



**April 17, 2019**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, April 17, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Colleen Lingle (will arrive late due to a previously scheduled real estate settlement), and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Others in Attendance:** Steve Kemper and Brian Dudley of York Home Depot, Owner's Agent for Martin Bagley, representing 48 South Street; and Jordan Chiaruttini, Property Owner, representing 211 S. Washington Street.

**Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, May 13, 2019.

**Review of Agenda**

Mr. Shaffer noted that there were no additions or corrections to the presented meeting agenda.

**Review of Minutes**

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the March 20, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe, and carried 6-to-0.

**Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

**Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

HARB Business Meeting

April 17, 2019

Page 1 of 6

### **Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review**

There were no applications requiring further review at this time.

### **New Business: Applications for Review**

#### **A. COA-19-0025: 48 South Street – Martin Bagley / Tim Riley as Owner’s Agent**

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove five (5) existing wood one-over-one wood windows on a sensitive building at third story only: two (2) on dormer on primary façade, two (2) on east façade, and one (1) on rear elevation; install new one-over-one Simonton 6100 Series DH replacement windows in existing openings.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her April 17, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project to replace / install five Simonton 6100 Series Double Hung (DH) one-over-one replacement windows in existing openings on the top (3<sup>rd</sup>) floor front façade and both sides of the house. She said that the windows may be original, and noted that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* does not consider one-over-one window configurations as an influential characteristic, but the Board has considered them in the past. She said that the owner intends to use the third floor as a game room, and would like to retain the second and third-story windows. Ms. Lingle said that the Adams County tax records indicated the property is circa 1870.

*(Enter Board Member Colleen Lingle)*

Mr. Kemper and Mr. Dudley of York Home Depot acting as agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Kemper said that there is a 2-3 foot space between buildings and that the windows are not visible from the public view-way. Mr. Goble noted that the side windows are visible from the street. Mr. Kemper said that the current windows are wood; but the proposed windows are Fibrex, a 40-percent wood to 60-percent vinyl material. He said that the window frame allows the window screen to move vertically, and would give the window historic shadow lines. He said that the proposed windows are totally vinyl clad wood, and would custom fit into the existing window openings. He said that the proposed windows would provide easy operation, maintenance, and emergency egress for the owners. He noted that there was peeling paint, but could not attest to further window deterioration. He said that the 400 Anderson Series would have vinyl clad frames and Fibrex sills. Mr. Shaffer noted that the Board had allowed past applicants to install vinyl windows on side façades. Ms. Gustafson said that she would consider the use of vinyl clad windows if they “popped out” for escape / safety reasons. Mr. Malot said that window openings must be 5.7 sf to meet fire code.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed amended project at 48 South Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the windows, assumed to be original to the property that are located on the rear and side facades, have limited visibility by the public; but the dormers are very visible on the primary façade. He noted that the closer examination of a better photograph of the property reveals historic brackets that dates the windows to pre-1900s.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the one side window and the rear façade window with the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 19, 2019; but rehabilitate the two front dormers and the one side window closest to the front on the east elevation. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The Board further discussed the motion, and agreed that the side windows should be of the same configuration. Ms. Lingle withdrew her second, and Mr. Goble reframed his motion.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the two east-side windows and the rear façade window with the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 19, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 7-to-0.

The Board discussed the two dormer windows on the front façade with the applicant; and Mrs. LaBarre informed the owner's agent the procedure to resubmit an application for the May 15, 2019 HARB Business Meeting for the two front windows, and to show evidence of their deterioration.

**B. COA-19-0026: 211 S. Washington St – Jordan Chiaruttini**

MAJOR PROJECT/FENCE: Alterations to a c. 1980s non-sensitive addition located on southern elevation of a sensitive building; remove existing storm windows and reframe openings to 53" h x 36" w, reducing total number of windows from ten (10) to six (6), install one-over-one double hung vinyl replacement windows; remove existing wood siding and replace with smooth vinyl siding; remove existing picket wood fencing at southern property line, replace with new white 4' high vinyl open picket style fencing to build-to line (10' back) then 6' high privacy fence down remainder of southern property line; remove existing wood privacy fence at eastern property line and replace with 4' high open picket style fencing extending to northern boundary.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her April 17, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this Major Project / Fence with alterations to a sensitive circa 1865 historic building at 211 S. Washington Street on the circa 1980s "side unit" addition located on the south to include reducing the number of windows from ten to six, replace the existing siding, and replace the existing wood fencing with vinyl fencing.

Mr. Chiaruttini, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Chiaruttini said that he would like to renovate the second "side unit" currently in disrepair, which was converted from a patio at some point in the 1980s. He noted that the proposed work is for this side unit only, and no changes would be made to the main building. He said that he would like to reduce the number of windows from ten to six, leaving the two front windows visible from the street; and reduce the windows on the side unit to four windows. He said that the proposed windows are double hung 36" x 53" high efficiency vinyl, and would replace the current storm windows of varying sizes. He said that non-grained siding would be installed after the window replacement. He said that he would like to replace the dilapidated wood fencing with a 4-foot white vinyl open picket fence along the front and on the sides 10 feet back from the front of the property; and a 6-foot privacy fence from 10 feet to the back of the property in order to shield it from the neighboring properties which are in a state of disrepair.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 211 S. Washington Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, but the current addition is not sensitive by age. He said that the proposed project is viewable from the public view way and constitutes a permanent change to the structure, and is located in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations to the side unit that would include the reduction of ten windows to six one-over-one double-hung vinyl windows; replace siding with non-grain siding; and replace the existing wood fence with a 4-foot white vinyl open picket and 6-foot white vinyl privacy fence as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 26, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 7-to-0.

Mr. Malot said that a PMCA Residential Building permit would be required for the framing-out of windows if the addition would be used as a sleeping area.

## **Reports**

### **A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting**

- **COA-19-0048: 34 York Street – White Orchid Enterprise**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/ REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove deteriorated replacement windows located in dormer, replace with new Marvin wood windows in existing openings.
- **COA-19-0020: 395 Buford Avenue – Randolph N. & Phyllis A, Smith**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/ REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove existing shingles on porch roof only, replace with GAF Timberline HD 30-year shingles in "Pewter" colorway with all required synthetic underlayments, flashings, edges/drips, vents, ice/water shield, etc.
- **COA-19-0022: 19 York Street – Gettysburg Moose, LLC**  
SIGN: Install 50sf wall sign of solid opaque metal channel letters "THE UPPER CRUST" with indirect LED light casting from behind signage onto the building façade. Signage has a semi-gloss finish and is grey-brown (RAL #8019) in color and will be centered over the three garage doors.
- **COA-19-0023: 48 Baltimore Street – A Jay Kay Associates / J & P Winery, LLC**  
SIGN: New vinyl cling logo business sign on primary elevation
- **COA-19-0024: 206 S. Stratton Street – Glenn G. & Holly B. Riley**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Installation of new GAF Timberline HD architectural shingle system in "Weathered Wood" colorway over existing shingle roof with all required synthetic underlayment, drips/edges, vents, flashings, etc.
- **COA-19-0027: 23 Baltimore Street – Times Square, LLC / Michael Cantor**  
SIGN: 6 SF (2' x 3') portable business sign for "Cantori's Theater of Magic"
- **COA-19-0028: 76 Steinwehr Avenue – Borough of Gettysburg / Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc. Business Improvement District (BID)**  
SIGN: Install custom vinyl wrap on municipal electrical box in public right-of-way with way-finding map of Steinwehr Ave; to be maintained by Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc.

- **COA-19-0029: 205 Steinwehr Avenue – Borough of Gettysburg / Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc. Business Improvement District (BID)**  
SIGN: Install custom vinyl wrap on municipal electrical box in public right-of-way with way-finding map of Steinwehr Ave; to be maintained by Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc.
- **COA-19-0030: 297 Steinwehr Avenue – Borough of Gettysburg / Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc. Business Improvement District (BID)**  
SIGN: Install custom vinyl wrap on municipal electrical box in public right-of-way with way-finding map of Steinwehr Ave; to be maintained by Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc.
- **COA-19-0031: 539 Steinwehr Avenue – Borough of Gettysburg / Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc. Business Improvement District (BID)**  
SIGN: Install custom vinyl wrap on municipal electrical box in public right-of-way with way-finding map of Steinwehr Ave; to be maintained by Steinwehr Avenue Heart of Gettysburg Battlefield, Inc.
- **COA-19-0032: 20 & 20-1/2 N. Reynolds Street – Susan Delgado**  
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Remove deteriorated porch flooring, replace w/ painted southern yellow pine tongue and groove; minor repairs to framing as needed

**B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

- **APPLICATION WITHDRAWN: 150' Communications Towner proposed by AT&T at 35 N. Stratton Street; Zoning Hearing scheduled for Wednesday April 10, 2019 at 7:00pm in Council Chambers has been canceled.**

Ms. LaBarre announced to the Board that AT&T withdrew their application for the 150-foot-tall cell tower proposed for the northeast corner of the Gettysburg Fire Department property in the GC General Commercial zoning district. The Board discussed the withdrawal, and said that the communication industry needs to communicate better with the Borough, seeking better placement alternatives.

- **Recommendations to Planning Commission regarding Sidewalk Ordinance revisions as they relate to Historic District streetscapes; advocate for revolving loan funds for historic homeowners along with sidewalk repair when Borough Council begins to Revolving Loan Program up for consideration.**

The Board discussed the current revision of the Sidewalk Ordinance, and how those revisions would impact the Historic District. Ms. LaBarre said that the Board could comment on the value of the vegetative strips, and to provide their comments directly to the Planning Commission. She noted that any new sidewalks would change to the proposed new standards per the revised ordinance. Mr. Shaffer said that the Board should advocate for revolving loan funds for Historic District property owners relative to the Historic District streetscape.

- **Final Review of 2018 Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Projects eligible for 2019 Historic Preservation Awards**

Mr. Shaffer reviewed with the Board all final projects for the 2019 Historic District Awards slated for the May 15, 2019 HARB Meeting.

- **May 15, 2019 – 600 Window Series Presentation on Lincoln Windows**

Mr. Shaffer said that more information is forthcoming through notices and next month's meeting agenda

#### **C. Report of Staff – *Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation***

Mrs. LaBarre reminded the Board about the following **2019 "SAVE THE DATE" HARB Happenings:**

- **Saturday May 4, 2019 from 9:15am-4:45pm:** FREE Historic Preservation Seminar presented by Adams County Library System and Gettysburg Borough Department of Planning Zoning and Historic Preservation at Gettysburg Branch, 140 Baltimore Street; eligible for CLG training hours
- **Monday May 6, 2019 5:30-9PM:** HGAC Annual Awards Banquet to be held at the United Lutheran Seminary Refractory
- **Wednesday May 15, 2019 at 7:00pm:** Annual Borough of Gettysburg Historic Preservation Awards will take place at the regularly scheduled HARB meeting, punch and dessert reception to follow.
- **June 19-21:** PA Statewide Conference on Heritage, Wilson College, Chambersburg

#### **Other Business**

There was no other businesses presented before the Board.

#### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,  
Karen M. Mesher  
Borough Management Assistant