



**September 15, 2021
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg**

Director English called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:03 PM on Wednesday, September 15, 2021 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harman, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Others in Attendance:** Jeremy Davis of Wizzy Adventures and Property Owner representing 504 Baltimore Street; Borough Manager Charles R. Gable and Director of Historic Preservation Debra English representing the Gettysburg Municipal Building at 59 E. High Street; Kenneth Eshleman, Property Owner representing 27 Hanover Street; Fred Young and Joan Peck of the Trinity United Church of Christ representing both 60 E. High Street (church) and 141 S. Stratton Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Director of Historic Preservation English called the meeting to order at 7:03 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were **present:** Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Brandon Stone, Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harmon, and Building Code Official Clem Malot.

Temporary Chair and Vice-Chair Appointments

Director English opened the meeting and gave the following opening speech:

“I would like to open the meeting at 7PM. Vice-Chair Colleen Lingle resigned due to personal reasons and both Chair Phil Goble’s and Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson’s terms were up August 31, 2021 and they decided they were unable to commit to a full 5-year term on the Board. I would like to welcome our three new members recently appointed by Borough Council: Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harmon, and Brandon Stone. All HARB members are expected to attend all meetings and a minimum of four training hours per year. All trainings must be reported to me to track for our Certified Local Government (CLG). You are expected to physically inspect the projects on the agenda to provide comments at the next scheduled meeting. Members are to participate in voting and other necessary duties such as general participation of HARB, research, special projects and the awards ceremony. All new members have been provided with a digital copy of the by-laws, the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, and a link to Section 106 Federal Guidelines. If you would like a hard copy to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, please let me know.

At this time, will someone on the Board make a motion for the nomination of Chair and Vice-Chair to complete the year through December 31, 2021. In January 2022 HARB will hold its reorganization meeting to appoint chair seats.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** to accept Gary Shaffer as Chair of HARB through December 31, 2021. Mr. Shaffer accepted the nomination. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and a roll call vote was taken. The motion carried **7-to-0 without dissention**. Mr. Shaffer assumed his role as Chair.

Chair Shaffer called for a motion to nominate a Vice-Chairman of HARB through December 31, 2021.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept Brandon Stone as Vice-Chair of HARB through December 31, 2021. Mr. Stone accepted the nomination. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe, and a roll call vote was taken. The motion carried **7-to-0 without dissention**. Mr. Stone assumed his role as Vice-Chair.

Chair Shaffer called for a motion to create an 'alternate' position in case a quorum could not be met, and subsequently add that position to the HARB Bylaws.

Ms. Hodges made a motion to create an 'alternate' position on the HARB Board. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The Board discussed the motion. The motion carried **6-to-1** (Mr. Stone would like to explore the need for this position).

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Tuesday, October 12, 2021 (Closed Monday, October 11, 2021 for the Columbus Day observance).

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept both the September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented, and the August 18, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept both the September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented and the August 18, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried **4-to-0 with the three new members abstaining**.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-0097 MAJOR PROJECT: 504 Baltimore Street – Jeremy and Danielle Davis, Wizzy Adventures

Change front façade lighting over front of entrance from long incandescent lighting to old style hoop lighting (two on front and two on side over new signage); remove vinyl siding and replace with real wood lap siding and stained; repaint handrails and pickets and wood trim on structure; and lay landscape boards and create garden boxes at entranceway.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1902 as a two-story duplex frame dwelling with a side and rear framed porch with a shingled roof, and a one-story frame out building with a shingled roof. She said that the Permit History for the property included the use as RRUs from 2017 to 2021; Change of Occupancy in 2021; a 2021 roof project, a 2021 sign application, and the current application.

Mr. Davis, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he intended to use time-appropriate goose neck lighting (two lights on the front façade and two lights on the side façade) consistent with the building style. He intends to replace the business signs, hand rails and pickets, and deck boards. He said that he would like to replace the current vinyl siding with period appropriate German Shiplap or Clapboard siding depending on what lies beneath the current siding; and stain the wood in a natural or gold stain. He reassured the Board that he intended to keep all existing gingerbread ornamentation above the windows and near the roof and does not plan to wrap any wood with aluminum. The Board requested lighting cut sheet on the proposed gooseneck lighting to review size and style.

Chair Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Critical Project at 504 Baltimore Street. He said that this dwelling of moderate architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Baltimore Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed work for the structure is a Critical Project and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the Board must review submitted lighting fixture cut sheet before the installation of the gooseneck lights.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the restoration project at 504 Baltimore Street as presented to the Board in the application dated July 30, 2021 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* with the requirement that the light fixture cut sheet be submitted for Board approval prior to installation. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

The applicant said that he will email to Director English the lighting cut sheet for Board approval.

B. COA 21-0111 MAJOR PROJECT – 59 E. High Street, Borough of Gettysburg Municipal Building – Debra English and Charles R. Gable

Replace rotted basement wood doors with Timber Tech material; and refinish and re-use the existing metal hardware with lock on the doors.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick dwelling and as a two-story jail both with a tin/slate roof and included a 16-foot wall around the rear jail portion of the structure. She said that the Permit History for the property included a 2017 Yard Sale Permit, a 2019 accessory shed, and a 2021 10 x 12 bronze garden plaque.

Director English and Manager Gable gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that the Borough would like to replace the existing rotted wood basement doors with Timber Tech Azek composite wood basement doors, and that all of the original hardware to include hinges and the pad lock will be restored and reused on the replacement doors. She noted that the bulk door is a defining feature in a highly visible area, and that the change in material from wood to composite required a full Board review. Manager Gable said that the doors need replaced for safety reasons, noting that many ghost tour groups visit the front of the building and that the present doors create a safety hazard for visitors. He told the Board that the preferred color would be dark gray, and that the old doors could be repurposed in the building somehow in the future. Vice-Chair Stone suggested donating them to the Architectural Warehouse if needed.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at the Gettysburg Municipal Building at 59 E. High Street. He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via E. High Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed basement door replacement is a Major Project and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the cellar entranceway is of significant architectural importance to the structure's historic integrity.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the front basement door replacement at the Gettysburg Municipal Building, 59 E. High Street, using composite materials in a dark gray colorway that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 30, 2021. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

C. COA 21-0109 MAJOR PROJECT – 27 Hanover Street – Kenneth and Delores Eshleman

Replace front porch boards due to deterioration from wood to composite material.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story frame dwelling with a shingled roof, a one-story front and rear porch with a tin/slate roof, a rear two-story porch with a tin/slate roof, and a rear frame

outbuilding with a one-story porch with a tin/slate roof. She said that the Permit History for the property included a previous porch board replacement.

Mr. Eshleman gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he has lived at the property for 56 years and has replaced the front porch floor boards four times during that period, noting that the current floor boards only lasted 15 years. He said that he would like to replace only the porch floor decking before winter and would like to use a composite material in a dark gray color with a grain pattern instead of wood which is hard to get. Chair Shaffer noted that although your porch is not located in full sun, the composite material loses its strength in full sun and could be quite slippery in the winter months with frost and ice.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 27 Hanover Street. He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both Hanover and York Streets and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed front porch decking board replacement is a Critical Project and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the proposed project will not remove original wood decking and that the use of an alternate material is acceptable; and that the property was part of the 1999 expansion to the Gettysburg Historic District.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the front porch decking board replacement using composite materials in a dark gray colorway that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 30, 2021. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **7-to-0 without dissention**.

D. COA 21-0114 MAJOR PROJECT – 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ

Repair Lower EPDM roof (strip and seal existing seams, seal all concrete coping joints with sealant); replace high EPDM roof (remove existing EPDM roof, install two layers of insulation, install new fully adhered EPDM roof); install new gutters, downspouts, and flashing; and **install metal coping over existing concrete coping.**

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1907 as a two-story brick reformed church with a shingles roof with 26 feet to the eaves. She said that the Permit History for the property included banners and signs from 2018 to 2021, a 2018 window replacement, 2019 interior work, and a 2021 roof and HVAC replacement.

Fred Young and Joan Peck of the Trinity United Church of Christ gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Peck said that the addition that was constructed in 1949 included coping stones which needed covering to protect them from the elements and prevent further deterioration. She said that the proposed coping metal sheathing that will cover the concrete coping stones will be granite gray in color and will prevent water penetration into the roof structure. Chair

Shaffer said that a similar project was administratively approved for the Adams County Courthouse in an area that was under 50 years old.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at the Trinity United Church of Christ at 60 E. High Street. He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via E. High Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed gray metal coping installation is a Critical Project and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of gray metal coping over the existing concrete coping at the Trinity United Church of Christ, 60 E. High Street using metal in a granite gray colorway that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 19, 2021. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

E. COA 21-0115 MAJOR PROJECT – 141 S. Stratton Street – Trinity United Church Christ

Replace in-kind shingle-to-shingle roof; remove two existing skylights and reroof area; and repoint mortar on bell tower and chimney (top four feet).

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story brick structure with two side and one rear single-story porches with composite roofing. She said that the Permit History for the property included a 2018 RRUO and the current roof permit.

Fred Young and Joan Peck of the Trinity United Church of Christ gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Peck said that the proposed roof replacement would be shingle-to-shingle to include a roof alteration that will remove two existing skylights and replace with new plywood decking.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at the Trinity United Church of Christ Parsonage at 141 S. Stratton Street. He said that this dwelling of moderate architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via S. Stratton Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed roof replacement is a Minor Project and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the roof replacement is in-kind, but the skylight removal alteration is reviewable by this Board.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the shingle-to-shingle roof replacement using in-kind materials to include the

removal of two skylights at the Trinity United Church of Christ Parsonage, 141 S. Stratton Street consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 19, 2021. The motion was second by Mr. McCabe and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0099 MINOR PROJECT: 430 Baltimore Street – Arthur Stewart**
Installation of one 28 SF Wall sign and one 16 SF monument sign with 'Gettysburg Olive Oil Company' lettering. One 24"x36" portable chalkboard sign with changeable copy.

Installation of two temporary banners - one 28 SF and one 16 SF with 'Gettysburg Olive Oil Company' lettering. BANNER PERMITS EXPIRE 9/12/2021. Banner permits remaining in 2021: One. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0064 MINOR PROJECT: 317 N. Stratton Street – CSC Rentals LLC**
Repairing Wood Structure of porch. Replacing porch floor with new 'IN KIND' boards, remove and replace handrails with same type of handrails 'IN KIND', Remove concrete steps that are broken and replace with Wood steps. Add 2nd floor joists for support porch floor per manufacturers recommendation. Porch boards to be mahogany with clear coat, handrails white in color. Bandboards white in color, steps gray, risers white and replace lattice with same type and color. All work must in be 'IN KIND' or must be reviewed through HARB. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*. Project scope edited from June 3, 2021 application.
- **COA 21-0101 MINOR PROJECT: 45 Steinwehr Avenue – Susan Saum-Wicklein**
Portable wooden A-frame sign 36" wide by 47" tall, 11.76 sq ft total with text: 'Tattered Flag Tap Room Fresh Craft Beer & Spirits', and area for changeable text. Remove existing half round gutters to replace with 'in-kind' gutters of same style and material. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0102 MINOR PROJECT: 60 E. Middle Street – Reaver Real Estate**
Removal of deteriorating, non-functioning chimney, and installation of a small vent where chimney was previously located. Installation of wooden frame attached to the roof where the old chimney was and apply brick around the wooden frame to look like an ordinary, functioning chimney. The chimney must be the same shape and size of original chimney in 12 tiers of brick. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*. All construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0103 MINOR PROJECT: 32 S. Washington Street – Mike Abate**
Remove old rubber roofing system damaged by storm and replace with in-kind rubber roof with a foam backer board over the existing decking. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.

- **COA 21-0104 MINOR PROJECT: 124 Carlisle Street – Cy Dietz**
Exterior painting on street side of building to include replacing missing cedar shingles in-kind, replace two pieces of crown molding in-kind, reglaze windows if needed, and clean, prime, and paint all surfaces. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0093 MINOR PROJECT – 1-5 Baltimore Street – House of Bender LLC**
Change of Occupancy from former retail jeweler/clock repair to retail gift. To replace wood panels where previously located signs were hung above the display windows with plywood, paint blue paint with yellow trim. The existing windows are with false background above ceiling line – care should be taken to ensure the existing windows are not broken when covered with plywood. Installation of 3 wall signs and 1 portable sign for ‘OH MAN’ retail shop. All signage and construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*. Revised 8/23/21
- **COA 21-0107 MINOR PROJECT: 224 Court Alley – Waltz Equipment Partnership**
Application for Certificate of Occupancy for commercial Real Estate office. Signs: One 20"x53" vinyl door sign, one 72"x18" aluminum wall sign, and one 36"x36" aluminum wall sign for ‘IRON VALLEY REAL ESTATE GETTYSBURG’. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0108 MINOR PROJECT: 230 Steinwehr Avenue – Dana Kluck**
Installation of one new portable sign measuring 21"x36" for a total of 50 sq ft. Max sign limit has been met. All signage must meet the *Secretary of the Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines*.
- **COA 19-0110 MINOR PROJECT: 110 Chambersburg Street – Philip B. Schindel**
Replace roof in-kind, shingle to shingle.
- **COA 21-0113 MAJOR PROJECT 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
Remove and repoint deteriorated brick mortar joints on bell tower. Remove and salvage dislodged brick and re-install. Install ground protection on chimney, remove and repoint mortar joints. All work must be done 'in kind' for mortar type and application as well as brick composition/age.
- **COA 21-0105 MAJOR PROJECT 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
Replace packaged roof top HVAC unit with Trane Voyager packaged roof top HVAC unit. Existing unit to be removed from site and disposed of in accordance with local and federal laws.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the August 18, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried **4-to-0 (with the three new members abstaining)**.

B. Report of Chair – *Chair Shaffer*

Chair Shaffer thanked the new members for their willingness to serve on the HARB Board. He reminded the Board of the importance of viewing the suggested webinars for Certified Local Government (CLG) Training credits, and to inform Director English of any credits earned to meet their four trainings per year training requirement. He noted that Keystone trainings are very informative.

Vice-Chair Stone informed the Board that 323 Baltimore Street is a failing structure exhibiting a 2015 Building Permit in the window and could be a case of Demolition by Neglect. Mr. Malot said that PMCA will check into that structure tomorrow.

C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation*

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Discussed the usage of HARB “Thank You for Your Support” hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow),
- Asked HARB members to review HARB By-Laws for discussion at the August HARB Meeting,
- Asked HARB Members to forward any webinar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars),
- HGAC Barn Tour (used as a training for 1 HR max) on September 18, 2021.
- Will discuss all other agenda items at the next meeting.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed **7-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant