



January 20, 2021

Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes

Borough of Gettysburg

(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, January 21, 2021. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation, and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant. **Absent Board Member:** Colleen Lingle. **Others in Attendance:** Joshua Boehner, property owner, representing 240 W. Middle Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe (entered meeting before New Business), and Building Code Official Clem Malot. **Absent** Colleen Lingle.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, February 8, 2021.

Review of Agenda

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the submitted Revised January 20, 2021 HARB meeting Agenda to include the added HARB Reorganization as presented, and the Board agreed to the submitted agenda.

Review of Minutes

AHARB Business Meeting

January 20, 2021

Page 1 of 5

Vice-Chair Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the December 16, 2020 HARB Meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Hodges, Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **4-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Lingle; and with Mr. Shaffer abstaining due to his absence at the December 16, 2020 HARB meeting).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Reorganization

As customary during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized with a quorum present. Ms. English opened the floor for nominations for Chair. Mr. Shaffer nominated Mr. Goble and the nomination was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. There being no other nominations, Ms. English closed the nominations, and called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Hodges, Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion to elect Mr. Goble as Chair carried **5-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Lingle). Mr. Goble agreed to serve as Chair in 2021 and resumed running the meeting in that role.

Chair Goble received nominations for Vice-Chair. Ms. Lingle was nominated by Ms. Hodges and seconded by Ms. Gustafson. There being no other nominations, Chair Goble closed the nominations, and called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion to elect Ms. Lingle as Vice-Chair carried **5-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Lingle). Ms. Lingle agreed to serve as Vice-Chair in 2021 via email correspondence dated January 21st to Director English.

Chair Goble received nominations for Second Vice-Chair, a position where that person would need to assume the duties of the Chair in the event that the First Vice-Chair could not attend the HARB meeting, and the Chair was either absent or would have to recuse him or herself for fiduciary reasons. Ms. Gustafson was nominated by Mr. Goble and seconded by Mr. Malot. There being no other nominations, Chair Goble closed the nominations and called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion to elect Ms. Gustafson as Second Vice-Chair carried **5-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Lingle). Ms. Gustafson agreed to serve as Second Vice-Chair in 2021.

Chair Goble asked for a motion to set the monthly HARB Business Meeting dates for the calendar year 2021 as the third Wednesday of every month pending holidays and major weather events and to authorize the Borough Secretary to advertise those dates in the *Gettysburg Times* in January 2021.

Mr. Malot made the **motion** to hold the 2021 Monthly Business Meetings of the HARB on the following Wednesday dates at 7:00 PM prevailing time in the Municipal Building (or via Zoom format), and authorize the Borough Secretary to advertise the same in the *Gettysburg Times* for the calendar year

2021: January 20th, February 17th, March 17th, April 21st, May 19th, June 16th, July 21st, August 18th, September 15th, October 20th, November 17th, and December 15th; and it was seconded by Second Vice-Chair Gustafson. Chair Goble called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion to set the monthly HARB meeting dates, and to authorize the Borough Secretary to publish those dates in the *Gettysburg Times* carried **5-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Lingle).

(Enter HARB Member Mr. McCabe via zoom)

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-20-0098 MAJOR PROJECT: 220 W. Middle Street – Joshua Boehner (tabled from 12/16/2020)

Replace rotted wood railing on the front porch with new wood railing; power wash and paint the aluminum siding navy blue and paint all trim white; add stained NEW wood shutters to the exterior of all windows to meet the width of the existing windows with hinges; and replace the front door with a new full-view storm door and a new wooden front door.

Chair Goble referred the Board to the Background History of the historic property noted on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as indicated in the January 20, 2021 HARB Meeting agenda, which was included in their COA packet; and asked the applicant to provide a brief project scope and answer Board questions. He said that the applicant had revised his scope per the December 16, 2020 Board recommendation.

Mr. Joshua Boehner, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he would like to leave the current front porch columns as they are, replace the black aluminum railing on the front porch with a painted black wood railing, note that he had painted the existing white aluminum siding navy blue using Behr Marquee Exterior Satin and paint the existing yellow/orange trim work in Cotton Knit White using Behr Marquee Exterior paint. He said that he would like to replace the shutters with paneled shutters that would be mounted on hinges with shutter dogs to make them appear functional, and that they would be mounted on the window frames and sized appropriately to cover the existing windows per the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He said that he would like to replace the existing storm door and front door with a black, full view glass pane storm door and a wooden front door.

The Board discussed the COA project with the applicant, who was apologetic for his previous application. Ms. Gustafson suggested when considering his color choices for the trim, that he also considers including his shutters, porch columns, porch railing, and front door in his color choices to add balance to the front façade. Mr. Shaffer acknowledged the applicant's willingness to work with the Board on this project and pointed out that the design of the wood porch railing not imitate a deck-style railing. Mr. Boehner said that his proposed porch railing would be of wood material with wooden spindles.

Chair Goble presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 220 W. Middle Street is a contributing structure located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public view way from

W. Middle Street, and thus comes under the review right of the Board. He said that the proposed construction for this front façade project to include maintaining the front porch columns, replacing the front porch railing, replacing the front storm and wooden doors, and replacing the shutters with paneled wooden shutters mounted on hinges with shutter dogs proportioned to all exterior windows is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented in the revised COA scope dated January 14, 2021. He noted that some of the work for this project was completed prior to this application and must meet all PMCA permitting requirements.

Mr. Shaffer made a motion to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness at 220 W. Middle Street for the front façade replacement project to include new paneled shutters, a new wooden spindled porch railing, maintain existing porch columns, and new front doors as presented per the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* in the revised scope dated January 14, 2021. Mr. McCabe seconded the motion. Chair Goble called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0** (absent members for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Chair Goble told the applicant that Council would vote on his project at their February 8, 2021 Council Business Meeting; and that any permits issued, or payment made to PMCA could be made after that time.

The Board discussed projects concerning duplex properties, the challenges faced by applicants with those projects, grandfathered changes to those historic district properties, and issuing any enforcement actions relative to projects started or completed without permits.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0001 MINOR PROJECT: 140 W. Middle Street – Theophilus and Linda Golden**
To repair rear garage/barn structure along alleyway (not visible from Middle Street) with wood siding as needed and cover two sides with vinyl siding. The structure is approximately 50+ years old and in poor condition.

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the December 16, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. Chair Goble called for a **Roll-Call Vote** with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**. (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

B. Report of Chair – Phil Goble

There was no report at this time.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

- Director English asked the Board to continue to review the master list for the upcoming Annual Historic Preservation Awards which will be held as soon as it is feasible to do so in light of the current COVID19 pandemic. She asked the Board to eliminate those projects that

would not qualify, and that she would send out a revised list to all Board members pending their feedback. The Board discussed possible meeting options for the event to include an outside venue or a zoom format with options to change in light of the PA Department of Health Guidelines.

- Director English updated the Board on the status of revising the *Gettysburg Design Guide* regarding satellite dishes, and solar panels; and opened a discussion for developing an ordinance for those devices in the Historic District. She said that Ms. Mary Tate with The Pennsylvania Downtown Center will present in the future verbiage for the guide revisions for the satellite dishes and solar panels; and that HARB should consider the permitting process and the location of those devices on historic district structures in order to reduce clutter on the front facades. Ms. Tate said has provided samples of ordinances by other municipalities and will work with HARB to develop a draft ordinance for the Borough of Gettysburg.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed **6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:10 PM (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning Management Assistant