



August 16, 2023
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 16, 2023 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of five (5) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Paul Witt, Suzanne Christianson, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Joan Hodges, and Andrew Johnson; **Others in Attendance:** Bradley Smith, Property Committee Chair of St. James Lutheran Church representing 121 York Street; Chad Collie, Owner of Allied Plaster and Construction representing 330 Baltimore Street; and Megan Doolittle, Property Owner, representing 323 Baltimore Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of five (5) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 11, 2023.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the August 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the August 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 5-to-0 without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the July 19, 2023 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted with the following correction made by Vice-Chair Stone on page 9 under Reports - Administrative Approvals: move "Item F: COA-230045 MINOR PROJECT – 321-323 Baltimore Street" to full HARB review because item was moved to the August 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Agenda for full Board review due to a change in materials.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the July 16, 2023 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **5-to-0 without dissention**.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the next applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Mr. Stone assumed the role as Chair.

A. COA 23-00062 MAJOR PROJECT: 121 York Street – St. James Lutheran Church

Exterior alterations include removing the existing windows and infilling the openings on the back porch. Interior renovations include a kitchen remodel, new appliances, and cosmetic repair.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in the August 16th HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the project scope includes exterior alterations including the removal of existing windows and infilling openings on the back porch and altering the back porch to provide a storage room for a refrigerator and freezer; and stated that the application must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story brick parsonage with one front porch and rear-framed porches with a slate tin roof. She said that the permit history includes this application for the window infill and the back storage room.

Bradley Smith, Property Committee Chair at St. James Lutheran Church, and Gary Shaffer, owner architect at Shaffer Design Associates PC, presented the application and answered Board questions. He said that the Church would like to convert an unconditioned sun porch to a storage room for more useable interior space by removing and infilling the existing door and windows, installing new siding to match the existing siding and using salvage brick at the base of the area.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the exterior alterations to the rear porch at 121 York Street, the Foltz-Keyser Youth House. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the Borough of *Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*; is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District*, is of high architectural integrity, is not visible from the main public view way at York Street but is visible from W. Zerfing Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed rear porch exterior alterations are considered a critical project and meet the material standards that this Board has accepted previously for rear elevations.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed rear porch exterior alterations at 121 York Street per the application dated June 13, 2023. The motion was second by Mr. Witt and **carried 5-to-0 without dissention**.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

B. COA 23-0061 MAJOR PROJECT: 330 Baltimore Street - C and B Ruth Family Revocable Trust

Exterior restoration of a single-family home, including painting the front façade, installation of historically accurate wood shutters, installation of new pediment and trim to add architectural detail, installation of a new door, replacement of transom in-kind with wood finish, installation of new windows on back/lower portion of the property, matching trim of existing structure, installation of new lintel moldings to match existing historical moldings, and the modification of back porch to reflect historical accuracy. Please review the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for mortar and brick restoration in the Historic District.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in the August 16th HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the project scope includes the exterior renovations of a single-family residential home to include the painting of the front facade, the installation of historically accurate wood shutters, the installation of new pediments and trim to add architectural detail, the installation of a new door, and the replacement of the transom in-kind with a wood finish. She said that the applicant would also like to install new windows on the back lower portion of the property matching the trim of the existing structure and install new lintel moldings to match the existing historical moldings, noting that the modification of the back porch would reflect historical accuracy. She stated that all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a two-story brick dwelling with one side porch and a rear frame porch with a slate or tin roof. She said that the permit history includes interior modifications in 2023, and this current application for façade and exterior changes (with the interior work located under LU-230192 application).

Chad Collie, owner of Allied Plaster and Construction, presented the application and answered Board questions. He said that he came to the project one month ago after the property owner performed some maintenance to reinforce the property. He said that the applicant plans to restore the exterior of the property to include: painting the front façade (lower left square of the building), pressure wash the rest, and replace any soffits as needed; install new historically accurate shutters, install new in-kind pediment and a new front door and trim to add architectural detail; and replace in-kind the transom with wood finish. He said the applicant would like to install new vinyl windows on the back lower porch of the structure which is visible from the parking lot and Schoolhouse Alley with matching trim, and that new lintel moldings will be installed to match the existing historical moldings. He said that the two lower rear windows would be arranged to accommodate the kitchen renovations. He said that that the second floor railing will be constructed out of mahogany or cedar with 1 x 1" wood spindles and 5 x 5" cedar posts. He said that the siding will be James Hardie Fiber Cement 5" Lap Siding and will restore rear window pediments as needed. He said that the window configuration on the front will remain two over two, and that the rear first-floor alley window that was added in the late 1970s will be removed. He said that the existing chimney will be capped to maintain the existing roof-line.

Chair Shaffer said that the building has a lot of architectural features that represent the architectural character of the town, and cautions adding architectural features to a structure to embellish details that were not there in order to make the structure more historic; but said that the addition of functional historical elements are possible if the original elements could not be restored. He suggested not replacing the historic front door but restoring it.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the exterior renovations at 330 Baltimore Street. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, the current structure is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the Borough of *Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*; is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* is visible from both Baltimore Street and Schoolhouse Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity with many original features that have not been altered like the front wood door, door surround, and window Etters, and that they should be maintained; but he did note the infilling of the Pferrer Alley-side window which was a later addition to the structure.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 330 Baltimore Street for the proposed exterior renovations of this single-family home to include painting the front façade, installing historically accurate wood shutters, replacing wood transom in-kind, installing new windows on the back lower portion of the property, matching the trim of the existing structure, modifying the back porch to reflect historical accuracy, removing the small window on the Pferrer Alley-side of the building, replace rear siding with Hardie Plank Lap siding, replace front concrete stoop with brick, and add six-inch copper gutter downspouts while maintaining the original historic features as presented in the application dated August 3, 2023. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 5-to-0 without dissention**.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the first three applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Stone assumed the role as Chair.

C. COA-230045 MAJOR PROJECT: 323 Baltimore Street – Adam Doolittle

Replace existing white aluminum screen door with mahogany colonial-style door, and paint exterior trim, sills, lintels, door jams for both 321-323 Baltimore Street.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in the August 16th HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to replace the existing white aluminum screen door with a mahogany colonial-style door at 323 Baltimore Street and paint the exterior trim, sills, lintels, sashes, doors, and door jams at both 321 Baltimore and 323 Baltimore Streets; and stated that all applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. She said that the structure was built in 1820 and known as the Henry Garlach House / Cabinet Shop Building; and that the kitchen and shop additions were built in 1855, additions to the shop area and conversion to dwelling units in 1891, and the addition of a one-story rear room to 323 Baltimore Street (Lot 1) in 1905. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick dwelling with a shingled roof and a rear frame one-story frame extension with a shingled roof. She said that that the permit history includes interior alterations 2021, roof work in 2022, and this 2023 application for rear façade renovations.

Megan Doolittle, Property Owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that she would like to replace the existing deteriorating front screen door at 323 Baltimore Street and replace it with an African Mahogany Colonial-style wood screen door which is very rot resistant in a similar style (tempered glass and screen). She also said that she would like to paint the trim, stiles and rails, lintels, sashes, front doors including door panels and their jambs and trim, the beveled trim around each panel on each front door both at 321 and 323 Baltimore Street at the same time since the properties are adjacent to each other.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the rear siding replacement at 321-323 Baltimore Street. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, the current structure is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the Borough of *Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*; is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* is visible from both Baltimore Street and Court Alley to the rear, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity and that the proposed project is a critical project, and that every effort must be made to maintain original historical features in addition to replacing the wood storm door and painting the windows and trim.

Mr. Witt made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior façade renovations at 321-323 Baltimore Street to include removing the existing aluminum storm door and replacing it with a mahogany wood storm door and paint the wood trim per the application dated June 16, 2023. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 5-to-0 without dissention.**

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- a. **COA 23-0050 MINOR PROJECT – 115 W. MIDDLE STREET – Mark Ellsworth**
Emergency shingle-to-shingle re-roof. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- b. **COA 23-0051 MINOR PROJECT: 135 N. Stratton Street – Spontaneous Holdings LLC**
Shingle-to-shingle re-roof. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- c. **COA 23-0052 MINOR PROJECT – 29 E. Middle Street – Darren Glass**
Replace gutters and downspouts. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- d. **COA 23-0055 MINOR PROJECT – 330 Baltimore Street – Jeryl Martin**
Shingle-to-shingle re-roof with gray Owens Corning shingles. Repair and restore two existing chimneys to their original historic state. Please review the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for mortar and brick restoration in the Historic District. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- e. **COA 23-0056 MINOR PROJECT – 57 E. Middle Street – Pamela Neighbors**
Replace second-floor rear balcony flooring in existing plywood with dark gray TREX decking. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- f. **COA 23-0057 MINOR PROJECT – 59 W. Middle Street – Orchard County Realty**
Replace existing gutter system with 6” half-round galvanized gutters. NO new materials may be used without HARB review. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- g. **COA 23-0058 MINOR PROJECT – 1 West Street – Juan Romero Lira**
Emergency shingle-to-shingle re-roof using charcoal GAF Timberline HDZ architectural shingles. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- h. **COA 23-0060 – 101 Chambersburg Street – John Levan**
Remove rotted trim on the front elevation of commercial building and replace in-kind with matching detail and paint; and replace metal trim on cornice. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- i. **COA 23-0059 – 211 N. Washington Street – Harry Stokes**
Shingle to shingle replacement and paint existing shutters. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, and each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building Code Requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Ms. Christianson made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the July 19, 2023 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Chair Shaffer and **carried 5-to-0 without dissension**.

A. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer discussed the use of color on permanent materials with the Board to refute the inaccurate statement at the August 14th Borough Council Meeting regarding the Adams County Arts Council COA. He said that HARB does review colors on permanent materials, and that HARB’s input is to protect the Historic District structures. He said that the Board has to be more specific when making their recommendations to Council than using “to be determined” while waiting for more information from an applicant (regarding the use of color on a change of material in this case).

B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the Historic District Inventory with the Board. She said that the Historic Evergreen Gatehouse at 799 Baltimore Street is currently under solicitor review. She also discussed the prevalence of LED lighting in the Historic District, especially the many illuminated signs in business storefronts. She told the Board that Council approved the ordinance for Satellite Dishes, and it is currently under solicitor review. She told the Board that there is a grant application that may cover the cost to update the Historic District Ordinance and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. She discussed the

Board's use of the "Thank You" hang tag showing appreciation for property maintenance in the Historic District; but to let her know where tags are distributed.

Other Business

Director English announced that Borough Council approved Andrew Johnson as the newest HARB member at their August 14, 2023 Borough Council Meeting to replace the vacant seat left by Justin Harman.

Public Comment

There was no public comment at this time.

With no other business before the Board, Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone. The **motion passed 5-to-0**; the meeting adjourned at 9:05 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant