

DRAFT

**August 17, 2016
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 17, 2016. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Clem Malot, Gettysburg Building Code Official; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Absent Board Member: Colleen Lingle. Also in attendance were: Anne S. Zabawa, President, and Bruce Kyle, Chairman of the Building Committee of Historic Gettysburg-Adams County, Inc. (HGAC), representing 53 East Middle Street; Richard Kelley, owner, representing 37 Hanover Street; Justin David Blanset, Agent for Shenandoah Telecommunications Company (Shentel) c/o NB+C Engineering Services, LLC, representing One Lincoln Square; Gina and Charles Longhitano, tenants, representing 315 North Stratton Street; Donald and Michele Behan, owner, representing 373 Buford Avenue; Kevin McCready of Orchard County Realty and Gary W. Shaffer of Shaffer Design Associates, representing 59 West Middle Street; Jon and Stacy Chronister, owner, representing 61 East Middle Street; Steven Wolf, owner, representing 131-133 West Middle Street; Brandon Stone, owner, representing 63 West High Street; Keith George of the Purple Piggy, representing 114 Buford Avenue; Susan Naugle, Gettysburg Borough Councilor; and Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PA Municipal Code Alliance.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections to the revised meeting agenda, which shows the addition of **COA-16-55, 61 East Middle Street, Jon Chronister. Alteration. Replace existing shingles with new shingles; and two Stop Work Orders at 131-133 W. Middle Street, and 63 West High Street for windows not compliant with previously issued Certificates of Approvals.** Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the July 20, 2016 meeting. Seconded by Mr. McCabe. Motion carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 12, 2016.

- A. COA-16-47, 53 East Middle Street, Historic Gettysburg-Adams County Inc. (HGAC). Alteration. Replace existing asphalt shingles, felt and drip edge with new asphalt shingles, felt and drip edge on the GAR Hall.**

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

The building, the GAR Hall, is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. It appears on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, which are the first of the series, as a solid brick building labelled G.A.R. Hall. It appears on the Sanborn maps dated 1891, 1896, 1902, 1907 and 1912 with an additional solid brick structure at the rear of the building. In November of 1988, Historic Gettysburg-Adams County, Inc. (HGAC) also known as the Historic Preservation Society of Gettysburg-Adams County, established in 1975, agreed to acquire and restore the G.A.R. property. Since it was the oldest standing church building in Gettysburg, the HGAC board of directors decided to restore some features of the original church structure, such as the contour of the altar area, the choir loft and the cemetery in the rear of the building. Over the next two years, HGAC members worked diligently to achieve a level of restoration that would preserve the charm of the original 1822 structure while respectfully displaying artifacts to retain features and the appearance of the traditional G.A.R. meeting place. Due to the deteriorated condition of the walls in the sanctuary, new walls were installed on which folk art murals were painted that depicted historic scenes throughout Adams County. By reinforcing crumbling walls, uncovering the balcony in the main room, adding a new roof and attractive serviceable lower meeting hall, HGAC assured that the building would remain standing to provide service to many generations to come. The building today serves the community as a meeting and dining hall hosting numerous local groups, catered affairs, and regularly scheduled HGAC and Sons of the Union Veterans (SUVCW) functions.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

No prior approvals for 53 East Middle Street.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 53 East Middle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.

- The proposed work is a Minor Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinances as “A project that does not result in a change in appearance of a building, such as replacing deteriorated wood with identical wooded pieces.”
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District.

Mr. Kyle gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the HGAC wants to replace the existing asphalt roof shingles, felt and drip edge down to the plywood sheathing which was installed in 1989. He said that they want to install a new felt, drip edge and new gray Timberline architectural asphalt shingles. He said that the current asphalt shingles are deteriorating, but the gutters are in good shape. Mr. Shaffer said that the roof is not visible from the street, and that the proposed shingles are the same style as the current shingles; therefore the entire application would be a replacement in kind, and could be approved administratively.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board issue a Certificate of Appropriateness administratively at the G.A.R. Hall at 53 East Middle Street for the replacement of the existing asphalt shingles with new asphalt shingles and perform other roof maintenance as depicted in the application dated July 14, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

B. COA-16-48, 37 Hanover Street, Richard Kelley. Alteration. The applicant plans to replace both back roofs and to replace the back walls on the lower part of the house.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This building is located within the Gettysburg Historic District 1999 Extensions. It first appears on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, which are the first of the series to cover that area of Gettysburg, as a two story frame dwelling with a one story frame structure attached at the rear of the building. There is also an out building shown at the rear of the property. It appears on the Sanborn maps dated 1912 with the same configuration.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

There were no prior approvals for 37 Hanover Street.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 37 Hanover Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work is a Minor Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project that does not result in a change in appearance of a building, such as replacing deteriorated wood with identical wooden pieces."
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Kelley gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he had found structural problems due to water infiltration to the back roofs and back walls of the lower part of the house. He intends to replace both back roofs and the back walls with like materials. Mr. Shaffer noted that the back part of the house is not visible from the street. Mr. Malot stated that the applicant would be held to replacing the materials with in-kind materials in any permits.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board issue a Certificate of Appropriateness administratively for the property at 37 Hanover Street for the replacement of the existing back roofs and back walls on the lower part of the house with like materials as depicted in the application dated July 18, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

C. COA-16-49, 1 Lincoln Square, The Gettysburg Hotel. Alteration. Modify the existing Shentel wireless telecommunications facility.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This building is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. It appears on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, which are the first of the series, as a two story solid brick structure with some frame portions and is labelled McClellan House. It appears roughly the same and with the same label on the 1891 Sanborn maps. On the 1896 maps, the configuration has changed to a three story solid brick structure and is labelled Hotel Gettysburg. On the 1902, 1907, and 1912 Sanborn maps, the configuration appears roughly the same and with the Hotel Gettysburg label.

The following history of The Gettysburg Hotel is taken from the Historic Hotels of America web site:

The Gettysburg Hotel started off as a tavern on what is now known as Lincoln Square, Gettysburg's historic town center. Scott's Tavern was built in 1797 by James Scott and in 1809 it was acquired by William McClellan, a former York County sheriff who renamed the tavern, the Indian Queen. After 1846, it was called the McClellan House for its owners, the McClellan brothers.

The 1890s brought about an imposing revamp of the old building that the new owner christened The Gettysburg Hotel. It remained as such throughout the majority of the 20th century. By the time the 1900s rolled around, the Gettysburg Hotel boasted electric lights, steam heat, hot and cold baths, and a fine restaurant.

In 1955, it became a temporary White House while President Eisenhower recovered from a heart attack at Gettysburg. President Eisenhower and his wife, Mamie, were the Gettysburg Hotel's last guests in 1964 before the owner closed its doors. The old building was ravaged in an unfortunate fire in 1983. It had long since been abandoned as a victim of postwar America and changes in traveling habits.

Through an initiative of Gettysburg College, the Gettysburg Hotel was carefully restored in cooperation with the Historic Architectural Review Board. Opened in 1991 as The Gettysburg Hotel, the grand new building faithfully recaptures its historic past.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

COA 16-02 was approved at the Board meeting on January 13, 2016 to replace four existing double-hung windows on four rooms/suites in the front of the hotel with aluminum-clad double-hung windows.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 1 Lincoln Square is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work is a Critical Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building, or change of configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any

alteration to a sensitive building, as defined in the definition of "sensitive building" in this Subsection 3."

- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Justin Blanset, Agent for Shentel c/o NB+C Engineering Services, LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Blanset said that there is too much metal on the rooftop, and that there is a need to meet the huge demand for data with these antennas. He said that the antennas need be moved up higher to shoot telecommunication signals over the edge of the building in order to provide the needed data coverage. He said that Shentel would like to construct a "stealth penthouse" fiberglass structure atop the existing rooftop penthouse which will match the existing penthouse in color and design. He said that Shentel's antennas and some ancillary equipment will be moved inside the proposed stealth penthouse. Mr. Shaffer said that this is not a replacement.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the existing Shentel wireless telecommunications facility by constructing a "stealth penthouse" at 1 Lincoln Square for the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated July 26, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. The motion carried 6-to-0.

D. COA-16-50, 315 North Stratton Street, Courtney Wege. Alteration. Install both a 4-foot wooden picket fence at the rear of the house, and three wooden gates.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This property is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. However, none of the six series of Sanborn Fire Insurance maps cover that area of Gettysburg.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

No prior approvals for 315 North Stratton Street.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 315 North Stratton Street is a nonsensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application. Based on available information, the building was constructed in 1974, which is 42 years ago.

- The proposed work is a Major Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project proposed for a nonsensitive building, involving replacement with other than original materials or design of existing building components such as windows, doors, soffits, rain channels, roofs, siding, porches, fencing, shutters, and awnings in a manner that does not change the configuration and rhythm of the building as a whole, and is proposed for a nonsensitive building."
- The building is not a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Gina and Charles Longhitano gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Longhitano said that they have permission from Ms. Courtney Wege, owner of the property, to install a new 4-foot treated wooden picket fence and three 5-foot wide gates constructed out of pine that will eventually be stained. She said the proposed fence will be a little taller, and will replace an older weathered fence that has deteriorated. She said that the fence contractor will be D&G Fence and Decks. Mr. Shaffer noted that the building is less than 50 years old, and is a non-sensitive major project.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 315 North Stratton Street to install a 4-foot wooden picket fence at the rear of the house with three gates using the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated June 25, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble. The motion carried 6-to-0.

E. COA-16-51, 373 Buford Avenue, Donald and Michele Behan. Alteration. Remove the existing shingle roof, which according to the applicant is original to the house built in 1985, and install GAF Timberline HD shingles.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This building is located within the Gettysburg Historic District 1999 Extensions. None of the six series of Sanborn Fire Insurance maps from 1886 to 1912 include this area of Gettysburg. As noted under Description above, the house was built in 1985.

PREVIOUS APPROVAL

No prior approvals for 373 Buford Ave.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 373 Buford Ave is a nonsensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic

District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.

- The proposed work is a Minor Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project that does not result in a change in appearance of a building, such as replacing deteriorated wood with identical wooden pieces."
- The building is not a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Ms. Behan gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that the applicant would like to remove the existing original roof from 1985 and replace it with a new shingle roof using GAF Timberline HD shingles that are similar in style. She said that the roof is over 30 years old and that there is water infiltration in their bathroom. She said that RAYMAR Roofing will replace her roof.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board issue a Certificate of Appropriateness administratively for the property at 373 Buford Avenue for the replacement of the existing shingle roof with like materials as depicted in the application dated August 2, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the next two agenda items, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as chair.

F. COA-16-52, 59 West Middle Street, Kevin McCready. Demolition. Demolish an existing one-story frame building on a concrete slab to the rear of the house.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This property is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. The house first appears on the 1891 Sanborn map and is shown as a 1 ½ story solid brick dwelling with a 2 story and 1 story frame portion to the rear. There is also a frame stable or out building shown at the rear of the property which is no longer present. The 1896, 1902, and 1907 maps show the same configuration. On the 1912 map, the house is shown as a 2 story solid brick dwelling with a 2 story frame portion to the rear. The 1 story frame portion is not present at the rear of the house on the 1912 map.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

The Board considered COA-16-52 for 59 West Middle Street at the July 20, 2016. The application was for the demolition of the same frame structure discussed in this new application and for construction of a monitor horse barn style garage. After some discussion, the applicant withdrew his application with the intention of resubmitting new applications in the future.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 59 West Middle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work is a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."
- The house is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Shaffer presented the application on behalf of the owner, Kevin McCready. He said that the applicant would like to demolish a non-descript 12-foot by 24-foot structure on a concrete slab, and that the building has no visibility from West Middle Street, but it has limited visibility from West Zerfing Alley as a result of fencing and landscaping that screen it. He said that the building is not an exemplary structure of any architectural style or historical significance. He said that Mr. McCready would like to build an interior garden and private green space in this area.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 59 West Middle Street to demolish the accessory structure behind the historic residence as submitted in the plans depicted in the application dated August 1, 2016. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

G. COA-16-52, 59 West Middle Street, Kevin McCready. New Construction. Construct a new barn style accessory building/garage to the rear of the house.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This property is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. The house first appears on the 1891 Sanborn map and is shown as a 1 ½ story solid brick dwelling with a 2 story and 1 story frame portion to the rear. There is also a frame stable or out building shown at the rear of the property which is no longer present. The 1896, 1902, and 1907 maps show the same configuration. On the 1912 map, the house is shown as a 2 story solid brick dwelling with a 2 story frame portion to the rear. The 1 story frame portion is not present at the rear of the house on the 1912 map.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

The Board considered COA-16-52 for 59 West Middle Street at the July 20, 2016. The application was for the demolition of the same frame structure discussed in this new application and for construction of a monitor horse barn style garage. After some discussion, the applicant withdrew his application with the intention of resubmitting new applications in the future.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 59 West Middle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work is a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."

- The house is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Shaffer presented the application on behalf of the owner, Kevin McCready. He said that the applicant would like to add a 24-foot by 30-foot deep monitor style horse barn accessory building/garage, and it will sit 23 feet off of West Zerfing Alley. He said that it has been reconfigured as per the attached north (alley) elevation to reduce the size of the two “wing” portions in relation to the center, taller section. He said that the 10-foot wide center configuration with the shorter wings to the rear of the structure will screen the house from the alley. He said that there is a 24-foot height limit, and that this structure is under that limit at 23.4 feet. He noted that the Zoning Hearing Board approved the variance, and that the Planning Commission recommended approval of the variance at its July, 2016 meeting.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 59 West Middle Street to construct a new barn style accessory building/garage behind the historic residence as submitted in the plans depicted in the application dated August 1, 2016. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

H. COA-16-55, 61 East Middle Street, Jon Chronister. Alteration. Replace existing shingles with new shingles.

Mr. Malot gave background information, a brief building history, and presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* from the Board Memorandum dated August 17, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

This building is located within the Gettysburg Historic District. On the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, which are the first of the series, there is a two story frame dwelling shown on the property. The building appears in the same configuration on the remaining series of Sanborn maps from 1891 to 1912.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

There were no prior approvals for 61 East Middle Street.

PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT:

- The structure at 61 East Middle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic

District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as a building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.

- The proposed work is a Minor Project, which is defined in the Historic Districts Ordinance as "A project that does not result in a change in appearance of a building, such as replacing deteriorated wood with identical wooden pieces."
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

Mr. Malot recommended strict adherence to the findings of the Board.

Mr. Chronister said that he would like to replace the 3-tab shingles from his 40-year old roof with new 3-tab shingles as depicted in the supplied sample. He said that the roof decking and underlayment is fine, and that Sanders roofing will replace his roof.

Ms. Goble made a **motion** that the Board issue a Certificate of Appropriateness administratively for the property at 61 East Middle Street for the replacement of the existing shingle roof with like materials as depicted in the application dated August 8, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 6-to-0.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals

1. **COA-16-46, 69 West Middle Street, Alam Barrera. Replace slate roof with like materials. Approval dated 7-20-16.**

B. Clem Malot-Interim Director for Planning and Historic Preservation

- a) **131-133 West Middle Street, Steven Wolf. Stop Work Order on 8-25-26: Windows not compliant with HARB approval recommendation of COA-16-30 to Council from May 18, 2016 meeting.**

Mr. Malot stated that a Stop Work Order Notice per Title 34 Part XIV Section 403.81 for violation of the Uniform Construction code evident upon inspection on August 13, 2016: "The owner or contractor had replaced all windows, as well as a front door on the street elevation of this address. There was no approval for these windows to be replaced, the contractor informed the HARB at the May meeting that the windows would be restored. All work must stop until this issue is resolved."

Mr. Wolf responded to the notice and to Board questions. He said that the door on his building at 133 West Middle was hinged the wrong way, and that his contractor, Tom Reed, replaced the door with a correctly hinged 6-panel door of the same character. He said that the window casings and sashes were broken beyond repair causing their replacement. He said that the new windows are wood inside and out, and are paintable. He said that he could not save any of the wooden windows that were removed on the front façade, but that he had replaced those window with wooden windows. He stressed that he was repairing the deteriorated windows, and that safety of the deteriorated wood factored into his decision.

Mr. Shaffer said that the issue here is that the replacement of the windows required Board approval, and that the work was stopped because window restoration and not replacement was approved. Mr. Wolf said that PlyGem built 1-over-1 windows to the specs of the former windows. Mr. Shaffer said that the integrity of an historic structure is lost through replacement, and that the Board would have considered the project initially if window replacement was originally presented. Mr. Goble said that in order to maintain historic integrity in the Historic District, projects must be approved and changes addressed. Mr. Malot stated that the Building Code Official must enforce the zoning ordinance which includes the Historic District. He said that HARB recommends the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to Borough Council based on the application for the repair of the windows as submitted. He said that you had made a decision in the field to make those changes without zoning approval from both the Board and Borough Council based on the zoning ordinance covering the Historic District. Mr. Malot said that the current Stop Work Order would remain in effect for the front stoop and windows until the problem is resolved and permission to lift the order is granted at the September 12, 2016 Council meeting.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a modification to the original Certificate of Appropriateness that was issued for 131-133 West Middle Street at their August 8, 2016 Council meeting for the replacement of the front stoop and windows based on the actual conditions that could not be made at the time of the prescribed work. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion carried 6-to-0.

b) 63 West High Street, Brandon and Valerie Stone. Stop Work Order on 8-15-16: Windows not compliant with HARB approval recommendation of COA-16-19 to Council from April 20, 2016 meeting.

Mr. Malot stated that a Stop Work Order Notice per Title 34 Part XIV Section 403.81 for violation of the Uniform Construction code evident upon inspection on August 15, 2016: "The owner or contractor had installed windows that "are significantly smaller than the original windows". The drawings show the first floor replacement windows as taller and they were not installed that way. As was typical of the period

the first floor windows need to be taller. This is a major issue as the replacement windows are not acceptable and have not been approved as installed.”

Mr. Stone responded to the notice and to Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the windows on the first floor front elevation were mounted higher than the door originally, but the windows now are the same size. Mr. Stone explained that the amount of damage to the building structure is extensive, perhaps termites. He said that the log cabin was built out of two-by-fours with no structural bearing within the walls, and that the windows are not frameable as built. He said that the intent was to align the windows with the frame of the house and add shutters, referring to the Farnsworth House as an example. He said that the style of the door is prevalent, but the work had to be done for structural reasons due to termite damage that occurred 20 years ago compromising the structural integrity of the building.

Mr. Shaffer said that the building drawings are important, and that the current work could be determined to be in accordance with HARB. The drawings did depict windows of equal size but mounted higher than the top of the door, and that the window size was missed on the drawings. Mr. Stone said that the windows were installed in accordance with the drawings, but the windows needed to be adjusted downward slightly to match the height of the door to meet the window inspection. He noted that the building had been altered several times. Mr. Malot said that the Stop Work Order could be lifted if HARB makes the determination that the current window placement is in accordance with HARB. Mr. Shaffer said that the window placement was determined by building integrity and in line with the drawings. He said that the work had been performed in compliance with the HARB recommendation to Council.

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** that the Borough Building Official rescind the Stop Work Order and that the current placement of the windows is compliant with the HARB recommendation to Council. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 6-to-0.

C. Reports of Chair

Mr. Malot updated the Board on the job search for the Borough Planning Director, and that the candidate pool had been reduced significantly.

Other Business

A. Satellite Dish Requirements

Mr. Shaffer said that Susan Naugle made a presentation to Council at their last work session meeting on Monday, July 25th addressing regulations to safeguard historic structures in the district. Ms. Naugle stated that the Board can proceed with

exploring the regulation of satellite dishes by ordinance in the Historic District. She said that she will contact the City of Reading about their procedures, and how to add them to the Historic District ordinance. Me. Shaffer said that an ordinance would help both property owners and tenants control the placement of these dishes. He stated that an ordinance would be a positive thing for our Historic District, and that the Historic District is a positive thing for the Borough.

B. Window Survey

Ms. Gustafson presented the Board with a window survey guideline to review.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 9:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant