



**June 17, 2020**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
**(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, June 17, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Vice-Chair Phil Goble. **Others in Attendance:** Timothy L. Redding of Reddwood Carpentry LLC, representing property owners Daniel and Shannon Small at 65 E. High Street; Eric Jarvinen of Jarvinen Associates Inc. on behalf of the property owner, Susan Saum-Wicklein of L & SW Enterprises LLC, representing 20 Breckenridge; Gary W. Shaffer, AIA, of Shaffer Design Associates on behalf of the property owner, Linda Atiyeh of ISAM LLC, representing 15 York Street ; **Absent Applicant:** Mike Torrao, Northeast Regional Manager of R. L. Grove and Sons Inc. on behalf of the property owner, Dr. Mark Rarrick, representing 250 Buford Avenue-Rarrick Orthodontics.

**Call Meeting to Order**

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Building Code Official Clem Malot. **Absent** HARB Member was Vice-Chair Phil Goble.

**Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, July 13, 2020.

## **Review of Agenda**

Mr. Shaffer said that there was one correction to the June 17, 2020 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented: change the address “11 York Street” to “15 York Street” for COA-20-00XX (number to be determined)” in Item D under *New Business*.

## **Review of Minutes**

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the May 20, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended with the following correction: remove Joan Hodges as “Absent Member” under *Call Meeting to Order*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 4-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Vice-Chair Goble).

## **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

## **Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

## **New Business: Applications for Review**

### **A. COA 20-0040, Major Project: 65 E. High Street – Timothy L. Redding, Reddwood Carpentry LLC**

Replace the existing garage shingled roof with a metal corrugated roof in evergreen colorway with change of material from shingles to metal.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her June 17, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story frame dwelling with a composition roof, and a one-story porch on the east side of the dwelling. She noted that the garage (circa 1951) was not shown on the map. She said that the applicant would like to replace the existing shingled garage roof with a metal corrugated roof in evergreen color.

Mr. Timothy L. Redding gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Redding said the garage roof is leaking and needs to be replaced. He said that he chose a standing seam corrugated roof option with a 1' x 6' underlayment to place over the existing asphalt shingle roof; and that there are not any other structural issues indicated. The Board noted that the house was built from a 1931 Sears Catalogue, and that the garage was built as an accessory detached structure 20 years later.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 65 E. High Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances /*

*Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is an accessory building to an earlier home and is approximately 70 years in age without architectural features. He noted that the roof was used frequently and is highly visible to the public from E. High Street with the gable-end of the roof facing the street.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the existing garage with a metal corrugated roof at 65 E. High Street as presented in the application dated May 18, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member: Vice-Chair Goble).

**B. COA 20-00036, CRITICAL PROJECT: 20 Breckenridge Street – L & SW Enterprises LLC**

Patch and repair north and east exterior walls located above and left of the front entrance door. The brick has crumbled and was removed and patched without permit review. The applicant intends to complete repair, seal, and paint the brick, and repair the lintel over the front door. Ms. English noted that a Stop Work Order was issued by PMCA on May 13, 2020. Mr. Shaffer said that the wrong brick was used for the repair; and that HARB Administrative approval could be granted if the proper permits are secured. Mr. Malot added that the wrong mortar was also used and questioned if a PA licensed contractor was used for the project.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her June 17, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1896 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown as a two-story brick duplex with a rear one-story frame shingled roof, and a rear one-story frame addition with a shingled roof; and there is a small two-story side porch with a slate roof, and two accessory structures both with one-story shingled roofs. She said that the applicant would like to repair the north and east exterior walls located above and to the left of the front entrance door, noting that the brick has crumbled, and was removed without permit review.

Mr. Eric Jarvinen gave a brief presentation and answered board questions. He said that the applicant had received an *Order to Show Cause Notification* from Clem Malot at Pennsylvania Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA) on April 23, 2020, stating that the structure was unsafe, and that all work had to be stopped. He said that the east wall was previously painted white, and squalling did appear here and over the front door. He felt that the damaged was caused by failure of the roof edge over the East wall, and that an air conditioning unit caused the damage over the front door. He said that the applicant had employed a MD contractor, Wayne Painting and Home Improvements, on April 20, 2020 to repair the building. He said that both issues were brought to the applicant's attention by PMCA on April 23<sup>rd</sup> and was instructed that the unsafe structure must be repaired immediately. He noted that the contractor had then proceeded to repair the lintel over the front door as an emergency repair during COVID19. Mr. Malot said that the property owner had never obtained the required permits to do the repairs, that the brick debris was observed on the front stoop by the Gettysburg Borough Police Department, and that the contractor had never submitted a Certificate of Liability Insurance (COI). Mr. Jarvinen said that he came onto this project midway through the process, and he was not involved in the selection of the project materials. Mr. Shaffer said that the

proper permits must be obtained before the work could proceed; and that HARB was asked to review the COA application because of the change in materials used (hard brick with machined edges instead of soft brick with round edges). Mr. Malot noted that the stop order was issued because the proper permits were not obtained, and that the appropriate mortar was not used to install the brick resulting in the debris on the front porch. Ms. English said that the Director of Planning did notify the applicant that permits were required before work was started; and that the proper permits were finally submitted on May 12<sup>th</sup>, but the application submittal was incomplete at that time. Ms. Carly Marshall, Director of Planning, Zoning and Code Enforcement, had advised via email to the applicant that the project must wait until HARB review. Mr. Shaffer said that any work must comply with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for the repair and painting of historic brick, using the same mortar, brick size and consistency for the existing structure.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 20 Breckenridge Street to repair a historic building with similar materials compliant with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for brick, mortar, painting and cleaning as submitted in the application dated May 8, 2020. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe.

The Board discussed the motion. Mr. Jarvinen said that he would use a means to seal the brick that would protect the brick but allow it to breathe. The Board instructed the applicant to obtain the proper permits that would comply with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. Mr. Jarvinen said that he would have the applicant hand-deliver the COI on June 18<sup>th</sup>. Mr. Shaffer noted that if the proper permits were submitted demonstrating the correct material, then the approval could have been approved administratively. Mr. Malot said that the brick problem did not happen overnight, and that the applicant could have sought permits earlier.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member: Vice-Goble).

*Mr. Shaffer noted that Agenda Item C will be moved to the end of the Agenda pending the arrival of the applicant, and will proceed to Agenda Item D.*

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Second Vice-Chair Gustafson assumed the role as Chair.*

#### **D. COA 20-0051, MAJOR PROJECT: 15 York Street – Linda Atiyeh, ISAM LLC**

Install two windows and one door, and one door on the west façade of the rear extension of the building. This façade has limited visibility from E. Zerfing Alley. The two windows will be large, 4' x 3' four-inch insulated fixed glass in aluminum frames. Frames to be anodized aluminum. The door will also be full lite glass panel in an aluminum frame. The glass will be insulated panel and the door will be a single 3'-6" x 3'-8" minimum side hinged door; and both will have a window style that will match the large size of the glazed fixed glass opening on the street façade.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her June 17, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick dwelling with a shingled roof. She said that two existing wood-fill openings

may also be restored as windows as indicated in the submitted photos; and that the visibility is limited to Zerfing Alley.

Mr. Gary Shaffer representing the applicant gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the legal address is 11 York Street; but the various address numbers (9-17) represent door openings, and that this project is to the rear of 15 York Street. He said that all are approved as one occupancy. He noted that the Stop Work Order from PMCA was for the work being done to the rear of 15 York Street where the doors and windows are being repaired. Ms. English said that a COA number will be assigned pending the receipt of a few more documents needed for review. Mr. Shaffer said that the proposed work would replace the glass to expand the rear area of the building, noting that there were a number of openings in the rear of the structure when it was expanded and later infilled.

Second Vice-Chair Gustafson presented the *Findings of Fact*. She said that the structure at 15 York Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is located in the public view way from Zerfing Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The proposed work is a Critical Project to a sensitive building and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* by using historically sensitive materials. She noted that the structure is of high architectural integrity despite its many alterations to the rear of the building.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the creation of new and the reopening of old window and door that will match the fixed glass openings on the front facade at 15 York Street Rear as presented in the application dated June 9, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 with one abstention (Mr. Shaffer) (absent member: Vice-Chair Goble).

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair*

**C. COA 20-0043, MAJOR PROJECT: 250 Buford Avenue-Rarrick Orthodontics – Mike Torrao, Regional Manager for R. L. Grove and Sons Inc.**

Replace the rolled roof system with architectural shingles in slate gray color.

Chair Shaffer called for a **motion** that the application for COA-20-0043 at 250 Buford Avenue be tabled until the July 15, 2020 HARB Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member: Vice-Chair Goble).

*The Board did not review this application at this time due to the absence of the applicant.*

## Reports

### **A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:**

- **COA 20-0032, 227 Carlisle Street – Gettysburg College**  
In-kind roof replacement: shingle-to-shingle and rubber base to flat rubber base. No new materials will be utilized
- **COA 20-0039, MINOR PROJECT: 444 Harrisburg Street – Gettysburg College**  
In-kind roof replacement: replace deteriorated gutters and downspouts, repoint, and replace deteriorated brick. All materials must be the same style and color rated for exterior buildings. Match using recycled brick if available.
- **COA 20-0042, MINOR PROJECT: 43 E. Middle Street – Douglas Miller**  
Replace new board fence planks to pre-existing wood stockade fence in back and 4-foot high fence in front of property. Replace some fence posts as needed. Material would match existing wood on fence on the other side of the property.
- **COA-20-0046, MINOR PROJECT: 315 N. Stratton Street – Regina Piper**  
Replace fence between 315 and 317 N. Stratton Street with a 42-inch (3.6 foot)-high white vinyl fence running 50 feet along the north perimeter of the property from the screened porch to the rear carport to include a front gate near the porch.
- **COA-20-0047, MINOR PROJECT: 505 York Street – William H. Ward**  
Remove existing shingle roof system and install GAF Timberline HD Architectural Shingles to include ice and water shields on all eaves, new edgings, flashings, and a snow country ridge vent.
- **COA-20-0041, MINOR PROJECT: 39 Delap Avenue – Douglas Miller**  
Replace rear wood steps with new wood deck and stairs.
- **COA-20-0048, MINOR PROJECT: 39 Delap Avenue – Douglas Miller**  
Install new wood stockade fence around property, 6-foot high with 4-foot high in front yard.

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the May 20, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson and carried 6-to-0.

### **B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer**

- Chair had no report at this time
- **Feedback on Solar Panels**  
The Board discussed the installation of solar panels on historic structures in the Borough of Gettysburg Historic District; and concluded that if they should be installed on rear, they can be approved administratively. The Board would have to review any installations on the front and side facades; and noted that there is some federal protection consistent with satellite dishes stating that they cannot be prohibited, but their positioning could be regulated. The Board discussed placement of panels on the ground and not always on roof; and that any placement should coincide with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

## **B. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation***

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Ms. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2019 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to email her with any recommendations to revise the current list. She encouraged the Board to continue to look for training credits.

### **Other Business**

Ms. English discussed tents used by businesses for outdoor dining during the COVID19 pandemic with the Board. She said that all large tents over 200sf should be inspected by PMCA for structural integrity and safety (flame and smoke retardant, grounding etc.). Tents are being used by businesses to encourage outdoor dining activity as a social distancing option during the pandemic. Mr. Malot suggested issuing a time-limit for placement, and that the timeframe could be extended as needed.

### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Ms. Lingle made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Planning Management Assistant