



May 18, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 18, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of four (4) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, and Suzanne Christianson, and Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Justin Harmon, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, (Jim McCabe had resigned from the Board on May 5 2022); **Others in Attendance:** Dan Small, Property Owner, representing 205 S. Stratton Street; Dwayne Mills, Owner Manager of J M Construction, representing both 139 and 143 Chambersburg Street; David Martin, Gettysburg #0363058905 SONOCO Manager, representing 225 York Street; Robert Thaeler, Adams County Principle Planner, representing 45 W. High Street-Mercy House; and Max Felty of Felty Investments LP and Architects Christopher Urban and Elijah Dolly of Buchart Horn Inc., representing 778 Baltimore Street-Baltimore Street Tour Center; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:03 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of four (4) voting members present. Chair Shaffer said that tonight's meeting followed the 2022 Historic Preservation Awards that celebrated and honored 20 Historic District Projects that were completed during the 2018-2021 calendar years with 30 representatives in attendance. He noted that the annual awards ceremony covered a four-year period due in part to pandemic shutdown. He thanked all those who attended this festive presentation normally held during May which is Historic Preservation month (see attached brochure).

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness; and in the case of a split-vote decision tonight due to only four members constituting a quorum, HARB would not recommend that project to Council at this time. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 13, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to remove Agenda Item A from the agenda because they would not be representing that project tonight; and to accept the May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone and **carried 4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

B. COA 22-0049 MAJOR PROJECT: 205 S. Stratton Street – Dan and Shannon Small

Remove existing widow sashes and exterior trims and replace with Harvey Vinyl replacement windows to match grille profile with full fiberglass mesh screens; apply aluminum window wraps, caulk on interior and exterior to finish including a complete wrap of bow window trim on north façade, and installation of both picture window /double-hung assemblies on south façade. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story frame dwelling with a front and south side single story porch with a composition roof. The permit history shows 2018-2022 RRUO permits, a new roof permit in 2018, a fence permit in 2021, and the current application for a window replacement.

Mr. Daniel Small, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the structure at 205 S. Stratton Street is a sister Sears Catalogue Home to the house that he lives in at 65 E. High Street. He said that he would like to replace the existing wooden single-pane glass windows with Harvey Vinyl replacement windows that will be built to manufacturer specifications with grille configurations to match existing windows and full fiberglass screens. He said that the new windows would be installed to the existing interior trims, and that the air cavity between the new vinyl units and existing wooden frames would be insulated with fiberglass batt insulation per standard practice. He said that the exterior trims would be wrapped in aluminum to resemble the current trim profile and would be sealed with silicone caulk. He said that vinyl windows were installed across the street. The Board discussed the proposed window replacement with the applicant, noting that the installation of vinyl windows was done without prior board approval or knowledge of the project. Chair Shaffer explained that vinyl windows look different than wood windows, and change the look of the building over all, noting that maintenance of wood windows could be achieved per the

Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for historic windows. Mr. Small said that the house was enlarged during the late sixties or early seventies and asked to replace all eleven wooden windows with vinyl and wrap the wood casing around the windows to reduce maintenance and add energy efficiency. He said that most of the windows are not operational and that an air conditioning unit on the east façade caused wood rot. Chair Shaffer said that cladding the woodwork on the main façade which is visible by the public view way is not recommended. He noted that wood windows last longer than vinyl which usually needs replacement from wear in 25 years. He said that the main windows on the original front façade and the window to the left of the front door look radically different than those that are on the addition. He said that he would recommend not replacing the wood windows on the original Sears Tudor style home which are design elements of the house, noting that the windows on the addition are not sensitive to the style and could be replaced. He suggested not replacing the original windows on the east façade facing Stratton Street and therefore maintaining the wood windows. He would recommend the replacement of the other windows not original to the structure or visible to the public. Mr. Small discussed replacing the three front windows with solid wood windows of the same size.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 205 S. Stratton Street. He said that this dwelling has significant integrity, is representative of a Sears Tudor style home, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via S. Stratton Street and Wall Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the windows on the addition do not represent any design significance and could be replaced along with the rear windows; but the three front façade windows on the original structure along with the door and window trim should be maintained or replaced with wood windows casings or wood-like materials that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide for Historic Windows*.

Chair Shaffer made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to maintain or replace the wood windows on the original structure facing east with wood materials, to replace the remaining windows with vinyl, and that none of the casings be clad in aluminum at 205 S. Stratton Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated April 18, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

C. COA-220047 MAJOR PROJECT: 139 Carlisle Street, KPI Technology – Annsan Partnership et al

Violation removal prior to permit application and fines may apply. Removed existing slate shingles and replaced them with synthetic slate roof; removed metal roof and replaced it with a standing seam roof. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her project scope from her May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps as a two-story frame structure with a slate roof, and that the permit history includes this current application for roofing (NOV).

Mr. Dwayne Mills representing the home owner gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Mills said that the roof on the structure consists of a hodge-podge of materials, and

leaks compromising the ceiling. Mr. Mills said that he would like to use standing seam metal to replace the metal roof on the main roof that pitches away from the building; and synthetic slate to replace the slate on the mansard roof. He said that no siding work would be done unless in areas where the roof needs to be patched; and that he would use wood materials from the rear of the structure which was protected from the weather under the eaves in order to make the repairs. He noted that the attic has bats and is compromised. Chair Shaffer suggested working with the property owner to maintain as much of the original material as possible, especially on the front façade.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 139 Carlisle Street. He said that this Queen Ann Victorian style structure has a significant amount of detailing, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building with high architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Carlisle Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed roof replacement using synthetic slate and standing seam metal resulted from severe deterioration of the slate that could not be corroborated since it was prematurely removed and is a critical project that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation.

Vice Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the slope metal roof with standing seam metal and the mansard part of the roof with synthetic slate at 139 Carlisle Street as presented to the Board in the application dated April 20, 2022 that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

D. COA 22-0048 MAJOR PROJECT: 143 Carlisle Street, KPI Technology – Annsan Partnership et al

Notice of Violation (NOV) for the removal of shingles on main roof with new shingles (fines may apply); and replaced rubber and metal porch roof with rubber and standing seam metal roof. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She asked what material will be used on the second-floor roof area over the extruded window above the porch, noting that this area was not indicated on the submitted application. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story frame structure; and the permit history includes this current application for roofing (NOV).

Mr. Dwayne Mills representing the property owner gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Mills provided background information to the Board as presented in his presentation regarding his project. He told the Board that he would like to replace in-kind the shingles on the main roof with architectural three-tab shingles, replace the rubber and metal porch roofs with rubber and standing seam metal, remove the wood siding from the rear façade to replace the deteriorated siding on the front façade, and to replace the removed rear siding with Hardy Plank wood siding.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 143 Carlisle Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a folk Victorian building used as a

former residence with high architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Carlisle Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed work involves the replacement of the shingled roof on the main roof with architectural three-tab shingles, replace rubber and metal porch roofs with rubber and standing seam metal roofs, remove the wood siding from the rear façade to replace deteriorated siding on the front façade, and replace the removed rear siding with Hardy Plank wood siding that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the shingled roof on the main roof with architectural three-tab shingles, replace rubber and metal porch roofs with rubber and standing seam metal, remove the wood siding from the rear façade to replace deteriorated siding on the front façade, and replace the removed rear siding with Hardy Plank wood siding at 143 Carlisle Street as presented to the Board in the application dated April 20, 2022 that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

E. COA 22-0054 MAJOR PROJECT: 225 York Street, SUNOCO Mini Mart – Ravi Singh

Violation for the installation without permits of new lighting on the commercial building to include three wall packs and 16 light bars. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story brick building with a slate or tin roof and utilized as a Veterinarian Hospital. The permit history includes a 2020 sign permit and the current application for lighting (NOV).

Mr. David Martin, Store Manager of the SUNOCO Mini Mart and representing the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Martin said that the lighting was installed due to an attempted robbery at the gas station store due to poor lighting conditions which prevented the identification of the car involved. He said that the bulbs could not be replaced and that the actual fixtures were inoperable, and that there was not enough light to illuminate the area for safety. He said that lights were added to the front of the building under the soffit to make the building area safe. He said that this SUNOCO station belongs to a private franchise. Chair Shaffer said that the building is over lit for a structure in the Historic District resulting in light pollution for surrounding neighborhoods. He said that the Board does not have enough information such as night time lighting conditions from the property owner to review the application as submitted regarding the installed lighting fixtures. The Board discussed different lighting alternatives with the applicant and how they would affect neighboring properties and how to reduce/restrict light to their property only. Chair Shaffer asked the applicant if he wanted to table the application until more information regarding night time lighting conditions, light lumen and temperature information of existing light fixtures was available to present to the Board for their review and he agreed. Director English will provide the applicant with a list of lighting items needed for Board review.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that the presented COA application COA-220054 for 225 York Street-SUNOCO Mini Mart be tabled pending the submission of supplemental lighting cut

sheet information for Board review. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

- F. COA 22-0053 MAJOR PROJECT: 45 W. High Street, Mercy House – Robert Thaeler, Adams County**
Replace metal roofing on upper 12' x 30' roof with EPDM rubber roofing material; replace wood trim around upper portion of roof with in-kind wood. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick building with a rear framed porch and a shingled roof. The permit history includes a 2018 Zoning Certificate Letter; a 2019 Land Use Permit for exterior and interior modifications as approved through COA, for the current use of Mercy House as a Rehab Center; and this application for a change in roof materials.

Mr. Robert Thaeler, Adams County Planner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Thaeler said that the flat roof on top of the Mercy House (the former St. Francis Xavier Convent) is leaking and compromising the structure. He would like to use an EPDM to replace the existing flat metal roof, and that a wood clad replacement would surround the flat roof and painted to match the existing building trim. He noted that the flat roof could not be seen from W. High Street.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Critical Project at 45 W. High Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building with high architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and that the proposed work is not visible from the public view way via both W. High Street and Legion Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed removal of the flat metal roof because its deteriorated condition has no visibility, is compromising the structure, and that the surrounding fascia board has limited visibility (and will be replaced in-kind) and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the flat roof at 45 W. High Street-Mercy House due to compromising conditions as presented to the Board in the application dated April 27, 2022 that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

- G. COA 22-0055 DEMOLITION/NEW CONSTRUCTION PROJECT: 778 Baltimore Street, Baltimore Street Tour Center – Christopher Urban and Max Felty**
Demolish a one-story commercial building and replace it with a new two-story commercial building to include a first-floor space for ticketing and sales and second-floor space for offices and an employee conference area.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her 18, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as the Cyclorama, a steel circular frame building with a brick exterior and a small frame

entranceway. The permit history includes a 2017 sign permit; a 2017 permit to remove and replace six Verizon Wireless telecommunication antennae on the existing water tank; a 2017 Amusement License; a 2018 permit to remove the existing front porch columns and porch roof and the north and south stairs, re-shingle, paint, and add railings; a 2018 Certificate of Pre-Existing Non-Conformity; a 2021 RRUO; and the current application for demolition and new construction.

Mr. Max Felty of Felty Investments, and Mr. Christopher Urban, Architect and Mr. Elijah Dolly, Project Manager from Bucharth Horn Architects, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Felty said that the current structure began as a ticket booth from a modular cabin and had numerous additions for functionality over the years to include an enclosed front porch and an addition to the east façade until the current space could no longer be maintained. He said that the structure does not have a basement/foundation, and that this is a good time to construct a new building that would meet their needs. He would like the proposed building to compliment the surrounding structures in the neighborhood. He said that the property also includes a GMA right-of-way to their water tower and a stone fence without a safe entranceway to the battlefield. He told the Board that he would like to go deeper into the existing lot with the building footprint, address handicap parking spaces to include a sidewalk with a level accessway to the building and add greenspace design elements that would include planters. He said that the proposed plans would include a setback on the southside and would add landscaping; that the east side would be a proposed picnic area and he would like to remove the benches in order to widen the sidewalk. He said that he would work with the National Park Service to gain an accessway through the stone wall to his parking lot to the south; and that he would like covered seating on the east side so that patrons could wait out of the elements for their buses. He discussed his exterior lighting elements to include three 3000 Kelvin wall-mount packs and goose neck lighting for the signage. He said that he would like to remove the telephone pole out front and bury the wires to the building. He proposed to use near brick to match the color of the original brick from the 1890s that came from the brickyard from Costner Avenue. He said that he would like to start construction sometime after August 2022. Mr. Urban said that the parking lot lighting would be placed around the perimeter of the lot and would match their needs striving to not over light the area. He said that access lighting would surround the entire building and would be dimmable and color changing to use as holiday/event lighting purposes.

Director English said that the Board needs to review both the demolition and the proposed design submission together, ensuring that project construction would start after demolition, noting that if any design changes occur through the Planning Commission, that the applicant must return to HARB for resubmittal of those changes. Mr. Felty said that his business would continue business operations out of a construction trailer during demolition/construction process. Mr. Shaffer said that the zoning requires a 24-foot minimum height; and if the current structure is demolished, the new building would be subjected to new zoning regulations. He said that the lighting under signage is specified in the ordinance and suggested checking those lighting guidelines when considering their lighting options.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Demolition/New Construction Project at 778 Baltimore Street, The Baltimore Street Tour Center. He said that the current dwelling proposed for demolition is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a non-sensitive building without architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Baltimore Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed demolition of the highly altered structure is due to limited retail space as determined by

the nature of their business and that the proposed new construction and use of color and materials is sensitive to the design and scale of the surrounding buildings and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for demolition and new construction.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing structure at 778 Baltimore Street that is tied to new construction as presented to the Board in the application dated May 2, 2022 that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **4-to-0 with one by roll call vote without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 22-0039 MINOR PROJECT: 64 E. Stevens – Kane Family Trust**
Damage to garage roof from a tree. Repair and replace with ‘in kind’ materials and style. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0042 MINOR PROJECT: 323 Baltimore Street – Mark & Heidi Kile**
Remove existing mismatched roof in rear addition only and replace with an EPDM roof. The rear roof is not visible from the main roadway and is in disrepair with mismatched metal pieces. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0043 MINOR PROJECT: 43 Chambersburg Street – G-Burg Real Estate**
Remove and replace existing wood privacy fence with stone veneer over concrete to the rear of the property not visible from Chambersburg Street. Remove and replace existing patio concrete squares. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0050 MINOR PROJECT: 220 S. Stratton Street – Bruce Potter**
Install a concrete pad and Fujitsu 2400 BTU heat pump condenser, install two 12,000 BTU wall hung units on main floor, and install line sets. Located on side of house 10 feet back front facade. All efforts should be made to screen the unit from public view by landscaping or small fence. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0051 MINOR PROJECT: 102 E. Middle Street – Alban Ritterson**
Replace roof shingle-to-shingle using Owens Corning architectural shingles. All applications and construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0052 MINOR PROJECT: 144 E. Middle Street – Nicholas Cellucci**
Repair/replace porch flooring and maintenance of porch and columns, replace rotted wood in-kind and paint. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the February 16, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 4-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer did not have a report at this time.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Thanked everyone for a successful and enjoyable Historic Preservation Awards Ceremony with 30 representatives in attendance receiving 20 Preservation Awards for successful projects in the Gettysburg Historic District.
- Discussed the Satellite Dish updates, noting that Council will need to approve any ordinance/design guide updates. She said a staff intern would be available to help with this transition, and to bring any comments to the next meeting. She said that the Arts Council is interested in working with HARB / Borough to recycle removed satellite dishes and repurpose them into artistic bird baths.
- Discussed the use of “Thank You” hang tags and asked members to provide the address locations where they are hung
- Notified the Board that long-time member Jim McCabe has resigned his position effective May 5, 2022 and asked to recommend anyone interested in serving on the HARB board.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Christianson. The **motion passed 4-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant