



October 20, 2021
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, October 20, 2021 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harman, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Member:** Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, **Others in Attendance:** Leslie McGraw and Andrew Johnson, Property Owners, and Chad Collie, Contractor from Allied Plaster & Construction, Gary Shaffer, Architect of Shaffer Design Associates, PC, all representing Sign of the Buck Tavern & Roadhouse at 29 Chambersburg Street (currently 27½ Chambersburg Street); David Monsour, Property Owner, representing 37 Barlow Street; Bradley Reaver of Reaver Real Estate Investments LLC and Property Owner representing 60 E Middle Street; and Jim Hale, representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, November 8, 2021.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Vice-Chair Stone and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Mr. Harman made a **motion** to accept the September 15, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 without dissent.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

(Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the following applicant, whereby Mr. Stone assumed the role as Chair.)

A. COA-21-0127 MAJOR PROJECT: 29 Chambersburg Street Hotel – Frictionless Real Estate LLC

Re-construct window on west side of building for proposed restaurant. The terra cotta tile in the storefront will be replaced with wood raised panels, new windows will be installed adding posts and trim for support as well as historical aesthetics. The front doors to each of the dining areas will be moved to the center closer to what they would have been originally. On the west side of the restaurant in the courtyard adjoining the Gettysburger Restaurant and awing window will be installed to allow for customers to access the bar area from the courtyard for orders. The new awing window will be in the opening of an original window that was later bricked in. Existing trim around the leaded glass storefront will remain intact and preserved.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1891 as a four-story brick structure with side 3 and two-story brick structure and rear 2 and one-story frame structure with a one-story rear bowling alley; all with a slate/tin roof the City Hotel. She said that the permit history includes new awnings and exterior paint to the hotel in 2019, and the current project under review.

Mr. Collie, Contractor, Mr. Shaffer, Architect, and Leslie McGraw and Andrew Johnson, Property Owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Collie said that the applicant would like to preserve the turn-of-the-century front façade including the leaded glass but would like to replace some of the more modern features (such as the transom and sidelights) with historically accurate wooden front doors. He said that the setback for the double entry doors would remain ADA accessible. He would replace the terra cotta bulkhead with wood raised panels and install a new awning window in a previously bricked-in window on the west façade facing the Gettysburger Restaurant so that patrons could access the bar area from the courtyard for their orders. Mr. Shaffer said that he is serving as the Architect of Record for the project, and that the exterior alterations will allow the construction documents to proceed and any code concerns regarding fire safety will be addressed in the UCC permit with those documents.

Vice-Chair Stone presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at the Sign of the Buck Tavern and Roadhouse at 29 Chambersburg Street (currently 27 ½). He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Chambersburg Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed façade alterations to the front door and bulkhead and side window is a critical project and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that all façade alterations are significant architectural importance to the structure's historic integrity.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the historical façade restoration that will include new wood panels, doors, windows, posts and trim in the front and an awning window on the west side for the proposed restaurant at 29 Chambersburg Street as presented to the Board in the application dated September 29, 2021 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

(Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.)

B. COA 21-0129 MAJOR PROJECT – 37 Barlow Street, David Monsour

Replace roof shingle to shingle, replace front porch columns from wood to fiberglass, replace wood decking with composite decking, construct a new 24' x 24' garage, expand covered porch with additional 261' decking, new in-kind siding, and repoint chimney.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story frame structure with a one-story front and rear porch with composite roofing. She noted that the garage roof would be all metal in a colorway that would match the house.

Mr. David Monsour gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the porch columns would remain the same style but will use alternate wood materials. He said that a mahogany decking would replace the existing wood decking. He would install new siding and replace the roof in-kind. He said that the 24' x 24' garage would be in a blue colorway to match the house. He would restore, if possible, any existing original material when uncovered, and that it could be approved administratively.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 37 Barlow Street. He said that this dwelling of mixed architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Barlow Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed porch restoration, siding, and new garage is a critical project and is consistent with both the *Secretary of the*

Interior Guidelines and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the changes are highly visible and yet minor rehabilitation.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof, porch columns and decking, and expand the covered porch on the house and to construct a new rear garage at 37 Barlow Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated September 28, 2021. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-0 without dissention**.

C. COA 21-0128 MAJOR PROJECT – 60 E. Middle Street – Reaver Real Estate

Notice of Violation (NOV) received for removal of existing chimney without permit application or approval. Applicant is requesting removal of chimney after the fact.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 20, 2021 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1891 as a two-story brick structure with a rear porch, two-story porch with a shingled roof. She said that the permit history includes RRUO Licensed from 2017 to present, roofing in 2017, new windows in 2017, electrical work in 2018, and the current permit application.

Mr. Brad Reaver gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he responded to the letter that he had received regarding fixing the chimney. His family had purchased the property in 2018. He said that he is looking to replace the deteriorated non-functioning chimney with a roof vent, and that surrounding houses do not have visible chimneys. He said that replacing the chimney would create a financial hardship. The Board discussed ways of restoring the chimney with the applicant. Chair Shaffer said that the chimney was a visible design feature that was functional at one time to the home, and that chimneys indicated how the house functioned historically. He said that the building character is richer with a chimney on it than with a flat roof; and that the Board had recommended in the past to repoint and cap existing chimneys in order to restore them. After consideration, the applicant decided to withdraw his application, and will resubmit to replace chimney in-kind after consultation with a structural engineer.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0117 MINOR PROJECT: 340 Baltimore Street – Main Street Gettysburg/ Borough of Gettysburg**
Installation of TWO 3'x11' banner on the façade of 340 Baltimore Street with the text: "Future Home of the Gettysburg Welcome Center". Expires 12/31/2021 All applications must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0118 MINOR PROJECT: 1-5 Baltimore Street – House of Bender**
Install new step flashing and counter flashing around chimney and repoint as needed on upper main shingle roof. Flash wall areas around windows on second story South roof. Replace rubber roof with EPDM roof on second story north roof. Replace all three first

floor flat rubber roof areas with EPDM. Remove existing shingles on first floor sloped roof and replace with Timberline HDZ shingles. All work must be 'IN KIND' or must be reviewed through HARB. All applications must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.

- **COA 21-0119 MINOR PROJECT: 315 N. Stratton Street – Regina G. Piper**
Remove and replace existing asphalt shingles with charcoal gray architectural shingles. All applications must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0120 MINOR PROJECT: 101 Chambersburg Street – John and Gina Levan**
Installation of a 20'x30' temporary commercial tent to extent outdoor dining for a restaurant seating. All construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0121 MINOR PROJECT: 145 W. Middle Street**
Replace current metal roof with new metal roof same color and install white gutters. All construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0122 MINOR PROJECT: 400 Baltimore Street John & Katherine Reid**
Shingle to shingle commercial roof replacement with GAF architectural shingles in hickory color. Install roof & gutter system with in-kind materials and like colors. All construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0123 MINOR PROJECT – 2 Baltimore Street – Kadel LLC - David Peters**
Repair exterior wall and window area damaged by car crash, including windows and frame, brickwork, interior drywall, any additional hidden damage. Mason to repair exterior bricks that are deteriorating. Materials to be used include wood, glass, bricks like current bricks, nails, caulk, paint. All signage and construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21-0124 MINOR PROJECT: 221 S. Washington Street – Richard and Nancy Taylor**
Residential metal roof replacement. All construction must meet the Department of Interiors Historic Restoration Guidelines.
- **COA 21- 0116 MINOR PROJECT: 60 Breckenridge Street – Make Group LLC**
Renovating existing 4-unit residential building into a 3-unit residential building. Renovation includes removal of all interior finishes, new mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; new insulation; code compliant unit separations; code compliant egress windows; and all new finishes. Front elevation removal of existing door, restore historic wood siding, remove, and replace center front door and door hood/roof, restore existing wood siding, windows, repoint stone masonry foundations, remove existing front steps and provide new brick steps. Side elevation: permission to install alternative vinyl siding (shiplap) on entire elevation, remove and replace windows as necessary to provide emergency exits, provide

new doors and hoods. Rear Elevation: Remove and replace 2nd floor windows with large emergency egress windows, and remove and replace existing siding, provide compliant handrails at entrance door, remove existing vinyl siding restore substrate / sheathing. Previous COA 19-0121 approval.

- **COA 21-0125 MINOR PROJECT 211 S. Washington Street – Jordan T. Chiaruttini**
Re-roof from shingles to rubber on late side addition – emergency repair due to leaks and pitch of roof. Changing from shingles to EPDM rubber roof.
- **COA 21-0126 MINOR PROJECT 250 Baltimore Street – John Buchheister**
Replace wood porch floorboards on second floor to match existing. Replace wood band boards to match existing. Scrape and repaint handrail and ceiling under porch. All 'in kind' work any change in materials will require HARB review and approval.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

Ms. Christianson made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the September 15, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **6-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer gave no report.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Asked HARB Members to review the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist, and to provide any new nominations,
- Asked HARB Members to forward any webinar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars),
- Asked HARB Members to consider changing meeting time from 7PM-9PM to 6PM-8PM, and the Board decided to keep the current meeting time beginning at 7PM,
- Asked the Board to review and comment on the Satellite Dish updates to both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council. She said that she could submit a CLG Grant application for both updates. She noted that the Borough is working in conjunction with the Adams County Arts Council for repurposing removed satellite dishes into bird baths, and
- Discussed the usage of HARB “Thank You for Your Support” hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow).

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Chair Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed **6-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant