



May 19, 2021

Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes

Borough of Gettysburg

(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Phil Goble called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:05 PM on Wednesday, May 19, 2021. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Phil Goble, Vice-Chair Colleen Lingle, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Jim McCabe, and Joan Hodges; Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; and Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager for PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA), participating as a non-voting advisory role; **Absent Board Member:** Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; **Others in Attendance:** Cindy Fox, Property Owner, representing 29 Breckenridge Street; Shelley Knouse, Property and Business Owner, representing 28 Chambersburg Street; and Gary W. Shaffer, AIA at Shaffer Design Associates PC, representing 135 Buford Avenue.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Phil Goble called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:05 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Phil Goble, Vice-Chair Colleen Lingle, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Jim McCabe, and Joan Hodges; **absent:** Building Code Official Clem Malot.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Goble introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 14, 2021.

Review of Agenda

Chair Goble asked the Board to accept the May 19, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the May 19, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Lingle. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY:**

HARB Business Meeting

May 19, 2021

Page 1 of 6

Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the April 21, 2021 HARB Meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Lingle. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-0046 CRITICAL PROJECT: 29 Breckenridge Street – Cindy Fox

Notice of Violation (NOV) was issued (noted in the April 2021 NOV Report) for the demolition of a 19'x4' front façade block foundation porch with wood board flooring, frame roof, and four columns. Applicant would like to replace the existing entranceway with two separate steps and landings to the front entrances of both apartments. The new 72'x42' steps and landing area would be made of pressure treated lumber resembling the steps located at 25-27 Breckenridge Street.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 19, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a 2-story frame dwelling with a slate/tin roof; and that the Permit History for the property included the use as RRUOs since 2018, a 2011 Land Use Permit issued for the repair of fire damage, and a 1994 Land Use/Fence Permit.

Ms. Fox gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that she was unaware of the historic district requirements and was seeking to replace a dangerous front porch. She said that she had obtained an Adams County Building permit, and that her proposed work would include installing a prebuilt pressure treated wood front porch with stainless steel screws that would match the front porch at 25-27 Breckenridge Street in style but with the stairs going in the opposite direction to align with the front doors. Mr. Shaffer noted that there were many alterations to this building, and the Board discussed more complimentary design styles with the applicant. Director English will email porch style samples from the Gettysburg Design Guide and those that would meet the historically accurate requirements from the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for porch rehabilitation.

Chair Goble presented the Proposed Findings of Fact for the Critical Project at 29-29.5 Breckenridge Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing structure located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as

defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public view way via Breckenridge Street, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed work for the front porch is not consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* nor the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for porches and is not complimentary to the house. He said that the front porch was removed without approval from HARB or the required permits from Gettysburg Borough. Mr. Shaffer recommended that the application be denied as submitted until the project scope aligned with both guidelines, and to clarify the siding.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council **NOT** issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the front porch replacement project at 29-29.5 Breckenridge Street as presented to the Board from the application dated April 21, 2021 until the project scope includes a front porch design with staircase that aligns with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, and that the siding proposal be clarified. Ms. Hodges seconded the motion.

Chair Goble called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Lingle, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Hodges; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**.

B. COA 21-0045 MAJOR PROJECT – 28 Chambersburg Street – Shelley Knouse

Replace 120 feet of existing chain link fence with a solid 6'-high privacy stockade vinyl fence **OR** with a 4'-high wrought iron fence with three (3) man gates in rear yard as shown in the submitted COA application photos. The new fence will replace the existing chain link fence in the exact same location.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 19, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the building first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a three-story brick residential structure, with a shingled roof, to include a rear facing two-story brick portion of the main residence with a slate/tin roof and side two-story frame porch with a slate/tin roof. She noted that other work would include the removal of the existing sidewalk and replace it with pavers, and to topcoat the existing parking area. The Permit History for the property included: LU-18-0009 to replace windows, LU-200039 resubmitted for new signage (denied signage painted on brick), S-150004 for new signage, 2013 replace shutters and downspouts, 2007 to enclose rear sunroom, 1998 for new signage, 1997 reconstruction due to a car accident, and 1990 for front door replacement.

Ms. Knouse gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that the existing 4' chain link fence is not historic and only has two gates; but that she would like to add a third gate on the Church side to access the fire escape. She said that she would like to add a 6'-high vinyl stockade privacy fence in a color to match the building (khaki or black) on both sides (and deter visitors from accessing her rear yard); and to use a black aluminum open fence to the rear of the property to maintain visual site over her rear parking area. The pavers from Architectural Products in Hanover would create both a walkway and permit water to drain through it.

Chair Goble presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 28 Chambersburg Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing structure located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as

defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public view way via Chambersburg Street and Zerfing Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed work for the proposed fence and pavers is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 6'-high stockade privacy fence on both sides of the property, a rear wrought iron aluminum fence to the rear of the property, and architectural pavers to replace the side walkway at 28 Chambersburg Street that is consistent with *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented to the Board from the application dated April 27, 2021. Mr. McCabe seconded the motion.

Chair Goble called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Lingle, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Hodges; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**.

(Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant.)

C. COA 21-0037 MAJOR PROJECT – 135 Buford Avenue – Thomas Daniel LTD

Applicant submitted a new COA in response to a Notice of Violation (NOV) received from PMCA in November 2020. The completed porch railings did not match the approved 2019 COA.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 19, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1912 as a 2-story frame structure with a double front and rear addition with a shingled roof. The Permit History for the property included: LU-190205 for external/internal upgrades to convert to Air B&B with COA-190077 to replace all aluminum/vinyl siding with vinyl and to replace existing windows with new vinyl windows.

The Board discussed the COA project with Mr. Shaffer, who is representing the applicant. Mr. Shaffer asked the Board for guidance on what the Board expects for the front porch after the denial of the project at the April 21, 2021 meeting due to the completed project not matching and going beyond the initial scope approved in COA-19-0077 for the installation of porch railings and balusters thereby resulting in a Notice of Violation from PMCA for work without proper permits. Chair Goble said that the April motion recommended denial of the COA as presented for a scope not consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guideline*. The Board discussed the porch application with the applicant's representative, noting the different materials used to construct the railings, spindles, and substrate beyond the original scope; and that the height of the porch railing failed to meet code as constructed. The Board recommended that the porch materials should be replaced with wood, and the railing height should meet code.

Mr. Shaffer withdrew the application as presented.

(Mr. Shaffer returned as a voting member of the Board).

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0041 MINOR PROJECT: 156 York Street, Borough BBQ - Linda Atiyeh**
Installation of two new business signs for Borough BBQ: one 36"x27" projecting sign with text "Borough BBQ" to be hung by brackets bolted to the mortar joints (not in the brick); and one 8'x2.5' wall sign with text "Borough BBQ" to be bolted to mortar not bricks to building façade above store front window. Total sign square footage permitted for the property is 66 SF, total approved is 64.25SF. CONDITION OF APPROVAL: all unpermitted signs must be removed from building frontage, and property shall remain in compliance with Chapter 19 of the *Code of Ordinances Gettysburg Borough*, and all construction must meet the *Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0043 MINOR PROJECT: 461 Baltimore Street – Frederick and Marcia Fowler**
Installation of a portable plastic 8.6 SF A-Frame sign to read "Local Artist Jewelry Studio".
- **COA 21-0044 MINOR PROJECT: 13 Steinwehr Avenue – Donald Altman**
Installation of two signs and one banner: one portable 2'3"x3'10" vinyl plastic A-frame sign, one 4'x2' (8SF) wood sign to hang from existing brackets to read "Lavender and Sage Metaphysical Shoppe", and one 2'x6' banner to be displayed from 4/30/2021 through 5/30/2021.
- **COA 21-0047 MINOR PROJECT: 214 Chambersburg Street – SPG Capitol**
Replace existing concrete step covered in turf grass with pressure treated wood step covered in turf grass, and tie in sump pump to side downspout to alleviate water flowing over sidewalk in winter months.
- **COA 21-0048 MINOR PROJECT: 12 Wade Avenue – Kurt and Nancy Kramer**
Replace 20 existing vinyl windows with 'in kind' vinyl replacement windows to match existing windows; and restore and repaint wood frames as needed.
- **COA 21-0049 MINOR PROJECT: 341 Baltimore Street – Deborah Shearer & Marc Ferraro**
Repair and repoint mortar, check for leaks in eaves; spot re-pointing consists of filling any holes or voids in brick wall near rain spout; repair all mortar and brick with age-appropriate material; and seal brick with clear sealant to ensure long brick life.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinance and Building code requirements.

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the April 21, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – *Chair Goble*

Chair Goble had no report at this time.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

Director English discussed the following items with the Board:

- Continue to review the master list of candidates for the upcoming Annual Historic Preservation Awards and forward any information to her directly,
- Updated the Board on *Gettysburg Design Guide* funding,
- Updated the Board the use/proliferation of satellite dishes in the Borough,
- Discussed the HARB Recognition of Exceptional Work Door Hangers with the Board, and asked members to send addresses for these informal recognitions to her email; and discussed possibly recognizing non-HD properties in the *Gettysburg Times* “Letters to the Editor” section,
- Discussed available webinars/trainings for CLG credits with the Board,
- Discussed the use of alternate materials in the Historic District,
- Reminded the Board to fill out and return their ethics papers to Assistant Borough Manager / Secretary Stull at 59 E. High Street as soon as possible.

Other Business

There was no other business presented to the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed **6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:22 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant