



August 18, 2021

Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes

Troxell Council Chambers

Borough of Gettysburg

Second Vice- Chair Peggy Gustafson called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:04 PM on Wednesday, August 18, 2021, in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, **Absent Board Member:** Chair Phil Goble, Suzanne Christianson, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher. **Others in Attendance:** Gary Shaffer Architect from Shaffer Design Associates PC, representing 529 Baltimore Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Call Meeting to Order

Ms. Gustafson called the meeting to order at 7:04 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Building Code Official Clem Malot, and **absent:** Chair Phil Goble, Suzanne Christianson and Karen Mesher, Planning Assistant. It was noted new member Suzanne Christianson, Realtor, was unable to attend her first appointed meeting, she will be starting her first seat at the September 15, 2021 meeting as appointed through Council on August 9, 2021 to replace the seat of Ms. Lingle, Relator.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Ms. Gustafson introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. She explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. She noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. She said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 13, 2021.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Second Vice-Chair Gustafson asked the Board to accept both the August 18, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented, and the July 21, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to

accept both the August 18, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented and the July 21, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Clem Malot and carried **5-to-0**.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-00097 CRITICAL PROJECT: 504 Baltimore Street – Jeremy and Danielle Davis, Wizzy Adventures LLC.

Change front façade lighting over front of entrance from long incandescent lighting to old style hoop lighting (two on front and two on side over new signage); remove vinyl siding and replace with real woodlap siding and stain; repaint handrails, pickets, and wood trim on structure; and lay landscape boards and create garden boxes at entranceway.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to table this project because a representative was not present to discuss the application. The motion was seconded by Jim McCabe and carried **5-to-0**.

B. COA 21-0098 MAJOR PROJECT – 529 Baltimore Street – Anne Knox

Restore house previously damaged by car accident and fire. The scope of work includes the restoration and repair of brick facades, doors, windows, siding facades which includes framing existing porch, roof and crown moldings, and decorative and structural columns. The undamaged portion of the building is to remain as is. All floors except the third floor are being restored as apartments. The third floor is to be restored to the original mansard roof profile which will no longer include the third-floor apartment. There will not be any changes to the building footprint.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description for the structure which was damaged by a severe fire due to a car accident that occurred on March 1, 2021. She said that the overall project plan is to rebuild the damaged structure and modify the third-story apartment to the original mansard roof line removing the third-story apartment. She said that the other work will include repair of the brick façade, doors, windows, siding (which includes the existing front porch framing), roof and crown moldings, and decorative and structural columns, and that all work must be 'in kind' with style and materials, noting that any changes in style or materials must be reviewed by HARB.

Ms. English said this structure was first shown on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a two-story brick dwelling with a slate roof, and a front and rear framed porch with a slate roof. She said that the permit history of this project includes sign permits in 2017, RRUO from 2017 to present; and the current application for the change of roof style to a Mansard roof, and other internal and external modifications in a separate application for Administrative Review.

Mr. Gary Shaffer, architect for the project, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Shaffer distributed a photograph of the Battlefield Hotel on Baltimore

Street where you could see the roof pitch of the Mansard style roof at 529 Baltimore Street circa 1900. He noted that the applicant would like to remove the third-floor dormer window and return the roof style and pitch back to the original Mansard style roof by removing the third-floor apartment and using the space as attic storage space only. He said that all other restorations would be 'in kind' to include all exterior reconstruction of the brick façade, doors, windows, and siding (including the existing front porch framing), roof and crown moldings, and decorative and structural columns. Mr. Shaffer noted this review through HARB would be for the Mansard roof change and asked if the other work would fall under the Administrative Review in a second submittal. Ms. English said all work must be 'in kind' with style and materials to qualify for Administrative Review, and that any changes in style or materials must be reviewed through a formal HARB meeting.

Second Vice-Chair Gustafson presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 529 Baltimore Street. She said that this dwelling is a contributing structure located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg*, and that the restoration is visible from the public view way via Baltimore Street, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. She said that the proposed work of bringing the roof back to its original Mansard roof style for the proposed change of roof pitch and style is complimentary to the character defining features of the historic structure, is of high architectural integrity, and would maintain a distinctive appearance that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to change the current roof pitch at 529 Baltimore Street to that of a Mansard style roof, and to repurpose the third-floor apartment space as attic storage only that is consistent with *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented to the Board from the application dated July 12, 2021. The motion was seconded by Jim McCabe and carried **4-to-0, with one abstention** (Gary Shaffer representing the applicant for this project).

The Board told the applicant that this approval will be reviewed by Council on September 13, 2021, and that any other permits and review will be required when the design is completed for the total restoration of this project.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

a. COA 21-0080 MINOR PROJECT: 222 Buford Avenue – Lawrence Plank

In-kind replacement of existing roofing shingles to repair damage from the July 8, 2021 storm. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.

b. COA 21-0082 MINOR PROJECT: 125 N. Stratton Street - Ronald Nicodemus

To remove existing damaged steel shingles and install 'in-kind' steel shingles with raised horseshoe pattern similar to the raised pattern on existing shingles. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.

- c. **COA 21-0083 MINOR PROJECT: 314 N. Stratton Street – Susan Cipperly**
Remove existing half-round gutters and replace with 'in-kind' gutters of same style and material. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- d. **COA 21-0085 MINOR PROJECT: 504 Baltimore Street – Reddings Hardware**
Installation of two wall mounted exterior signs in the same location of existing signage. Each sign is 7' x 3' for a total of 42 sq. ft. The signs will be of natural wood, lettering in cream with dark blue accents. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- e. **COA 21-0086 MINOR PROJECT: 100 Buford Avenue – Four Kings Surplus**
Installation of four new signs: #1) Vinyl window decal 2' x 3'; #2) Vinyl window decal 3' x 3'; #3) Projecting plastic sign 4' x 2'; and #4) Portable wood sign 2' x 4' for a total sign area of 31 sq. ft. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- f. **COA 21-0087 MINOR PROJECT: 17 Chambersburg Street – Lord Nelsons**
Installation of three new signs: #1) Hanging projecting wood sign 36" x 56"; #2) Vinyl window decal 40" x 16"; #3) Vinyl window decal 46" x 10" for a total sign area of 22 sq. ft. All signage must be anchored within the mortar between the bricks (and not through the brick of the structure) or on existing hardware. Sign will read 'Lord Nelson's Est. 1990'. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- g. **COA 21-0088 MINOR PROJECT: 29 North Washington Street – Truist (formerly BB&T)**
Installation of four new signs: #1) Monument wood sign 48.5" x 20.25"; #2) Wall-mounted aluminum sign 66.875" x 15.75"; #3) Aluminum wood pole sign 24"x 24" to read 'drive through'; #4) Aluminum wood pole sign 24' x 24" to read 'exit' for a total sign area of 22 sq. ft. All signage must be anchored within the mortar between the bricks (and not through the brick of the structure) or may be hung on existing hardware. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- h. **COA 21-0089 MINOR PROJECT: 55 Steinwehr Avenue – C.J. Probst**
Installation of one new portable A-frame sign with a metal frame and a vinyl sign measuring 35" x 42" for a total of 10.5 sq ft. The sign will read 'The Original Getty's BBQ Company, \$1 Cold Water' and the sign will be black, red, and white. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- i. **COA 21-0090 MINOR PROJECT: 217 Steinwehr Avenue – Gettysburg Eddies**
Installation of one new portable A-frame sign measuring 32" x 48" for a total of 10.8 sq ft. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- j. **COA 19-0097 MINOR PROJECT: 51 E. Stevens Street – Orchard County Realty, LLC**
Previously approved permit in 2019 and granting an extension for the installation of a 14' x 14' (196 sq. ft.) patio to the rear of the house; add a gray masonry block retaining wall along the side of the property and add a 6' pine wood privacy fence.

k. COA 21-0092 MINOR PROJECT: 312 N. Stratton Street – George Bolton Jr.

Replace existing wood privacy fence on right and left side of back yard with an approximately 6' wood stockage privacy fence with a concave picket fence top ('Classic Gettysburg Concave' fencing); and replace metal wire fence along rear property line with a 4' P/T wood FR gothic picket-style 'Dover Concave' fencing. The rear fencing is a mix-match of chicken wire and metal fencing that is falling and in poor condition. The side fencing is an 'in-kind' rear fence composed of existing chicken wire and metal fence and is in major disrepair.

l. COA 21-0094 MINOR PROJECT: 320-336 Village Drive – Breckenridge Village Association

Remove and replace existing shingled roof at Building #1 (all even number units) and install new 'in-kind' architectural replacement shingles.

m. COA 21-0095 MINOR PROJECT: 33 York Street – Senator Mastriano's Office

Installation of two new signs: #1) Vinyl window decal 16.7 sq ft.; #2) Projecting plastic double-sided sign 3' x 3' for a total sign area of 25.7 sq. ft.

n. COA 21-0091 MINOR PROJECT: 43 South Street – Kevin Forbes

Shingle to shingle roof replacement.

o. COA 21-0096 Minor Project: 57 E. Middle Street – Pamela Neighbors

Replace rotted pine boards on front porch with new pine boards, remove rust and paint metal porch railings on front steps, replace wood door jam on rear shed, and repair cement walkway in rear yard where concrete has deteriorated.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

Mr. Shaffer asked Director English if she knew where the owner of 125. N. Stratton Street (item b. under Administrative Approvals) was able to obtain historic metal roofing materials. She said that she did not know where, but that she would make an inquiry and get back to the Board.

Mr. McCabe made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the July 21, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried **5-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – Second Vice-Chair Gustafson

Ms. Gustafson had no report for the Board.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the following items with the Board:

- The board reviewed the master list of candidates for the Historic Preservation Awards and removed those properties that they felt did not qualify for an award level of excellence. Ms.

English will update the list for next month's meeting for the Board to start assigning projects to the appropriate award categories,

- Ms. English distributed a *Historic District Design Guide* brochure that she is working on to provide information to the public on permitting and HARB's process for the restoration of historic structures. She said that this is a rough draft, and it will be sent to members for their review and comments,
- Asked HARB members to review the HARB By-Laws for discussion at the September HARB Meeting,
- Asked HARB Members to forward any webinar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records,
- Updated the Board on the use/proliferation of satellite dishes in the Borough, noting that Borough Council would need to approve any ordinance updates or any *Gettysburg Design Guide* updates; and that this discussion will be on the next HARB meeting agenda. She said that grant funding would be used for any changes, and that the funding must be used within six months,

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Second Vice-Chair Ms. Gustafson asked for a motion to adjourn. Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed **5-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:47 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation