



April 21, 2021

Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes

Borough of Gettysburg

(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Phil Goble called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:04 PM on Wednesday, April 21, 2021. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Phil Goble, Vice-Chair Colleen Lingle, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Jim McCabe, Joan Hodges, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance; Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher. **Others in Attendance:** Lisa Oriolo, Property Owner, representing 196 S. Stratton Street; Giovanni (Alex) Cucuzza, Property and Business Owner, representing 412 York Street-La Bella Italia (402 York Street); Judith Tully and Peter Holzwirth, Property Owners, representing 59 South Street; Kevin McCready, Property and Business Owner, representing 126 Chambersburg Street-Garryowen Irish Pub; Kevin McCready, Property Owner, and Nash Re representing 49-51 E. Stevens Street; James (Jes) Stith, Property and Business Owner, representing 307 York Street-Gettysburg Bicycle and Fitness; Dr. Brian Coleman representing 135 Buford Avenue; Gary Shaffer, Architect, Joe MacDowell and Daniel Bringman, Members, representing 109 York Street-St. James Evangelical Lutheran Church; Carmen A. Doyle, Property Owner, and Jason Redding, Reddings Handyman Service, representing 140-144 Chambersburg Street; and Laura Goss, Adams County Library Systems Executive Director, representing 140 Baltimore Street-Adams County Library.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Phil Goble called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:04 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Phil Goble, Vice-Chair Colleen Lingle, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Gary Shaffer, Jim McCabe, Joan Hodges, and Building Code Official Clem Malot.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Goble introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building***

code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council.” Borough Council will next meet on Monday, May 10, 2021.

Review of Agenda

Chair Goble asked the Board to accept the April 21, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Vice-Chair Lingle made a **motion** to accept the April 21, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Malot, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **7-to-0**.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the March 17, 2021 HARB Meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Lingle. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Malot, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **7-to-0**.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-0007 CRITICAL PROJECT: 59 South Street – Peter Holzwirth & Judith Tully

Cover existing wood siding with new Dutchlap 5 vinyl siding in sea slate color; wrap windows on sides and pad with custom bent white aluminum coil stock; the front windows and doors will have Azek white composite woodgrain installed around them; new white aluminum coil stock fascia, new white vinyl soffit both solid and vented, and install new seamless gutters; cover both slate pieces on dormers and all existing wood clapboard to have a maintenance free exterior.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 17, 2021 Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a 2-story frame structure with front and rear porch, showing a tin slate roof on the house and front porch and a composition roof on rear porch addition.

Ms. Tully and Mr. Holzwirth gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. The couple noted that they are getting older and that the exterior wood clapboard requires a lot of maintenance which they are unable to provide at their age. Mr. Holzwirth said that they would like to cover the wood clapboard with vinyl siding; and at the time, wrap the house in insulation to help lower heating costs.

The Board discussed the COA project with the applicant. They noted that the dwelling is a defining historic feature and one of the few Craftsman-style cottages left within the Historic District; and that covering the existing siding with vinyl would drastically change the look of the structure. The Board

noted that *The Secretary of Interior Guidelines* states that if the exterior is in good condition, it should be maintained. The Board noted that the distinguishing qualities of the woodwork, clapboard and window trim would be lost if they were covered in vinyl siding; and they would like to maintain the integrity of the original wood clapboard per the design standards. Mr. Holzwirth and Ms. Tully restated their concerns regarding the siding wood-clad siding recommendation relative to their advanced age and their inability to paint the exterior; and said that they cannot afford to hire someone to paint the exterior every few years. Mr. Holzwirth said that their proposed vinyl siding in the chosen style would not take away from the historic character of their home; and it would provide them with a maintenance free exterior. They said that if they are required by HARB to paint and maintain the exterior wood clapboard on their home that they would be forced to move due to its maintenance.

The Board discussed a motion to deny the project, but Mr. Shaffer offered to meet the homeowners on-site to discuss modifications to their scope of work. The Board noted they have specific guidelines to follow, and that their application does not fall under that purview. The applicants chose to withdraw their application and agreed to meet Mr. Shaffer on-site, stating that they will provide the Board with a new project scope at next month's meeting. (Ms. Gustafson was absent for the withdrawal of this application).

B. COA 21-0018 Gettysburg Borough South Street Beautification Project – Borough of Gettysburg, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English

Director English said that this project will affect many homes located along South Street for the Gettysburg Borough South Street Beautification Project comprising of utility work, vehicular access, and both sidewalk and parking relocation; noting that the relocation of the sidewalk will require the removal of several steps from the front porches of affected properties and may require adding needed features such as railings with modified steps to some dwellings. She said that the current chain link fencing at 402 South Street will be replaced with either the Belmont or Canterbury wrought iron fencing style; and that any porch modifications must be "in-kind" replacement or strictly follow the *Design Guide* for style and materials. She said that new porch railings will be period-appropriate wood railings with turned balusters and molded handrails. She told the Board that some porch steps will be removed entirely in order to raise and widen South Street for 2-way traffic and to adjust for parking; and will tie into existing porch steps with modified sidewalks. She stressed that all materials will be repaired/replaced with "in kind" materials; and that the sign at the Farnsworth parking area will be relocated from the sidewalk in order to expand the roadway on that side of the street to facilitate expansion of the entrance for bus traffic and to provide parking spaces across the street.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 17, 2021 Meeting Agenda. She said that 3-4 structures on South Street first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1907, and that more populated in 1912.

The Board discussed the COA project with the applicant. Mr. McCabe noted that he had concerns about the fencing at 402 South Street; and that he does not like chain-link but wants to make sure that the appropriate style is chosen to replace it. Ms. English noted the two proposed styles, the Belmont or Canterbury, would mimic other styles located within the Historic District and that no other style would be accepted.

(Chair Goble lost his Zoom connection and Vice-Chair Lingle assumed control of the meeting)

Vice-Chair Lingle presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact*. She said that many of the structures along South Street are contributing structures located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, are sensitive buildings over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg / Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public view way, and thus comes under the review right of the Board. She said the above modifications for this streetscape project fall within the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented during the discussion of this meeting.

(Enter Second Vice-Chair Gustafson)

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Gettysburg Borough South Street Beautification Project with a scope that is consistent with *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented to the Board in its application dated March 1, 2021. Mr. Malot seconded the motion. Vice -Chair Lingle called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Lingle, Mr. McCabe, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0** (Absent: Chair Goble who lost his Zoom connection).

C. COA 21-0017 MAJOR PROJECT 26 E. Stevens Street – Tracy Sheffer on behalf of Owner John Lawver and Contractor Chad Collie.

Replace two rotted windows on the west alley-side of the house with exact-size replacement windows; remove rotted windows with “in-kind” exact-size vinyl windows to be sized to fit existing openings and installed from the inside so as not to disturb the existing vinyl siding or aluminum trim; replace all rotten wood windowsills and rotted framing below large window.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her March 17, 2021 Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a 2-story frame structure with a front and rear porch, and with a mix of slate and shingled roofing.

The Board discussed the COA project with the applicant. Mr. Shaffer asked if the applicant would consider clad-wood window replacement instead of the vinyl window replacement submitted by the applicant. Mr. Shaffer noted that this structure is a Queen Ann Victorian structure with many architectural details that the Board would like to see maintained to include a shadow-line profile and the inset of the window wells.

Vice-Chair Lingle presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact*. She said that this dwelling is a contributing structure located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg / Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public view way, and thus comes under the review right of the Board. She said that there are modifications to the window style from vinyl to wood-clad that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented during the discussion of this meeting.

Ms. Hodge made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness at 26 E. Stevens Street for the replacement of 2 rotted windows with a modified window style of clad wood consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented in the application dated March 12, 2021. Mr. Shaffer seconded the motion. Vice-Chair Lingle called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodge, Mr. McCabe, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0** (Absent: Chair Goble who lost his Zoom connection).

D. COA 21-0014 EMERGENCY MOTION FOR DEMOLITION: 531 Baltimore Street – Emergency Demolition approved by Borough Council on March 8, 2021

A motion to approve an emergency demolition permit for the structure at 531 Baltimore Street following severe and significant damage resulting from a motor vehicle accident and collision at threat property occurring on March 1, 2021 and consistent with a structural engineering evaluation finding that the structure presents a danger to the public health, safety, and welfare and that no other reasonable alternatives exist to its demolition.

The Board discussed the COA project and were all in agreement with the above motion. Ms. Hodge made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness at 531 Baltimore Street for the emergency demolition resulting from the March 21, 2021 fire at that address consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the PMCA structural engineering evaluation as stated in the application dated March 2, 2021. Mr. Shaffer seconded the motion. Vice - Chair Lingle called for a roll-call vote: **YAY**: Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Ms. Hodge, Mr. McCabe, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **6-to-0** (Absent: Chair Goble who lost his Zoom connection).

E. Satellite Dish Presentation - Mr. Bryan Van Sweden, Community Preservation Coordinator, Susquehanna Region of the State Historic Preservation Office

Mr. Van Sweden attended the HARB meeting to discuss the CLG grants in regarding the updating of the *Code of Ordinances Gettysburg Borough* and *Design Guide* for satellite dishes. He noted the language must reflect ability for enforcement and suggested any dishes placed on the front façade of structures go through HARB review. The only way to clean-up the old unused dishes on the building facades is to reflect language in our ordinance to support code enforcement. Ms. Gustafson said she would like to see language requiring tenants to obtain approval from their property owners prior to the installation of the proposed dishes.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0015 MINOR PROJECT: 126 Chambersburg Street – Orchard Reality LLC – Gary Owens Irish Pub**
Installation of a temporary 20'x40' tent in the rear of the budling to be used for outdoor seating for restaurant to maintain compliance with COVID 50% operating capacity restrictions.

- **COA 21-0016 MINOR PROJECT: 89 Steinwher Avenue – Jacqueline D. White - Dobbin House**
Installation of two temporary 40'x40' tents in the parking lot in front of the Dobbin House to be used for outdoor seating for restaurant to maintain compliance with COVID 50% operating capacity restrictions.
- **COA 21-0019 MINOR PROJECT: 306 N. Stratton Street – Chasity F. Parks, Contractor: Jeremy Crum**
Repair fieldstone and brick remove repaired concrete block restore to existing fieldstone with proper mortar. Remove incorrectly applied mortar and repaint areas in need of repair within the brickwork of the structure. Seal brickwork and mortar with clear sealant to ensure long bring life. Use of age-appropriate mortar.
- **COA 21-0022 MINOR PROJECT: 19 Baltimore Street – Times Square LLC**
Installation of new signage, Sign 21"x3.5" window sign to read :Curaleaf' in white vinyl lettering.
- **COA 21-0023 MINOR PROJECT: 137 W. Middle Street – Patrick & Sandee Luckenbaugh**
Replace existing gray metal roof with slate-colored roof and white metal seamless gutters and downspouts. Repair and repaint existing wood fascia. NO change if soffits. All work must be done 'in kind'.
- **COA 21-0024 MINOR PROJECT: 34 York Street – Joan Hodges**
Replace existing shingle to shingle roof on rear or structure 24'x48' area, with all 'IN KIND' materials. Install drip edge at all eaves and rakes, ice and water shields along all eaves and valleys, install OC 4' Ventsure Ridge Vent. Any exposed wood must be restored and painted.
- **COA 21-0031 MINOR PROJECT: 320 N. Stratton Street – Ian Clark**
Installation of AC unit on side of ½ unit duplex to be placed as far back on side of alley way of house to be screened from public view.
- **COA 21-0032 MINOR PROJECT: 110 Chambersburg – Philp Schindel**
Installation of 2' high x 4' wide banner with the text 'Serving up Coffee and Conversation since 2001'. (2 banners signs left)
- **COA 21-0033 MINOR PROJECT: 223 Baltimore Street – Waltz Partnership**
Installation of three (3) temporary banners with the text, 'The Crystal Wand – Healing crystals and dowsing rods, sage divination tools Books and more!'. Temporary 60 banners to expedite re-opening of business after fire.
- **COA 21-0034 MINOR PROJECT: 108 N. Stratton Street - Adams County Farm Market**
Three vinyl banners "Adams County Farmers Market Today 8AM - 1PM". Two 20.5 Sq.ft Razor banners, one at 108 N. Stratton St and one at 103 Carlisle St; one 36 sq ft banner at 103 Carlisle St (on fence) on Saturdays 5/8/21- 10/30/21.

- **COA 21-0035 MINOR PROJECT: 25 Carlisle Street - Robey Inc**
Repair and replace two areas of stucco in the façade of the building. Sections of cladding will be removed/re-attached to the structure and coated with new in-kind stucco material.
- **COA 21-0036 MINOR PROJECT: 127 W. Racehorse Alley – Gettysburg College**
Removal of existing shingle roof system and install new shingle roof system in its place. There is one section of existing rubber roofing that will be replaced with new EPDM.

NOTE: HARB is a **DESIGN** review board only, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinance and Building code requirements.

Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the March 17, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Chair Goble. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Goble, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Gustafson, Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Malot, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. McCabe; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried **7-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – *Chair Goble*

Chair Goble acknowledged and complimented Director English on the new HARB door hangers that Board members could leave on the front doors of selected properties to thank and acknowledge the property owner(s) for their diligent work to improve their historic district properties. Director English said that 1500 door hangers were printed, and she will make hanger packets accessible to Board Members for their use.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

- Director English had no report at this time.
- Director English reminded the Board to fill out and return their ethics papers to Assistant Borough Manager / Secretary Stull at 59 E. High Street as soon as possible.

Other Business

Mr. Shaffer asked if Board Members could meet at the Borough Building in person socially distanced per the CDC / PA Governor's COVID19 Guidelines to conduct a training with photographs for approximately 45 minutes. Director English will check with Borough Management for this training between HARB Members only.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Vice-Chair Lingle made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed **7-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:30 PM.

HARB Business Meeting

April 21, 2021

Page 7 of 8

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant