



**September 20, 2023**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Troxell Council Chambers**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, September 20, 2023 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Paul Witt, Suzanne Christianson, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Andrew Johnson; **Others in Attendance:** Gettysburg Borough Manager Charles Gable; Charles H. Huber, property owner, representing 120 N. Stratton Street; Sharon A. Monahan, property owner, representing 114 W. Broadway; Principal Project Architect Charles Alexander of Alexander Design Studio, Attorney Kurt E. Alexander Esq. of Salzmann Hughes PC, and Developer Timothy C. Harrison of TCH Realty and Development Company LLC Staten Island, all representing the Gettysburg Station Project between Carlisle and N. Stratton Streets; representing the press was Jim Hale with the Gettysburg Times: and filming by *Community Media of South Central PA*, formerly known as *Adams County Community Television (ACTV)*.

**Call Meeting to Order**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of six (6) voting members present.

**Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***“HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council.”*** Borough Council will next meet on Tuesday, October 10, 2023 (Borough will be closed on Monday, October 9<sup>th</sup> in observance of Columbus Day).

**Review of Agenda and Minutes**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the September 20, 2023 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the September 20, 2023 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 6-to-0 without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the August 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted with the following correction made by Vice-Chair Stone on page 4 change “whereby Vice-Chair Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair” to “whereby Vice-Chair Stone assumed the role as Chair”. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the August 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

#### **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

#### **Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

#### **New Business: Applications for Initial Review**

There were no applications presented for initial review.

#### **Special Presentation**

**Concept Design Presentation for the Gettysburg Station by Architect Charles Alexander of Alexander Design Studio.** Principal Project Architect Charles Alexander of Alexander Design Studio, Attorney Kurt E. Alexander Esq. of Salzmann Hughes PC, and Developer Timothy C. Harrison of TCH Realty and Development Company LLC Staten Island, all representing the Gettysburg Station Project, are present to provide preliminary images and receive comments from HARB regarding the design for the project located north of the Race Horse Alley Parking Plaza between Carlisle and N. Stratton Streets.

Project Developer introduced himself and his team to the Board and expressed their gratitude for the opportunity to showcase their Gettysburg Station Project to the Board and receive their comments. The team views Gettysburg as a very special place and plans to incorporate the historical nature of the architecture in this project.

Principal Project Architect Alexander presented the project location, preliminary concept design elements and project elements to the Board and received and responded to their questions. He showed images of the three buildings (two 48-foot tall buildings closer to Carlisle and N. Stratton Streets and one center structure between them reaching up to 72 feet) that included warm Glen-Gery Mahoney Brown Smooth bricks, Hardie Straight Edge Titanium Gray roof mansard shingles, green roofs, black trim/panels, Greek façade pilaster motif on ends to create Juliette-style balconies, and dark-colored upper floors stepped back from the street level on the 2.4 acre site. He said that the N. Stratton Street building would comprise three town house units fronting the sidewalk and would complement the existing residential architecture of the neighborhood. He said that 186 residential apartment units would be located above retail and restaurant spaces below with covered porches for outside dining areas; and that an elevator shaft (5 feet above roof line) and ventilation units (3 feet above roof line) would only rise from the center of the roof and not visible from the public view way. He said that 195 parking spaces are planned for the site to include 95 underground spaces surpassing the 129 required parking spaces for the project; and would also include green grass spaces intermixed with parking spaces on the site. He said that a proposed elevator for the Race Horse Alley Parking Plaza would be built at the developer’s expense to accommodate

additional parking at the neighboring garage. He said that the proposal includes the demolition of the existing Carlisle Street Transit Center and its relocation or a new structure across N. Stratton Street on the east side that would consist of a canopy structure with limited seating and without restrooms or offices per the wishes of the transit provider Susquehanna Regional Transportation Authority. He said that the project proposal included an extension of the Gettysburg Innerloop bicycle-pedestrian pathway on the site parallel and north of the railroad tracks located behind the Race Horse Alley Parking Plaza; and that the lighting for the sight would involve fixtures that radiate light towards the ground in accordance with “dark sky rules” used in Maryland to prevent lighting overload and to protect nature.

HARB members offered the following suggestions to the development/project design team:

- incorporate more local stone into the façade (Architect Alexander considered adding stone to the façade base consistent with other buildings in town).
- Parking spaces need to include full vehicle pull-in and consider separate in/out gates to the garage.
- Add decorative crowns above top floor windows to replicate the popular Italianate-style buildings throughout the town and to create warmth to the buildings.
- Incorporate less modern and more residential design elements to the three duplex units in the N. Stratton Street structure to blend into the residential neighborhood.
- Use similar lighting structures in parking lots and along the bike path that would be black in color and would accommodate hanging plants similar to those fixtures used to light the Borough streets and Steinwehr Avenue.
- Add façade street trees to soften appearance and to reflect neighborhood.

HARB Members were pleasantly surprised by the overall design elements for modern construction of the proposed multi-story Gettysburg Station Project and complimented the thoughtfulness of the development design team in their efforts to make this project functional and appropriate for the downtown Historic District area.

## Reports

### **A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:**

- **COA 23-0063 MINOR PROJECT – 41 Barlow Street – Charles Hess**  
Re-roof shingle-to-shingle. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 23-0065 MINOR PROJECT – 162 York Street – Waymore Properties LLC**  
Restoration and painting of existing wood front façade windows; install a new ADA ramp to rear with wider sidewalks and raising existing porch floor with wood decking over existing concrete deck, keeping historic columns (not visible from York Street). All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration.
- **COA 23-0066 MINOR PROJECT – 44 York Street – White Orchard Enterprise LLC**  
Re-roof EPDM-to-EPDM “in-kind”. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- **COA 23-0064 MINOR PROJECT 123 W. Middle Street – Dean Vaccher**

Re-roof 5 V-Crimp-to-5 V-Crimp ‘in kind’. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

**NOTE:** HARB is a *design review board only*, and each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building Code Requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the August 16, 2023 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 6-to-0 without dissension**.

**A. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer**

Chair Shaffer said that he had no report; but wanted to note that he was encouraged by the Gettysburg Station preliminary design plans.

**B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation**

**1. Historic District Inventory**

Director English said that the request to annex into the Gettysburg Historic District the Evergreen Cemetery at 799 Baltimore Street is under the review of the Borough Solicitor (this is to correct the address of 368 Springs Avenue as previously noted in a previous agenda).

**2. LED Lighting in the Historic District**

Director English stated that the use of LED lights in the Historic District has become more prevalent and discussed their use with the Board.

**3. Satellite Dish Updates**

Director English said that Council approved the ordinance, and it is under review by the Borough Solicitor. She noted that there is a grant application for the updates to the ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

**4. THANK YOU Hang Tags**

Director English distributed more “Thank You” hang tag (showing appreciation for property maintenance in the Historic District) to the Board for their use; but highlighted the need to let her know where tags are distributed.

**Other Business**

Director English discussed the front entry steps repair project at 49 York Street (Gettysburg Community Theatre) with the Board. She said that the concrete steps were covered by carpet, which is disintegrating and causing damage to the steps. She said that this project is not an administrative approval because the change in materials must be presented before the Board.

**Public Comment**

There was no public comment at this time.

With no other business before the Board, Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone. The **motion passed 6-to-0**; the meeting adjourned at 8:35 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Planning Management Assistant