



November 20, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, November 20, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Acting Zoning and Historic Preservation Officer Sharon Hamm, PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA Administrative Services Manager); Debra English, Associate Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Colleen Lingle; **Others in Attendance:** David A. "Tony" Strickland, Property Owner, representing 41 Steinwehr Avenue, Civil War Store.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He welcomed Debra English, Associate Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation, to the table. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, December 9, 2019.

Mr. Shaffer announced that the Board will use this meeting as a training session since there were no review items on the agenda.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there were no additions or corrections to the November 20, 2019 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented. He noted that the Board will hear the appeal by Mr. Strickland during the Public Comment Period.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the October 16, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

Mr. Strickland, 41 Steinwehr Avenue appeared before the Board to present his appeal regarding his roof replacement at the Civil War Store, 41 Steinwehr Avenue. Ms. Hamm gave a brief background history of the submitted November 18, 2019 Certificate of Appropriateness Application (COA-19-0111). She said that this application was received late Tuesday afternoon by Mr. Quinn, the contractor doing the roof work at this address. She said that Mr. Quinn indicated that he had already replaced in-kind the rear portion of the roof with asphalt shingles; but told her that the front portion of the roof was currently slate, which was falling off, and causing water to leak badly into the structure. She said that he wanted to replace the front portion with asphalt shingles. She told the Board that a Stop Work Order was issued on Wednesday for the unpermitted project (no Land Use or COA permits approved to date). She told the Board to consider the application presented before the Board as submitted, and that this project would not have been accepted for this meeting. She said that with even a recommendation from this Board, that it would not appear before Council until their January meeting. She asked to the Board to hear the application for this Critical Project, and to determine if there is enough information to move the project forward to remediate the leaking roof. She said that the structure first appeared on the 1902 Sanborn Fire Insurance maps as a two-story brick building; and it appeared in the same configuration in the 1907 and 1912 Sanborn maps.

Mr. Strickland offered an apology to the Board for his oversight regarding permits for his roof project. He said that his contractor, Mr. Quinn, was from Hanover, and was not familiar with the permitting process or the Historic District in Gettysburg Borough. He told the Board that he would like to replace the roof to stop it from leaking into his store. He researched alternative slate roof materials and brought in the EcoStar Majestic Slate Traditional Classic C sample in Midnight Gray for inspection by the Board. He said that he was willing to front the additional expense to replace with an alternative slate shingle for approximately 500 square feet of roof in front of the building. He said that he did tarp the attic to prevent further water damage until the materials could be obtained. Mr. Shaffer gave the Board time to review the application and inspect the alternative slate roof sample. The Board discussed the Stop Work Order and the approval process. The Board asked PMCA to draft a letter to the contractor explaining the UCC permitting process. Mr. Malot asked the Board to clarify if it is their intent to approve the entire roof project to include the unpermitted rear portion, or just the front slate portion as presented. Mr. Shaffer said that the application only addresses the front slate portion of the roof. Mr. Malot said that he would look for an administrative approval for the rear portion of the roof in lieu of issuing any permits; and he stressed the importance of obtaining permits for UCC projects. He noted that this is a statewide issue, and not only occurring in Gettysburg.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board issue through Administrative Approval a Certificate of Appropriateness for the emergency replacement of the existing slate roof with alternative slate material as presented, and to replace or replicate as needed the existing snowbirds as submitted in the application received on November 19, 2019 by PMCA. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

There were no projects appearing before the Board currently.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA-19-0099: 60 E. Middle Street – Reaver Real Estate Investments, LLC**
MINOR PROJECT: Repaint entire exterior brick facade of 5-unit mixed-use building in like colors.
- **COA-19-0101: 60 E. High Street – Trinity United Church of Christ**
SIGN: Temporary 3' x 9' vinyl banner to hang on High Street on side of building for Annual Christmas Bazaar. Banner will be installed from 11/8/19-12/8/19.
- **COA-19-0100: 119 W. Middle Street – Swift & Helen Dickison**
MINOR PROJECT: Install six (6) foot high fence along east property line only from house located at front to rear garage; install two four (4) foot high gates at front by house and at rear by garage
- **COA-19-0098: 109 York Street – Council of Evangelical Lutheran Congregation**
MINOR PROJECT: Remove 40 window units in new church addition, which dates to 1998; replace with 31 Marvin fiberglass, 3 Marvin round top, and 9 awning double hung cashmere color window units on north/east elevation; repoint existing mortar, install 24GA aluminum coping on stone caps.
- **COA-19-0103: 44 York Street – The Brafferton Inn Bed and Breakfast**
CRITICAL PROJECT:
 - i) Remove window trim on dormers and front of building and will replace in kind. All will be replaced and painted in kind.
 - ii) Replace existing leaking roof with in-kind new Owens Corning Architectural Shingles to include wood decking, ice/water shield, metal eaves/rakes, pipe/chimney flashings, OC Venture Ridge Vent, OC Hip and Ridge Shingles.
- **COA - 19-0104: 129 Chambersburg Street, - Margaret Gustafson**
MINOR PROJECT: Replacing existing asphalt shingles with new shingles. Color to remain a medium shade of gray. Replace current white aluminum gutter and downspouts if needed. Consider enlarging aluminum gutter near the northwest corner of the lower roof to the next larger size.
- **COA - 19-0105: 548 Baltimore Street – 1863 Inn of Gettysburg**
MINOR PROJECT: Replace existing shingle roof on Annex Building with black GAF Timberline HD architectural shingles and all necessary flashings. Includes ice and water shield on all eaves and valleys, synthetic felt, and new edgings.
- **COA - 19-0107: 687 York Street – K&W Tire**
MAJOR PROJECT: Remove an existing concrete masonry unit wall to extend tire alignment bay and provide additional storage. Construct a 9' x 40' concrete masonry unit addition. The addition will be located at the rear of the building and will not be visible from the public street.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the October 16, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer gave no report.

C. Report of Staff – Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PMCA

Ms. Hamm presented the Board with a *Demolition Checklist* for their review as part of a training exercise, which included the demolition criteria needed to make informed decisions regarding Certificate of Appropriateness applications that present demolition projects. She said that this is a draft checklist for Board input, and to add their input where appropriate. The Board reviewed and discussed the basic criteria and will use it as a tool for future demolition presentations. She told the Board that all permits regarding a property must be proper before any permits can be granted; and she stressed the need for building documentation by the property owner before demolition could take place.

Ms. Hamm thanked the Board for their hard work during the transition; and said that she is “officially passing the HARB torch” to Deb.

Other Business

There was no other HARB business currently before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Shaffer made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. McCabe. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 8:35 PM to an informal reception for Sharon Hamm and Deb English.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant