



May 15, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, May 15, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Others in Attendance:** James Gardner and Ron Hankey of the Gettysburg Presbyterian Church, Jason Haney and Alam Barrera of Alam B. Roofing and Home Improvement LLC, and Joe Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC all representing 208 Baltimore Street, Gettysburg Presbyterian Church; Peter Martin of PJ Martin Engineering, Attorneys Robert E. Campbell and Samuel E. Wiser of Salzmans Hughes PC, and Property Owner Jacqueline White all representing the following properties: 688-690, 696-698, and 700-702 South Washington Street; Jon Knepper of Inch & Company Construction, **Special Board Presentation (prior to meeting):** Tim Palkovitz of HPG Windows and Doors, and Bill Smith of Lincoln Windows, HARB Board presenters representing the 600 Window Series on Lincoln Windows; **Historic Preservation Award Recipients:** Stephanie McIlwee, of Adams County Housing Authority representing 54 E. Stevens Street; Andrea Proulx of the Gettysburg Hotel, representing 6 York Street, Starbucks; Michael McCloskey of the Regimental Quartermaster, representing 49 Steinwehr Avenue; Charlie Bender, Property Owner, representing 1 Baltimore Street; Paul Witt, Owner of the Quality Inn Gettysburg Battlefield, representing 380 Steinwehr Avenue, Quality Inn Gettysburg Battlefield; Dave and Lynn Petters of the Blue & Gray Bar & Grill, representing 2 Baltimore Street; Max Felty of Felty Investments LP, representing 778 Baltimore Street, Gettysburg Tours Inc.; Giovanni Cucuzza, Owner, representing 412 York Street, La Bella Italia; Rebecca Brown, Property Owner, and Ruth Brown representing 783-785 Baltimore Street, Civil War Tails at the Homestead Diorama Museum; John Michael Buchheister, Owner of 250 Baltimore Street, The Maryland Sutler, Daniel and Elizabeth Fetter, Property Owners representing 142 E. Middle Street; and Jay Mackie of Twin Bridges Farm LLC, representing 15 Lincoln Square, Open Minds; **Other Adams County and Gettysburg Borough Representatives:** Tammy Myers of Gettysburg Heritage Center at 297 Steinwehr Avenue; Wade Leedy, Owner of Tommys Pizza at 105 Steinwehr Avenue and Fourscore Beer at 603 S. Washington Street; Lynda Taylor, Resident of 149 W. Lincoln Avenue; Borough Councilor and Resident Susan Naugle; Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*; and James filming for Adams County Television (ACTV).

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the

HARB Business Meeting

May 15, 2019

Page 1 of 7

meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 10, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer noted that there were no additions or corrections to the presented meeting agenda.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the April 17, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 7-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

- **Paul Witt, of the Quality Inn Gettysburg Battlefield at 380 Steinwehr Avenue**, commented that having a parking garage in the 600 block of South Washington Street was a terrific idea to address parking in that area of town.
- **Max Felty, of the Felty Investments LP representing 778 Baltimore Street**, commented and praised Jackie White's vision for a parking garage on S. Washington Street, and how it would benefit that section of town.
- **Mike McCloskey of the Regimental Quartermaster at 49 Steinwehr Avenue**, said that he was completely in favor of a parking garage that would benefit the local economy.
- **Tammy Myers of the Gettysburg Heritage Center at 297 Steinwehr Avenue**, said that a parking garage in the south end of town would get business patrons parked easier.
- **Wade Leedy, owner of both Tommys Pizza at 105 Steinwehr Avenue and Fourscore Beer at 603 S. Washington Street**, said that a parking garage in that area is a great asset to the community.
- **Steve Vorhees of Washington Street** said that he preferred a parking lot over a parking structure that resembled something out of a city.
- **Brenda McCabe, employed by the Dobbin House Tavern at 89 Steinwehr Avenue**, favors a parking garage in that area of town where parking is scarce for employees of those business.

Mr. Shaffer expressed an appreciation for all of the public comments, and that Ms. White and the Borough are carefully looking at this project.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the next two applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role of Chair.

Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review

There were no applications requiring further review at this time.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-19-0037: 208 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Presbyterian Church / Alam B Roofing as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove existing deteriorated historic slate shingles from "Pencil Steeple" turret roof on a sensitive building; replace with EcoStar rubber slate shingles in similar configuration.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her May 15, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project to remove the shingle from the Queen Anne-style turret roof of the church steeple and replace with rubber slate shingles that would be fixed with mechanical fasteners.

Mr. Hankey of the Gettysburg Presbyterian Church, Mr. Edgar of Shaffer Design Associates PC, and Mr. Haney and Mr. Barrera of Alam B. Roofing and Home Improvement LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Hankey said that the Presbyterian Church is requesting permission to remove all slate shingles from the Church “pencil steeple” turret roof and replace it with new EcoStar slate tile rubber shingles; and that this material would reduce costs to the Church from approximately \$30,000 for slate shingles to approximately \$7,000 for the EcoStar shingles. He noted that the remainder of the building is shingled in with asphalt shingles. Mr. Haney said that the will match the “fishtail” design with chisel point rubber slate, replicating the existing design. He said that the finial is made out of copper, and would replace it with copper if needed. Mrs. LaBarre noted that both 38 E. Middle Street and 105 E. Middle Street used this material to replace their roof systems.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 208 Baltimore Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the “Pencil Steeple” turret roof shingles represent a critical project, and that the design of these particular shingles are a defining roof feature.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the deteriorated historic slate shingles from the “Pencil Steeple” turret roof with EcoStar rubber slate shingles in a similar design configuration depicted in the application dated April 25, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

B. COA-19-0038: 688-690, 696-698, & 700-702 S. Washington Street – Jacqueline D. White / PJ Martin Engineering & Core Design Group as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: New three-story, 78,400 sf open parking deck to be constructed on site of

several existing residential dwellings granted conditional demolition approval on December 12, 2011. Exterior finishes are brick veneer, pre-cast concrete heads, keystones, sills and accents, pre-finished aluminum exterior doors and curtain wall systems, and a painted steel covered entrance with standing seam metal roof. The interior spaces include a vestibule, elevator, two stair towners, electrical room, and parking for 192 vehicles.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her May 15, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this Critical Project represents a new construction that are outlined in the *Gettysburg Design Guide*. She said that the proposed structure should blend in with the surrounding neighborhood and be respectful of Historic District elements; and that the Board should only be interested with the outside façade in that regard.

Peter Martin of PJ Martin Engineering, Attorneys Robert E. Campbell and Samuel E. Wiser of Salzmans Hughes PC, and Property Owner Jacqueline White all represent the proposed parking structure, and gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions.

Ms. White, property owner, said that she had asked the Board 42 years ago to turn the Dobbin House into a tavern; and that she is looking to create a structure with this project that would be revered and needed by all. She said that the Steinwehr Avenue Bid obtained funding to do a Revitalization Guide that was produced in 2009 and endorsed by Gettysburg Borough. She said that parking was addressed in that guide both as “flat street” and as a “parking facility”, to alleviate parking challenges on that end of town. She said that the proposed parking structure would address those needs, and that she is 100 percent committed to this project.

Mr. Martin, a Civil Engineer for PJ Martin Engineering, said that this proposed structure is an amazing opportunity to build a parking facility in a positive area for parking. He said that there are three properties on three adjoining parcels, and a fourth building all owned by Ms. White that are located within the redevelopment radius of Steinwehr Avenue where parking is needed. He said that this radius would also include Gettysburg Hospital, and would resolve many parking issues in that neighborhood. He said that both Court Alley and Dobbin Alley would be reconfigured in the proposed plans, and that a 24-foot wide street would be constructed to accommodate safe access to the structure.

Mr. Wiser, an attorney for Salzmans Hughes PC, said that this proposed project would be a continuation of the relationship between the Borough of Gettysburg and the Steinwehr Avenue Partnership. He said that this plan calls for innovative parking strategies, and that this site offers a strategic location to address many parking challenges faced by both the Steinwehr Avenue Bid and Gettysburg Hospital.

Mrs. LaBarre said that conditional approval was given for the demolition of the three structures on the adjoining parcels owned by Ms. White, and to have new structures built in their place. She said that the zoning for these parcels is already commercial; and that the change in project scope would aesthetically fit into the Historic District landscape. She reminded the Board that the scope would only include the proposed outside façade. Mr. Goble said that although a demolition request was previously approved for three of the buildings, the fourth building (now currently Ms. White’s office) would require demolition review. Ms. White said that she is currently seeking grant funding for parts

of the project. Mrs. LaBarre said that careful planning could be respectful of the Historic District; but said that cars should be screened from public view in their proposed design because of the proximity of the proposed structure to the build-to line; and perhaps eliminate the keystone design in the windows. She did say that the proposed design is sensitive to the Historic District and to the adjoining neighborhoods.

Ms. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend to table the application in order for the applicant to review Board input. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Malot said that a PMCA Residential Building permit would be required for the framing-out of windows if the addition would be used as a sleeping area.

(Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair)

C. COA-19-0039: 135 York Street – Inch’s Properties, LLC

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include removal of vinyl siding on main building, replace in vertical board-and-baton style cement board; wrap existing front porch post in old wood; install black windows in front of house; whitewash brick on addition at left (east); install board-and-baton style shutters in natural wood finish.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her May 15, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project to change the vinyl siding to board-and-baton style cement board, and cautioned that the proposed materials for this project are not found in the Design Guidelines: board-and-baton shutters.

Mr. John Nepper, manager for Inches Properties, and acting the owner’s agent, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Gustafson noted that existing brick should not be painted to allow the surface to breathe, and that the proposed shutters and the wrapped posts were not respectful to the Historic District property; nor were they consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. The Board discussed the overall project scope with the applicant, and how to propose a project that would meet the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*, discussing the placement of both the windows and the siding, white washing the brick, and the overall use of board-and-baton design elements. Mr. Shaffer suggested that the applicant withdraw and resubmit his application to address the Boards concerns.

Mr. Nepper **withdrew the application** and stated that he would resubmit at a later time.

Historical Architecture Review Board (HARB) 2018 Award Presentations

Mrs. LaBarre said that May is Historic Preservation Month, and introduced through a power point the 2019 Gettysburg Borough Historic Preservation Awards Presentation. She said that Historic Preservation is about managing change by respecting our past, but growing with our historic properties into the future. She said that the Historic District in the Borough of Gettysburg was established by ordinance on

May 8, 1972 and those boundaries were expanded in 1999 to include a total of 965 parcels out of the Borough's 1942 lots. She said that HARB is a recommending Board to Borough Council who grants Certificates of Appropriateness for improvement projects to properties located within the Borough's Historic District. She said that tonight's recipients would be honored for their projects in six categories: Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration, Stabilization, New Commercial Construction, and New Residential Construction. She noted that Board Members would introduce and present those recipients with their awards.

Planning Director Becky LaBarre, HARB Chairman Gary Shaffer, and HARB Members presented the following awards for: **PRESERVATION: Certificate of Exceptional Merit** – 142 E. Middle Street, Daniel and Elizabeth Fetter. **REHABILITATION: Certificate of Exceptional Merit** – 11-13 Baltimore Street, Roger Lund; 142 E. Middle Street, Daniel and Elizabeth Fetter; **Certificate of Merit** – 2-8 Baltimore Street, David and Lynn Petters; 15 Lincoln Square, Jay Mackie and Monica Oss, Open Minds; 6 York Street, Gettysburg Hotel Investors, Starbucks; 412 York Street, Giovanni Cucuzza, La Bella Italia. **Honorable Mention** – 778 Baltimore Street, Max Felty, Gettysburg Tour Center; 119 E. Middle Street, Edward and Penelope Zigler; 54 E. Stevens Street, Adams County Housing Authority. **RESTORATION: Certificate of Merit**: 343 Carlisle Street, Phi Sigma Kappa Fraternity. **Honorable Mention** – 783-785 Baltimore Street, Rebecca Brown, Owner and her sister, Ruth Brown; 165-167 N. Stratton Street, Andrew and Joanna Young; 26 York Street, Linda Atiyeh, Gallery 30. **STABILIZATION: Certificate of Merit** – 218 Carlisle Street, Gettysburg College. **Honorable Mention** – 1 Baltimore Street, Charlie Bender. **NEW COMMERCIAL CONSTRUCTION: Honorable Mention** – 49 Steinwehr Avenue, Susan Saum-Wicklein; 297 Steinwehr Avenue, FutureStake; 380 Steinwehr Avenue, Paul Witt, Nate and Laura Mares. **NEW RESIDENTIAL CONSTRUCTION: Certificate of Merit** – 38 W. Middle Street, Harry Stokes and Lisa Portmess. **Honorable Mention** – 250 Baltimore Street, John Buchheister.

Mr. Shaffer thanked Borough Council President, Susan Naugle, who will retire at the end of this year for supporting HARB with great energy and commitment over the years. He thanked Mrs. LaBarre for orchestrating a great 2019 Preservation Awards presentation.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-19-0033: 312 N. Stratton Street – Ross G. Miller & Chloe B. Ruff**
MINOR PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to existing gutter system on a sensitive building at front corner, addition, and back of house, install flashing and guards.
- **COA-19-0034: 451 Baltimore Street – Friends of the National Parks at Gettysburg, Inc.**
MINOR PROJECT: Installation of a 40' x 40' temporary commercial event tent for "Great Conversations" lecture series to be held on Saturday June 29, 2019 from 9AM-5PM; tent to accommodate approximately 200 people.
- **COA-19-0035: 14 Lincoln Square – House of Bender, LLC & Twin Bridges Farms, LLC (Open Minds)**
SIGN: Resurfacing of existing 18.62sf wall sign for new design "14 Lincoln on the Square", black lettering on white background; identifier for café space currently used by Open Minds as employee break area.

B. Report of Chair – *Gary Shaffer, AIA*

- **Board Recognition of Service to HARB.**

Mr. Shaffer announced to the Board that Planning Director LaBarre had taken the position of Executive Director of Renfrew Museum and Park in Waynesboro, PA. He thanked her for her dedication to Historic Preservation in the Borough of Gettysburg, and for her support to the HARB Board during her tenure as director; and expressed that she would sorely missed.

C. Report of Staff – *Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation*

Mrs. LaBarre thanked the Board, staff and all Historic District property owners for their support, stewardship, and growth during her tenure; and expressed hope that community support would continue for historic preservation in Gettysburg.

Other Business

There was no other businesses presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:00 PM.

(HARB Preservation 2019 Historic Preservation Awards Punch and Dessert Reception followed meeting)

Respectfully submitted,
Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant