



June 19, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, June 19, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA); and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Colleen Lingle; **Others in Attendance:** Michael Coldsmith, Coldsmith Roofing, Inc. and Joe Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC, both representing 208 Baltimore Street; Larry Hankey, Property Owner, Renee Dean and Chuck Phillips all representing 28 Breckenridge Street; Tom Blant and Chris Zentz of Blue Mountain Group, representing 61-71 Buford Avenue; Phil Goble, Jr. and Devon R. Goble from Hayesville, NC.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Ms. Hamm / Applicants during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, July 17, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer noted that there was one addition to the presented meeting agenda: **COA-19-0034, 451 Baltimore Street – Grace Lauver (Applicant), The Gettysburg Foundation (Owner); SIGN: Install a 4' x 8' temporary banner for the Gettysburg Foundation's "Great Conversations" event.**

Review of Minutes

Mr. McCabe made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the May 15, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 5-to-0. (Ms. Gustafson was absent).

(Enter Ms. Gustafson)

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

HARB Business Meeting

June 19, 2019

Page 1 of 5

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the next applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role of Chair.

Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review

There were no applications requiring further review at this time.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-19-0050: 147 Buford Avenue – Mike Coldsmith

CRITICAL PROJECT: Convert the single-family dwelling into a two-unit commercial transient rental property; and add a two-story addition to the rear of the building.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her June 19, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project to convert a single family dwelling into a two-unit commercial transient rental property; and add a two-story addition to the rear of the building.

Mr. Coldsmith of Coldsmith Roofing, Inc. and Mr. Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Edgar said that the owner, Mr. Coldsmith, is requesting permission to convert his single-family dwelling into two commercial transient housing rental units, and add a two-story addition to the rear of the building. He said that the applicant would also like to replace the windows of the same size in the same location; and replace the shutters, basement door, and roof with a snap-seam standing seam 1.5-inch-rib roof system. Mr. Coldsmith said that the top windows might be original, but the remaining windows and the deck railing are not original to the structure. He said that there would be an ADA access located in the rear of the building. Mr. Edgar said that the front façade would not be changed, but only painted; and that the two diamond-shaped windows closest to the road would be maintained.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 147 Buford Avenue would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed alterations, door and window replacement and new addition, represent a critical project, and that the proposed design changes are respectful of the historic features of the structure.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations and new rear addition to convert a single-family dwelling into a two-unit commercial transient retail rental property at 147 Buford Avenue: add a new rear addition, replace a door, windows, shutters and deck railing as depicted in the application dated June 4, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

(Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair; and moved item B after Item C on the Agenda due to the absence of the applicant)

C. COA-19-0049: 28 Breckenridge Street – Larry Hankey

MINOR PROJECT: May be considered for Administrative Review or Full HARB Review

Remove metal roof and replace with Endura 40-year, 29 gauge, tuff-rib metal roof; the color will be ash-grey, which is identical to the existing roof.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her June 19, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this Minor Project represents a replacement of a metal roof system with a new tuff-rib metal roof system in ash-grey colorway that is identical to the existing roof. Mr. Shaffer noted that the structure is considerably altered and is constructed of industrial corrugated metal; and that the owner would like to change it to a standing seam multi-ribbed metal roof.

Mr. Hankey, Renee Dean and Chuck Phillips all gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Hankey said that he would like to replace the existing grey tin roof with a tuff-rib metal roof system in a similar grey color, and that would match the roof system of the neighboring building. Mr. Hankey noted that the house was damaged by fire in 1957, so the original roof was lost. Mr. Phillips said that the existing metal roof has deteriorated rusted metal, and that some wood purling would need replaced to prevent further damage to the interior of the structure. Mr. Shaffer said that this type of roof system was previously approved in the Historic District, and the Board could consider this application administratively.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 28 Breckenridge Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the original structure has been considerably altered over the years, and that the roof was lost to a fire in 1957. He said that the proposed roof replacement represents a minor project, and that the proposed multi-ribbed metal roof system was previously approved in the Historic District, is respectful of the historic features of the structure, and could be approved administratively by the Board.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board approve administratively the proposed multi-ribbed metal roof replacement in a similar colorway at 28 Breckenridge Street as depicted in the application dated May 24, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0. Ms. Hamm said that a Borough Land Use and Non-UCC building applications would be required prior to replacing the roof.

B. COA-19-0039: 135 York Street – Inch's Properties, LLC (resubmittal)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include removal of vinyl siding on main building, replace in white horizontal hardi board siding; repair and paint existing front porch posts; install new antique shutters on front of house – install louvered shutters on second floor; repair and paint original windows as needed; apply lime whitewash on brick on addition at left (east).

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the project at 135 York Street by Inch's Properties, LLC be cancelled due to the absence of representation for the application. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 6-to-0.

Discussion: 61-71 Buford Avenue

Mr. Tom Blant and Mr. Chris Zentz from the Blue Mountain Group appeared before the Board to receive their feedback on design concepts for their project at 61-71 Buford Avenue relative to the requirements of the Historic District ordinance.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative COA Approvals Since Last Meeting:

- **COA-19-0034: 451 Baltimore Street – Grace Lauver-Applicant, The Gettysburg Foundation-Owner (Last Minute Addition to Agenda)**
SIGN: Install a 4' x 8' temporary banner for the Gettysburg Foundation's "Great Conversations" event to be held on Saturday June 29, 2019 from 9AM-5PM.
- **COA-19-0040: 218 Chambersburg Street – Margaret King**
MAJOR PROJECT: Install a 130 linear foot, 6'-high privacy fence with 8'-wide double-drive gate for access to West Zerfing Alley to be located in back yard with limited visibility from the public way via Chambersburg Street.
- **COA-19-0041: 19 York Street – Gettysburg Moose, LLC (Owner), The Upper Crust, LLC (Applicant)**
SIGN: Erect a 78" x 2.5" double-sided projecting sign with bracket to be mounted on west elevation; indirect illumination via LED lighting cast from behind; business name on sign: The Upper Crust Fine Food & Beverage.
- **COA-19-0042: 244 Steinwehr Avenue – Michael Kaminkow**
SIGN: Install three window cling vinyl business signs: (1) 11.4 sf., (2) 22.4 sf., (3) 4.8 sf.
- **COA-19-0043: 108 North Stratton Street – Adams County Industrial Development Authority**
SIGN: Install a 10' x 2.5' temporary vinyl razor banner for the Adams County Farmers Market from May 18, 2019 through October 26, 2019.
- **COA-19-0044: 103 Carlisle Street – Adams County Industrial Development Authority**
SIGN: Install a 3' x 12' temporary vinyl banner and a 10' x 2.5' temporary vinyl razor banner for the Adams County Farmers Market from May 18, 2019 through October 26, 2019.
- **COA-19-0045: 19 Lincoln Square – Mazza Vineyards, Inc.**
SIGN: Erect three business signs for Mazza Vineyards, Inc. with the logo of Mount Hope Winery & Gift Shop to include one 10 sf. wall sign, one 14sf. cling storefront sign, and one 6 sf. portable sign.
- **COA-19-0046: 53 E. Middle Street – Historic Gettysburg Adams County Inc.**
SIGN: Install an 8' x 3' temporary vinyl event banner for the "Barn Art Show" located on the north façade visible from E. Middle Street from May 24, 2019 through June 9, 2019.

- **COA-19-0047: 226 Steinwehr Avenue – David Donley**
SIGN: Replace existing 18 sf. double-sided business sign with new business name / logo; install a 6 sf. A-Frame sidewalk sign; install a 12 sf. pole sign.
- **COA-19-0048: 129 N. Stratton Street – Lynn Barrett**
MAJOR PROJECT: Remove and replace existing siding, trim, and shutters.

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the May 15, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **Board Recognition of Service to HARB.**

Mr. Shaffer discussed with the Board building demolition vs. new construction in the Historic District, and how it relates to the character of a neighborhood. He also announced the donation gift of two properties owned by Wellspan Gettysburg Hospital to Adams County Habitat for Humanity on S. Washington Street (428/430/432 S, Washington Street). He instructed staff to obtain more historical information on those properties.

C. Report of Staff – Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PMCA

Ms. Hamm discussed with the Board the proposed demolition process for a Historic District structure owned by Ms. Jacqueline White at 712 S. Washington Street that is also under consideration for the proposed future site for the new parking garage. Mr. Shaffer noted that this particular building is constructed of cinder block covered by wood siding, and has the least historic value relative to the three other buildings (688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street) approved for demolition by Council on December 12, 2011 (see #4 from the attached letter stating the intent for the replacement in-kind for those three structures from then Planning Director Dellett to Ms. White dated December 14, 2011). Mr. Malot suggested that the applicant articulate through a design professional the reason we should deviate from the letter and include the 712 S. Washington Street lot for demolition.

Mr. Shaffer expressed his appreciation for all of the hard work by staff and PMCA to prepare for this meeting in the absence of a Director of Planning and Historic Preservation.

Other Business

There was no other businesses presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Shaffer. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant

HARB Business Meeting

June 19, 2019