



August 17, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 17, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Suzanne Christianson, and Justin Harman, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Paul Witt, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; **Others in Attendance:** David Martin, Gettysburg #0363058905 SUNOCO Mini Mart Manager, representing 225 York Street; Curt H. Grim, Property Owner, and Kyle Whitlow, Property Manager, of Curt Grim Rental Properties, both representing 100 Baltimore Street; Jose Barrera-Duque and Mike Fleet, both from Alam B Roofing and Home Improvements LLC, representing 404 Baltimore Street; Dean G. Harner, Property Owner, representing 29 Hanover Street; Joe Edgar, Architect of Snyders Design LLC, and George Makoutz of 240-242 Chambersburg LLC, both representing 240 Chambersburg Street; and Carly Marshall, Director of Planning, Zoning, and Code Enforcement.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:05 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of five (5) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 12, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to remove Agenda Item D, COA-220082-7 Hanover Street, from the agenda tonight because the applicant withdrew the application; and to accept the August 17, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the August 17, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to table the July 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes until the September 21, HARB Meeting due to a lack of members present from the July meeting who are able to vote on those July meeting minutes as submitted. The Board agreed by consensus.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 22-0054 MAJOR PROJECT: 225 York Street – Ravi Singh & Carly Marshal, Code Enforcement

Notice of Violation (NOV) for installing lighting without permits. Install new lighting on building to include three wall packs and 16 light bars. Review light fixtures, lumens, and direction of building and site lighting.

Carly Marshall, Director of Planning, Zoning, and Code Enforcement gave a brief summary of the pending enforcement action and zoning violation for this project at 225 York Street, Gettysburg SUNOCO Mini Market due to the fact that the building's lighting is too bright for surrounding structures. She said that there should be "no glare beyond the property line", explained the techniques used to determine bright lighting, and stated that the brightness of the lighting needed to be reduced. She also said that the use of internally illuminated signs is prohibited, and that they must be turned off. She discussed lumens and different lighting types with the Board.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story brick building with a slate or tin roof. The permit history shows a sign permit in 2020, a sign permit in 2021, and this current application for lighting (NOV).

Mr. David Martin, Manager at the Gettysburg SUNOCO Mini Mart, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Martin told the Board that the owner intends to place wall hoods over the wall packs to direct the light downward. Vice-Chair Stone suggested exploring the possibility of using a voltage regulator to dial down the electricity to dim the lights, and that hoods should be installed to move the project forward. Ms. Christianson said that reducing the number of lights used by removing lights or turning off lights could reduce the surrounding brightness affecting neighboring properties without compromising safety to employees and patrons. Chair Shaffer said that what shielding of lighting is acceptable and what constitutes safety needs to be determined; and that the use of hoods, reducing lumens, adjusting light levels and removing fixtures are all possible necessary first steps. Planning Director Marshall said that it would be appropriate to reduce the brightness of the lighting by using hoods.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 225 York Street-Gettysburg SUNOCO Mini Mart. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as

defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both York and Hanover Streets and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the lighting on the property intended for safety is too bright, is affecting neighboring properties, and that the proposed work to reduce brightness emitted from the lights would require the installation of hoods to each fixture in order to meet building code requirements and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 225 York Street-Gettysburg SUNOCO Mini Mart to approve the lighting as submitted with the stipulation that hoods must be applied to all lighting fixtures and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated April 27, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

Planning Director Marshall said that the applicant was told that the SUNOCO and the price sign cannot be internally lit in the Historic District and must be turned off.

B. COA 22-0080 MAJOR PROJECT: 100 Baltimore Street – Curt H. Grim

Replace 62 wood windows with new wood windows with aluminum cladding on the second and third floors of the building facing Baltimore and Middle Streets and that 24 of those windows will be in three-unit bay windows; and all window colors will remain hunter green.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a two-story brick building with a tin/slate roof, brick rear extension with a frame two-story side porch. The structure split use as a hardware and book store, with a rear repair shop. The permit history shows RRUO history from 2010-present, sign permits in 1982, 1989, and 1996, and this current application for window replacement.

Mr. Curt H. Grim, property owner, and Mr. Kyle Whitlow from APM Inc. gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Grim said that all of the second-floor and third-floor windows needed to be replaced because they are rotting and separating from the sashes. He said that there are currently three separate window styles: square, arched and bay; and that he would like to use the square window style with the arched top with one-over-one, and without grids. He would like to use Jeldwen aluminum clad windows in hunter green, openings will remain the same, and paint the building in a tan color.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 100 Baltimore Street. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both Baltimore and Middle Streets and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that although retaining the windows is the goal, the current shape of the windows would necessitate replacement. He said that the arch window openings and their one-over-one design element should be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 100 Baltimore Street to replace the existing wood windows with the divided Jeldwen clad wood windows that replicate the current arched windows on the second floor and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated June 28, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

C. COA 22-0019 MAJOR PROJECT: 404 Baltimore Street – M. Glatfelter, Mr. G's Ice Cream

Commercial re-roof from historic asbestos shingles to fiberglass asphalt shingles. Remove existing shingled roof; and install a new roof support forest step wood 1 x 3, a new metal drip edge, a new valley at dormers, all flashing and pipe flashing at dormer and chimney, ice and water shields on eaves and valleys of roof, GAF Pro-Starter strips at all eaves and rakes, and a ridge vent, GAF seal ridge cap over ventilation. REMOVE TWO DORMERS on the side of the building facing Reid's Winery. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a two-story brick structure with a shingled-style roof, frame two-story side and one-story rear porch, three attached side/rear one-story brick and two frame outbuilding structures, and two detached one-story brick and frame structures. The permit history shows a paint and repair exterior wood on the house and on the cement block and replace private hedge with mid-19th century style picket fence in 1990, add twin double-hung windows on gable ends at peak roof replicating existing windows in 1993, replace sidewalk in 2010, replace 50 feet of brick sidewalk along Baltimore Street in 2011, renovate interior ice cream parlor in 2011; and install Mr. G's signage in 2012, and this current application for roof replacement.

Mr. Jose Barrera-Duque and Mr. Mike Fleet from Alam B Roofing and Home Improvements LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the property owner. Mr. Barrera explained the use of asbestos shingles and how it replicates the look of asbestos tile; and referenced the completed re-roof at United Emory Church located on the New Oxford Square. He said that the GAF Woodland Shingle mimics the existing shingle in a gray color. Chair Shaffer told the Board that there is no proof of what was originally on the roof, but the intent is to replicate the existing look. Mr. Barrera discussed the existing dormers stating that the applicant would like to keep the front dormer and remove the two rear dormers. Chair Shaffer said that there is no justification presented for removing the rear dormers and that they are protected older design elements on this historic structure which are visible from Baltimore Street and Schoolhouse Alley. He said that these particular dormers speak to the historic style of dormers.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 404 Baltimore Street. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both Baltimore and Lefever Streets and Schoolhouse Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the current roof has deteriorated and that the original style could not be determined, so the goal is to replicate the current look of the roof on this historic structure and stated

that the existing dormers should be kept; and the proposed work should be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 404 Baltimore Street to replace the existing asbestos roof system with a Woodland GAF roof system and retain all three dormers and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 15, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention**.

D. COA 22-0082 MAJOR PROJECT: 7 Hanover Street – APPLICATION WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT

Remove metal access stair to second floor and add a third level pressure-treated lumber stairway and landing to the second and third floors by removing a window at the 3rd story to a man door entrance.

E. COA 22-0084 MAJOR PROJECT: 29 Hanover Street – Dean G. Harner

Remove one-inch quarter-corrugated galvanized panels that are approximately 50 years old due to pitting and rust damage making the roof difficult to repair; and replacing it with 5-V crimp steel roofing material that is also galvanized steel.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story frame dwelling with a shingled roof and a single-story front and rear framed porch with a tin roof; and a small one-story framed rear outbuilding with a tin roof. The permit history shows RRUO history from 2018-present, and this current application for a roof replacement.

Mr. Dean G. Harner, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Harner said that he would like to remove the existing metal roof on the main house and install a new multi-rib metal roof with all flashings, accessories and snowguards. He said that the roof is currently to his knowledge not leaking. The Board said that the rear roof style is not acceptable and not allowed on the front of the house.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 29 Hanover Street. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Hanover Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the 5-V crimp roof style is original to the house and needs to be replaced and should be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 29 Hanover Street to replace the existing 5-V crimp style historic roof with 5-V crimp style roof with all accessories, flashings and snowbirds, and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 9, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention**.

G. COA 22-0086 MAJOR PROJECT: 240 Chambersburg Street – George Makoutz

Demolish a concrete block two-car garage (650 sq. ft.) with a shingled roof to the rear of the property along W. Zerfing Alley to allow work on the main house, and to expand off-street parking in the rear of the property; and replace the roof on the rear addition (change roof pitch) to match the roof on the main part of the original building.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a three-story shingled frame structure with a shared front porch, rear two-story shingled frame extension of the structure, with north extension with a tin roof. Rear building numbered as 240 ½ presents as a frame two-story structure with one-story porch facing towards the dwelling. The permit history shows RRUO history from 2018-2022, an emergency roof repair, board-up windows, new roof and downspouts to direct water away from the neighbor's siding as needed to repair the emergency area in 2021; and this current application for window replacement.

Mr. Joe Edgar, Architect from Snyder Design LLC, and Mr. George Makoutz of 240-242 Chambersburg LLC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Edgar said that the main house structure currently needs a lot of work, and that the future vision is for apartments or an Air B & B. He said that the rear garage would need to be demolished in order to allow access for construction work to the main house, and to change the roof to the rear of the property. He said that the rear roof trusses would have to be replaced, and access for that type of work cannot be gained with the current rear garage standing in the way. He said that they would excavate the area after demolition for future parking. The Board discussed the demolition requirements with the applicants, highlighting points A, B, C, E in the *Historic District Ordinance for Demolition*. Mr. Makoutz said that the garage would need to be repaired in order to become a sound structure.

Chair Shaffer said that the demolition of the garage that is over fifty years old is needed to further protect the main house, but key elements are required in order to tear it down. He requested more information from the applicant to support demolition of the rear garage.

The applicants agreed to **table the application** until more information could be presented regarding demolition; and they were provided with a copy of the Demolition Checklist from the Historic District ordinance for their review.

Chair Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the following applicant: 163 York Street – Twin Bridges Farm LLC (Open Minds), whereby Vice-Chair Stone assumed the role as Chair.

F. COA 22-0085 MAJOR PROJECT: 163 York Street – Twin Bridges Farm LLC

Demolition of a brick portico above the office entrance was approved in a previous HARB meeting; and this application is for the restoration of the wall face above the entrance using stucco at a reduced height to match the height of the building roof.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 17 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a brick two-story building with a shingled roof, with an attached rear-facing framed one-story addition with a shingled roof; and two rear outbuildings that are one-story and two-story

framed structures with shingled roofs. The permit history shows restoration and replacement of brick and RRUO in 2017; repair stucco on rear south exterior and paint in 2028; and replace HVAC, power wash, prime and repaint panels, replace door in-kind, replace window sills/reinstall window, demolish portico, and this application to rebuild same in 2022.

Mr. Gary Shaffer of Design Associates LLC, on behalf of the applicant answered Board questions. He said that the applicant would like to use a stucco material and keep the same design; and that the repair is needed for safety reasons.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 163 York Street. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both York and Liberty Streets and Zerfing Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure has had several alterations over the years but has a unique character. He said that the replacement of the brick portico with stucco would address the current safety issue and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 163 York Street to demolish the existing brick portico above the Open Minds' side entrance due to the brick separating from the building, and to restore the wall face using stucco at a reduced height to match the height of the building roof that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated June 28, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention**.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- A. COA 22-0077 MINOR PROJECT: 528 York Street - Peter Prowant**
Replace roof in-kind shingle to shingle. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.
- B. COA 22-0078 MINOR PROJECT: 619 Baltimore Street - Erian Associates Limited **CANCELLED PROJECT****
Remove existing decking and railing on gazebo leaving the framing in-tact. Install composite decking over entire deck. Install two new sets of steps in existing locations, including new stringers, tread and risers. Install vinyl posts sleeves over existing 4' x 4' with base and cap trims. Install new 42" vinyl railings with ADA handrails at steps and ramp area. All work will be done in-kind. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.
- C. COA 22-0079 MINOR PROJECT: 13 Chambersburg Street - Gioconda Fazzolari**
Replace rubber roofing, install all necessary flashing as needed. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

D. COA 22-0081 MINOR PROJECT: 1 Lincoln Square – Gettysburg Hotel Investors, LLC

Display 4' x 8' banner to welcome the US Army 50th from September 6th – 9th. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

E. COA 22-0098 MAJOR PROJECT: 529 Baltimore Street – Anne Knox

CHANGE OF SCOPE: Revised COA - no change in the building footprint, the structure will be restored 'in-kind' to its original features prior to the fire and explosion. All work will be in-kind, and any new materials or changes to the façade appearance will require HARB approval; and any applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the July 20, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and **carried 5-to-0 by roll call vote**.

F. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer had no report at this time.

G. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English had no report at this time.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Ms. Christianson made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The **motion passed 5-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 10:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant