



March 20, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Garry Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, March 20, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board members:** Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Peggy Gustafson, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Vice-Chair Phil Goble. **Others in Attendance:** Ed Steinour, Jr. of Ed Steinour Jr Building and Remodeling, Owner's Agent for Philip Letendre, representing 39 E. Water Street; Eric Jarvinen of JAIA, Owner's Agents for Susan Saum-Wicklein, representing both 50 Mayer Alley and 55 Steinwehr Avenue; Brandon Staub of 1863 Escape representing 344 Baltimore Street; Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PA Municipal Code Alliance; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, April 8, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer noted that 39 E. Water Street, represented by Edward Steinour, Jr. acting as Owner's Agent, would be added to the agenda as Item B under Old Business; and Mrs. LaBarre noted that Item B under New Business was revised as indicated on tonight's Revised Agenda without objection from the Board.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the February 27, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the first applicant, whereby Second Vice-Chair Ms. Gustafson assumed the role of Chair.

A. COA-19-0119: 344 Baltimore Street – Gettysburg Anniversary Committee / 1863 Escape
AMENDMENT REQUEST TO PREVIOUSLY APPROVED COA: Property is being sold; future owner requests slight modifications to design granted a COA by Borough Council on January 14, 2019 to include:

- Ramp will be less angled and up to 6'-0" longer; construction and look to be the same
- First floor enclosed side porch will be rehabilitated as an open porch
 - Porch floor will be raised 6" to provide accessible entrance
 - Guardrail; will be restored to match second floor railing (may be higher to meet IBC Code requirements)

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her March 20, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is an amendment to a Critical Project from a previously approved COA at 344 Baltimore Street. She said that the property's future owner is requesting slight design modifications that would include a new rear access ramp that is six foot longer, alterations to the existing enclosed porch, and new rear door that is more in line with the new purpose of the building.

Mr. Shaffer, Principal of Shaffer Design Associates PC acting as agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer explained that the owner wishes to modify the rehabilitation of the rear porch slightly from the original COA dated January 14, 2019; and to replicate the railing on the upper floor. He said that the porch would be used as a landing to provide an accessible entrance with an ADA compliant wood ramp that will be connected to the front of the property by a cement walkway. The revised ramp is less angled than previously presented and will have a railing that will match the second floor porch railings. He said that there will be an extension of brick pavers to the rear parking area from the rear porch.

Ms. Gustafson, HARB Second Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. She said that the proposed amended project at 344 Baltimore Street was previously granted a COA by Borough Council at its January 14, 2019 Business Meeting. She said the proposed alterations would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. She said that the current application, due to pending new ownership, requests a modification of the rear ramp in length and slope, and that the proposed design will meet and accommodate the use of the side

porch entry. She said that the change to the rear façade will be ADA compliant, restore the use of a historic porch entrance that will provide a visibly enhanced approach.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed amended request to the previously approved COA dated January 14, 2019 as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the new application dated March 14, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

B. COA-19-0004: 39 E. Water Street – Philip Letendre / Ed Steinour, Jr. as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove fourteen (14) existing single pane one-over-one double-hung wood windows and aluminum storms on the side and rear façades on a sensitive building, and install new Simonton Reflections 5050 Series dual pane one-over-one double-hung vinyl replacement windows in existing openings; rehabilitate four (4) historic wood windows on front façade.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her March 20, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this Critical Project with alterations to a sensitive building at 39 E. Water Street was previously heard by the Board at their February 27, 2019 Business Meeting and withdrawn by the applicant’s agent on behalf of the owner pending more information and window samples. She explained that Mr. Edward Steinour, agent for the owner, was present with a new application and the requested window sample. Mr. Shaffer noted that the applicant will present regarding the following façade windows: four on the front, four on the right side, and five on the left side.

Mr. Steinour, contractor and agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Steinour said that he would like to replace the proposed windows with Simonton 5050 Series Reflections Double-Hung white windows and provided the Board with a window sample. He said that he would replace the sashes in all of the double-hung windows, and that these windows are made to fit the existing openings, and that all windows will have existing storms. He said that the proposed windows will not have any faux grills/decorative dividers, will tilt-in for easy maintenance, and would be energy efficient. He said that the current windows are inoperable, the broken cords, and that a few are painted shut. He noted that approximately 6-7 windows face away from the street that may include a few side windows. He said that he could rehabilitate the front façade windows by replacing the sashes, and cords; and that all windows have existing storms. Mr. Shaffer noted that replacement windows do have different shadow lines and are sharper than the original wood windows; and asked about removing the weights and rehabilitating the cavities. Mr. Steinour said that he would cut the sash cords, remove the weights, infill the cavities to prevent energy loss, and finally replace the stop strips after the windows are inserted.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 39 E. Water Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, is viewable from the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed window renovation project includes the

replacement of original one-over-one windows, which are typically not considered a key architectural design element which would change the windows' overall appearance.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations that would include the replacement of one-over-one windows on the side and rear facades with Simonton Reflections Double Hung 5050 Series white windows, but rehabilitate the front four windows, as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the revised application dated March 20, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-19-0017: 50 Mayor Alley (formerly known as 50 South Street Rear) – Susan Saum-Wicklein / Eric Jarvinen as Owner's Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Rehabilitation of a sensitive industrial building for conversion to a museum and learning center that will include a new storefront entrance, egress doors, wood stoop for egress, concrete curb for sidewalk, gutters and downspouts to replace existing, replace fascia and rake trim, limited new brick infill, replace door with window, and paint exterior wood, existing windows, and trim.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her March 20, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive industrial building at 50 Mayer Alley that is over 50 years old, visible from the public view way from the alley, and is representative of 20th Century industrial architecture from the manufacturing era. She further noted that this property has recently been re-classified and is now located in the RO Residential Office zoning district. She said this is a creative repurposing of a building that will be converted into a museum and learning center, which is a great example of adaptive reuse for this "workhorse building that is getting a new lease on life". She said that the applicant has a repository of historic weaponry that she would like to share with the public via museum exhibitions, related programming, and as a repository for further research.

Mr. Eric Jarvinen, architect and agent for the property owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Jarvinen said that the owner would like to add asymmetric doors with a total opening measuring 7-feet which would accommodate large artillery artifacts and display pieces. A 4-foot wide panel would remain stationery much of the time and the 3-foot wide door would provide for regular ADA access. He mentioned that a new roof has recently been installed under an administratively approved COA. Work under this proposal includes infill of door and window openings with brick, replacement of downspouts and gutters; painting all existing wood trim and sashes on the front façade; installing a new concrete curb and access door on the right facade; replace existing door, existing stoop with ADA compliant access stoop on the rear (south) façade; and replace existing fascia trim, existing access roof on left-side façade. He said that all trim, siding, window sashes and fascia would be painted in a neutral color to match the brick; and all gutters will be replaced. He said that he would be sensitive to the stormwater drainage areas, and that all impervious areas would be maintained with no increase in net coverage. He noted that all rear-entry doors and stoops would be ADA compliant as well as the door on the left façade (main ADA entrance). He said that a level landing on the inside of the main entrance will also be constructed.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 50 Mayer Alley (formerly known as 50 South Street Rear) would be a permanent change to a sensitive industrial building that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed rehabilitation is respectful of the existing structure and surroundings, and is a creative example of adaptive reuse.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed rehabilitation at 50 Mayer Alley (formerly known as 50 South Street Rear) located in the RO Residential Office zoning district as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated March 8, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0.

B. COA-19-0018: 55 Steinwehr Avenue (formerly known as 61 Steinwehr Avenue Rear) – Susan Saum-Wicklein / Eric Jarvinen as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive industrial building to include replacement of flat roof, front porch, windows, and exterior wood trim; install new doors and paint all.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her March 20, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that the proposed alterations to this sensitive building at 55 Steinwehr Avenue (formerly known as 61 Steinwehr Avenue Rear) is a Critical Project to the former Gettysburg Motor Tours (also previously a dry cleaning establishment) and repurposed as “Ike’s Bunker. She said that aging flat roof, front porch, windows, and doors would be replaced; and that everything would be repainted.

Mr. Eric Jarvinen, architect and agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Jarvinen said that the owner would like to repaint the current yellow cinder block, and replace the red corrugated metal roof with a widespread standing seam red metal roof panel system. He said that the owner would like to replace the current doors, windows, and shutters to give the building a more “bunker-like” appearance. He said that repairs are needed to the existing wood fascia board, and a service entrance must be created. He mentioned that interior will be used as a leather goods workshop and retail space for WWII era merchandise. He noted that the building, originally constructed as a dry cleaners, had unusual concrete buttresses on the rear façade, located just off of Court Alley. These once separated the vats of chemicals used by the dry cleaners. The owner would like to maintain these and refresh them with a new coat of paint, also installing a barn door with possible board and batton on the rear façade. He indicated that the entire concrete block structure would be repainted a beige or khaki color; and that the existing one-over-one windows would be replaced with new one-over-one windows in the existing openings.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed alterations to 55 Steinwehr Avenue is a Critical Project that would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with a mixed degree of integrity that is over 50 years old; the property is visible from the public view way via Steinwehr Avenue and Court Alley and is located within the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that due to alterations, the building

had lost much of its historical integrity over time and felt the proposed renovations to the original structure would add architectural interest and value to an otherwise unremarkable structure.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed renovation to the building at 55 Steinwehr Avenue as submitted with the plans and proposed materials in the application dated March 8, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 6-to-0.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-19-0014: 33 York Street – Golden Brick LLC / Speiser Town & Country, Inc.**
BANNER: Install one (1) 16 SF (2' x 8') temporary vinyl banner located in storefront window for "Allstate", to be displayed for no more than 30 days: Wed. 2/27/2019 - Wed. 3/27/2019 ONLY.
- **COA-19-0016: 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
BANNER: Install one (1) 40 SF (4' x 10') temporary vinyl banner located on west façade visible from High Street, to be displayed for no more than 30 days: Mon. 3/25/2019 - Mon. 4/22/2019 ONLY.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **150' Communications Towner proposed by AT&T at 35 N. Stratton Street; Zoning Hearing scheduled for Wednesday April 10, 2019 at 7:00 PM in Council Chambers**

Mr. Shaffer discussed with the Board the 150-foot-tall cell tower that is being proposed for the northeast corner of the Gettysburg Fire Department property in the GC General Commercial zoning district after seeing proposed plans at the March 18th Planning Commission meeting. He said that the applicant is asking for a "Communications Tower" as a use permitted by exception from the Zoning Hearing Board (ZHB), and seeking relief in the form of a variance: *"The tower shall be set back a minimum distance equal to 2/3 of its height from all lot lines and existing street right-of-way lines"* in order to erect a 150' monopole as permanent lessee on the property of the Gettysburg Fire Department in the GC General Commercial and Streetscape Enhancement Overlay Districts." He noted that the proposed cell tower site is not reviewable by this Board because the Fire Department property does not fall within the Historic District boundaries; but he had expressed his concern over the exceptional height of the proposed AT & T tower that would intrude on the Borough's historic skyline. He noted that Verizon installed low-impact mini transmitters on Borough traffic signals at considerable expense to minimize the impact of these cell towers on the Borough. He said that Adams County invested considerable financial resources to upgrade the County's emergency radio system for First Responders. Mrs. LaBarre said that although this new type of signaling would benefit the Fire Department financially, she said that the PA Museum Commission, State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), and the Gettysburg Military Park are poised to weigh-in as consulting parties on National Historic Preservation Act Section 106 review with testimony against it possible at the April 10th Zoning Hearing. The HARB Board discussed the matter.

Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** that the HARB Board is officially against the construction of the 150-foot monopole proposed by AT & T at the northeast corner of 35 N. Stratton Street owned by the Gettysburg Fire Department. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson, and it carried 5-to-0 with 1 abstention (Mr. Malot).

- **Review of 2018 Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Projects eligible for 2019 Historic Preservation Awards**

Mr. Shaffer reviewed with the Board all eligible projects for the **2019 Historic District Awards** slated for the May 15, 2019 HARB Meeting. The Board narrowed down their choices, and will review all nominated projects one last time at the April 17th Business Meeting. The Board agreed to invite all owners of completed projects for the past year to thank them personally for their preservation efforts. Mrs. LaBarre will draft a formal “Thank You” letter to enclose with their invitations to the awards ceremony.

C. Report of Staff – *Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation*

Mrs. LaBarre reminded the Board about the following **2019 “SAVE THE DATE” HARB Happenings:**

- **Saturday May 4:** Historic Preservation Seminar presented by Adams County Library System and Gettysburg Department of Planning Zoning and Historic Preservation at Gettysburg Branch, 140 Baltimore Street; *eligible for CLG training hours*
- **Wednesday May 15:** Annual Borough of Gettysburg Historic Preservation Awards will take place at the regularly scheduled HARB meeting, punch and dessert reception to follow.
- **June 19-21:** PA Statewide Conference on Heritage, Wilson College, Chambersburg

Mrs. LaBarre told the Board that she is still waiting on neutral roof samples from the owners of 250 Buford Avenue that outlined by Council in their HARB motion from their March 11, 2019 Business Meeting under COA-19-0011.

Other Business

There was no other businesses presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:20 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant

HARB Business Meeting

March 20, 2019

Page 7 of 7