

## November 16, 2022 Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes Troxell Council Chambers Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, November 16, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members**: Chair Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Paul Witt, and Justin Harman, Acting Code Enforcement and Zoning Officer Wesley Winner of PA Municipal Code Alliance); Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Absent Board Members:** Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Suzanne Christianson, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, **Others in Attendance:** Richard and Wanda Gallimore, tenants, and Dwayne Piper, property owner, all representing 313 N. Stratton Street; Peter Yingling for property owner, and Anthony Wiker of Wiker Restoration, both representing 17 Chambersburg Street; Lizbeth and Mariano Amato, property owners, both representing 124 W. High Street; Ian and Ashley Miller, property owners, both representing 4 SW Confederate Avenue; and Powel Drozdz, property owner at 165 N Stratton Street.

#### **Call Meeting to Order**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of five (5) voting members present with Vice-Chair Stone attending at 8PM).

#### **Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that "HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council." Borough Council will next meet on Monday, December 12, 2022.

#### **Review of Agenda and Minutes**

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the November 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the November 16, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and **carried 4-to-0 without dissention**.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to accept the October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to accept the October 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Witt and carried 4-to-0 without dissention.

#### **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

#### <u>Public Comment for Items on the Agenda</u>

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

#### **New Business: Applications for Review**

#### A. COA 22-0111 MAJOR PROJECT: 313 N. Stratton Street – Regina G. Piper

Construction of a 23'x20' open carport for residential use with 6"x6" corner posts and shingled roof attached to existing adjacent carport serving other side of duplex. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 16<sup>th</sup> HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a two-story brick duplex with a shingled roof each with a single-story non-attached front-frame porch; and with a two-story rear attached frame porch and shared rear out building with a concrete block frame with a shingled roof. The permit history shows a fence in 2020; roofing work in 2021; and this permit for the construction of a 23' x 20' open carport. Staff recommendation is to review this application for new construction of a rear open-sided permanent carport to be connected to the adjacent carport residential duplex over the existing concrete foundation; and this structure will be located to the rear of the property and match the existing neighbor's carport which is of non-historic significance and is not highly visible from North Stratton Street but is visible from Barlow Street. Staff recommends the approval of the application.

Mr. Dwayne Piper representing the property gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Piper told the Board that his wife's parents live next door to he and his wife at (who live at 315 N Stratton Street) and the added parking is for them. He said that the carport at 315 N Stratton was constructed in the 1960s with brick columns, and that the owner intends to extend the carport design-wise and maintain the same style as the existing carport which is not visible from the street. He said that both carports would be of the same size, and that the intended wood clad posts would be a cost savings over the current brick posts and would match the trim of the structure. He said that the knee wall is clad in white vinyl siding and that the new carport construction would match the house, and that the fence would be relocated to the side of the carport. Chair Shaffer said that the Board would review the design for this project only, and that any construction permits must meet code because the proposed construction meets the existing carport structure at the property line and must be of non-combustible materials.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Major Project at 313 N. Stratton Street. He said that the structure is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, the main duplex structure is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application and is of high

architectural integrity as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and the accessory structure is visible from the public view way from the rear alley and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed accessory structure is of appropriate scale in structure and that the design, which is reviewable by this Board, is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for New Construction and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* but does not meet building code.

Mr. Witt made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 313 N. Stratton Street to approve the design only for the proposed new carport structure pending it must meet building code compliance as submitted and is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines and Gettysburg Design Guide as presented to the Board in the application dated October 7, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **4-to-0**.

#### B. COA 220112 CRITICAL PROJECT: 17 Chambersburg Street – Carl Yingling

Install new rubber roof over existing rubber roof. Re-point areas of failing brick on east side of the third floor wall. Paint brick with two coats of brick paint. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 16<sup>th</sup> HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the building first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1886 as a three-story brick dwelling with a rear brick two-story addition and a two-story frame east-facing frame porch all having a slate roof. The permit history shows Regulated Rentals since 2017, a Change of Occupancy in 2021; and this application for roof and mortar work. Staff recommends the restoration and repointing of the brick-and-mortar areas as paint is only a temporary solution to the deteriorated mortar; and that according to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for Restoration and Treatment #6 stating that deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. She showed the Board pictures of the deteriorated mortar on the east side of the building.

Mr. Pete Yingling, on behalf of the property owner, and Mr. Anthony Wiker, contractor from Wiker Restoration, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Wiker said that there are three different shades of brick on the building and that there are 50-100 cracked bricks, and that there is deterioration of the mortar on the east side of the building. He would like to install a new rubber roof, repoint the brick, and paint the existing brick with brick paint to preserve and seal them. Chair Shaffer said that many buildings were constructed when adding third floors to buildings using new brick. He said that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* states that painting is an acceptable treatment of the brick but must be a breathable paint to let the brick breathe, not damage the brick, and to repel moisture. He said that it can not be heavy seal coating. He noted that the rear part of the building is not visible from the street, and that Lexon brick paint is a breathable paint.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Critical Project at 17 Chambersburg Street. He said that the structure is not of high architectural integrity, is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District and* is not visible from the public view way and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the rubber roof replacement could be replaced in-kind; and that the proposed brick work is a permanent

improvement to the structural elements of building as long as the repointing and repainting of the brick meets the standards set forth in the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines and the Gettysburg Design Guide.

Mr. Harman made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 17 Chambersburg Street to replace and repoint the deteriorating brick on the east side of the third floor wall and repaint the brick using brick paint in the application as submitted that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated October 3, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Hodges and carried **4-to-0 without dissention.** 

Chair Shaffer noted that the in-kind roof work could commence as soon as possible.

(Enter via telecommunications Haley and Dustin Smith architect and landscape architect for the project at 4 SW Confederate Avenue)

#### C. COA 220217 MAJOR PROJECT: 124 W. High Street - Alex and Lizbeth Amato

Remove the exterior siding and replace it with a stucco-style exterior and add stone foundation up to siding around building. Remove and close the side-facing window due to water damage. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

Chair Shaffer told the Board that the structure is less than 50 years old, but that the exterior changes to the façade are extensive and a constitute a major project to a non-contributing building; and that the Board will review the materials presented because of its location in the Historic District to see if the materials for restoration are appropriate for use and contribute in a positive way to adjoining structures in the Historic District.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 16<sup>th</sup> HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the applicant is seeking a change of occupancy for the property from a medical office to a professional office; and that the exterior modifications to include: removing the existing siding and replacing it with stucco, and stone at the base; and removing one window on the west elevation due to water damage and replacing it with a solid wall. She said that the building was newly constructed in 1988 and did not appear on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. The permit history shows hearing/variance subdivision in 1982; demolition and build of current structure in 1988; roof replacement over side porch in 1994; enclosure of front porch with a new entry door in 2004; roofing work in 2010; and this current application for exterior façade work. Staff recommends reviewing options of applicant for change in front façade and to approve the exterior façade work as submitted; noting that structure is not historically significant, but the proposed work would improve the façade of the building.

Mr. Alex Amato and Mrs. Lizbeth Amato, property owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Amato said that they would like to remove the window on the west elevation due to water damage and replace it with a solid wall. Ms. Hodges said that the proposed stucco and stone would improve the look; and Chair Shaffer said that the building has an undefined architectural style and that the existing windows are a false traditional window style; and that the proposed windows will be of large-paned glass the are consistent with a more contemporary style. Mr. Harman can vote, and that the property was sold prior to the application and is not a fiduciary conflict.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 124 W. High Street to approve the application as submitted with the additional information for the proposed windows and door and that the contemporary project is not precluded by the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated October 26, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **4-to-0 without dissention.** 

Chair Shaffer told the applicant that it was permitted to secure the building against outside elements with plywood pending the outcome of the application by Borough Council on December 12, 2022.

(Enter Vice-Chair Stone)

#### D. COA 220120 CRITICAL PROJECT: 4 SW Confederate Avenue – Ian and Ashley Miller

Proposed construction of an in-ground pool with pool house and associated walkways and patio. Demolition of existing carriage house and construction of >1,000 sf 3.5-car garage with 3.5 stall parking court in front, construction of separate 4-car parking court, both with associated drive and walkways. Removal of portion of driveway connecting to W. Middle Street. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her November 16<sup>th</sup> HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the property is outside of the inventoried Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps through 1932. The rear detached shed not visible from the public view way is constructed with sawn lumber walls, studs and rafters and is covered with wood lap siding with out sub-sheathing; and the foundation is constructed with masonry, bricks, and some masonry blocks. The floor consists of portions of a concrete slab and portions of exposed gravel and soil. She provided the structural engineer's report to the Board which the brick retaining wall is heavily eroded, and that the rear foundation wall has bowed outward, and that the roof has a hole in it. It stated that the building has existed beyond its serviceable life and was not previously maintained and recommends demolition. The permit history shows a zoning hearing for tours in 1984 but was cancelled; external updated to restore structure in 1989; and this application to demolish the existing rear garage/shed and adding garages with parking areas and a pool. Staff recommends that the demolition of the rear garage needs to be discussed by the Board; and that documentation from a UCC representative or structural engineer will be required for demolition deeming the structure uninhabitable and unrepairable *if found* to be of historic significance.

#### Demolition of Rear Garage/Shed

Mr. Ian Miller and Mrs. Ashley Miller, property owners, and Haley and Dustin Smith, architect and landscape architect, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions about the existing garage structure. Mr. Miller said that they had purchased the "Schultz House" to raise their family and had contracted the design of their project with the Smiths. He said that the garage is not historically significant nor a contributing structure on their property. Mr. Smith said that the garage is hidden by existing vegetation on the side of the structure, and that the submitted engineer's structural report shows significant deterioration of the 1870s garage structure with failing features, and the extensive damage makes the structure cost prohibitive to renovate. Mr. Miller said that the proposed use of the garage would not lend to preserving the garage in that space for housing modern sized vehicles, and that the extensive damage to the structure: significant roof failures, rotted rafters and joist, ground

hog holes in flooring, and deteriorated sheathing precludes any viable restoration. He said that it could not be moved or salvaged in its extremely deteriorated state. He said that he would be willing to donate any salvageable materials to the Salvage Warehouse. Vice-Chair Stone said that the stage coach carriage stoop and the four barn door mechanisms on the garage could be salvaged. Mr. Miller said that the proposed new garage structure would shift to the left of the existing structure footprint preserving the existing vegetation and to maintain a vegetative buffer. He said that the new proposed garage structure would be sensitive to the main house structure in style. Chair Shaffer said that they do not review landscaping or the driveway, but any new construction and that structural landscape elements are reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed new garage would be more visible than the old garage.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this rear garage/shed demolition at SW Confederate Avenue. He said that the main house structure existed during the time of the Civil War which is a contributing structure to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District.* He said that the garage structure is not visible from the public view way via W. Middle Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the garage is structurally unsound as depicted in the Structural Engineer's Report dated November 10, 2022 from Jeffrey N Fertich, PE Principal Structural Engineer at Structural Engineering Resources LLC. He said that the proposed demolition of the very deteriorated structure was not demolition by neglect by the current owners and meets all of the standards set forth for demolition per the Gettysburg Historic District Ordinance and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for demolition.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 4 SW Confederate Avenue to demolish the existing free-standing garage/ wood shed that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated October 26, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Witt and **carried 5-to-0 without dissention.** 

#### New Construction of Rear Garage Structure

Mr. Miller told the Board that he would like to retain the existing oak tree and add a new tree to shroud the new garage. Mr. Smith said that the proposed new garage site will shift to preserve the existing elevation and topography, and to maintain the integrity of the site using the bottom of the yard and existing driveway. Chair Shaffer said that the new design of the garage on a protected property comes under the review right of this Board. Mr. Miller said that they wanted to create a modern characterization of the historic carriage house to include two dormers (three over one windows), three exterior doors, six over one windows, area next to the garage doors for storage space, siding will be Hardie Plank horizontal siding replicating the siding from main house from the 1980s, frees board under the roof line on the garage will mimic the main house. He said that he would relocate the light poles in the driveway and will maintain the driveway brick and not coat. He said that the roof will be a graphite color.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Critical Project at 4 SW Confederate Avenue. He said that the proposed new garage structure is a secondary structure that is located on

an individually listed property and protected by the Historic District Ordinance within the Borough of Gettysburg, will have its own integrity as a new structure but would relate to the historic style of the main house, is visible from W. Middle Street, and that the design elements for the windows, doors, etc. is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines for new construction and the Gettysburg Design Guide.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rear garage structure at 4 SW Confederate Avenue to approve the application as submitted with the additional final light fixtures information to be provided to the Board that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for new construction as presented to the Board in the application dated October 26, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **5-to-0 without dissention.** 

#### **Pool House Structure Construction**

Mr. Miller said that the proposed pool house will be located behind the pool which is situated when exiting the main house through the 1830s front door to a raised seating area, down a few steps to the pool deck with the pool house located to co-exist with established trees. Mr. Smith said that the pool house is five feet lower than Confederate Avenue eliminating visibility to the public. Mrs. Smith said that the standing seam metal roof on the pool house will also include a painted wood pergola, Hardie Plank horizontal wood siding, a brick chimney, outside seating area and bar, trim board that will relate to the main house and garage and would be appropriately scaled. She said that they would provide future lighting plans to the Board when they become available. She said that the design is a monolithic building without windows and doors, and that the pool would be screened by gardens. She said that the fill from the pool would enhance the east elevation. Mr. Smith said that a new canopy would be added with evergreens on the west side to screen the pool for privacy; and that pool equipment would be stored in space under pool house.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for this Critical Project at 4 SW Confederate Avenue. He said that the proposed new pool house structure is a secondary structure that is located on an individually listed property and protected by the Historic District Ordinance within the Borough of Gettysburg, will have its own integrity as a new structure but would relate to the historic style of the main house, and will be screened for privacy, that the design elements would be to scale and would not impact the main structure, and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for new construction and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the pool house structure at 4 SW Confederate Avenue to approve the application as submitted with the additional final light fixtures information to be provided to the Board that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* for new construction as presented to the Board in the application dated October 26, 2022. The motion was second by Mr. Harman and carried **5-to-0 without dissention.** 

Chair Shaffer said that the applicant would have to submit all permits including stormwater plans. Mr. Miller said that Sharrah Design Group is the architect of record.

#### **Reports**

#### A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

## • COA 22-0110 MINOR PROJECT: 64 E. Stevens Street – Vincent Bruinsma Install 17 linear feet of wood privacy fencing six feet in height between the garage and the existing fence line in the rear of the property. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

## • COA 22-0113 MINOR PROJECT: 75 Springs Avenue – Monahan Parentship LP Replace existing asphalt shingles on west and south side of building and replace them in-kind with GAF Timberline HDZ shingles. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

# COA 22-0114 MINOR PROJECT – 123 Baltimore Street - Barley Snyder Install 7.2 square foot projecting sign for 'Barley Snyder'. Projecting signs shall not extend more than four feet from any building or structure to which the same is attached, and such signs shall not extend into any street, alley or drive or be less than eight feet above any sidewalk or other public thoroughfare. The signage bracket anchor must be bolted through the mortar and not the brick of the building. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

• COA 22-0115 MINOR PROJECT – 17 Lincoln Square – 17 Lincoln Square Collections
Shingle-to-shingle re-roof on a portion of the building adjacent to Lincoln Square. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

#### • COA 22-0116 MINOR PROJECT – 22 W. Water Street – Lori Hough

Residential shingle-to-shingle re-roof using architectural shingles. This building is located in the FEMA AE Flood Zone designation. This project does not constitute a 'Substantial Improvement'; however, the property owner should be conscious of the requirements of Chapter 8 Floodplains of the *Gettysburg Borough Code of Ordinances* when planning improvements. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

#### COA 22-0119 MINOR PROJECT – 217 N. Stratton Street – Reuben Crandall

Proposed replacement of existing metal roof 1 ¼ standing seam on main house and porches and replace with AB Seam standing seam roof (same style and color). No portion of this project is located within the AE Flood Zone. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

### COA 22-0118 MINOR PROJECT – 25 S. Washington Street – Barbara Entwistle Replace in-kind wood windowsills and sash, remove and restore, scrape and paint existing wood

windows and paint all same in existing color. All applications must meet the Secretary of Interiors Guidelines.

COA 22-121 MINOR PROJECT – 100 Buford Ave – Sunshine Project II

Install two sets of non-illuminated letter signs 11'8" x1 8" each. Install 3'11" wall sign over entrance in existing mount. Total proposed sign square footage is 47 sf. Total sign SF remaining is 3 sf. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

Install 9' x 3' Metro by T-Mobile banner over front entrance for 60 days (two 30-day banner permits). All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

#### COA 22-0122 MINOR PROJECT – 777 Baltimore Street – Felty Investments LP

Install 7.5 SF projecting sign for Gettysburg Tour Center above entrance of temporary storefront location. Sign must be anchored in mortar between the existing brick, not through the brick. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

#### • COA 22-0118 MINOR PROJECT – 25 S. Washington Street – Riley's Property Maintenance

Remove and replace wooden windowsill and existing window on alley-side of building and remove and replace window sash on other side of building. Paint windowsills and front doors in current color. 'In Kind' work is wood-to-wood replacement. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

#### COA 22-0123 MINOR PROJECT – 10 Lincoln Square – Gettysburg Construction

Change of occupancy from community thrift store to retail store and ghost tours. One 2' x 3' projecting sign for 'Ghost City Tours.' Sign brackets must be anchored within the mortar not through existing brick. All applications must meet the *Secretary of Interiors Guidelines*.

**NOTE:** HARB is a *design* review board only, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements prior to final approval through Council.

Chair Shaffer made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the September 21, 2022 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Witt and **carried 7-to-0 without dissension**.

#### A. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer did not have a report at this time.

#### B. Report of Staff - Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English did not have a report at this time; but reminded the Board that there is an on-line training on November 17, 2022 from 2PM-3PM, and the tour of the Benner House Restoration is scheduled for December 5, 2022 from 12PM-1PM on site. She said that both events can be applied to the annual HARB training hour requirements. She reminded the Board to review the Satellite Ordinance revisions for Council and tabled the rest of the agenda items until the next meeting. Chair Shaffer said that it is the 50<sup>th</sup> year of the HARB Ordinance.

#### **Other Business**

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

#### **Public Comment**

Paul Drozdz, property owner at 165 N. Stratton Street, addressed with the Board his Notice of Violation (NOV) for removing the existing historic short wood porch railings and replacing it with decorative PVC to match the rear of the house. The Board needed more information to review the project, and it will not be discussed at this time.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Harman made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The **motion passed 4-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant