



**October 16, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, October 16, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Acting Zoning and Historic Preservation Officer Sharon Hamm, PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA Administrative Services Manager); and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Others in Attendance:** Jonathan Diehl representing 58 W. Water Street; George and Beverly Ott representing 135/137 Chambersburg Street; Bruce Kile, GAR Hall Committee Member and Anne Zabawa, President of Historic Gettysburg-Adams County (HGAC), representing 53 E. Middle Street; and Debra English of 1210 Pumping Station Road.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Tuesday, November 12, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the October 16, 2019 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the September 18, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-19-0058: 58 W. Water Street, Jonathan & Jessica Diehl – New Deck and Fence

Project 1: CRITICAL PROJECT: Adding an 18' x 16' deck made from treated pine lumber with stainless steel cables to the rear of the house. Deck should not be visible from location other than driveway after proposed 6' fence is installed.

Project 2: MINOR PROJECT: Adding 6' high 1x6" dog ear privacy fence made from treated pine. Approx. 5 6' wide sections on the east side of the property, 9 sections on west side of property and 2 sections facing West Water Street.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her October 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appears on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps in 1912 as a two-story structure. She said that there were two projects submitted together for this property: a Critical Project involving a deck addition, and a Minor Project involving a fence. She said that the applicant would like to add an 18' x 16' pine deck that would not be visible to the public after the privacy fence is installed. She noted that the 6' high 1 x 6" dog ear vertical board privacy fence would be constructed from pine in five 6' wide sections on the east side of the property, nine sections on the west side of the property, and two sections facing West Water Street.

Jonathan Diehl gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Diehl said that the deck is already completed, and that the proposed fence would be a six-foot-high dog-ear privacy fence. Mr. Malot said that the deck was built without permits and inspections, and that any construction issues would be addressed during the permit review.

Ms. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 58 W. Water Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Chapter 11 Gettysburg Historic District, has limited visibility from the public way, is located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register Gettysburg National Battlefield Historic District*. The proposed exterior deck and fence renovations is compliant with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed deck and fence projects at 58 W. Water Street as submitted in the application dated September 18, 2019.

The Board discussed the motion. Mr. Goble said that all inspections and the review of the deck be certified by a zoning official. Ms. Hamm said that the land development procedure is fine but noted that whether the deck was built to UCC code would occur after Council approval of the COA. Mr. Malot said that final consideration for the COA should be contingent upon inspection of the deck. Ms. Gustafson withdrew her motion.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed deck and fence projects at 58 W. Water Street pending all permits

and fees be obtained and approved as submitted in the application dated September 18, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 7-to-0.

B. COA -19-0094: 53 E. Middle Street-GAR Hall, Historic Gettysburg-Adams County (HGAC) – New Storm Windows

MINOR PROJECT: Install white aluminum framed glass storm windows on 9 historic windows on the GAR Hall. These units will protect the historic double-hung windows with minimal visual impact.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her October 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the GAR Hall appears on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, which was the first in the series, as a brick building and is labelled GAR Hall. She noted that the building appears on the Sanborn Maps dated 1891, 1896, 1902, 1907, and 1912 with an additional brick structure at the rear of the building. She said that the building dates to 1822 when it was constructed for the Methodist Episcopal Church; and noted that it is Gettysburg's oldest standing church building.

Anne Zabawa and Bruce Kile gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Kile said that the windows are set back in their frames, so there is very little visual impact by the addition of the white aluminum, custom-made storm windows. Ms. Zabawa said that the intent was to make a pattern storm window to cover the palladium window. She said that there would not be any moisture issues regarding the storm windows; but that their addition would protect the historic double-hung windows on the GAR Hall building.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project to install nine storm windows at 53 E. Middle Street would be a permanent change, is visible from the public way, is located in the Gettysburg Historic District, stood at the time of the Battle; and thus, is reviewable by this Board. He said that the addition of the storm windows would create very little visual impact on this historic structure and is consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed installation of nine storm windows at 53 E. Middle Street-GAR Hall as presented in the application dated September 23, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 7-to-0.

C. COA-19-0095: 135/137 Chambersburg Street, George Ott– New Roof

CRITICAL PROJECT: Replace shingle and slate roof on the upper main section only with a corrugated powder coated metal roof.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her October 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that the building appears on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, which are the first in a series, as a two-story brick dwelling; and that it appears in the same configuration in each of the subsequent series of maps.

George and Beverly Ott gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Ott said that the roof is not visible from Chambersburg Street, and that its replacement would have no impact on the building. Ms. Gustafson noted that the building is meticulously maintained by the owners.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed Critical Project to replace the roof at 135/137 Chambersburg Street would be a permanent change to a building that has high architectural integrity; is visible from the public way; is located in the Gettysburg Historic District; is over 130 years old; and thus, is reviewable by this Board. He said that the replacement of the roof is a project with limited visibility from the public alley / street and is consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed metal roof replacement on the upper main section at 135/137 Chambersburg Street as presented in the application dated September 27, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 7-to-0.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative COA Approvals Since Last Meeting:

- **COA-19-0090: 267 Baltimore Street – Becki Redwine**
MINOR PROJECT: Replace shingle roof with Owens Corning Shingles; Install solar attic fan.
- **COA-19-0091: 224 W. Middle Street – Becki Redwine**
MINOR PROJECT: Scrape metal roof system where rust is building/chipping. Install rust inhibitor as needed. Apply Bulldog Base Coat, fabric on all seals and apply final topcoat of Bulldog.
- **COA-19-0093: 415 S. Washington Street – Ed Steinour**
MINOR PROJECT: Remove eleven (11) existing vinyl windows and storm windows. Install Simonton 5050 series white vinyl windows with Low E, Argon Glass, No Grids (3) 27 ¾" x 65 ¼"; (7) 27 ¾" x 61 ½"; (1) 39 ¾" x 51 ¾".
- **COA-19-0092: 5 Steinwehr Avenue – Lloyd Runkle**
SIGN: Remove / replace existing 26" x 48" (8.67 sq. ft.) illuminated projecting sign with like sign. Total sign coverage for both sides is 17.33 sq. ft.
- **COA-19-0096: 19 Baltimore Street – Time Square Partnership**
MINOR PROJECT: Remove existing rubber roof system and install new .060 black rubber roof system to include: decking, flashing aluminum adjoining wall area, and 5 dome skylights.
- **COA-19-0097: 51 E. Stevens Street – Nash Re**
MINOR PROJECT: Installing a 14' x 14' (196 sq. ft.) patio to rear of house.

Mr. McCabe made the motion for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the September 18, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **HARB News**

Mr. Shaffer told the Board that he did not have a report; but reminded them to keep a record of their trainings for the calendar year to maintain compliance. He discussed with the Board various training opportunities; and proposed the possibility of a HARB training in November. He requested that staff provide a “Demolition” tab in their HARB Books for reference materials relating to the Borough ordinance for Board members to consult when discussing this complicated demolition issue.

C. Report of Staff – *Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PMCA*

Ms. Hamm told the Board that Jim McCabe was approved by Council for another 5-year term on the HARB. She introduced the Associate Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation, Debra English, to the Board.

Other Business

There was no other HARB business currently before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:05 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant