



**February 19, 2020
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, February 19, 2020. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Others in Attendance:** Darren B. Glass, representing 29 E. Middle Street; Hannah Hauser and Arturo Ottolenghi representing 17 Lincoln Square; Steve Hemler and Curtis Whitmoyer of the Gettysburg Moose Lodge 1526 / Chapter 182, representing 414 York Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Mr. Shaffer called the meeting to order at 7:00PM.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, March 9, 2020.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no corrections to the February 19, 2020 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the January 15, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

HARB Business Meeting

February 19, 2020

Page 1 of 5

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 20-0004, CRITICAL PROJECT: 29 E. Middle Street – Darren Broderick Glass

Removal of existing front porch floor. Repairs to porch framing including rebuild of stairs and apply joint hangers. Repair wood column and reconstruct masonry pier at west end of porch. Install mahogany tongue-and-grove flooring on porch deck and stairs, and apply finish (stain, paint, sealer, etc.) Install Plygem PVC trim on band boards, stairs, risers and stringers. Remove all debris.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her February 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown as a two-story brick dwelling with slate or tin roof, front single-story frame porch with slate or tin roof.

Mr. Darren B. Glass, Property Owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the porch dates back to the 1950s and was renovated in the 1970s. He told the Board that he would like to rebuild it in the same style with mahogany planking and minor repairs to the railings.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 29 E. Middle Street, a single-family dwelling, is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity with prior alterations. The proposed work is considered a critical project, and the proposed work is compliant with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*; and will restore features without altering the appearance of the structure.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the existing front porch at 29 E. Middle Street as submitted in the application dated on January 21, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

B. COA 20-0007, MAJOR PROJECT: 17 Lincoln Square – Martin Crabill

Construction of a new ADA handicap accessible ramp to the first-floor business. A Right-of-Way (ROW) Agreement will be requirement between the Borough of Gettysburg and the property owner of 17 Lincoln Square.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her February 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1891 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown as a brick, three-story tobacco business with a slate or tin roof. She said that the intent of the applicant was to relocate the “named bricks” from the Main Street Brick Program on Lincoln Square that would be affected by the construction of the ADA ramp; and incorporate them into the ramp design. She told the Board that a Right-of-Way Agreement between the Borough of Gettysburg and the property owners would need to be secured before construction could begin.

Ms. Hannah Hauser and Mr. Arturo Ottolenghi, property owners, and Gary Shaffer, Architect with Shaffer Design Associates, PC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Hauser said that they intend to build an ADA compliant ramp with wrought iron vertical railings to the first-floor business of their building; and that she would like to incorporate the “named bricks” into the ramp design. Ms. English discussed the ROW Agreement with the applicant, and the procedures to obtain the agreement.

Vice-Chair Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 17 Lincoln Square is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The proposed work to construct an ADA accessible safety compliant ramp to a first-floor business is considered a Major Project, and the proposed work is compliant with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*; and will comply with ADA guidelines.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project proposed ADA Ramp installation project 17 Lincoln Square as submitted in the application dated on January 24, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Ms. English will check the process needed to incorporate the “named bricks” currently located in front of 17 Lincoln Square with Gettysburg Borough staff.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair

C. COA 20-0008, MAJOR PROJECT: 414 York Street - The Gettysburg Moose Lodge 1526/Chapter 182, Steve Hemler (EMERGENCY REPAIR)

Remove damaged front windows (with bb-size bullet holes through glass), replace with smaller windows, frame-in around area, replace with double-pane windows with muntins in top of window,

install new front door, and install siding to match existing siding. The sides of the porch area will be enclosed without windows and sided with like in-kind.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her February 19, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick dwelling with a slate tin roof, and a two-story rear porch and one-story front porch of frame construction and with a slate or tin roof. She said that this permit was submitted by the applicant as an emergency repair caused by bb bullet damage to the front porch windows of the Gettysburg Moose Lodge.

Mr. Steve Hemler and Mr. Curtis Whitmoyer, representing the Gettysburg Moose Lodge 1526/Unit 182, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Hemler said that it is the intent of the Moose to remove the BB-damaged storefront window and door as required by their insurance company and replace the windows with smaller-style double-pane windows with muntins on top. He said that the Moose would also like to replace the front door with a code-appropriate door, enclose the side porch by removing the East- and West-side windows for safety, and replace siding to match the existing siding. He said that the existing wood windows are circa 1982 and would cost approximately \$30,000 to replace them. He said that the proposed windows on the front porch would replicate the existing windows on the building; and that the intent is to replace the two windows to the right of the door, and the paired windows to the left (centering them on the second floor bay window). He commended both Historic Preservation Officer English and Code Enforcement Officer Weaver for their help, and for viewing the damage first-hand. He appealed to the Board for their consideration in reviewing this project in a cost-effective manner. The Board discussed the project in detail, examining window placement and design. Mr. Hemler would have to return HARB Board suggestions to the Moose Board for consideration.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 414 York Street-the Gettysburg Moose Lodge is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District-1999 Extension, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The proposed work initiated by vandalism is considered a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building that is viewable from the public way from York Street, and would change the look of the structure with permanent construction. He noted that the proposed enclosure of the porch that occurred in 1982 was prior to the 1999 HARB Annexation and was not previously approved by the Board.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the emergency repair porch project to include repairs to the west-side of the front porch, front door, west-side small window and east-end of the porch; and that the window locations / size of the front façade be administratively approved as amended at 414 York Street-The Gettysburg Moose Lodge 1562/Unit 182 as submitted in the application dated on February 5, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA-20-0006: 26 E. High Street – Georgia Bittle, Mixed use Hair Salon/ Apt rental 2nd floor**
Replace 2nd floor rear porch board that are rotting with in-kind materials and front rotted panel of bay window to match existing paint and style. No structural changes. Non UCC Review.
- **COA-20-0003: 34 Baltimore Street – J&J Asian Restaurant (formerly Pings), Yu Ping Huang**
Removing and replacing vinyl sign in front window. Sign in window 58 x 46 cut vinyl white graphics window sign. Removing Ping sing, keeping existing address sign.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the January 15, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 7-to-0.

Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **COA Emergency Approval Situations**
Chair Shaffer discussed with the Board situations where emergency approvals of COAs were needed.

B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

- **Passed out Ethics forms to HARB Board members**
- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**
Ms. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2019 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards. Ms. English said that she will provide a spread sheet of all completed 2019 projects for their discussion at next month's meeting; and to email her with any recommendations to narrow down the list for the 2020 HARB Historic Preservation Awards Ceremony to be held during the May 20th HARB Meeting.

Other Business

Ms. Gustafson gave a brief presentation, *Window Repair & Restoration*, to the Board for CLG Training Hours; and how it affects window projects in the Borough.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant