

May 18, 2016
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 18, 2016. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Phil Goble and Clem Malot, Borough Code Enforcement Officer; Scott Dellett, Planning Director; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Christopher Ackerman of the Regimental Quartermaster, representing 49 Steinwehr Avenue; Prince Henlon, representing 55 Breckenridge Street; James W. Fouts of the Memorial Church of the Prince of Peace, representing 20 West High Street; Tom Reed of Reeds Construction, representing 131-133 West Middle Street; Steve Wyngarden and Matt George of the Civil War Trust, representing 401 Buford Avenue; and Robert A. Sharrah of Sharrah Design Restoration & Construction, LLC, representing 259 Steinwehr Avenue. Board Members Joan Hodges and Colleen Lingle were absent.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the April 20, 2016 meeting. Seconded by Mr. Malot. Motion carried 5-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 13, 2016.

Mr. Shaffer stated that the applicant representing Americana Souvenirs, 150 North Third Street was not present at this time, and moved this application to the end of the agenda.

A. COA-16-27 George Lomas, 49 Steinwehr Avenue. Demolition/New Construction. Replace the existing shed with a new larger shed.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

Based on Borough property records, it is believed the present storage building was approved in April 1999 (Building Permit 99-13).

Mr. Ackerman, representing the applicant, gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. Mr. Ackerman said that the applicant wanted to remove the existing dilapidated shed and replace it with a larger eight-foot-by-13 foot Craftsman Resin shed with a second floor storage area for non-flammable items. He said that the approximate height of the new structure would be 18 to 20 feet.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The subject accessory structure is a non-sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance).
- Based on the age of the structure, the accessory structure is a non-contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The new outbuilding shall comply with regulations in Chapter 27 of the Borough Code of Ordinances.

Mr. Dellett said that the applicant must comply with the zoning ordinance for side yard setback requirements for the proposed structure.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 49 Steinwehr Avenue for the proposed plans depicted in the April 15, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble. The motion carried 5-to-0.

B. COA-16-28 Prince Henlon, 55 Breckenridge Street. Alteration. Replace 11 windows with vinyl windows.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

Known as the Runkle-Wheeler-Schultz House, attached is the Gettysburg Elm Street Architectural Inventory dated July 7, 2009.

Mr. Henlon gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He said that the house was built in 1947, and that he had purchased the property from the Adams County

Housing Authority in 1992. He said that the windows are old wood windows, difficult to open, and that they did not have storms. He said that the side windows are not visible to the public from the street, and that the front windows would fall apart if he attempted to open them. He said that his house has three front windows, two front doors, and no back door; and it is a very unusual house. He did not bring a window sample to the meeting. Mr. Dellett said that a letter was sent to Mr. Henlon and an email was sent to his contractor, Mr. Wheeler from Aspen Home Improvements, explaining what was needed for tonight's meeting: pictures of the windows needing replaced and samples of the proposed replacement windows. Mr. Shaffer said that the Board has never recommended a window replacement certificate based on limited information, and therefore the Board cannot review it at this time. He presented options to Mr. Henlon on how to proceed.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The structure at 55 Breckenridge Street is a sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The outbuilding is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as "A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building."

Mr. Shaffer said that the Board would closely review the three front windows and the two side windows which are visible to the public and possibly original to the structure.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for 55 Breckenridge Street for the proposed plans depicted in the May 4, 2016 as submitted until a window sample could be provided to the Board and an evaluation made in accordance with the Borough's Design Guide and the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties regarding windows. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion carried 5-to-0.

Mr. Dellett said that he would send a letter with the Board's recommendation to both Mr. Henlon and his contractor requesting photographic evidence of all of the windows in the structure, a specification sheet for those windows proposed for replacement, and a sample window for Board review.

C. COA-16-29 The Memorial Church of the Prince of Peace, 20 West High Street. Alteration. Replace the existing door with a more period-appropriate door.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

The Memorial Church of the Prince of Peace was constructed as a symbol of national reconciliation after the Civil War. The cornerstone was placed by war veterans on the 25th anniversary of the battle. An outline of the church's foundation appeared on the Borough's 1891 and 1896 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps; the completed church building first appeared on the Borough's 1902 Sanborn Fire Map.

Mr. Fouts gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. Mrs. Fouts said the Church wanted to install a more period-appropriate door which would provide increased energy efficiency, provide greater security, and improve the appearance to their offices on 205 Baltimore Street. He said that he did not think that the door is original to the building. Mr. Shaffer said that the high-profile door was considered for replacement in 2005, but was repaired instead. Mr. Fouts said that the proposed door would be custom-made, would not have a knocker or mail slot, but would consider a lacquered brass kick plate that would weather naturally. He said that the door is not used as an entrance to the church or the main offices. Mr. Shaffer recommended that if the existing door is not used, that it be salvaged and given to the local architectural warehouse.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The building at 20 West High Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.

- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Ms. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 20 West High Street for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated May 4, 2016 as submitted for a new door replicating the molding and the mail slot from the existing door. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 5-to-0.

D. COA-16-30 Steven Wolf, 131-133 West Middle Street. Alteration. Remove aluminum siding; restore and paint the original wood; remove the front storm windows; repair the original windows; apply door hoods above both of the doors; repair the brick steps.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

According to research by the Adams County Historical Society, the property is known as the Hannah Kitzmiller residence. The original structure was built in 1810. The building was either improved on torn down in 1879. A house was built on the western half of the property in 1880 and the lot was divided in 1885.

Mr. Reed gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions for the property on behalf of the applicant. He said that the dormers on the east side of the front reflecting the same appearance as that depicted on the west side of the building. The applicant plans on removing all storm windows, and repairing the old windows to their original appearance. Mr. Reed indicated that all of the satellite dishes would be removed and would consider using storm windows. Mr. Shaffer said that the storm windows could not be raw aluminum, the sashes must align with the sash behind them, and the colors must match the color of the windows.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The building at 131-133 West Middle Street is a sensitive building, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.

- The building is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “a project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 131-133 West Middle Street for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated May 4, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble. The motion carried 5-to-0.

E. COA-16-31 Civil War Trust, 401 Buford Avenue. Demolition. Amend the approval of COA-15-25 to permit the demolition of the Dustman Barn guest suite construction.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history, previous approvals and correspondence from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

Information on the Mary Thompson House from the Gettysburg Historic Building Survey Committee Survey Form (GETTS/HBSC 141-88) prepared in 1988 was previously distributed.

PREVIOUS APPROVALS

At its December 14, 2015 meeting Council approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish buildings formerly known as the Larson’s Quality Inn motel and Appalachian Brewing Co. restaurant. The two stone structures on the property – the Mary Thompson House and the Dustman Barn – remain.

At its April 11, 2016 meeting, Council approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following work at the Mary Thompson House:

- Repoint exterior masonry walls and foundation;
- Construct porch at the east elevation;
- Repair and replace windows;
- Replace existing door with a window at the north elevation;
- Reconstruct wood rose trellis;
- Remove dormers and replace roof; and
- Replace doors on the east, south and north elevations.

CORRESPONDENCE

- Letter from James M. Vaughan, State Historic Preservation Officer and Executive Director, Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission to Patrick Jennings of the U.S. National Park Service American Battlefield Protection Program dated November 19, 2015.
- Letter from Douglas C. McLearn, Chief of the Division of Archaeology and Protection, Pennsylvania State Historic Preservation Office to Paul Hawke, Chief, American Battlefield Protection Program, U.S. Department of Interior National Park Service, dated May 11, 2016.

Mr. Dellett said that this application is an amended application, noting the background information and correspondence.

Mr. Wyngarden gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He said that the National Park Service (NPS) intends to demolish the barn when they take over the property. The Civil War Trust wanted to determine what to do with the stone, and met with the Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission (PHMC), who questioned the historical integrity of the foundation of the structure. The Civil War Trust suggested removing the top of the structure and retaining the stone foundation of the barn despite the adverse visual affect, and the PHMC agreed. Mr. George said that the stone structure is in very good shape. He said that they are partnering with the Journey through Hallowed Ground (JTHG) to maintain the orchard. He said that they would break up the concrete slab inside the barn and return it to dirt to mitigate all safety concerns. He said that the PHMC does not believe that there is enough photographic evidence to recreate the barn.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*:

- The Dustman Barn guest suite structure at 401 Buford Avenue is a sensitive structure, as defined in Chapter 11 of the Borough Code of Ordinances, Historic Districts (Historic District Ordinance). A sensitive building is defined as any building that has been standing for at least 50 years at the time of application, even though it has been considerably modified and certain sites of later historic significance or buildings that the Board has determined to be exemplary of later architectural styles.
- The proposed work constitute a permanent change, making this proposal a critical project, which is defined in the Historic District Ordinance as “A project involving demolition of all or part of any building or change in configuration and rhythm of any building as a whole, or any alteration to a sensitive building.”

- In a November 19, 2015 letter, the Executive Director of the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission (PHMC) issued an opinion that *“retention of the modern addition to the Dustman Barn Foundation will result in an adverse visual effect to the National Register listed Battlefield Historic District. [The PHMC recommends] that American Battlefield Protection Program discuss with the Civil War Trust revisions to the proposed undertaking that stipulates removal of the Dustman Barn addition to ensure the maximum restoration of the Lee’s Headquarters landscape.”*
- In a May 11, 2016 letter, the Chief of the Division of Archaeology and Protection wrote: *“Our office is in receipt of Civil War Trust’s commitment to demolish the modern motel structure on top of the Dustman Barn’s stone foundation dated May 6, 2016. In our opinion, this commitment negates the adverse effect opinion expressed in our November 19, 2015 letter wherein the ‘retention of the modern addition to the Dustman Barn foundation will result in an adverse visual effect to the National Register listed Battlefield Historic District.’”*

Mr. Shaffer said that only the stone work is sensitive and that alterations were made in 1995. He said that the PHMC and Preservation Pennsylvania had deemed that the structure is an adverse visual effect and that demolition would mitigate adverse visual effects of the structure.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 401 Buford Avenue for the removal of all of the structure above the Dustman Barn foundation, but not to remove the stone foundation excluding the stone slab until verification of the building as a historic structure can be determined. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The Board discussed the motion. The motion carried 5-to-0.

Mr. Dellett told the applicant that they would need an amended demolition permit.

F. COA-16-32 Future Stake, Inc. 259 Steinwehr Avenue. New Construction. Install an eight-foot high fence to screen a parking area.

Mr. Dellett gave background information and a brief building history from the Board Memorandum dated May 13, 2016:

BUILDING HISTORY

The property includes the Gettysburg Heritage Center (formerly the American Civil War Wax Museum & Gettysburg Gift Center), which has operated for more than 50 years. After immigrating to the United States from Poland during World War II, C. M. Uberman, founding owner and operator, opened the National Civil War Wax Museum on April 19, 1962. The property is under new ownership and interior renovations are proposed for

the building to reopen as the Gettysburg Heritage Center. Construction of the building took place about the same time when the Steinwehr Avenue corridor changed into a strip development during the 1950s and 1960s.

Mr. Sharrah gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He said that the applicant intended to install an eight-foot high board fence to screen the beer garden patio area from the general parking area. He said that the fence would not be permanent, stained to match the color of the building, and would sufficiently be set back from the roadway. Mr. Sharrah requested that the application be amended to a fence height of six feet to meet the current zoning requirements.

Ms. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 259 Steinwehr Avenue for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated May 4, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 3-to-2. The recommendation failed because the motion did not receive four votes. The Board discussed the motion. The Board advised the applicant to amend the application to define the fence height of six feet to meet zoning requirements, and seek administrative approval.

Reports

A. Mr. Shaffer presented the Administrative Approvals since the last meeting:

1. **COA-16-26 Jon Shultz/Americana Souvenirs, 150 North Third Street, Certificate of Appropriateness. Alteration. Remove the existing shingles and EPDM roof; install synthetic felt over the roof deck and install a rafter system over the existing deck; install a metal roof system on the loading deck.** (Approved administratively because the proposed work on the structure is not visible from public view, and the existing roof is not original to the structure).
2. **COA-16-33 David and Joanne Getty, 460 Baltimore Street. Alteration. Install a crown on the chimney.**

Other Business

2016 Historic Preservation Awards

Mr. Shaffer presented the 2016 Historic Preservation Awards to recipients at the May 9th Council meeting, and it was well received.

CLG Training Session

The date for the training by the Pennsylvania State Historic Preservation Office Certified Local Government (CLG) will be held on May 24th at 5:30 PM in Council Chambers focusing on windows.

Satellite Dish Requirements

The Board requested that Susan Naugle be invited to attend the next HARB meeting in June to discuss the creation of an operable working ordinance similar to the one used by the City of Reading to formulate regulations to safeguard historic structures in the district.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 9:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant