



**September 16, 2020**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**  
**(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, September 16, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through a Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Colleen Lingle, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, and Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation. **Absent Board Members:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant. **Others in Attendance:** Tessa Bardo, Property Owner, and Tim Finnafock Contractor at T.F. Enterprises, representing 5 Steinwehr; Katherine Reid, Reid's Winery & Cider House, representing 400 Baltimore Street; Peter T. and Debbie Sheads, Property Owners, and Damon Taylor Contractor, representing 331 Buford Avenue; Reyna Fallon, Alam B Roofing, representing 344 S. Washington Street.

**Call Meeting to Order**

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:00 PM and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle, and Building Code Official Clem Malot. **Absent** HARB Member was Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present.

**Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He said that a roll call vote will be taken after each motion during the Zoom format. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Tuesday, October 13, 2020.

### **Review of Agenda**

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the September 16, 2020 meeting agenda as amended, and to the amended agenda as presented including Item D: 344 S. Washington.

### **Review of Minutes**

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the August 19, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

### **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

### **Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

### **New Business: Applications for Review**

#### **A. COA 20-0070, CRITICAL PROJECT: 5 Steinwehr Avenue – Tessa G. Bardo**

Demolition of rear wood garage adjacent to alleyway due to instability from several car accidents.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 16, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to demolish the wood garage at the rear of property due to instability and damage resulting from several car accidents from Court Alley. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story frame dwelling with a shingled roof; and currently is a two-story brick structure with a duplex commercial use, and the accessory garage was not shown on the map at this time.

Ms. Bardo and Mr. Finnafock gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Bardo noted the disrepair of the structure describing the caving in of the roof and the frame which had moved off of the foundation due to several cars hitting the structure from Court Alley. Mr. Finnafock noted that the visibility is poor for drivers trying to back out and removal of the structure would improve site distance. Ms. Bardo said that the structure is irreparable due to the severity of damage from the latest car hitting it in June. Mr. McCabe and Ms. Hodges noted the safety issues and severe damage of the building and supported the demolition. Mr. Shaffer noted repairs would exceed fifty percent of the value of the building and not considered an option for repair. Mr. Goble noted the safety issues of the structure and that this structure does not have historical significance. There were no other comments from the Board.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the garage structure to the rear of 5 Steinwehr Avenue is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is not visible to the public from Steinwehr Avenue but is only visible from Court Alley, and thus comes under the review right of this Board for demolition. It is a nonsensitive building, and demolition must proceed as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. He noted that the building is an accessory structure of non-historical significance.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of this wood garage structure located at the rear of 5 Steinwehr Avenue.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the rear wood garage located at the rear of 5 Steinwehr Avenue due to instability and safety of the public per the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented in the application dated July 8, 2020 Mr. Malot seconded the motion.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Mr. Shaffer told the applicant that demolition may start if there is an immediate risk of danger and safety to the public. He suggested that the applicant work with Borough Staff and the Director of Historic Preservation if they wish to start demolition prior to Council approval on October 13, 2020.

**B. COA 20-0074, MAJOR PROJECT: 400 Baltimore Street – Katherine Reid, Reid’s Winery & Cider House**

To erect a 20’x40’ wood pavilion to the rear of the property, with red cedar style roofing, four open sides with lighting, and 2-3 ceiling fans.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 16, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to erect a 20’x40’ wood pavilion to rear of property, with a cedar style riviera red roofing, four open sides with lighting, and ceiling fans on existing gravel base. She noted that the structure first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a 2-story brick dwelling with a slate/tin roof, framed side porch with slate/tin roof, and rear 1-story concrete block building with composition roof.

Ms. Reid gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that the structure will be used for outside dining, and that temporary sides would only be used during inclement weather. Mr. Goble and Mr. McCabe asked how the structure would be vented if sides were placed on the structure. The applicant said that the type of heating element would be determined once the final designs were completed; and that she would apply for permits through PMCA which would include all of the required design reviews and inspections.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 400 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and that the proposed structure

has limited visibility from Baltimore Street with an arbor blocking visibility from the alleyway; and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He noted that construction will be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* as presented.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the 20'x40' outdoor pavilion located at 400 Baltimore Street as presented in the application dated August 25, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Mr. Shaffer told the applicant that Council would consider their recommendation on October 13th; and that he could proceed to submit plans to PMCA for their building code review and preliminary approval of the proposed pavilion to identify any design issues at their risk prior to Council approval.

**C. COA 20-0073, CRITICAL PROJECT: 331 Buford Avenue – Peter T. and Debbie Sheads**

Repairs and rebuild of masonry area above the lintels, re-pointing of the foundation, and other brick as needed.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 16, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant would like to complete repairs and rebuild the masonry area above the lintels, re-point the foundation and other brick as needed, repair the wooden lintels as needed, and complete lintel replacement or just the fascia plate as needed. She said that the applicant would like to level, stabilize and rebuild the porch to match the original materials in-kind; rebuild the wooden porch to include structural posts and joists as well as the tongue and groove decking; and repair the masonry with a lime-based mortar and repaint brick where replaced. She said that the applicant would carefully match the bricks with old historic bricks as close as possible. She noted that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story brick structure with a double wood frame front porch.

Mr. Taylor explained his credentials and extensive work rehabilitating historic homes, and that he is familiar with re-purposing as much of the original materials as possible. He noted that once he gets into the project, he will better be able to determine what materials could be re-used and what type of replacement materials would best suit the project. He said that the wood today would not be of comparable quality of that used in the past, and suggested mahogany or pine. Both Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Goble said that new growth pine would not be a good alternative, and that they would prefer mahogany because it is a denser wood and would withstand the elements. There were no other comments from the Board members.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 331 Buford Avenue is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District 1999HARB Extension, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District* and is highly visible to the public from

Buford Avenue. He said that the proposed renovations represent a major project that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for rehabilitation.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new exterior structural repairs/renovations at 331 Buford Avenue as presented in the application dated August 31, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no other members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

**D. COA 20-00076, MAJOR PROJECT: 334 S. Washington Street – Alam B Roofing, Reyna Fallon**

To replace the aluminum siding with vinyl siding and wrap windows in aluminum, some windows are currently wrapped others are wood.

Mrs. English gave background information and a brief project description to remove existing aluminum siding and replace with vinyl siding to include wrapping of window frames with aluminum. She said that the total project included shingle-to-shingle roof replacement under LU 20-0129, and COA 20-0064 which was administratively approved. The siding portion of the job was meant to be included in this application; however, it was not included. She said that the applicant began the roof work under COA 20-0064 and assumed that the siding was also approved at that time. She noted that the roofing work is complete, and that a stop work was posted on the property during construction of the siding and the aluminum wrapping of the windows. She explained to the Board that two facades were wrapped in aluminum siding which is now replaced with vinyl siding; and that the left side and rear side of house currently has asbestos shingles and is proposed for vinyl siding, which has been wrapped with paper to watertight the exterior in conjunction with the stop work order. She noted that some windows were wrapped in aluminum others were clad in wood on areas where the vinyl siding was completed; and that a few windows have been wrapped by the contractor. She said that the total scope of work will need to change from all aluminum siding to vinyl siding with aluminum wrapped windows. She noted that the structure first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story frame dwelling with a slate or tin roof, split use as a grocery store with a rear 2-story stable shingled roof, and a one-story porch with a composition roof noted at 344 ½ S. Washington Street.

Ms. Reyna Fallon of Alam B Roofing apologized for not following permitting procedures, and for not adding the vinyl siding and aluminum wrapped windows to the scope of work on the original submittal. She noted that she did not realize the application was missing pertinent information for project review and that she normally handles roofing projects only; and that this project process was something new for her and that she has learned from her mistake. She said that the project scope would be to remove the aluminum siding and replace with vinyl siding, and to wrap all windows in aluminum.

Mr. Shaffer noted the original wood board siding under the aluminum siding of the structure seemed to be in decent shape and is of a wider style than what is proposed. The Board discussed the wrapped aluminum window proposal; noting that in December 2001, a request for wrapped

aluminum windows was denied by HARB, and that the property had changed owners twice since then. Mr. Shaffer noted that sometime after 2019 (as shown on Google maps), some of the windows were wrapped in aluminum; but in some of the photos from 2001, it shows the second-story front façade windows wrapped in aluminum, and the first-floor windows and second-floor windows facing South Street remained wood. Ms. English noted that the owner was not present to confirm when some of the windows were wrapped in aluminum.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to table the project at 344 S. Washington Street until a field meeting could be scheduled to meet with the contractor and owner to clarify questions regarding this project. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no other members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

Ms. English said that she will schedule a date and time to meet on-site early next week. Mr. McCabe asked if the asbestos would be removed. Mr. Barrera, Contractor at Alam B Roofing, said that they are not licensed to do so, and that all asbestos will be wrapped with the proposed vinyl siding.

## **Reports**

### **A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:**

- **COA 20-0062 MINOR PROJECT: 204 Chambersburg Street – Joel Desotelle**  
Two signs 16'x1.5" black wall sign with white lettering centered above the entrance door and a 14"x22.5" directory to be mounted to the left side of the main entrance door. All signs should use either existing hardware or anchor all new hardware through the mortar of the building following The Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehab and Sustainability for Rehabbing Historic Buildings.
- **COA 20-0072 MINOR PROJECT: 223 Chambersburg Street – Warren G and Ray H Rudisill**  
Replacing existing shingled roof to shingled roof in kind replacement gray in color.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the August 19, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges.

A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Hodges, Mr. McCabe, Mr. Malot and Ms. Lingle; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member for this vote: Ms. Gustafson).

### **B. Report of Chair – *Gary Shaffer***

- Chair Shaffer said that illegal work within the Historic District does not set a precedent for applicants requesting to do similar work to their structures.

- Chair Shaffer revisited the PA Historic Museum Commission (PHMC) Certified Local Government (CLG) Survey and will schedule a time to review and discuss the survey with the Board members. Ms. English stated she would schedule a time for the Board to discuss the survey, not all board members would need to attend, all will be welcome.

### **C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation***

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Mrs. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2018, 2019 and 2020 for the Annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to email her with any recommendations to revise and finalize the current list. She will distribute the hard copy list to start the review and will continually update the list.

- Mrs. English said that HARB has the opportunity to receive free services to update our *Design Guide* through Mary Tate with The Pennsylvania Downtown Center. The Board discussed a few options for updates with two being solar panels and satellite dishes. Mr. Goble noted that Susan Nagle did extensive research on satellite dishes and would enlist her expertise and combine both the dishes and solar panels for this update. The board also discussed temporary tents within the Historic District with many businesses moving to outdoor dining and events to mitigate Covid19 restrictions. Mr. Malot noted PMCA inspects all tent structures over 200 square feet, and that they would be approved as TEMPORARY structures that could remain on site for a maximum of 180 days. The Board suggested that the Borough decide on an appropriate time frame of 180 days or less and should note on all permits that these are temporary structures due to the current pandemic restrictions of Covid19.

### **Other Business**

There was not other business presented before the Board.

### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:59 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation  
c/o Karen M. Mesher, Planning Management Assistant