



August 19, 2020
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 19, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Colleen Lingle, Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant, and Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager for PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA), participating as a non-voting advisory role; **Absent Board Members:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance. **Others in Attendance:** Roy Fauth, Property Owner, representing 24-26 Barlow Street; Barry Dunlap of Dunlap's Restaurant, representing 90 Buford Avenue; Kenneth E. Klein, Property Owner, representing 687 York Street; Jon Shaffer of SPG Capital representing 128 Chambersburg Street, Connor Phiel on behalf of the property owner, Wetzel Family Holdings LLC, representing 312 Baltimore Street; and Joseph Edgar, Architect AIA of Shaffer Design Associates.

Call Meeting to Order

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Colleen Lingle. **Absent** HARB Member were Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson and Building Code Official Clem Malot. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 14, 2020.

HARB Business Meeting

August 19, 2020

Page 1 of 9

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the August 19, 2020 meeting agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the July 15, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 20-0044, Major Project: 24-26 Barlow Street – Roy and Linda Fauth (tabled from July 15, 2020 HARB Meeting)

Replace the current asphalt shingled roof on the garage with a rib brown metal colorway roofing material. Replace the existing sidewalk in-kind from house to garage (same footprint) 22" wide x 16' long.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace the current asphalt shingled roof on the garage with a rib brown metal colorway roofing material, and would also like to replace the existing sidewalk in-kind from the house to the garage with the same footprint that would be 22" wide x 16' long. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story duplex frame dwelling with a single porch on the front and back of the structure with a composition roof material and a rear frame outbuilding with same.

Mr. Roy Fauth, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Fauth apologized to the Board for not presenting his project at the July meeting due to experiencing health issues. He said that the garage needs repaired, and that its roof has a deep depression. He said that his contractor, Bob Crouthamel, suggested replacing the asphalt shingled roof with a ribbed metal roof in a brown colorway to match the house. He said that he had only owned the property for the last eight to ten years and suspected that the roof might be original to the structure. Mr. Shaffer stated that the roof had to be at least 90 years old, and that the garage was built at the same time as the duplex. Mr. Fauth said that there was no way of proving the originality of the roof but said that the proposed roof would be similar to the several existing metal garage roofs in Naugle Alley.

He said that his contractor plans to replace the rafters and repair the underlayment depression to ensure the viability of the roof's structure. Ms. Lingle said that asphalt shingles would not have lasted 90 years and suggested accepting the project as presented. Mrs. English said that the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps showed a composition roof. Mr. Goble said that the original roof would have been asphalt and was then replaced by an asphalt roof. The Board discussed the pitch of the roof relative to using an asphalt shingle (roof pitch above 3/12) versus a metal roof material (roof pitch under 3/12).

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the garage structure to the rear of 24-26 Barlow Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is visible to the public from Naugle Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is an accessory building to an earlier home and all proposed work represents a major project that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* depending on the pitch of the roof. He noted that the rear garage may have included original asphalt shingle roofing material, but an alternate material could be considered.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the composite roof installation project to the existing garage at the rear of 24-26 Barlow Street for asphalt shingles if the roof pitch is greater than 3/12; and the installation of a metal roof if the pitch is lower than 3/12. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The Board discussed the roof pitch with Mr. Edgar, and Architect from Shaffer Design Associates, who stated that a metal roof could go to 1/12. Mr. Goble said that if it is 3/12 it could be asphalt shingle, but if it goes below 3/12 it could be metal. The Board denied the motion as framed by Mr. Shaffer, who then withdrew his motion.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the composite roof installation project for the rear accessory garage at 24-26 Barlow Street for asphalt shingles if the roof pitch is greater than 3/12, and for a metal roof if the roof pitch is below 3/12 per the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented in the application dated May 26, 2020 pending the verification of the roof pitch by the contractor. Ms. Lingle seconded the motion.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

Mr. Shaffer told the applicant that his project could be approved administratively by the Director of Historic Preservation if the materials are asphalt shingles; but would have to be approved by Council if the pitch is verified to be under 3/12 applicable to a metal roof.

Follow-up Notation after Meeting: Both Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Crouthamel (the applicant's contractor) revisited the property on August 20, 2020. Mr. Shaffer noted in his email to Mrs. English that "the building most likely had a rolled asphalt shingle roof because the pitch is 1.5/12 as determined by the contractor's crew today, August 20, 2020. Shingles should never have been put on the building and cannot be reinstalled per current building code. The metal roof system with felt underlayment

would meet the manufacturer's requirements and the building code for low slope roofs. Phil (Goble) indicated that his intent was to allow Debra to approve the roof installation administratively depending on what was determined after the investigation." – Respectively, Gary Shaffer

B. COA 20-0068, MAJOR PROJECT: 90 Buford Avenue – Barry Dunlap

Build at ground level a 20' x 10' seating deck for outdoor dining with PVC covered posts, black wrought iron railings, and composite decking.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to build at ground level a seating deck for outdoor dining, with PVC covered posts, black wrought iron railings, and composite decking. She said that the project must meet all zoning and building code requirements through the Borough and PMCA. She said that the structure first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a single-story, three-section building; and that the main section is of stone construction with a composite roof, that the second main section is of brick construction with a composite roof, and rear small frame section has a composite roof. She told the Board that the number of parking spaces were verified in the proposed project to meet the current zoning requirements per Carly Marshall, the Borough's Director of Planning, Zoning and Code Enforcement. Mr. Shaffer noted that there were many significant changes to the structure since the 1930s.

Mr. Barry Dunlap gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he will remove two parking spaces closest to his garage to meet the minimum zoning requirements for his outdoor dining patio project; and to avoid a potential hazard with vehicle traffic to the proposed patio deck.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 90 Buford Avenue is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District 1999 Extension and is located in the public view way from both Buford and Spring Avenues, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that it is a highly visible surface structure project with railings that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented. He said that this project is located next to a historic property that has undergone many significant alterations.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the placement of an outdoor seating patio deck at 90 Buford Avenue as presented in the application dated June 26, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

Mr. Shaffer told the applicant that any landscaping elements must wait Council approval; and that he could proceed to submit plans to PMCA for their building code review and preliminary approval of the proposed patio deck in order to identify any design issues.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the following three applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

C. COA 20-0067, MAJOR PROJECT: 687 York Street – Kenneth E. Klein

Construct a 21' x 44' brick addition to the north side of the building containing three vehicle repair bays with 10' x 10' doors. Install a metal canopy with steel rods above each door. Replace existing 12-panel single pane commercial windows with a new aluminum window system into the existing window opening. Construct a new 400sf addition to the south side of the building with a new stairwell.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to construct a 21' x 44' brick addition to the north side of the building containing three vehicle repair bays with 10' x 10' doors; and install a metal canopy with steel rods above each door. She said that the applicant would also like to replace the existing 12-panel single-pane commercial windows with a new aluminum window system into the existing opening; and construct a new 400sf addition to the south side of the building with a new stairwell. She stated that the applicant must meet all Zoning and PMCA construction and setback requirements. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as an iron frame one-story structure with a composite roof and a small side attached bump out in brick with a composite roof. Mrs. English noted that Planning Director Marshall had issues with the presented signs stating that they were over the 50sf limit and that many long-standing signs did not have permits; and that no additional signage would be permitted (to include the two signs on the shed slated for demolition can not be moved or reinstalled). She said that businesses are limited to one A-Frame sign, and that banners must be permitted and removed after 30 days.

Kenneth Klein of K&W Tire, and both Gary W. Shaffer, AIA and Joe Edgar, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Edgar said that the application should be approved as submitted; and that KPI Technology from Gettysburg had originally reviewed the set-back requirements and noted that they have been met as indicated on the building plans. He said that the proposed project is not located within the floodplain according to KPI elevations, and that the floodplain limitations were also reviewed by Borough Planning Director Marshall.

Vice-Chair Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 687 York Road, K&W Tires, is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District 1999 HARB Extension, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District* and is highly visible to the public from York Road. He said that the proposed addition represents a major project that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for new construction.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of a three bay 21'x44' brick addition at 687 York Street-K&W Tires as presented in the application dated July 28, 2020. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 4-to-0 (with one abstention, Mr. Shaffer) (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

D. COA 20-00066, MAJOR PROJECT: 128 Chambersburg Street – Jon Shaffer, SPG Capital LLC

Replace the header over front door, 2nd-floor windows, and doorway; secure the front wall of building, replace the missing aluminum fascia piece at the top of the building; and repair, replace, seal, and paint the front façade.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description for a resubmission of a previously approved project as noted in her August 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace the header over the front door, replace the second-floor windows, replace the missing aluminum fascia piece at the top of the building, and repair/replace/seal and paint the front façade. She noted that the original front doors still exist, and that the header of the storefront revealed structural issues. She said that the applicant's permits had expired, and that PMCA had requested the project resubmission to address the bulging front façade and blistering brick veneer.

Mr. Jon Shaffer of SPG Capital and Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC gave a brief presentation and answered Board Questions. Mr. Gary Shaffer said that the applicant intends to restore the store front façade of this business space, repair the blistering thin brick; but most likely would not match the original thin brick veneer that was not original to the structure. He acknowledged that PMCA had asked for a resubmission of the plans with new structural information but noted that most of the proposed work was interior in nature. He said that the project was initiated at the end of 2017 and work began in 2018 but stated that the rehabilitation work was never completed. Ms. Hamm said that PMCA requested a new building permit, and that any structural work must be reviewed by their reviewer.

Vice-Chair Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 128 Chambersburg Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is located in the public view way from Chambersburg Street, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The proposed work is a Critical Project to a sensitive building and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* by using historically sensitive materials. He noted that although the work was previously approved by a previous Council, the proposed project required a resubmission and needs a current HARB review and recommendation.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of exterior renovations at 128 Chambersburg Street as presented in the application dated July 28, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (with one abstention, Mr. Shaffer) (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

E. COA 20-0065, MINOR PROJECT: 312 Baltimore Street – Wetzel Family Holdings LLC

Remove the existing deteriorated metal exterior rear egress stair and replace it with a new pressure-treated wood stair, rails, and landing (note: existing metal stair does not meet code requirements).

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her August 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant wanted to remove the existing deteriorated metal exterior rear egress stair and replace it with a new pressure-treated wood stair, rails, and landing. She noted that the existing metal stair is not code compliant. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a two-story brick dwelling with a shingled roof, a rear two-story brick addition with a slate roof, and a side frame two-story side porch with a slate roof.

Mr. Connor Phiel representing the applicant, Dr. Chris Wetzel of Wetzel Family Holdings LLC, and Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Phiel said that the applicant intended to replace the steep metal stair to the second-floor apartments with a shallower pressure treated wood stair that will include handrails. He said that the rear egress is screened by existing trees and a rear garage; and that the split landing will be located two-thirds of the way down the stairway with a new slab landing at the bottom in the same footprint as the existing ground slab. He said that the proposed project is code compliant. Mrs. English said that the new ground landing might need a stormwater permit to meet the code requirements.

Vice-Chair Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 312 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District and is located in the public view way from both Baltimore Street and Schoolhouse Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The proposed work is a Critical Project to a sensitive building and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* by using historically sensitive materials. He noted that the stair replacement is for safety, and that the proposed project is code compliant.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of a rear exterior metal stairway to the second floor apartment with a wooden stairway that is code compliant at 312 Baltimore Street as presented in the application dated July 29, 2020. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (with one abstention, Mr. Shaffer) (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 20-0057 MINOR PROJECT: 343 Carlisle Street - Phi Sigma Kappa Druid Corp**

Remove existing rubber roof, Install new tapered insulation system with a new EPDM roof system. Remove three lower shingled roofs and install ice and water shields on all eaves GAF Timberline roofing. No NEW materials will be permitted IN KIND replacement only.

- **COA 20-0066 MINOR PROJECT: 201 Chambersburg Street – Jonathan Edgar Pollard**
Paint exterior trim and replace roof with in-kind materials. NO chemical products to remove paint. NO paint permitted on terra cotta roofing material on front façade.
- **COA 20-0129 MINOR PROJECT: 344 S. Washington Street – Kenneth R. Kauffman**
Shingle to shingle roofing replacement – Owens Corning Architectural shingles and ridge vents/shingles.
- **COA 20-0133 MINOR PROJECT: 40 N. Stratton Street – Alan Perry**
Construct a privacy 6' in height extending 35 feet from the rear of the house to the rear of the property, and 25' along the rear property line. Install 4' high door along the rear property line. Fence materials shall be pressure treated lumber.
- **COA 20-0055 MAJOR PROJECT: 218 N. Stratton Street – James and Amanda Kittleberger**
Replace existing 3-tab shingle roof with GAF asphalt architectural oyster grey HD single roof system; Replace existing concrete paver patio and install an 18" high wall at patio edge. (10x12 shed denied by zoning not included in this approval).
- **COA 20-0069 MAJOR PROJECT: 123 Baltimore Street – KGG Investments Inc**
NEW 3'x3' double sided metal sign to be affixed to the exterior of the brick building above the main entrance door. Colors of sign will be navy, blue light blue and white to read "Mid Penn Legal Services" Law Firm. Must meet all sign code requirements for construction.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the July 15, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members for this vote: Ms. Gustafson and Mr. Malot).

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer

- Chair Shaffer said that he had watched one third of the on-line presentations during the NAPC Forum 2020: Preservation Coast to Coast Celebrating Tacoma, Summer 2020; and that the webinars were very informative. He discussed the webinars with the Board and encouraged all members to view any missed presentations through the Conference link, noting that the on-line recordings will be available for viewing through October 1, 2020.
- Chair Shaffer discussed the PA Historic Museum Commission (PHMC) Certified Local Government (CLG) Survey with the Board that would update CLG Guidelines used to develop

a self-assessment tool to preserve historic preservation programs in CLG communities. He noted that the Commission last surveyed Gettysburg Borough in 2011; and that the PHMC must evaluate each CLG in Pennsylvania every four year as required by the National Park Service, and they are running behind on their 4-year reviews. He asked the Board to review their questionnaire and then meet virtually as a group with Bryan Van Sweden, PHMC Community Preservation Coordinator for the Susquehanna Region to review/discuss the self-assessment.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Mrs. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2018, 2019 and 2020 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to email her with any recommendations to revise and finalize the current list.

- **NAPC Forum 2020: Preservation Coast to Coast Celebrating Tacoma, Summer 2020 Grant Funding**

Mrs. English said that she had obtained through Gettysburg Borough grant funding for four out of six HARB members to attend the 2020 virtual conference in the amount of \$600 and encourage board members to watch any missed presentations until October 1, 2020.

Other Business

There was not other business presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 5-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:35 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant