



January 16, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Garry Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, January 16, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble, Colleen Lingle, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant and Becky Labarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation. Board member Jim McCabe was absent. Also in attendance were: Larry Steinour, Director of Building and Maintenance for the County of Adams, and Conor Phiel Associate Architect at Shaffer Design Associates PC, representing 117 Baltimore Street; Jim Biesecker, Director of Facilities Planning and Management for Gettysburg College, and Stuart Christenson, Architect for Noelker and Hull Associates, Inc. representing 157 Carlisle Street; Ashly Miller, Property Owner, representing 105 E. Middle Street; and Rod Simpson, Property Owner, representing 322 Baltimore Street; and Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager for PA Municipal Code Alliance.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the meeting agenda for the January 16, 2019 HARB Business Meeting as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot, and carried 6-to-0.
Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the December 19 2018 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges, and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, February 11, 2019.

Mr. Shaffer turned the meeting over to Mrs. LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation, for the Reorganization of the Board.

Reorganization

As customary during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized with a quorum present. Mrs. LaBarre opened the floor for nominations for Chair. Mr. Shaffer was nominated by Ms. Gustafson, and seconded by Ms. Hodges. There being no other nominations, Mrs. LaBarre closed the nominations and called for a vote. The motion to re-elect Mr. Shaffer as Chair carried 6-to-0. Mr. Shaffer agreed to serve as Chair.

Mrs. LaBarre received nominations for Vice-Chair. Mr. Goble was nominated by Ms. Gustafson, and seconded by Ms. Lingle. There being no other nominations, Mrs. LaBarre closed the nominations, and called for a vote. The motion to re-elect Mr. Goble as Vice-Chair carried 6-to-0. Mr. Goble agreed to serve as Vice-Chair.

Mrs. LaBarre received nominations for Second Vice-Chair, a position where that person would need to assume the duties of the Chair in the event that the First Vice-Chair could not attend the HARB meeting, and the Chair was either absent or would have to recuse him or herself for fiduciary reasons. Ms. Gustafson was nominated by Ms. Hodges, and seconded by Mr. Goble. There being no other nominations, Mrs. LaBarre closed the nominations and called for a vote. The motion to elect Ms. Gustafson as Second Vice-Chair carried 6-to-0.

The meeting date for the third Wednesday of every month pending holidays and major weather events was approved by Borough Council at their January 14, 2019 Council Business Meeting, and advertised in the *Gettysburg Times* on January 22, 2019.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the first three applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Mr. Goble will assumed the role as Chair.

Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review

A. COA-18-0117: 196 S. Stratton Street – Survivors, Inc.

CRITICAL PROJECT: Construction of a new 6'-9-5/16" wide x 15' long frame storage shed addition on the south elevation of a sensitive building; relocate existing fence panel back (eastward) to left of side porch; to be accessed via new man door at eastern side of south elevation and pocket door on west elevation; exterior materials to include white vinyl siding and tab shingles to match existing on main house.

- Foundation work ONLY approved by Borough Council on December 13, 2018.
- Revised drawings submitted by applicant on January 2, 2019.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her January 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this was a proposal for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a storage shed addition to the south elevation of a sensitive building and the relocation of an existing fence panel to accommodate the addition; and that Council had approved the foundation work only at their Business Meeting on December 13, 2019. She said that the applicant had submitted at the Board's request revised design drawings for the proposed project on January 2, 2019.

Mr. Shaffer, AIA, gave a brief presentation and answered questions on behalf of the applicant. He said that the proposed project would protect most of the historic windows on the south elevation, but the applicant was willing to give up use of one window which will be covered by the new shed addition. He noted that the shed, which will be used to house strollers and car seats for residents, will be situated flush against the building and “flushed in” to prevent water damage.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 196 South Stratton Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from South Stratton Street in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed shed addition on the south elevation and fence relocation is a critical project that would cover from view one historic Italianate window and relocate an existing fence panel back (eastward) to the left side of the porch. Mrs. LaBarre said that the proposed plan would treat the Italianate windows respectfully and still adhere to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed new shed addition and the relocation of the existing fence at 196 South Stratton Street as indicated with proposed materials in the application dated November 2, 2019 (revised drawings January 2, 2019). The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 5-to-0, with one abstention.

B. COA-18-0046: 105 E. Middle Street – Ian & Ashly Miller

REQUEST FOR AMENDMENT TO PREVIOUSLY APPROVED CERTIFICATE: Applicants were granted a COA by Borough Council on June 11, 2018. Since then, new photographic and physical evidence has been discovered which requires changes to the original plan. Applicants request the following amendments to the existing COA:

Front Elevation:

- Alteration of front porch to reflect conditions of historic photograph including more detailed/turned columns, arches connecting columns, and pilasters on either side of door
- Restore extant ornament discovered on site to its original location at center of gable
- Install fence at west lot boundary

Rear Elevation:

- Addition of exterior door at second floor
- Eliminate previously approved trellis from plan; move column support 7” to accommodate preservation of discovered well and install porch roof/patio cover structure across entire width of façade with mansard roof to match existing synthetic slate shingles

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her January 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this was an amendment to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness by Council on June 11, 2018 for rehabilitation work to their building at 105 E. Middle Street; but since then the applicant had discovered new photographic and physical evidence from the turn-of-the-century prompting changes to their approved plans.

Ms. Miller, owner of the property with her husband, gave a brief presentation on her amended proposal and answered Board questions. She said that the proposed changes would keep more to the design depicted in the historic photograph and incorporate the original structural elements. She said that the changes to the front elevation would involve the replication of the half-front porch columns and pilasters on either side of the door, restore the extant ornament to its original location on the center of the gable, and would install a wood fence depicted in the photo at the west boundary line. She said that the proposed changes to the rear elevation would include the addition of an exterior door on the second floor and a recovered staircase allowing access for furniture into the building, and would eliminate the approved trellis to accommodate the preservation of a newly discovered historic 4' x 4' well located in the corner of the kitchen. She said that they would like to install a porch roof/patio cover structure across the entire width of the façade with a mansard roof to match the existing synthetic slate shingles. She said that the rear access door would match the existing windows.

Mrs. LaBarre referred to the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* covering Standards for Restoration (referenced in Standard 7) that "replacement of missing features from the restoration period will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence. A false sense of history will not be created by adding conjectural features, features from other properties, or by combining features the never existed together historically." The applicant would like to retain the addition of pilasters below the historic storefront hood on the front façade that was previously approved by Council. The Board discussed the fact that the addition of these pilasters was previously approved by Council without photographic evidence. As documentation now exists showing the historic window hood trim never flanked the opening in this way, HARB could advise Council to revoke approval of the feature.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 105 E. Middle Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from E. Middle Street and East Legion Alley in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed restoration to the front elevation and the proposed rehabilitation to the rear elevation consistent with the photographic evidence presented in the applicant's amendment is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed restoration of the front elevation and the proposed rehabilitation of the rear elevation at 105 E. Middle. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-0, with one abstention.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-18-0130: 117 Baltimore Street – County of Adams

MAJOR PROJECT: Alterations to the non-sensitive 1970s annex of Adams County Courthouse to include enclosure of existing porch area/employee entry visible from the public way via West Middle Street; install new aluminum/glass storefront system, doors, and masonry infill with matching brick.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her January 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that the proposed alterations to the 1970s annex of the Adams County Courthouse to include enclosure of the existing porch area/secure employee entrance and the installation of a aluminum/glass front door system is visible from the public view way via West Middle Street. She said that the infilled masonry will have matching brick.

Mr. Connor Phiel from Shaffer Design Associates PC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the County of Adams would like to add a double set of doors to the rear Annex elevation for security and efficiency as indicated in the submitted drawings. He said that matching brick will be used as infill, and that the glass would match what currently exists on the front of the building. He said that the doors would open out onto an 8 foot sidewalk near the building, and that the doorway is approximately 60 feet over the parking lot to the public sidewalk at West Middle Street.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed alterations to 117 Baltimore Street is a major project that would be a permanent change to a non-sensitive building not yet 50 years old, the property is visible from the public view way via West Middle Street and is located within the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed alterations to the rear annex is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Mr. Malot made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration to the rear Annex at 117 Baltimore Street as submitted with the proposed materials in the application dated December 20, 2018. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0, with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

COA-18-0131: 322 Baltimore Street – Rodney G. Simpson

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include construction of a new door hood over principal entry to be made of wood frame with open brackets, bead-board or board-and-baton style enclosure on gable, and natural cedar shake shingles on roof.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her January 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a critical project, with minor alterations to a sensitive building over 50 years old and is visible from public way via Baltimore Street. She said that the property contributes to the Baltimore streetscape, but the façade had been altered with a PermaStone material popular in the 1950s-1960s used to cover up failing masonry. She said that the proposed alterations would include the construction of a new wood frame door hood over the principal entry to protect a recently restored historic front door.

Mr. Simpson, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he could add a little more ornamentation to the original design. Mrs. LaBarre suggested looking at similar door hoods in the first block of Baltimore Street. Mrs. LaBarre said it was unclear from the drawings what type of material would be placed in the gable area. Mr. Simpson said he would like to use bead board and paint it to compliment the façade.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 322 Baltimore Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with moderate integrity that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from Baltimore Street and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed installation design of a new door hood over the principle entry on the front façade is respectful of the building's features and is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 322 Baltimore Street to install a new door hood over the principle entry on the front façade as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated December 6, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

B. COA-18-0132: 157 Carlisle Street "The Colonial" – Gettysburg College

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include installment of new black shutters to match original color scheme, refurbishing of wrought iron balcony support and railing with new white finish to match original color scheme, infill of carport with addition utilizing building materials complimenting the existing façade and reconfiguration of parking area providing 15 parking spaces, greenspace, and terrace.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her January 16, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a critical project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 157 Carlisle Street – "The Colonial" which is over 50 years old and is visible from public way via Carlisle Street. She said that the proposed alterations to the structure incorporated Board feedback from the November 28, 2019 HARB Business Meeting during their Pre-Application Consultation. She said that the proposed alterations to the former motor lodge that is currently used by Gettysburg College as a residence hall will update the use and functionality of the building for students. She said that the addition of new black complimentary shutters, the refurbished wrought iron balcony in a black color scheme, the infill of an existing carport to enhance student living space, and to reconfiguration of the existing parking lot to add green space and a terrace will update this modest residence hall.

Mr. Biesecker from Gettysburg College and Mr. Christenson from Noelker and Hull gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Christenson said that the restoration of the wrought iron, changing the color scheme from black to white as documented on an old post card, will not only make the building look like it did decades ago as a motor lodge; but will also give students an updated residential feel with a unique social space. He noted that the existing window framing respects the existing drive-through carport; and that the proposed infill would comprise a warm gray tone brick. He said that the new improved parking area would reduce parking to 15 spaces, but would provide an outdoor terrace and greenspace area for students to study and socialize. Mr. Biesecker said that the lost parking spaces would be accessible to students in another area of the campus. Mrs. LaBarre said that the proposed plans are respectful of a 20th Century motor lodge; and that the reduced parking will further be examined through a zoning perspective which allows off-site parking within a certain distance of the building.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 157 Carlisle Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with moderate integrity that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from Carlisle Street and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed alteration design of a new door hood over the principle entry on the front façade is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. He said that the proposed plans maintain and restore many of the features original to the building's design as depicted in an earlier postcard, and is respectful of the Board's comments.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 157 Carlisle Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated December 26, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-18-0126: 33 Steinwehr Avenue – Tess G. Bardo**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Repairs to existing rear stairs on a sensitive building to include replacement of deteriorated handrail tops, balusters, stair treads, and deck boards in pressure-treated wood. No structural work.
- **COA-18-0127A: 211 S. Washington Street – Jordan T. Chiaruttini**
MAJOR PROJECT: Remove existing asphalt tab shingle roof from modern addition only, replace with GAF Timberline HD architectural shingle system in "Charcoal" colorway
- **COA-18-0128: 777 Baltimore Street – Felty Investments LC**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Alterations to a sensitive building on elevations not readily visible from the main public way via Baltimore Street to include: removal of existing windows and doors, infill and install new as presented; removal of existing siding and roof materials, replace with new metal standing seam roof and vinyl siding.
- **COA-18-0129: 425 Steinwehr Avenue – John Fine**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Removal of existing red asphalt shingle roof a sensitive building on portico, cupola, and main roof, replace with new GAF Timberline HD architectural shingle system in "Patriot Red" colorway; remove existing deteriorated rubber roof on flat portion of train station facade, replace with new "Mule-Hide" EDPM rubber roofing system

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer discussed with the Board the upcoming **2019 Historic District Awards** slated for the May 15, 2019 HARB Meeting. He said that moving the presentation to the monthly meeting would afford more time celebrating the achievements of the selected property owners. He recommended that the Board consider and prepare a list of eligible projects for the award nominations for their February meeting, referencing the various selection category definitions

from the *Manual of PA Historic Architectural Review Boards: Protection, Stabilization, Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration and New Construction*. Mrs. LaBarre recommended celebrating the inexpensive projects within the Historic District. Mrs. LaBarre discussed the Revolving Loan Program that is currently under consideration by Borough Council for preparation in the spring 2019. She said that these loans would be used by income-eligible property owners to repair sidewalks, and other preservation projects, and welcomed any Board feedback to forward to Council.

C. Report of Staff – *Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation*

Mrs. LaBarre reminded the Board about the following **2019 “SAVE THE DATE” HARB Happenings:**

- **Thursday January 17:** CLG Training – Opportunity Zones and the Preservation Community webinar presented by the National Trust Preservation Leadership Forum.
- **Saturday May 4:** TBD - Possible Preservation Month program/event with local institutional partner; eligible for CLG training hours
- **Wednesday May 15:** Annual Borough of Gettysburg Historic Preservation Awards will take place at the regularly scheduled HARB meeting. Review of 2018 projects, compilation of list of eligible properties, and selection to begin in February.
- **June 19-21:** PA Statewide Conference on Heritage, Wilson College, Chambersburg

Other Business

Ms. Lingle discussed the “Adopt a Window Program” with the Board. The GAR Hall is interested in this program, and would like to put in historical storm windows, and Ms. Hodges noted that the storms at 313 Baltimore Street is a good example.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant