

DRAFT



January 19, 2022
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Troxell Council Chambers
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, January 19, 2022 in Troxell Council Chambers, 59 E. High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Brandon Stone, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Suzanne Christianson, Justin Harman, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot of PA Municipal Code Alliance, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation Debra English, and Planning Management Assistant Karen Mesher; **Others in Attendance:** **Daniel R. Altman**, Property Owner, representing 145 York Street; Business Owner Wade Leedy, Brand Shelton and Mike Bucher of Front Runner Exteriors all representing 105 Steinwehr Avenue – Tommys Pizza; and John Buchheister, Property Owner, representing Rear 123 W. High Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chair Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM in Troxell Council Chambers and conducted a roll call of members in attendance and confirmed a quorum of six (6) voting members present. He turned the meeting over to Director English to preside over the reorganization of the Historical Architectural Review Board (HARB).

Reorganization of Board

As customary during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized with a quorum present. Director English opened the floor for nominations for Chair. Mr. Stone nominated Gary Shaffer for HARB Chair. There being no other nominations, Director English closed the nominations and called for a vote. Mr. McCabe made the **motion** to elect Gary Shaffer as HARB Chair and was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried **6-to-0** (Ms. Christianson was absent). Mr. Shaffer agreed to serve as HARB Chair in 2022 and resumed running the meeting.

Chair Shaffer opened the floor for nominations for Vice-Chair. Ms. Hodges nominated Brandon Stone for HARB Vice-Chair. There being no other nomination, Chair Shaffer closed the nominations and called for a vote. Mr. McCabe made the **motion** to elect Brandon Stone as HARB Vice-Chair and was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried **6-to-0** without dissention. Mr. Stone agreed to serve as HARB Vice-Chair in 2022.

(Enter Suzanne Christianson-Quorum of seven members present)

Chair Shaffer opened the floor for nominations for Second Vice-Chair. The Board questioned the need for this position since it is not required by the HARB By-Laws and was created in 2021 to fill a particular Board need at that time. Ms. Hodges made a **motion** to forgo the position of Second Vice-Chair in 2022 and was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried **7-to-0** without dissention.

Chair Shaffer called for a motion to set the 2022 monthly HARB Business Meeting dates for the calendar year 2022 as the third Wednesday of every month pending holidays and major weather events and to authorize the Borough Secretary to advertise those dates in the Gettysburg Times in January 2022.

Vice-Chair Stone made the **motion** to hold the 2022 Monthly Business Meetings of the HARB on the following Wednesday dates at 7:00 PM prevailing time at the Municipal Building in Troxell Council Chambers (or via Zoom format) pending holidays and major weather events and authorize the Borough Secretary to advertise the same in the *Gettysburg Times* for the calendar year 2022: January 19th; February 16th; March 16th, April 20th, May 18th, June 22nd, July 20th, August 17th, September 21st, October 19th, November 16th, and December 21st; and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion **7-to-0** without dissention.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Chair Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on agenda topics and minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that ***"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval through Borough Council."*** Borough Council will next meet on Monday, February 14, 2022.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Chair Shaffer noted that Item C on the January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda was removed by the applicant; and asked the Board to accept the January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. Mr. Malot made a **motion** to accept the January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Harman and carried **7-to-0** without dissention.

Chair Shaffer asked the Board to review and accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted (the December 2021 HARB Meeting was canceled). Mr. McCabe made a **motion** to accept the November 17, 2021 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **7-to-0** without dissention.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-21-0155 MAJOR PROJECT: 145 York Street – Daniel R. Altman

Replace existing wood single-pane windows with vinyl double-hung dual-pane replacement windows.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a duplex two-story stone with a composition roof, and a front and rear one-story framed porch. She said that the permit history includes permits from 2019, 2020, 2021, and the current project under review.

Mr. Altman, Property Owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Altman said that he would like to replace the second-floor window and all possibly of the windows due to loud traffic noise, drafts, and poor energy efficiency. He said that the windows are currently covered by storm windows and are not visible to the public. He noted that the wood windows have been in place since 1910. He said that he would like to replace the wood windows with dual-pane, double-hung sliding replacement solar zone windows with foam rom Window World's 4000 Series.

Chair Shaffer said that the storm windows cannot be raw aluminum and must be painted but could replace the side and rear façade windows with vinyl because of their lack of visibility. Vice-Chair Stone said that upgrading the storm windows would protect the wood windows behind them and would be considered an "in-kind" replacement costing much less. Ms. Christianson using a type of plexiglass as interior storms that would increase energy efficiency at reduced cost. He suggested a wood clad replacement for the front facades and would be considered a replacement "in-kind" similar to the replacement project at 167 S. Stratton Street. Chair Shaffer asked the applicant to reconsider the application and to replace the west-side and south rear facades with vinyl.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 145 York Street. He said that this dwelling of high architectural integrity with many historical features, is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via York Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed window replacement to the front façade with vinyl windows is a project that is not consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that all façade alterations are significant architectural importance to the structure's historic integrity, and vinyl is not recommended on the front; but could be used on the west-side and south rear facades which are not visible from the public view way.

Ms. Christianson made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of wood windows with vinyl windows on the west-side and south-rear facades at 145 York Street as presented to the Board in the application dated December 6, 2021 with a project scope that is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **7-to-0 without dissention**.

B. COA 22-0007 MAJOR PROJECT: 105 Steinwehr Avenue – Tommy’s Pizza

Remove red existing shaker-style roof and replace it with standing-seam metal roof, black in color; remove metal siding, wicker in color and board and batten style, and replace it with vinyl siding in the same style and color on all four sides to exclude the exterior refrigeration unit located on the Washington Street side; remove and replace the bottom aluminum slide drive-through window with an “in-kind” slide window with the top portion of the window will remain intact (metal framing).

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1931 as a thirteen-foot-high concrete block building which was used as a filling station; and a three-story frame dwelling adjacent to this structure which was demolished since this date and used for parking for Tommy’s Pizza. The permit history includes building permits issued in 2017, 2018, 2019; banner permits issued in 2018 and 2019, an Outdoor Dining Permit; and this application for a re-roof and siding work.

Chair Shaffer said that the original building had numerous alterations and is currently a non-sensitive structure; but was converted to the present building from an older gas station in the 1980s.

Brandon Shelton and Mike Bucher from Front Runner Exteriors and Wade Leedy, Property Owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shelton said that the building was struck by a vehicle in April, 2021 and needed repaired. He said that the style of roof is no longer made and proposed removing the metal roof and replacing it with a black shaker-style standing seam metal roof (with a strong seam). He would also like to remove the metal board and batten siding and replace it with board and batten vinyl siding in a wicker color. Mr. Bucher said that the owner would also like to replace the drive-through window but would maintain the metal frame. He said that the lighting and signage would be determined at a later date.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Major Project at 105 Steinwehr Avenue – Tommy’s Pizza. He said that this dwelling had many alterations over the years, is a contributing structure because of its age to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a non-sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via Barlow Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed building alterations to the roof, siding, and drive-through window is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the changes to the building are highly visible from both Steinwehr Avenue and Washington Street.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the roof, siding and drive-through window at 105 Steinwehr Avenue, Tommys Pizza that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated January 3, 2022. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **7-to-0 without dissention**.

D. COA-22-0006 Critical Project: 123 W. High Street – John Buchheister

Demolition of a 12 x 16 concrete block garage structure to the rear of the building with a shingled room and wood entrance addition sitting on a steel beam.

Director English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 19, 2022 HARB Meeting Agenda. She said that the structure first appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Maps in 1896 as a two-story brick structure with a shingled roof, rear brick one-story addition and framed porch with a tin roof on the rear of both duplex units. The permit history includes building permits: LU17-0114 for a change from a rear garage to an exercise club (project abandoned), and LU19-0013 for a change of use, and this project for the demolition of the rear garage.

Chair Shaffer said that the building was built on a functioning alley and used by the former H & H Pontiac as part of their business (body/paint shop), and reconfigured and later subdivided the lot for their use.

John Buchheister answered Board questions. He discussed the history of the building with the Board, and that the building is badly deteriorated and non-functional; and that he would like to tear it down. The Board had no questions for the applicant.

Chair Shaffer presented *The Proposed Findings of Fact* for the Critical Project at 123 W. High Street. He said that this dwelling has no architectural integrity, is a contributing to the Gettysburg Battlefield National Historic District located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, is a sensitive building over 50 years old at the time of application as defined in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg/Gettysburg Historic District* and is visible from the public view way via W. High Street and thus comes under the review right of this Board. He said that the proposed demolition is consistent with both the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. He noted that the block building from the late 1960s was used by H & H Pontiac to expand their auto sale and repair business providing them with room to work on their cars. He said that the structure does not have any features that would prevent it from being demolished.

Vice-Chair Stone made a **motion** to recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a deteriorated 12 x 6 concrete block rear garage structure at the rear of 123 W. High Street that is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and the *Gettysburg Design Guide* as presented to the Board in the application dated December 13, 2021. The motion was second by Ms. Christianson and carried **7-to-0 without dissent**.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since the Last Meeting:

- **COA 21-0143 MINOR PROJECT: 135 Baltimore Street – Truck Jones Limited LLC dba Bacas**
New Retail store 'Truck Jones Limited LLC' in existing retail space. One wooden wall sign 11' x .875' above entrance, and one 1.3' x 2.6' wood-framed portable sign with changeable copy. 28 SF of the building's 38 SF signage has been used; 10 SF signage remains available. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0144 MINOR PROJECT: 323 Baltimore Street – Mark & Heidi Kile**
Previous COA approval for work on June 10, 2015 and renewing permit to complete work as noted with this approval. This review notes the wood siding to be installed on the west side of the house similar to the south side. Repair damaged soffit and fascia. This property had a NOV and

reapplied to complete work of previous permit approval. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- **COA 21-0145 MINOR PROJECT: 35 Carlisle Street – M Potteiger Inc**
Installation of roofing snow fence system on two sections of the metal roof to address issues with snow/ice overhangs and prevent unsafe conditions. One is to be installed on the rear roof of the Train Station that overhangs the rear back porch/deck area, and the other is to be installed on the patio roof that runs parallel with the train tracks. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0146 MINOR PROJECT: 205 S. Stratton Street – Daniel Small**
Install 6' white vinyl fence along back and side of property, which will match fence along north boundary shared with 65 E. High Street. All fencing style and material shall be 'in kind' and any deviation from existing fence style will require HARB review. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. Previous HARB approval for fence style of 65 E. High Street NO 06-19 on April 28, 2006. This fence will be on the rear and side of the back of the property not visible from the main roadway.
- **COA 21-0147 MINOR PROJECT: 220 S. Stratton Street – Xiu Qin He**
Replace current roof with shingle to shingle 'in kind' work with 'Dynasty' laminated architectural asphalt shingles granite black in color. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0148 MINOR PROJECT: 41 Steinwehr Avenue – Susan & David Strickland**
Repair and replace damaged railing on front porch 'in-kind'. Repair will restore damaged components. Any change in material or style will require HARB review. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0149 MINOR PROJECT: 312 Baltimore Street – Wetzel Family Holdings LLC**
Installation of 3 window signs for UPMC; total sign square footage with existing signage is 6 square feet. All applications and construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0150 MINOR PROJECT: 59 E. High Street – Borough Municipal Office**
This work is to repair damaged roof on the elevator section of roof with 'in kind' materials. Install Bulldog on elevator roof section fix two seams the entire length of the building to repair roof leak. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21- 0151 MINOR PROJECT: 240-242 Chambersburg Street – Jeffery Marangi**
NOV dated 11/11/2021 for emergency roof repairs as holes in roof are damaging neighboring property. Roof damage will be repaired, new gutters and down spouts will be installed, windows will be temporarily boarded up. The neighboring exterior wall will be reconstructed, all work must use 'in kind' materials and style. Other modification to this structure will require re-review. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0152 MINOR PROJECT: 516 Baltimore Street – Norma J. Herring**
Removal of existing rubber roof and install a tapered roof insulation towards the rear of the building. Install EPDM roof system with all necessary flashings, terminations, and aluminum metal

edging. Install new seamless aluminum gutter system on rear of roof of three-bay garage storage building. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

- **COA 21-0153 MINOR PROJECT: 0 S. Franklin Street – Frederick Douglass Townhouses HOA**
Replace existing deteriorated fence in-kind with new fence in same height, location, and length, with white Dutch lap vinyl. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0154 MINOR PROJECT: 29 York Street. Charles & Dianne Earley**
Replace rear exterior stairs to second floor using 'in kind' materials with pressure treated lumber. All construction must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0156 MINOR PROJECT: 5 Steinwehr Avenue – Tessa G. Bardo**
Plastic A-Frame Sign 24"x 36" (6 sq ft), and wood 30" x 72" (15 SF) wall sign for Etheric Connections to be affixed to railing. Total sign SF for property is 30 SF, total used with previously approved hanging sign is 29.6 SF. Revised December 13, 2021 - S/W owner - previously approved wall sign withdrawn. Replacing banner on railing with permanent sign 15 SF. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 21-0157 MINOR PROJECT: 49 York Street - Karla and Jerry Carr**
Signs for Gettysburg Community Theater includes one 4'h x 3'w portable sign and one 11 SF hanging sign; and one 24 SF banner hanging on west porch wall from October 1, 2021 through December 31, 2021, and from January 1, 2022 through March 31, 2022. Sign SF Remaining: 27 SF. Banner permits remaining through December 31, 2022 is zero. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0001 MINOR PROJECT: 46 Chambersburg Street – Michelle Lenzi**
New signage: one 12.5 SF wall sign; one 2' x 3' portable with lettering 'Lele Bs Boutique'; 30 SF available 21.5 SF utilized with this application. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0002 MINOR PROJECT: 452 Baltimore – Miguel Vasquez LLC**
Install new architectural shingles over existing three-tab architectural shingles, repoint chimney, and coat metal roof. All repairs done 'in kind' roof maintenance. Repair slate shingles and replace using only slate shingles as needed. All applications must meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.
- **COA 22-0003 MINOR PROJECT: 150 N. Third Street – Timely Place LLC / Jon Shultz**
Replace existing shingle roof on a portion of building with multi-rib metal roof system with all the necessary flashings, accessories, and matching snow guards. Install 2 x 6 rafter system with 2 x 4 purlins over existing deck. All other maintenance work outside of this must be 'in kind' and meet all Secretary of the Interior Guidelines. As previously permitted January 4, 2017 COA 17-01.
- **COA 22-0004 MINOR PROJECT: 247 Chambersburg Street – Linda Potter**
Remove asphalt shingles from front main roof, flat and porch roof, and metal roof from rear main porch roof (not visible from roadway). Install asphalt shingles on entire main and both porch roofs and EPDM on front flat roof. Replace built-in gutters with 6" white aluminum half-round gutters in front, and K-style seamless white aluminum gutters in rear. Remove existing crown molding

from front porch roof. Install black aluminum wall and chimney flashings. Replace missing fascia wraps on the right side of house. Remove satellite dish.

- **COA 22-0005 MINOR PROJECT: 31 S. Washington Street – Ryan Jordy**
Shingle to shingle roof replacement, install ice guards on all eaves and valleys, install ridge vent, new pipe collars, and flashing and caulk as needed.

NOTE: HARB is a *design review board only*, each project must meet all other Borough Ordinances and Building code requirements.

Mr. Ma made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the November 17, 2021 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried **7-to-0**.

B. Report of Chair – Chair Shaffer

Chair Shaffer gave no report but did propose for consideration having the HARB Awards Ceremony during the third week of April before the HARB Business Meeting from 6PM-7PM on April 20, 2022 to include a small reception for the award recipients and their guests. He suggested inviting Borough Council Members to the award ceremony and providing a follow-up to the *Gettysburg Times*. The Board **agreed by informal consent** to host the HARB Award Ceremony prior to the April HARB Business meeting. Vice-Chair Stone suggested submitting one project to the State Preservation to highlight the work that HARB is doing in Gettysburg.

C. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

Director English discussed the items with the Board:

- Asked HARB Members to review the Historic Preservation Awards Checklist for the final review at the February meeting,
- Asked the Board to review and comment on the Satellite Dish updates to both the Historic District Ordinance and to the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, which would both have to be approved by Borough Council. She said that she could submit a CLG Grant application for both updates. She noted that the Borough is working in conjunction with the Adams County Arts Council for repurposing removed satellite dishes into bird baths, The Board discussed meeting at 6PM prior to the meeting to discuss the satellite dishes,
- Discussed the usage of HARB “Thank You for Your Support” hang tags, and to forward a list of any issued hang tag recipients to Director English (direction for distribution to follow), and
- Asked HARB Members to forward any online seminar training participation hours to Director English for her annual training records (to include 4 training seminars),

Other Business

There was no other business before the Board at this time.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. McCabe. The motion passed **7-to-0**. The meeting adjourned at 8:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher, Planning and Management Assistant