



July 15, 2020
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, July 15, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Colleen Lingle. **Others in Attendance:** Philip B. Schindel and Jake W. Schindel, representing 110, Chambersburg Street; Lois A. Edwards, representing 303 S. Washington Street; Dr. Mark Rarick of Rarick Orthodontics, and Zach Wolford of R. L. Groves & Sons Inc., representing 250 Buford Avenue; and Gary W. Shaffer, AIA, of Shaffer Design Associates on behalf of the property owner, Linda Atiyeh of ISAM LLC, representing Lulu's Finest Ice Cream Shop at 11 York Street ; **Absent Applicant:** Roy and Linda Fauth, representing 24-26 Barlow Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Building Code Official Clem Malot. **Absent** HARB Member was Colleen Lingle. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, August 10, 2020.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the July 15, 2020 meeting agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the June 17, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

A. COA 20-0033, Major Project: 110 Chambersburg Street – Philip B. Schindel

Renovation of existing cinderblock garage to rear of property, into commercial space with an exterior design like a typical carriage house with wood and batten exterior siding. (Reviewed 5/20/2020 – 2nd review)

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her July 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to construct a second floor to an existing detached rear garage, changing the concrete block exterior to wood board and batten siding, replace the roof with asphalt shingles, add a stone veneer base around the front, and add new windows and doors as shown on the elevation sketch. She said that the property first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a three-story brick dwelling with a composition roof, a two-story rear brick addition with a slate roof, and had a front single-story slate roofed porch and a two-story frame porch. Mr. Shafer said that the presented COA application is the final version of the project with minor modifications.

Mr. Jake Schindel and Mr. Philip Schindel, property owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Jake Schindel said that the proposed project would convert the first floor of the garage into a commercial space and would convert the second floor into a private space. He said that he proposed to keep the cinder block underneath but wanted to update the exterior façade with a carriage house look. He noted that the second-floor door could be relocated if the electrical service

to the building is relocated; but all other modifications would be made as shown in the submitted drawings.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure to the rear of 110 Chambersburg Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is an accessory building to an earlier home and all proposed work represents a major project that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. He noted that the rear garage is visible to the public from Zerfing Alley.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the complete rehabilitation of the existing garage to the rear of 110 Chambersburg Street as presented in the application dated June 25, 2020 pending the approval of all zoning requirement changes. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 with one abstention (Mr. Shaffer) (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair

Mr. Shaffer noted that Agenda Item B will be moved to the end of the Agenda pending the arrival of the applicant, and will proceed to Agenda Item C.

C. COA 20-0053, MAJOR PROJECT: 303 S. Washington Street – Lois Edwards

Replace existing picket fence and wood supporting retaining wall with new picket fence and stone block retaining wall. The retaining wall will be 15" in height. Project had HARB approval in 1995 by a former board but was never constructed.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her July 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace an existing fence and rotted retaining wall with a new picket fence and 15-inch high stone block retaining wall; and that the fence would sit behind and above the proposed retaining wall. She said that the property was first shown on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick dwelling with a shingled roof, side two-story porch with a shingled roof, and a rear single-story porch with a shingled roof.

Ms. Lois Edwards gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that the existing fence was deteriorated and wanted to replace it with respect to the historic style of the property; and said that the fence is located in the front to the left of the house approximately 9-10' from Washington Street (front curb) and 38'9" from Breckenridge Street (side curb). Mr. Malot liked the fence presentation but noted that the second-floor porch of the main structure was listing and unsafe and should be addressed as quickly as possible. She said that she would address that issue in the future.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 303 S. Washington Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is located in the public view way from both Breckenridge and South Washington Streets, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that it is a highly visible landscaping project to a historic property that defines this neighborhood; and that the proposed project is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented. He said that this project application was approved by a previous HARB Board but was never completed.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of an existing picket fence/wood retaining wall with a new picket fence and stone block retaining wall at 303 S. Washington Street as presented in the application dated June 17, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

E. COA 20-0043, MAJOR PROJECT: 250 Buford Avenue-Rarrick Orthodontics – Mike Torrao, Regional Manager for R. L. Grove and Sons Inc.

Replace the rolled roof system with architectural shingles in slate gray color.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her July 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace the existing rolled roof system with a GAF Lifetime Architectural Shingled roof system in charcoal gray color to include starter strips, FAF Cobra 20' Vent Roll, Ice and Water protection with a white 1.75" Drip Edge, 1-3 Aluminum Pipe Boot, Clear Sealant, and one Step Flashing. She said that the property was not shown on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps through 1931.

Dr. Mark Rarrick, property owner, and Zach Wolford of R. L. Groves and Sons, Inc. gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Dr. Rarrick said that the roof at Rarrick Orthodontics had two leaks and badly needed repaired; and that he was looking to replace it in the same charcoal gray (slate) color way. Mr. Wolford noted that the predominant pitch (inches per foot) is over a two (at 2/12 and therefore is under warranty), and the low sloping roof would also have ice and water shields.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 250 Buford Avenue-Rarrick Orthodontics, a contemporary former service station, is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District 1999 HARB Extension, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a non-sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District* and is highly visible to the public from Buford Avenue. He said that the proposed work represents a major project that would restore functionality to this roof and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for roof replacements.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the roof replacement at 250 Buford Avenue-Rarrick Orthodontics as presented in the application dated May 11, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

B. COA 20-00044, MAJOR PROJECT: 24-26 Barlow Street – Roy and Linda Fauth

Patch and Replace current asphalt shingled roof on the garage with rib brown metal colorway roofing material. Replace existing sidewalk in kind from house to garage (same footprint) 22” wide x 16’ long.

Mr. Shaffer acknowledged that the owner or representative was not in attendance to present their application at this time. Ms. English said that the applicant was notified twice by email prior to tonight’s meeting to present their application. The Board agreed that unforeseen circumstances may have prevented the owner’s appearance.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the application for COA-20-0044 at 24-26 Barlow Street be tabled until the August 19, 2020 HARB Meeting for the lack of representation for this project by this owner or agent at this time. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

F. COA 20-0051, MAJOR PROJECT: 9-17 York Street (11 York street-Lulu’s Finest Ice Cream Shop) – Linda Atiyeh, ISAM LLC

Change of Use and Occupancy and cosmetic interior work at 9-17 York Street, primarily 11 York Street-Lulu’s Finest Ice Cream Shop. Two business signs are one (1) “Lulu’s Finest” 27 sf ice cream wall mount sign (45lbs) lit by gooseneck lighting, and one (1) two-sided 4.9’ blade business sign “Lulu’s Finest Ice Cream” mounted to bracket using hooks lit by existing lighting. No illuminated signs will be permitted.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her July 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant was seeking a Change of Use and Occupancy and cosmetic interior work for 11 York Street; and are proposing two business signs for Lulu’s Finest Ice Cream” for consideration: one (1) 27 sf wall mount sign with “Lulu’s Finest” weighing 45 lbs. and lit from above by gooseneck (possibly globe lighting which is already installed) lighting; and one (1) two-sided 4.9 sf blade business sign with “Lulu’s Finest Ice Cream” mounted to brackets using hooks lit by existing gooseneck lighting. She said that the property first appeared on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story dwelling with a shingled roof.

Mr. Gary Shaffer representing the applicant gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the business signs were approved and installed, but the application did not

list the proposed lighting. He said that the globe lighting was installed, but the applicant was proposing 13 gooseneck lights similar to the style that the Gettysburg Brewery had installed when that business had occupied this site; and said that the lighting is the focus of the application before the Board. The Board discussed the different lighting styles, and liked the soft glow emitted from the globe lights. The Board did want to know more about the number, size, color and spacing of the proposed gooseneck lights, and was concerned about the amount of light emitted from them.

Vice-Chair Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 11 York Street-Lulu's Finest Ice Cream Shop is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is located in the public view way from York Street, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The proposed work is a Critical Project to a sensitive building and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* by using historically sensitive materials. He noted that the globe lighting complimented the front façade of the structure, but the proposed gooseneck lighting is a major façade enhancement that could affect the character of the structure in the Historic District without further design and spacing information.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of six first floor globe lights on the front facade at 11 York Street-Lulu's Finest Ice Cream shop as presented in the application dated June 24, 2020, but denied the 13 gooseneck lights pending further information on the number, size and spacing. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Gustafson, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 with one abstention (M. Shaffer) (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 20-0052 MINOR PROJECT, 149 N. Stratton Street – South Central Community Action Program**
In-kind roof replacement on main house and rear of building. Rear standing seam roof will be replaced with asphalt shingles (not visible from the roadway). Install ice and water shield on all eaves and in any valleys, all necessary flashings and snow country ridge vent. Remove existing gutter system on all areas except the porch. Install new 5".032 seamless gutter with hidden screw hangers two feet on center. Install new 2x3 downspouts at existing location. Porch not included. All materials used must be in kind replacement on front façade of the structure.
- **COA 20-0010, MINOR PROJECT: 1 Baltimore Street – House of Bender, LLC**
Replace 30' of wooden fascia board and rusted gutting along the rear wall of the property facing the parking lot off Zerfing Alley; attach a new downspout to the new guttering.

Mr. Malot made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the June 17, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson and carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Lingle).

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer

- Chair had no report at this time
- Two Board members acknowledged that their HARB terms expire in August 2020; and will notify the Historic Preservation Officer of their intent to continue serving on the HARB Board before the next Borough Council Meeting.

B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Ms. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2019 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to email her with any recommendations to revise and finalize the current list. The Board discussed the various ways and challenges of holding an awards ceremony during COVID19. The Board agreed to postpone the Annual Historic Preservation Awards Ceremony until an appropriate recognition and reception could be given to the award recipients. Mr. Shaffer suggested submitting an article highlighting the rehabilitation work in the Historic District during COVID19 and asked for Board input. Ms. English encouraged the Board to continue to look for training credits.

Other Business

There was not other business presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant