



**January 15, 2020**  
**Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes**  
**Borough of Gettysburg**

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, January 15, 2020. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, Colleen Lingle and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson; **Others in Attendance:** Brock Grim of Sell Today PA, LLC, representing 236-238 W. Middle Street; Catherine Crandall and Reuben Kline, representing 217 N. Stratton Street; David Petters of Kadel LLC, representing 2 Baltimore Street.

**Call Meeting to Order**

Mr. Shaffer said that tonight's meeting will open with a reorganization of the HARB Board; and turned the meeting over to Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation.

**Reorganization**

As customary during the first meeting of the year, the Board reorganized with a quorum present. Ms. English opened the floor for nominations for Chair. Mr. Shaffer was nominated by Mr. Goble and seconded by Ms. Hodges. There being no other nominations, Ms. English closed the nominations and called for a vote. The motion to re-elect Mr. Shaffer as Chair carried 6-to-0. Mr. Shaffer agreed to serve as Chair and resumed running the meeting in that role.

Mr. Shaffer received nominations for Vice-Chair. Mr. Goble was nominated by Ms. Lingle and seconded by Mr. Malot. There being no other nominations, Mr. Shaffer closed the nominations, and called for a vote. The motion to re-elect Mr. Goble as Vice-Chair carried 6-to-0. Mr. Goble agreed to serve as Vice-Chair.

Mr. Shaffer received nominations for Second Vice-Chair, a position where that person would need to assume the duties of the Chair in the event that the First Vice-Chair could not attend the HARB meeting, and the Chair was either absent or would have to recuse him or herself for fiduciary reasons. Ms. Gustafson was nominated by Ms. Hodges and seconded by Mr. Malot. There being no other

nominations, Mr. Shaffer closed the nominations and called for a vote. The motion to elect Ms. Gustafson as Second Vice-Chair carried 6-to-0.

The meeting date is for the third Wednesday of every month pending holidays and major weather events was advertised in the *Gettysburg Times* on January 15, 2020.

### **Introductions and HARB Review Procedures**

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, February 10, 2020.

### **Review of Agenda**

Mr. Shaffer proposed one amendment to the January 15, 2019 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented: to move Item D., COA-19-0122, 60 2 Baltimore Street – Kadel LLC before item C, COA-19-0121, 60 Breckenridge Street – Nancy Worley; and to move Item E, COA-20-0002, 47 Chambersburg Street – Gar Spar LLC (Steve Garvick) to Administrative Approvals, noting the project involved routine maintenance.

### **Review of Minutes**

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the December 18, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 6-to-0.

### **Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

### **Public Comment for Items on the Agenda**

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

### **New Business: Applications for Review**

#### **A. COA 19-0117 MAJOR PROJECT: 236-238 W. Middle Street – Brock D. Grim (rescheduled from December 19, 2019 meeting)**

Remove damaged wood soffit/fascia. Change soffit/fascia from wood to vinyl – wood is rotting, repair damage, wrap fascia in aluminum using a color that matches the siding. The roof replacement will be for the 236 W. Middle Street side of the residence.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown as a two-story adobe building.

Brock Grim, Realtor / Owner Operator of Sell for Sell Today PA, LLC, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he owns both properties at 236-238 W. Middle Street, and that they are currently rentals. He said that the proposed work would cover both sides of the duplex; and that he would like to replace the deteriorated soffit and fascia wood with vinyl to match the existing siding that is peeling (the windows are currently wrapped). He would also like to replace the existing metal roof in similar colorway. Mr. Shaffer said that the roof at that property is one of the oldest roofs in the Borough, representing a fish scale design. Mr. Malot noted that the request for a roof replacement was not part of the original COA / Land Use applications, and that the roof project was not part of the original proposal. The applicant agreed to submit the roof project at a later date.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 236-238 W. Middle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District*, and is of high architectural integrity with many alterations, despite the deteriorating roof and wood soffits /fascia. The proposed work is considered a critical project, with alteration(s) to a sensitive building, and is viewable from the public way from West Middle Street.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the existing soffit and fascia with alternate materials at 236-238 W. Middle Street as submitted in the application dated on November 25, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

**B. COA 18-0120 MODIFIED MATERIALS MAJOR PROJECT: 217 N. Stratton Street – Katherine Crandall**  
REQUEST FOR AMENDMENT TO PREVIOUSLY APPORVED CERTIFICATE COA18-0120: Applicants were granted a COA by Borough Council on January 14,2019. During construction, the applicant was unable to obtain approved materials and proposed modifications of materials mid-construction of the 720 square foot two-story garage. Currently under roof, the applicant would like to amend the siding style from traditional cedar shakes to solid wood shiplap with color to match house; change from windows in door to a solid door; install a garage door without windows; and add two second-floor windows facing Stratton Street.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown with a main structure and several rear outbuildings. She said that the intent of the applicant was to amend the siding style to the new structure located at the rear of the property facing Hazel Alley; and that a picture depicting the current state of construction.

Reuben Kline and Kate Crandall, property owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Kline said that they have owned their property for approximately two years and had received a HARB Merit Award for one of their projects. He noted that the application had stalled over the course of last year, and that he was not informed of the approval. He said that the delay caused a change in materials due to lack of availability. He said that the proposed changes would include sliding glass doors, vertical stained wood shiplap siding instead of shakes, and second floor windows. He said that he was confident that the materials for the proposed project would remain available throughout construction; and that the color of the siding will match the existing house.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 217 N. Stratton Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. The proposed work is considered a major project, relating to the primary residence, and is viewable from the public way from North Stratton Street and Hazel Alley.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the amendment of the original project proposed under COA-18-0120 to include a change in materials at 217 N. Stratton Street as submitted in the application dated on November 28, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0.

*Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Mr. Goble assumed the role as Chair.*

#### **D. COA 19-0122 MAJOR PROJECT: 2 Baltimore Street - Kadel LLC**

Changing materials from an ornate railing approved in previous COA 18-0096/LU18-0200 to a less ornate railing; construction of a handicap ramp within the right-of-way (ROW); and revised entrance steps to the front door.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1891 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick shingled roof structure. She said that the intent of the applicant was to construct in the public right-of-way an ADA ramp and revised front entrance steps to their first floor restaurant; and would change railing materials to a less ornate railing from a previously approved railing from COA-18-0096 / LU-18-0200.

Mr. Shaffer and Mr. Dave Petters, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the owner's intention is to go with a less ornate railing style that would complement the current building. The applicant is working with Gettysburg Borough to coordinate construction in the public right-of-way.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 2 Baltimore Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The

proposed work is considered a critical project, with alterations to a sensitive building, and is viewable from the public way from Lincoln Square and Baltimore Street.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the amendment of the original project proposed under COA-18-0096 / LU-18-0200 to include a less ornate railing at 2 Baltimore Street as submitted in the application dated on December 31, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

**C. COA 19-0121 MAJOR PROJECT: 60 Breckenridge Street – Nancy Worley**

Complete interior and exterior renovations and change from a four-apartment unit to a three-apartment unit (with one unit being utilized by the owner). Interior renovations for kitchen, bathrooms, and exterior renovations to include repair/replace exterior door, windows, front stoop, wood siding and repointing stone.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1921 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story shingled frame-style house. She said that the intent of the applicant was to convert four-unit apartment to a three-unit a structure that included both interior and exterior renovations.

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions on behalf of the owner, Nancy Worley. He said that the front façade will be a restoration to include functional wood shutters (pain on the first floor and louvered on the second floor); and that Ms. Worley intends to live at the property. He said that her project includes windows (restoring the front façade windows and replacing the rear windows); construct a new stoop; and include interior renovations to the kitchen, bathrooms, and a fire wall separating the three units.

Mr. Goble presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 60 Breckenridge Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The proposed work is considered a critical project, with alterations to a sensitive building, and is viewable from the public way from Breckenridge Street.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project to include interior and exterior renovations in order to convert a four-bedroom apartment building to a three-bedroom unit at 60 Breckinridge Street as submitted in the application dated on December 30, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

*Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair*

**E. COA 20-0002 MAJOR PROJECT: 47 Chambersburg Street – Gar Spar LLC – Steve Garvick**

Replace rubber roofing on front stoop and repair concrete downspouts and porch edging.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her January 15, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1886 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick dwelling with a shingles roof. She said that the intent of the applicant was to replace the rubber roofing on hood over the front façade stoop and repair the concrete edge.

Mr. Shaffer said that this project was considered routine maintenance and suggested that the Board approve it administratively. The Board moved the project under Administrative Approvals on the January 15, 2020 HARB Meeting agenda.

## **Reports**

### **A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:**

- **COA-20-0001: 234 Chambersburg Street – Paul and Shanin Caplener**  
Replace flat rubber roof on rear porch addition of living area (not screen porch addition) and replace 1 rear attic window facing rear of property in kind.
- **COA 20-0002 MAJOR PROJECT: 47 Chambersburg Street – Gar Spar LLC – Steve Garvick**  
Replace rubber roofing on front stoop and repair concrete downspouts and porch edging.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the December 18, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Gobles made the request to include Administrative Approvals in the Report to Council to the agreement of the Board.

### **B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA**

- **HARB Design Review**  
Ms. English stated that she will add the following note to the bottom of all future HARB Meeting agendas: *“HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval.”* She said that this statement will appear on all COA applications. The Board agreed to make the notation at the beginning of every meeting as part of their opening statement; and that it would be reflected in the HARB Meeting Minutes prior to the review of applications.

Mr. Shaffer and Ms. English discussed the HARB recommendation and subsequent Council approval of the window project at 43-45 E. Middle Street to rehabilitate the existing wood windows with the Board that had occurred prior to her employment at the Borough of Gettysburg. She said that the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) project to rehabilitate historic wood windows, COA-18-0116, was recommended by HARB for a project ***“as submitted in the COA application dated November 11, 2018”*** and approved by Council. The COA application noted the following: “rehabilitate historic window (scrape, paint, re-

glaze) and re-install as non-operable behind inset 'storms'." She said that the building code inspector from PMCA failed the Regulated Rental Unit Occupancy (RRUO) Inspection based on the Uniform Construction Code (UCC), because the windows were inoperable in the noted bedrooms that were not previously used as bedrooms. PMCA officials were able to rectify the issue with the applicant by having them relocate the second-floor tenant to a third-floor room deemed as a bedroom. She noted that the first-floor side façade window was unable to be corrected to UCC code, and PMCA failed their rental inspection for that unit. She said that future COA applications would be reviewed carefully, and that any possible ordinance or code violations revealed in the application would be discussed with the Board at their meeting prior to any recommendations. Ms. English said that she will reflect that change in her monthly report to Council.

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Mr. Shaffer asked the Board to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2019 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards. Ms. English said that she will provide a spread sheet of all completed 2019 projects for their discussion at next month's meeting. Mr. Shaffer suggested that the Board present the awards with a reception to the recipients at the beginning of the May 20<sup>th</sup> meeting followed by the Review of New Applications.

### **C. Report of Staff – *Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation***

Ms. English discussed her annual Certified Local Government Report with Board and suggested various ways for Board members to obtain certification credits that included: presentations and webinars.

### **Other Business**

There was no other HARB business currently before the Board.

### **Public Comment**

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:20 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher  
Planning Management Assistant