

DRAFT



**October 19, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, October 19, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Paul Witt, Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harman, Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Others in Attendance:** Marc C. McLean and Tessa Bardo of McLean Real Estate Holdings LLC and Timothy A. Finafrock of T.F. Enterprises, all representing 404 Baltimore Street; Geoff Sturgill CPA of Sturgill Realty LLC and Joseph Edgar, Architect of Snyders Design LLC, both representing Beer Mart at 646 York Street; Dwayne Mills of JM Construction representing 143 Carlisle Street; Gary W. Shaffer, AIA, of Shaffer Design Associates P.C. representing 238 Baltimore Street; and John R. Spangler Jr. of the *Gettysburg Times*.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of seven (7) voting members present.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, November 14, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Ms. Christianson and **carried 7-to-0 without dissent**.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the September 21, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Vice-Chair Stone made a motion to accept the September 21, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted.

The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 without dissent (Mr. Harman was absent at the September 21, 2022 HARB Meeting and not eligible to vote).

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 22-0101 MAJOR PROJECT: 404 Baltimore Street, Mr. G's – Marc C. McLean

Replace three windows on the short side of the building between the gift shop on the east side of the main building. The three windows on the east end are rotted beyond repair, recessed within the brick structure and not visible from Baltimore Street but partially visible from Lefever Street. The replacement windows are Marvin Elevate Ultrex/Wood windows which are paintable and will match the existing windows with the same grid system and window style.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 19 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a two-story brick structure with a shingled-style roof, frame two-story side porch and one-story rear porch; three attached side/rear one-story brick and two-story frame outbuilding structures, and two detached one-story brick and frame structures. The permit history shows: a paint/repair of the exterior wood on the house, and a paint/repair of the cement block, replace privet hedge with mid-19th century-style picket fence painted white in 1990; twin double hung windows in gable ends of bid (at peak roof) to replicate the existing windows in 1993; add rear window to entrance door in 2000; replace sidewalk in 2010; replace 50 feet of brick in sidewalk along Baltimore Street in 2011; renovate interior for Ice Cream Parlor in 2011; Notice of Violation to install address numbers in 2011; install Mr. G's signage in 2012; re-roof project in 2022 and this permit. Staff recommendation is to review options of applicant for the change in removal of the historic windows to be replaced with Marvin Elevate Ultrex, and to restore all portions of the existing window and glass panes and to replace the rotted sections with 'in-kind' materials. It is recommended to utilize through HARB approval the same style of window and replace them with an exterior wood window with a paintable surface if the windows are beyond repair. This replacement is recommended as Treatment #6 in the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration, and that deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced stating that where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Mr. Marc McLean, owner of Mr. G's and Mr. Timothy Finafrock, contractor with T.F. Enterprises, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Finafrock told the Board that the owner intends to replace the window sashes but keep the frames on the south-facing window and do a wholesale replacement of the two windows facing east with the Marvin Elevate Ultrex/Wood windows; and that the windows would maintain the same contour and six-over-six lites the existing

second-floor windows. He said that the windows could be protected in the future with painted aluminum storms.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 404 Baltimore Street-Mr. G's. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via both Baltimore and Lefever Streets and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity and historical significance, and that the proposed window project would reflect the existing window design elements, maintain historic size and configuration, restore components on the south-facing window, and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Mr. Witt made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 404 Baltimore Street-Mr. G's to approve the selective window restoration and replacement project using Marvin Elevate Ultrex/Wood Windows with the same window system and grid style as submitted and is consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated August 30, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **6-to-1** (Vice-Chair Stone objected to the use of alternative fiberglass window material for the replacement of wood windows and that it directly violates Standard #6 of the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*).

B. COA 220102 CRITICAL PROJECT: 165 North Stratton Street – Powel Drozd

This property has a Notice of Violation (NOV) for removing the existing historic short wood railing and replacing it with decorative PVC to match the rear of the house. The Board agreed to table this application due to lack of representation at the meeting.

C. COA 220107 MAJOR PROJECT: 646 York Street – Sturgill Realty

This building will be converted from three separate units into one large unit to house the new location of the Beer Mart. On the front elevation, modify the size of the existing overhang so that it will not hang as low, remove a portion of this overhang over the main entry door and windows, raise it two feet from the existing height, and cover it in EIFS to bring attention to the main entry. A composite cornice molding will be added to the top of the new section and a trim board added under the reconstructed overhang. The overhang will receive a new metal roof replicating the existing roof. Gooseneck lighting will be added above the sign at the main entrance. The reconstructed overhang will extend down the right side of the building and will stop at the end of the brick building like the existing roof. The previously infilled garage doors with doors and windows and the existing garage door will be removed and infilled with a new exterior wall with EIFS finish and new storefront windows. A new 8' x 8' door will be added to the rear of the building where a single 36" door was once located. A new rubber roof will be installed to replace the existing rubber roof that is not visible from the roadway.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 19, HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the building was constructed after 1932 which is the last dated document set of the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. The permit history shows sign and roofing permits in 2019; a change of use application in 2019; and this current application. Staff recommends reviewing options of applicant for change in front façade, that the structure is not historically significant, that the proposed work would improve the front façade of the building, and that the

proposed work be approved as submitted and is consistent with Treatment Standard #6 of the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration where historic features are repaired rather than replaced.

Mr. Joe Edgar, Architect from Snyder Design LLC, and Mr. Geoff Sturgill, CPA, of Sturgill Realty LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Edgar said that the owner would like to convert the building from three separate tenant units into one large unit to house the new location of the Beer Mart. He said that stucco material would be used, and that all doors and windows would remain as is on front elevations. He said that the intent is to infill the garage doors, provide glass, and add a loading door on the right elevation. He said that there will be lighting under the overhang for safety, and that letters on the signage will be lit with light provided by gooseneck lighting.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Critical Project at 646 York Street. He said that the structure is not of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via York Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the current building predates 1970 and represents commercial industrial style, and that the proposed work should be consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 646 York Street to convert the existing structure from three separate tenant units into one large unit as submitted and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated September 27, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

D. COA 220105 CRITICAL PROJECT: 145 Carlisle Street – KPI Technology

Repair and repoint foundation wall by removing existing stone and reusing in rebuild; build new 12" bulkhead wall; remove wood siding and replace with hardy plank 6" lap siding on the single rear and side portions of the building; and insulate wall under new siding.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story frame structure. The permit history shows replacement of shingles on main roof, and a rubber and metal side porch roof in 2022 (NOV work started without permits); and this current application. Staff recommends reviewing applicant options for change in siding material from wood to hardy plank 6" lap siding on rear and short side of structure which is highly not visible from Carlisle Street; and to deny application as submitted preserving the wood siding by prepping and painting it to extend this defining feature that is consistent with Treatment Standard #6 of the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* stating that deteriorated historic features should be repaired rather than replaced.

Mr. Dwayne Mills of JM Construction gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He provides German lap siding sample for board review. He said that the existing siding is deteriorated, the foundation wall needs repaired, and that the side exterior wall needs reframed. He would like to remove the wooden siding on the rear and side wall of the structure and replace it with Boral

TruExterior German Hardy Plank 6" Lap Siding with a color to match the rest of the building and is paintable.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 143 Carlisle Street. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Carlisle Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed siding and foundation work is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 143 Carlisle Street to replace the existing wood siding with Hardy Plank 6" German Lap siding, repair and repoint the foundation wall, and build new bulkhead, and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated October 4, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Witt and **carried 7-to-0 without dissention**.

Chair Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the following applicant: 238 Baltimore Street – Ronald Langdon, whereby Vice-Chair Stone assumed the role as Chair.

E. COA 220109 CRITICAL PROJECT: 238 Baltimore Street – Ronald Langdon

Return building to an IBC R-3 residential use as a Bed and Breakfast with five or less rooms for rent and with owner occupancy as their primary residence; and with alterations to the Baltimore Street (West/Front) elevation, to the North (Side) elevation, to the East (Rear) elevation and to the South elevation:

Baltimore Street (West / Front) Elevation

1. Existing windows to be restored. Aluminum storm windows with operable sash will be installed to increase energy efficiency, reduce street noise entering the front rooms, and protect the restored windows.
2. Masonry will have selective repointing in areas where mortar is missing or has failed. Low pressure washing will be used to clean the brick which is original to the structure.
3. A new front door will be installed. The existing flush, plank door is not original and does not present either a period or residential appearance. The door configuration will be a raised panel door featuring multiple panels. Any different door style will be resubmitted.
4. The louvered shutters on the second-floor windows will be repaired. If closer examination reveals replacement is required, new louvered shutters with correct hardware and of the correct size will be fabricated for the two windows. Material to be machinable extruded polyvinyl (paintable), or equal.
5. New shutters, raised panel style, will be fabricated for the first-floor windows and installed with accurate hardware - hinges, shutter stays, etc. The material again will be machinable extruded polyvinyl (paintable), or equivalent.
6. The twin windows in the third-floor dormer will be altered to operate as side hinged casements to be made compliant with fire egress requirements.

North (side) Elevation

1. The exposed brick masonry portion of this elevation will have existing windows restored. Aluminum storm windows with operable sash will be installed to increase energy efficiency, reduce street noise entering the interior rooms, and protect the restored windows.
2. The exposed masonry of the north side will have selective repointing in areas where mortar is missing or has failed. Low pressure washing will be used to clean the brick which is original to the structure.
3. The first two floors will have existing aluminum siding removed and the altered elevations will be finished in paintable cement-based siding with 8" exposed face.
4. New windows will be installed to replace the aluminum storm sash windows in the existing, second floor sun room at the rear of the building. All other existing windows on the north elevation will be restored.
5. The exterior wall(s) of the section of the structure under the sun room will be removed to create a covered porch area.
6. The major alteration to the rear section of the building will be the "raising of the roof" to create a livable third floor on the rear of the building. The third-floor construction will be lower than the existing three-story front portion of the structure. The new third floor construction will cantilever over sides of the rear portion of the existing second floor.
7. The exterior finish of the new construction shall be the continuation of the eight-inch face exposure cement board, paintable siding.
8. The new roof will be dimensional, architectural fiberglass shingles.
9. Windows will be clad wood windows or extruded fibrex windows with sash replicating wood window dimensions.

The East (Rear) Elevation

1. The first two floors will have existing aluminum siding removed and the altered elevations will be finished in paintable cement-based siding with 8" exposed face.
2. New windows will be installed to replace the aluminum storm sash windows in the existing, second floor sun room at the rear of the building. All other existing windows on the north elevation will be restored.
3. The exterior wall(s) of the section of the structure under the sun room will be removed to create a covered porch area.
4. The major alteration to the rear section of the building will be the "raising of the roof" to create a livable third floor on the rear of the building. The third-floor construction will be lower than the existing three-story front portion of the structure. The new third floor construction will cantilever over sides of the rear portion of the existing second floor.
5. All windows and doors facing the east shall be new, either replaced storm sash, replaced doors, or new windows in the third-floor construction.
6. The infill construction and alterations to the building have very limited visibility from the east (alley) as that portion of the building is inset into an alcove.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire

Insurance Maps in 1886 as a two-story brick structure with a shingled roof and a rear two-story brick addition with a shingled roof. The permit history shows signage in 1994; signage in 1996; signage in 2004; a sign violation in 2007; a new exterior glass door in 2007; signage in 2008; and the current application. Staff recommends that the proposed renovations to the rear of the structure and all historic district features should be transferred to the new addition to match as closely as possible the existing architectural nature of the building to include new roof materials that match front facing roof and new window materials that match the existing style, grids, and size of the existing windows that is consistent with Treatment #6 of the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration stating that deteriorated features will be repaired rather than replaced.

Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates P.C., on behalf of the property owner gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the building needs attention, and that the owners would like to operate a Bed and Breakfast with less than five rooms for lease on the second floor (not requiring ADA accessibility) and also reside on the property. He said that all front façade windows are two over two, enlarged, and were not original to the building, but aluminum storms will be added to protect the windows and decrease street noise, the brick portion of the building will be restored, rear back roof will be removed and replace the attic with a private third-floor residence, and significantly alter the sided portion with a mixture of Boral cement-based wood siding and brick.

Vice-Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Critical Project at 238 Baltimore Street. He said that the structure is of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Baltimore Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed alterations to all facades that would maintain all of the historic features are consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 238 Baltimore Street for alterations to return the building to an IBC Group R-3 residential use as a Bed and Breakfast with owner occupancy as their primary residence on the third floor and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated September 28, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and **carried 7-to-0 without dissention**.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 22-0100 MINOR PROJECT: 613 Baltimore Street – Inn at Cemetery Hill**
Replacement of commercial shingle-to-shingle roof. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0103 MINOR PROJECT: 29 E. Middle Street – Darren Glass**

Reconstruction of rotted wood railings on a second-floor porch. Removal of existing railings on rear balcony; scrape and sand loose paint, and wash with TSP; paint with one coat of primer and two coats of paint. Construction of custom wooden rails and installation on existing posts; prepare railings for paint by caulking, filling holes; and apply one coat of primer and two coats of paint. The moldings would be primed, finger-jointed pine. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

- **COA 22-010 MAJOR PROJECT – 23 W. High Street St. Francis Xavier Church**

Replacement of light pole with 'in kind' pole due to damage from gas main and street paving project. The two poles will be replaced with 'IN KIND' poles with similar style, color, and size. This will be as close of a match available from the Edgewater series to match the existing pole and will be painted in black gloss, and matching LED luminaire. The lighting lumens and brightness must match the existing lighting with same lighting softness / brightness. New lighting should not exceed the existing brightness. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

- **COA 22-0213 MAJOR PROJECT – 114 Buford Avenue**

Replacement of lower porch roof with EPDM-to-EPDM materials; and asphalt shingle-to-asphalt shingle replacement on remainder of roof using Dynasty IKO Shadow Brown shingles. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the September 21, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and **carried 7-to-0 without dissension**.

A. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer discussed the Satellite Dish ordinance with the Board and what it would take to move those revisions forward. He noted that those revision discussions were initiated in 2016, and the HARB has many new board members who were not part of that discussion. Director English stated that she would resend the Satellite Dish ordinance to the Board for their review.

B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the following report with the Board:

- Main Street Gettysburg (MSG) President/CEO Jill Sellers is working on a Keystone Community Grant that may be able to help fund directional street signage and sign designation in the Historic District (grant pending submittal and approval next year),
- Compilation of an additional building materials list to use for Administrative Approvals at the request of Council. She said that the creation of a compromise list of materials would help with the approvals for building projects related to windows, siding, and roof work,
- Satellite Ordinance / *Gettysburg Design Guide* revisions would have to be approved by Borough Council; and that there is a grant application pending for the ordinance and

Gettysburg Design Guide. She asked Board Members to bring their comments to the next meeting,

- Provide address locations when using HARB Hang Thank You Hang Tags,
- Proliferation of illuminated business signs in the Historic District (as discussed in the *Gettysburg Design Guide* on page 85), and how to provide clarification / direction to business owners for their appropriate use. She will have the solicitor examine case law, and determine what actions are enforceable. It was noted that rooftop signs are not allowed,
- Annual Training Hours for HARB (four credit hours) must be submitted to Director English, and that many training opportunities are still available.

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The **motion passed 7-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:53 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant