



July 20, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Vice-Chair Brandon Stone called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, July 20, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Paul Witt, Suzanne Christianson, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, and Justin Harman; **Others in Attendance:** Monica E. Oss, Chief Executive Officer, and J. Jay Mackie Ph D., Chief Financial Officer, both of Open Minds, representing 12 Chambersburg Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Vice-Chair Brandon Stone called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of five (5) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Vice-Chair Stone introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, August 8, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Vice-Chair Stone asked the Board to remove Agenda Items A and B from the agenda tonight because those items did not have representation present and would therefore be tabled; and to accept the July 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the July 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

Vice-Chair Stone asked the Board to review the June 15, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted and to make the following amendment by removing the names of both Joan Hodges and Justin Harman under "Absent Board Members" on page one because they both were present at the meeting as noted earlier in

the minutes under those in attendance. Mr. Harman made a **motion** to accept the June 15, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and **carried 3-to-0 by roll call vote with two abstentions** (Vice-Chair Stone and Ms. Christianson).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

Vice-Chair Stone noted that representatives for both Items **A: COA-220054 a Major Project at 225 York Street** and **B: COA-220057 a Critical Project at 51 E. Stevens Street**, were not present at tonight's meeting; and that both projects would be tabled to the August 8, 2022 meeting.

C. COA 22-0076 CRITICAL PROJECT: 12 Chambersburg Street – Open Minds, Monica Oss and Jay Mackie

Renovations to the front façade to include new stone masonry veneer, a new stone arched entrance, and large stone arched windows to create more of an entrance. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Rehabilitation.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her July 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick stone dwelling with a shingled roof. The permit history shows interior renovations in 2016; signage in 2017; alterations to include a new door and sidelights in 2018; a banner in 2019; and a change of use, the current application (for a window replacement, veneer façade and new door entrance) in 2022.

Ms. Monica Oss and Mr. Jay Mackie from Open Minds gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Oss presented the Board with a brief history of the building noting that it formerly was a restaurant, a gas station, a bank, and now Open Minds which is a market intelligence and management support firm. She said that this project would restore the north façade at 12 Chambersburg Street making the building more accessible and returning it to a style that would match that of the current front façade on the building's entrance at 15 Lincoln Square. Both Ms. Oss and Mr. Mackie presented the Board with existing façade pictures and discussion, noting that the 1950's-1970's style entrance would be updated to a more traditional façade with a new stone arched entrance and a stone arched large window that would give the entire building a more cohesive look. Ms. Oss and Mr. Mackie described the period lighting slated for the renovation but noted that the lighting fixtures would be submitted through a future application approval process.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this critical project at 12 Chambersburg Street. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public

view way via Chambersburg Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure has many original features, and that the proposed work to the front facade which includes a new stone masonry veneer will add a traditional look to the structure that would replicate the style of the existing Lincoln Square façade for Open Minds, and that the proposed renovations to the existing ACNB Bank will create an arched door and window that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation and would also maintain and enhance the character of the structure.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 15 Chambersburg Street to complete the traditional façade with a new arched stone entrance door and a new arched stone window using a new stone masonry veneer that will create a more formal entrance way and cohesive look that is similar to the Lincoln Square façade of Open Minds and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation as presented to the Board in the application dated July 5, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 22-0064 MINOR PROJECT: 228 Buford Avenue – Keith Soliday**
Shingle-to-shingle roof replacement. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0065 MINOR PROJECT: 45 E. Stevens Street – Leslie A Casteel**
Construct 3 ½' x 3 ½' concrete pad for a new HVAC unit located next to the side of the rear garage. The unit shall be screened from the street view. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0066 MINOR PROJECT: 28 E. Water Street – Gettysburg Strength and Conditioning**
Construct 12' x 40' driveway located off E. Water Street to the right of the dwelling. HOP required for final approval. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0067 MINOR PROJECT: 66-68 W. Middle Street – James and Barbara Entwistle**
Notice of Violation issued for work started without a permit by Coldsmith Roofing. Remove gutter system and install EPDM system with all necessary flashings on flat portion of roof. No change in materials permitted, and no covering of wood trims, fascia, or soffit. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0068 MAJOR PROJECT: 29 W. Middle Street – Fifty Properties LLC**
Repair structural and cosmetic damage to existing three-story porch. No new materials or changes to door, window sizes, shape or design are permitted. All work must be in-kind. All styles of the façade shall remain the same. Any changes in materials or size of windows or doors must be re-submitted for review through HARB. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0069 MINOR PROJECT: 37 W. Middle Street – BF Properties, LLC**
Shingle-to-shingle replacement of approximately 12' x 15' sloped roof at rear addition. The metal roof on the main building will be painted. No other materials are to be altered or replaced. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- **COA 22-0070 MINOR PROJECT: 37 W. MIDDLE STREET – James and Barbara Entwistle**
Remove existing composition shingle roof and replace with composite shingle roofing, replace chimney flashing, ridge vent, and ridge cap. No wrapping of wood frames, soffits, or fascia. Any change in materials will require HARB review. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0071 MINOR PROJECT: 326 S. Washington Street – Amy and Randy Nail**
Remove and replace corrugated metal roof on rear addition in-kind with corrugated metal roof. Remove and replace half-round gutters and downspouts; replace roof section in-kind with half-round gutters and downspouts. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0072 MINOR PROJECT: 512 York Street – Steve and Patricia Bussey**
Remove and replace vinyl siding on the side of the house with vinyl siding. Remove and replace raised panel shutters in kind. All work must be done in-kind, no wrapping of exposed wood windows or framing is not permitted with this approval. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0073 MINOR PROJECT: 228 Chambersburg Street- Gregory B. Dale**
Repair damaged brick and mortar and replace siding with matching siding. Reinstall electric connections and replace damaged meter boxes. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0074 MINOR PROJECT: 34 Baltimore Street - Yu Ping Huang**
Remove existing 2,000 SF rubber roofing on rear addition roof and replace with EPDM. Remove existing asphalt shingles on front building roof and replace in-kind with asphalt shingles. Replace damaged wood fascia with new wood. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0075 MINOR PROJECT: 40 South Street – Michael Gladfelter**
Remove approximately 324 SF of existing patio and replace with approximately 572 SF of new paver patio and steps with knee walls (34' length x 26" high x 11.5"wide) for a total impervious area of 404 SF and add vinyl pergola. This will ADD a new impervious area of 656 SF. This area will be behind the house and not visible from the main roadway. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Ms. Christianson made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the June 15, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Witt and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote**.

B. Report of Chair – Vice-Chair Stone

Vice-Chair Stone discussed the importance of zoning in the Borough, noting the need to protect historic structures within the Borough.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Discussed additional language for alternate building materials that would still maintain the historic character of the structure, and what those materials might visually look like to address more Administrative Approvals per request of Council (would like to create a list acceptable alternate materials for siding, windows, and roof work) to include in the *Design Guide* revision.
- Discussed the need for realtors to inform prospective buyers whether or not their property is located within the boundaries of the Historic District and why that information is initially important to them before they buy a property, and the need to inventory all historic structures over fifty years old within the Historic District.
- Discussed a process for HARB Members to follow if they are presented by applicants with a project that involves the removal of a covering or false façade on structures; and at the applicants' request, its removal and/or replacement with alternate materials or veneer coverings. HARB members should inspect the underlayment for the condition and useability of the historic materials; and that the on-site inspections should occur prior to Board approvals of alternate materials if they are in useable conditions. The removal of historic materials was noted by several members as issues to be discussed before they are discarded and not following approval.
- Discussed the Satellite Dish updates, noting that Council will need to approve any ordinance/*Design Guide* updates. She said a staff intern would be available to help with this transition, and to bring any comments to the next meeting.
- Discussed the use of "Thank You" hang tags and asked members to provide the address locations where they are hung.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The **motion passed 5-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:10 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant