



April 20, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, April 20, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Justin Harman, Suzanne Christianson, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Jim McCabe; **Others in Attendance:** Jay Mackie, CFO of Twin Bridges Farms LLC, representing 163 York Street; Troy Dean, VP at Creative Graphcom, and Dave Wolfe, Contractor for Do It All Dave, both representing 326 Baltimore Street; John Buchheister, Property Owner, representing 123 W High Street; Wesley K. Heyser, Property Owner, and Chad Collie, Contractor from Allied Plaster and Construction, both representing 226 N. Stratton Street; and Frank Grumbine, Historic Preservation Specialist for the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission (PHMC), Lewisberry PA.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of six (6) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, May 9, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to hear Agenda Item B, first because he represents Items, A, C, and D; and to accept the April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Vice Chair Stone requested that “specific” be changed to “breadboard” in paragraph three under Agenda Item B, COA-220025, 451 Baltimore Street. Vice Chair Stone made a **motion** to accept the March 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissent.**

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

B. COA 22-0038 MAJOR PROJECT: 326 Baltimore Street – Troy Dean

Remove existing rear steps and second floor decking and replace it with pressure treated lumber. Current decking and steps were installed without a permit review or approval. All exterior detail areas will be replicated to match the existing areas. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a 2 ½ story brick structure with a slate or tin roof. The permit history includes a RRUO permits for two units from 2019 to the present, and this application.

Troy Dean, property owner and Dave Wolfe, contractor at Do It All Dave, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he would like to remove the existing first floor and second floor decks and build a new 18’ x 9’ first floor deck and a new 13’ x 4’ second floor deck with a 4’-wide stairway to come down to the landing that meets the first-floor deck, and then from the landing incorporate both sets of stairs to meet the ground. He said that the top deck would extend completely over the bottom deck. He explained that the entrance to the bottom deck will be from the back of the yard instead of from the side. He said that all framing will be made out of treated lumber.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 326 Baltimore Street. He said that this dwelling is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is not visible from the public view way and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed critical building alterations to the rear decking is a critical project to a sensitive building that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the rear decking at 326 Baltimore Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the

application dated February 11, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention.**

Chair Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to fiduciary relationship with the following two applicants: 163 York Street, 123 W. High Street, and a design relationship with the applicant at 226 N. Stratton Street, whereby Vice-Chair Stone assumed the role as Chair.

A. COA-220040 Major Project: 163 York Street – Twin Bridges Farms LLC, Jay Mackie

Emergency demo work to remove separating brick from the entrance door awning/roof and replace with temporary plywood. Applicant will submit plans for HARB review for final rebuild, but roofing dormer structure will remain with this application. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her project scope from her April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a brick two-story building with a shingled roof with an attached rear facing framed one-story addition with a shingled roof; and two rear outbuildings that are one- and two-story frame structures with shingled roofs. The permit history shows 2017 restore/replace brick and RRUO; 2018 repair stucco on rear south exterior and paint; 2022 replace HVAC , power wash prime and repaint panels; replace door in-kind, replace window sills, reinstall same window, and this application for portico removal.

Mr. Jay Mackie, CFO of Open Minds, and Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the old firewall entrance was added in 2003 and was not original to the building but was used as the main entrance to the Open Minds office building. He said that the capstone is loose and that the brick portico is separating from the structure presenting a safety hazard. He is seeking the safe removal of the brick and capstone and would like to cover the area in plywood until plans are resubmitted to HARB for the rebuild at a later date. Mr. Malot suggested the issuance of an emergency permit to remove the brick to prevent any safety issues.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 163 York Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building with high architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via York Street and Zerfing Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed removal of the brick portico for safety issues is a critical project that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for rehabilitation.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the emergency removal of the brick portico at 163 York Street as presented to the Board in the application dated March 8, 2022 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 with one abstention by roll call vote without dissention.**

C. COA 22-0041 MAJOR PROJECT: 123 W. High Street – John Buchheister

Application submitted is a modification to a rear garage: secure existing garage door in raised position and replace opening with new exterior wall with a one-man six-panel steel door, install one new 3x5'6" double hung vinyl or aluminum clad wood window with insulated glass (emergency exit compliance), and cover this area only with black or black painted vinyl siding. Work to be done to front façade only and not permitted on sides or rear facing alley. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a duplex two-story brick structure with a shingled roof, rear brick one-story addition and framed porch with a tin roof in the rear of both duplex units. The permit history shows Zoning Hearing Board applications in 2017 and 2022; 2018 change rear garage to an exercise club (project abandoned); 2019 Change of Use; 2021 demo of rear garage; and this application for partial conversion of three-bay garage converting one bay to a one-unit apartment.

Mr. John Buchheister, property owner, and Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer told the Board that the building has limited visibility from the public view way from W. High and S. Washington Streets and was once used as a garage by the former H&H Pontiac Car Dealership. He said that it is currently used as a private garage by the owner, and he would like to convert part of the building into a one-unit apartment building. He said that the applicant would like to replace the existing garage door (save door for future use) with a six-panel man door, one new 3' x 5' double hung vinyl or aluminum clad window with insulated glass and cover the new area with black vinyl siding or black paint. He said that the Planning Commission will recommend to the Zoning Hearing Board the conversion of the left garage space to a one-bedroom apartment with a handicap ADA compliant bathroom.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 123 W. High Street. He said that this dwelling is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a cinder block building with limited architectural integrity over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and has limited visibility from the public view way via W. High and S. Washington Streets and Legion Alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed work has compatible scale and rhythm that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for new construction and rehabilitation.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the modification of a three-bay garage to include the conversion of the left bay- from a garage bay into a one-bedroom apartment at 123 W. High Street as presented to the Board in the application dated February 28, 2022 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and carried **5-to-0 with one abstention by roll call vote without dissention**.

D. COA 22-0034 MAJOR PROJECT: 226 N. Stratton Street – Wesley K. Heyser

Add rear addition to expand kitchen on first floor and master bathroom on second floor; replace rear second floor flat roof with a peaked roof; add master bath on second floor; alter window and door

size/placement inside and rear; add rear and side screened porch; remove aluminum siding and replace with brick veneer along with rotting trim and fly ash; rebuild front porch to address rot; replace front porch railing; replace front retaining wall; enclose yard with 48" black aluminum fence with arched gate at front entrance. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her April 20, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure was built by George W.S. Barbehenn as a brick structure with a two-story frame addition added later maintaining its original footprint until 1931. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1912 as a two-story brick structure, and that the masonry portion of the building is currently covered with a combination of form stone and white aluminum siding. The permit history includes the current application.

Mr. Wesley K. Heyser, property owner, Mr. Chad Collie, Contractor at Allied Plaster and Construction, and Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates PC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Heyser that three families only lived in this house, and that he would like to expand the footprint to meet the needs of his growing family. He discussed the expansion of the kitchen, addition of a master bath and second floor peaked roof. He said that he would like to create a rear-side screened porch, remove the aluminum siding and cover with a thin brick veneer, replace the rotting trim with Tri-Exterior Fly Ash-based replacement material, replace the front porch railings and posts with in-kind materials both the first floor and second floor porches, replace the front retaining wall with Allan Block and fence in the yard with Alumi-Guard 48" black aluminum fencing. He said that the exterior façade improvements would include: replacing the main door on south side with a French door; remove the bay window on the west wall and replace with four windows arranged in pairs and replace windows in second floor room with Provia Aspect AP500 Series vinyl with simulated light grid two over two patterns; replace all aluminum storm windows with white Larson Gold Series storms; replace all gutters with .Berger six-inch half-inch round painted aluminum in dark bronze color.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 226 N. Stratton Street. He said that this dwelling represents a nineteenth century structural design with high architectural integrity with original design from a working-class neighborhood, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via N. Stratton Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed major building alterations to the façade, siding, roof, and building structure would be an accepted change according to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide for Rehabilitation* and would recommend that any alterations maintain and enhance the character of the building and that any new construction be compatible with existing historic neighborhood elements.

Mr. Harman made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations and new construction at 226 N. Stratton Street as defined with a scope of work that would reflect and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated March 27, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **5-to-0 (with one abstention) by roll call vote without dissent.**

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Special Board Presentation

Mr. Frank Grumbine, Historic Community Preservation Coordinator with the Pennsylvania Historical Museum Commission, oversees a 28-PA County region and provides planning and training for local governments in the areas of preservation issues, record and data management, and ordinance reviews. He gave a special presentation, *Historic District Planning: Preparing for Successful Outcomes*, discussing the basics for the identification, education, and preservation of Historic District properties. He covered importance of history and material education, the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) applications, municipal staff duties and support of property preservation, and Historic District Guidelines. He talked about providing technical preservation assistance and the accessibility of historic district information to property owners, providing sound preliminary Historic District application reviews, the complete steps to processing COA Applications, and staff reviews and HARB Meetings. He stressed the importance of the three Rs: retain, repair, and replace in-kind, and to reach out to him with any Historic District needs.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 22-0022 MINOR PROJECT: 33 Steinwehr Avenue – Tessa G. Bardo**
Change of Occupancy from ice cream parlor to ice cream parlor and creperie. Installation of 4'x3' vinyl/PVC sign hanging from existing pole and brackets. Signage must be anchored in the mortar, not within the existing brick. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0026 MINOR PROJECT: 116 Baltimore Street – Stausbaugh Law, PLLC**
Change of Occupancy to professional office. Installation of one 3'x3' aluminum and cast-iron wall mounted sign for Strausbaugh Law. Aluminum sign with cast iron brackets wall mounted. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0027 MINOR PROJECT: 168 Carlisle Street - Melva Cockle – Gettysburg Vapes**
Change of Use from coffee shop to retail store. Installation of one 4.7'x3' laminated vinyl sign for Gettysburg Vales on existing brackets. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0028 MINOR PROJECT: 100 Chambersburg Street – JME II LLC**
Repoint joints and repair peeling enamel coating on the masonry units with new enamels intended for that use. Repair/install flashing and covering the tops of the parapet wall with copper metal coping. In-kind replacement repair work but using alternative materials may require HARB review. Paint window frames, doors, and other existing painted surfaces. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0029 MINOR PROJECT: 114 E. Middle Street – Anne Gallagher**
Remove existing chain link fence and install 72 linear feet of 6-foot-high privacy fence along the west side of the rear yard. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0030 MINOR PROJECT: 548 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Heritage Enterprises**

Repair rotted wood board 'in-kind' and paint wood above the gift shop entrance. Install 20"x13' wall sign for 'The Jennie Wade House Gift Shop' above entrance. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- **COA 22-0029 MINOR PROJECT: 114 E. Middle Street – Anne Roden**
Installation of 72 linear feet of 6-foot-high wood privacy fencing along the west side of the rear yard. This is to screen private residence from mixed business use side yard boundary. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0023 MINOR PROJECT: 45 Chambersburg Street – G-burg Real Estate Co.**
Use first floor as retail where retail business was previously located. Restore three (3) existing wood windows on 2nd floor to remain paintable original wood windows. In-kind maintenance. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0031 MINOR PROJECT: 46 South Street – Spencer Waldron**
Shingle-to-shingle replacement 'in-kind' no wrapping of exterior exposed wood trims. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0033 MINOR Project: 163 York Street, Twin Bridges Farm LLC**
Repair rotted wood on exterior panels as needed. Power-wash, prime, repaint panels using the same look and colors. Replace outswing double door in-kind. Repair rotted wood on interior entryway of building. Remove windows, replace window sills and reinstall same windows in interior entryway. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0035 66-68 W. High Street – The Gettysburg Academy - Scott and Debra English**
Remove an existing chain link fence and replace with a 6' privacy fence at the to-build line of 10' then use 1:1 open ratio fence from building line to sidewalk. Replace existing wood decking on rear 2nd floor deck with Timber-Teck material with a wood grain appearance and ceiling of same porch 'in-kind'. Paint existing wood porch columns, cupola, and soffit at roof line. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the February 16, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and **carried 6-to-0 by roll call vote without dissention**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer did not have a report at this time.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Discussed the review of a tree house in the Historic District, and Board requested more information,
- Discussed request to add muntins to windows at 57 Breckenridge Street,
- Reviewed the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist with HARB members for the HARB Preservation Awards Ceremony to be held on Wednesday, May 18, 2022 welcome reception at 5:45-6pm and awards ceremony at 6PM-7PM in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street,
- Asked the Board to continue their review and to comment on the Satellite Dish updates for both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council,
- Discussed the grant opportunity to reinventory properties in the Gettysburg Historic District, and that the item will be placed in next year's budget,
- Discussed the usage of HARB "Thank You for Your Support" hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow), and
- Asked HARB Members to forward any online seminar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars).

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone. The **motion passed 6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:42 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant