary Ave**
Shingle to shingle roof replacement, install ice water shields and synthetic felt, reflash chimney, paint two gable eaves, fascia trim. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0059 MINOR PROJECT: 126 Baltimore Street – Bernard Yannetti**
Repair and replace rotted windowsills in-kind in cedar wood and paint. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0060 MINOR PROJECT: 336 Baltimore Street – Alexander J. Zaharias**
Rear porch emergency roof repair, replace rear porch gutters, down spouts, and new fascia and soffits on gables. All repairs must be 'in-kind'. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0061 MINOR PROJECT: 34 York Street – White Orchard Enterprise**
Install acrylic 'Bulldog Elastomeric Coatings' on roof and perform all necessary sealing and rust control – all 'in kind' maintenance, no change in materials. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0062 MINOR PROJECT: 101 Springs Avenue – Rutherford Platt**
Shingle to shingle roof replacement with no wood or trims wrapped – all 'in kind' work only for this project. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0063 MINOR PROJECT: 45 Chambersburg Street – Dana Bruinsma**
Installation of three signs for 'Wildroot Collection': One 3'x2' projecting sign to be installed on existing bracket; One 1.6'x3.2' portable sign to maintain at least 4' clear pedestrian passage at all times. One 3.5'x1.25' wall sign to be installed above display window. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Mr. Malot made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the May 18, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and **carried 4-to-0 by roll call vote with one abstention (Joan Hodges, relationship to 34 York Street)**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer did not have a report at this time.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Thanked everyone for a successful and enjoyable Historic Preservation Awards Ceremony with 30 representatives in attendance receiving 20 Preservation Awards for successful projects in the Gettysburg Historic District.
- Discussed additional language for alternate materials to address more Administrative Approvals per Council request (would like to create a list of materials for siding, windows, and roof work).
- Discussed the Satellite Dish updates, noting that Council will need to approve any ordinance/design guide updates. She said a staff intern would be available to help with this transition, and to bring any comments to the next meeting. She said that the Arts Council is interested in working with HARB / Borough to recycle removed satellite dishes and repurpose them into artistic bird baths.
- Discussed the use of “Thank You” hang tags and asked members to provide the address locations where they are hung
- Welcomed new HARB member, Paul Witt, to the Board.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Christianson. The **motion passed 4-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant