



September 18, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, September 18, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Acting Zoning and Historic Preservation Officer Sharon Hamm, PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA Administrative Services Manager); and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Vice-Chair Phil Goble **Others in Attendance:** Ernie Kranias of Ernie's Texas Lunch, representing 58 Chambersburg Street; Jacqueline White, Property Owner and Dobbin House Tavern Owner, Peter J. Martin, P.E. of PJ Martin Engineering, Jim Baumgardner and Teen Vebares of Core Design Group, all representing 688-690, 696-698, 700-702, 712 S. Washington Street; Borough Manager Charles R. Gable of Gettysburg Borough, representing 59 E. High Street; Ted Hirt, Property Owner, representing 241 Baltimore Street; Gary Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates representing 327 Baltimore Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used if needed by Ms. Hamm and Applicants during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, October 14, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the September 18, 2019 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the August 21, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the following two applications, whereby Second Vice-Chair Ms. Gustafson assumed her role as Chair.

A. COA-19-0079: 154-160, Ernie Kranias, Shaffer Design Associates - Proposed Cosmetic Exterior Renovations

MINOR PROJECT: Cosmetic renovation of the front façade. The exterior work includes removal of existing awnings, restoring transoms with frosted glass, a replacement door and painting.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her September 18, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this Minor Project involves exterior work to remove the existing awnings, restore the transoms, replace the door, and paint the exterior. She noted that the structure first appeared on the 1891 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame duplex dwelling.

Ernie Kranias gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Kranias said that he would like to remove the existing awnings, light fixtures, and plywood transoms and venting louvers; and replace the transoms with frosted glass panels without back lighting. He would like to install seven goose head exterior lights and replace the doors. He said that his grandfather opened the business in 1921, and that he would like to update and clean the exterior of the building for its 100th Anniversary.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. She said that the proposed project at 58 Chambersburg Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Chapter 11, Gettysburg Historic District is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. She said that the structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed exterior renovations to the front façade to include the replacement of existing light fixtures, transoms, and doors; remove the awnings and repaint the exterior in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 58 Chambersburg Street for the cosmetic renovations to the front façade: replacement of existing light fixtures, transoms, and doors; remove awnings and

repaint exterior as submitted in the application dated August 6, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

B. COA -19-0086: 688, 698, 700, 712, 714 S. Washington Street, Jacqueline White – Proposed Parking Garage

CRITICAL PROJECT: Construction of a proposed (3) three story 78,400 square foot structure is intended to be used as a parking garage facility on South Washington Street. This facility will be constructed of pre-cast and cast-in-place concrete. The exterior finishes are brick veneer, pre-cast concrete heads, keystones, sills, and accents, pre-finished aluminum exterior doors and curtain wall systems, and a painted steel covered entrance with a standing seam metal roof. The interior spaces include a vestibule, elevator, two (2) stair towers, electrical room, and parking for 192 vehicles.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her September 18, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this properties at 688-690, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame dwelling. She said that the applicant, Jacqueline White, is looking to build a new 78,400 square foot, three-story parking garage structure constructed in pre-cast and cast-in-place concrete for the parking of 192 vehicles. She noted that the approved August 21, 2019 HARB minutes by both the HARB Board and Gettysburg Borough Council also included the staff recommendation to Borough Council for all of the properties addressed by COA-19-0038 at 688-691, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street, Gettysburg (based on the December 14, 2011 letter to Ms. Jacqueline White by then Planning Director Scott Dellett):

- *Based on the recommendations of HARB, a COA be granted for the demolition of the above referenced structures.*
- *The demolition permit be withheld until the structures are fully documented by photographs, video, drawings, and narrative provided to the Borough and reviewed by HARB.*
- *Design and location of the replacement structure shall be appropriate to the height, scale, and relations to the surrounding area.*
- *Before initiating any demolition, a detailed architectural design for the proposed replacement structure must be recommended by the HARB Board and approve by Borough Council.*
- *Before demolition of the three aforementioned structures commences, a bond shall be provided to the Borough in the amount to be stipulated by Borough Council to cover the cost of the designed replacement structure.*

She said that the applicant's intent to replace those buildings now would not occur as a replacement-in-kind of three structures; but instead, as the construction of a new parking garage at that location. She said that the existing structures must be documented, and a new construction design proposed before the demolition permit could be issued in compliance with the Historic District Ordinance. She said that the intent of the bond was to ensure that the lots would not remain empty. Ms. Gustafson said that the Board is not against demolition, but that new construction would take place in a timely manner. Mr. Malot said that Chapter 11, Section 110-3D(3) of the Historic District Ordinance addresses Demolition in the Historic District, and that the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness Permit for Demolition states that: "No demolition may occur until all permits necessary for the project, as well as licenses, zoning or land use permits, or other necessary documents or approvals have been obtained or met and the agreement set forth in Section 11-110,

Subsection 3D(2) above, has been executed by all parties.” The Board agreed to hear the presentation of the proposed parking garage by Ms. White.

Ms. White, property owner, Peter Martin, P.E. of PJ Martin Engineering, and Jim Baumgardner and Teen Vebares of Core Design Group representing 688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Martin presented the Board with maps, renderings, and drawings of the area, and discussed project plans for the proposed parking garage. Mr. Baumgardner said that the scale and appearance of the proposed three-story structure would match the brick of the Wellspan Gettysburg Hospital. He said that the pre-cast stone would replicate the Indiana limestone of the hospital building. He said that the entrances would be hidden from view from the streetscape. He noted that the third deck would not have a roof to minimize the scale and cost of the project. He said that trees and landscaping would break-up the appearance of the front façade. Mr. Martin said that the proposed structure on South Washington Street would address the parking challenges faced by the Dobbin House, and the surrounding neighborhood. He said that having one owner of three contiguous properties provides a unique opportunity to construct a parking facility. He said that relocation of the alley nearby would facilitate entering and leaving the facility. He said that the proposed project aligns with the Steinwehr Avenue Revitalization Project.

Ms. Gustafson asked Mr. Malot to present the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed Critical Project to construct a parking structure at 688, 698, 700, 712, 714 S. Washington Street was addressed in the August 21, 2019 Minutes, and read the Proposed Findings of Facts by Mr. Goble who stated that “the proposed demolition would be a permanent change to sensitive buildings that are over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, are visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structures are contributing structures to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore, any demolition approval by Borough Council per the Historic District Ordinance is required for structures located in the Gettysburg Historic District. The proposed demolition would occur to three buildings that are of poor integrity and will not last much longer.” Mr. Malot said that Ms. Gustafson then made a motion on August 21, 2019 that “the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed demolition project at 688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street for the demolition of three structures over 50 years old as presented in the application dated July 30, 2019; and that the motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.” Mr. Malot said that Staff recommended to Borough Council as entered with the August 21, 2019 minutes “for all the properties addressed by COA-19-0038 at 688-691, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street, Gettysburg that:

- *Based on the recommendations of HARB, a COA be granted for the demolition of the above referenced structures.*
- *The demolition permit be withheld until the structures are fully documented by photographs, video, drawings, and narrative provided to the Borough and reviewed by HARB.*
- *Design and location of the replacement structure shall be appropriate to the height, scale, and relations to the surrounding area.*
- *Before initiating any demolition, a detailed architectural design for the proposed replacement structure must be recommended by the HARB Board and approve by Borough Council.*

- *Before demolition of the three aforementioned structures commences, a bond shall be provided to the Borough in the amount to be stipulated by Borough Council to cover the cost of the designed replacement structure.”*

Ms. Hamm said that the Staff Recommendation to Borough Council was meant to restate what demolition means in the Borough according to the Borough Ordinance in Chapter 11. Mr. Malot said that the Board heard the proposal for the new parking garage tonight, and that they must act on that proposal, and could give preliminary approval.

After more discussion, Mr. Malot made the **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 688, 698, 700, 712, 714 S. Washington Street for the preliminary approval to build a three-story 78,400 square foot parking garage as presented in the drawings and plans before the Board, and as submitted in the application dated August 26, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Gable provided Mr. Martin with the HARB motion from their August 21, 2019 meeting that was presented and approved at their September 9, 2019 Council Business meeting as reflected in the September 9, 2019 Council Business Meeting Agenda:

COA-19-0038, 688–690, 696–698, 700–702 South Washington Street – Jacqueline White for demolition of three (3) structures subject to certain conditions, including details for the proposed replacement parking garage structure, prior to the issuance of a demolition permit; COA-19-0050, 712 South Washington Street – Jacqueline White for demolition of a structure subject to certain conditions, including details for the proposed replacement parking garage structure, prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.

Mr. Shaffer said that Borough Council issues demolition permits, and that the demolition for these properties is tied to the new construction of the parking garage as referenced in the minutes. He said that HARB has consistently tied demolition of structures in the Historic District to new construction to prevent properties from sitting empty; but it will be up to Borough Council to clarify demolition.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

- C. COA-19-0084: 59 E. High Street, Manager Charles R. Gable, Borough of Gettysburg – New Shed**
CRITICAL PROJECT: Installation of a 10’ X 12’ prefab shed on stone base on rear east side of building.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her September 18, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the applicant seeks to install a 10’ x 12’ prefab shed on a stone base on the rear east side of the building. She noted that there is a concrete pad where the building would go, according to the most recent pictures. She said that the main building appeared on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and was listed as a two-story jail structure with a 16-foot-high stone perimeter wall.

Charles R. Gable, Borough Manager, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the current Sally Port is full of unclaimed bicycles; and as a result, the Borough is in dire need of more storage space. He said that the proposed design would have a red metal roof, and a board and batten TREK wood grain siding that would complement the existing style of the Borough building. He said that the rear location would shield the shed from street visibility.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed Critical Project to install a rear accessory structure at 59 E. High Street would be a semi-permanent change, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District; and thus, is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed new outbuilding would accommodate new uses to the main building, would be located at the rear of the main property, would be of simple complementary design, and would not cause damage to other site elements consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed installation of a prefab rear shed of mixed materials at 59 E. High Street as presented in the application dated August 21, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

D. COA 19-0089: 241 Baltimore Street, Theodore and Mary Hirt – Maintenance of Siding and New Shed

MINOR PROJECT: Scrape, prep and paint wood siding and brick exterior of home including chimney. Pressure wash aluminum siding on front, right side and rear of home. Repair/replacement of any wood trim. McCormick generation exterior semi-gloss paint will be used. Placement in rear yard of prefabricated Craftsman brand garden shed – 4' 5" wide x 2' 8.5" deep x 3' 9.5" high.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her September 18, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the applicant would like to scrape, prep and paint the siding and brick exterior of home including the chimney; and pressure wash the aluminum siding in the front, right side and rear of home. She said that the structure first appeared as a two-story wood frame duplex dwelling on the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps dated 1886.

Ted Hirt, Property Owner, answered Board questions. Mr. Hirt said that there is exposure of the existing siding, and that back side faces the Court House parking lot. He said that he would like to paint the wood siding and brick and install a small Craftsman garden shed in the back of the property to accommodate his tools.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed Minor Project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 241 Baltimore Street is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed maintenance of the wood siding is replacement in kind, and the installation of a small rear garden shed is minor; and therefore could be administratively reviewed.

Mr. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Board administratively approve the proposed project at 241 Baltimore Street for the maintenance of the siding and the installation of a new rear garden shed as presented in the application dated August 26, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the following application, whereby Second Vice-Chair Ms. Gustafson assumed her role as Chair.

E. COA-19-0088: 327 Baltimore Street, Jon Muller, Shaffer Design Associates, PC – New Ramp Installation

CRITICAL PROJECT: The proposed work involves construction of a new ramp over an existing sidewalk on the north side of the existing building. The proposed wood ramp and railings would be constructed between the building and an existing 6' tall fence. The ramp would have little visibility from the public sidewalk as it will be largely screened by the guiding and fence. The ramp will basically be typical "deck" type construction of pressure treated lumber. The total ramp rise is less than 30", negating the need for a prominent guardrail. The ramp will need a 4" guard or curb on each side as well as graspable handrails. The handrails will be PVC pipe handrails and include extensions required by code.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her September 18, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this property first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. She said that the applicant is proposing the construction of a new wood ramp over the existing sidewalk on the north side of the building.

Mr. Shaffer, Agent for the Applicant answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant would like to construct a wood ramp over an existing sidewalk on the north side of the building for accessibility to the building. He said that the proposed ramp and railings would be constructed of pressure treated lumber between the building and an existing 6' tall fence.

Ms. Gustafson presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. She said that the proposed critical project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. She said that the structure at 327 Baltimore Street is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore, the proposed installation of an access ramp with railings is consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 327 Baltimore Street for the installation of a new wood access ramp with railings as presented in the application dated September 5, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative COA Approvals Since Last Meeting:

- a. **COA-19-0081: 15 Lincoln Square – OPEN MINDS**
SIGN: Temporary sandwich boards for OPEN MINDS event information - September 10, 11 & 12, 2019.
- b. **COA-19-0081: 35 Carlisle Street – OPEN MINDS**
SIGN: Temporary sandwich boards for OPEN MINDS event information – September 10, 11 & 12, 2019.
- c. **COA-19-0081: 53 E. Middle Street – OPEN MINDS**
SIGN: Temporary sandwich boards for OPEN MINDS event information – September 10, 11 & 12, 2019.
- d. **COA-19-0085: 234 W. Middle Street – Francine D’Onofrio-Stephens**
MINOR PROJECT: Repair existing fence and replace broken/loose sections with 6’ cedar privacy fence with 1 4X6 walk through gate to match.
- e. **COA-19-0082: 413 York Street – Meghna Mehta**
MINOR PROJECT: Repair leaking roof; replace black rubber in-kind; replacing gutters in a manner similar to existing gutters.
- f. **COA-19-0083: 425 Baltimore Street – Lisa Wilson**
MINOR PROJECT: Installation of approximately 80 ft of black aluminum fence 48” tall and will include three (3) gates. Fence is “Sailwind” manufactured by Coastal Aluminum.
- g. **COA-19-0087: 300 N. Stratton Street – Richard Bolinger**
MINOR PROJECT: Remove chain-link fence and replace with wooden fence. New fencing will be constructed of horizontal slats with approximately 6-inch gaps between the slats. Finished height of the fence will be less than or equal to 6 ft.

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the August 21, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **Historic Property Update**

Mr. Shaffer told the Board that the property at 323 Baltimore Street – Garlach Building is very historic, and that the HARB Board had approved the addition to the structure. He noted that the project had stalled for at least six years. He asked Board members to check on the status of the building that is viewable from the alley; and asked if what has been built signifies demolition by neglect.

C. Report of Staff – Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PMCA

HARB Business Meeting

September 18, 2019

Page 8 of 9

Ms. Hamm discussed the proposed fence / deck project at 58 W. Water Street with the Board, and that the application will be presented at the October 16, 2019 Business Meeting. Mr. Malot updated the Board on the hiring status for the Borough Planning Director. He said that a second round of candidate interviews will be held on September 27, 2019.

Other Business

Ms. Lingle said that the Historic Gettysburg-Adams County (HGAC), owner of the Grand Army of the Republic (G.A.R) Hall at 53 E. Middle Street, would like to place solid storm windows over their restored historic windows; and that they are seeking administrative approval for their project very soon.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant