



February 27, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Garry Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, February 27, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were Board members: Gary Shaffer, Joan Hodges, Peggy Gustafson, Phil Goble, Colleen Lingle, and Jim McCabe; Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot was absent due to a conflict presented by the change of the meeting date. Also in attendance were: William A. Bixler and Robert L. Bittick, Property Owners, representing 251 Court Alley; Jason Haney and Jose Barrera of Alam B Roofing and Home Improvements, Owner's Agents for Stephen R. and Karen A. Hendrie, representing 234 W. Middle Street; Ed Steinour, Jr. of Ed Steinour Jr Building and Remodeling, Owner's Agent for Philip Letendre, representing 39 E. Water Street; Dan Baumgardner of Adams County Winery, Owner's Agent for John G. Kramb and Katherine M. Bigler, representing 25 Chambersburg Street; Brandon Stone, Property Owner, representing 63 W. High Street; Marty Qually, Adams County Commissioner, and Joshua Bower, Architect from Crabtree Rohrbaugh Associates, representing 45 W. High Street (Mercy House / County of Adams RASE Project); Michael T. Coldsmith, Property Owner, representing 147 Buford Avenue; and Dr. Mark P. Rarrick of Rarrick Orthodontics, Property Owner, representing 250 Buford Avenue.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used by Mrs. LaBarre during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, March 11, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer noted that Item H on the agenda would be heard first due to the change of meeting date and to accommodate the applicant's schedule, without objection from the Board.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Hodges made the **motion** to approve the minutes from the January 16, 2019 meeting as submitted with the following addition or correction: add "Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation" to those in attendance under "Call Meeting to Order". The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble, and carried 6-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

Old Business: Applications Requiring Further Review

There were no changes requiring further review.

New Business: Applications for Review

H. COA-19-0012: William A. Bixler & Robert L. Bittick/ Crouthamel Construction as Owner's Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include installation of wood board and baton siding over existing concrete block façade and addition of decorative cupola at roofline to create a barn-like appearance.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 251 Court Alley that is over 50 years old, visible from the public view way, and is of low architectural integrity.

Bill Bixler and Bob Bittick, property owners, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Bixler said that their intent was to upgrade the structure by replicating a barn look that was more respectful to the historic character of the neighborhood. He said that the windows, door, garage and roof would remain the same, but they were seeking Board approval for the renovations with or without the cupola. He said that they would like to cover the concrete block building with board and baton siding in a barn red colorway. Mr. Bixler indicated that he had not yet chosen a cupola design. Mr. Shaffer and Mrs. LaBarre mentioned that the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* warns against creating a false sense of history, but indicated that a similar building renovation involving significant alteration to a mid-twentieth century industrial concrete block building was recently approved for 603 S. Washington Street (see Application #COA-17-0151).

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 251 Court Alley would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with no architectural significance that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed renovation is not consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* where a false sense of history is recreated, but that the proposed plans are similar to an approved project for 603 S. Washington Street.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations that would include covering a concrete building with board and baton siding in a red barn colorway at 251 Court Alley as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated February 14, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Goble made a motion to direct Mrs. LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation, to administratively approve the pending cupola submission. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle, and carried 6-to-0.

A. COA-19-0003: 234 W. Middle Street – Stephen R. & Karen A. Hendrie / Alam B Roofing and Home Improvements as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove historic tin shingles from roof of sensitive building, north/front elevation only, visible from the public way via West Middle Street; replace with A. B. Martin (ABM) multi-ribbed metal panel system in gray colorway to match existing on neighboring property at 232 W. Middle Street (no record of COA found) and south/rear elevation of 234 W. Middle Street as administratively approved on 2/25/2008 as an "in-kind" replacement under building permit #BLD-08-0008.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that the proposed alterations to this sensitive building at 234 W. Middle Street is a Critical Project which would remove a historic tin roof and replace it a multi-ribbed metal panel roof system in a matching gray colorway. She said that most of the tin shingles had already been removed from this duplex structure, and that the roof has lost its historical integrity. She said that matching the existing multi-ribbed metal roof would be appropriate to maintain the uniformity typical of historic duplex structures and enhance the streetscape.

Jason Haney and Jose Barrera from Alam B. Roofing and Home Improvements, acting as agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Haney said that Mr. Hendrie is attempting to sale the property, but the sale is impeded by an active leak on the roof. He said that replacing this roof with an A. B. Martin (ABM) multi-ribbed metal roof system in a gray colorway would fix the leak and still be respectful of the historic structure. He said that snowbirds would be used, and would match the neighboring snowbirds that are already existing.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed alterations to 234 W. Middle Street is a critical project that would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with a mixed degree of integrity that is over 50 years old; the property is visible from the public view way via West Middle Street and is located within the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore it is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed alterations to the original historic tin roof would protect and add value to a roof that originally was historic; but due to alterations, had lost its historical integrity over time.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration to the historic tin roof at 234 W. Middle Street as submitted with the proposed materials in the application dated January 23, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

B. COA-19-0004: 39 E. Water Street – Philip Letendre / Ed Steinour, Jr. as Owner’s Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove all existing eighteen (18) single pane one-over-one double-hung wood windows and aluminum storms on a sensitive building; install new Simonton Reflections 5050 Series dual pane one-over-one double-hung vinyl replacement windows in existing openings.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with minor alterations to a sensitive building over 50 years old and is visible from public way via E. Water Street. She said that the applicant is looking to replace 18 existing single-pane one-over-one double hung windows and aluminum storms with new Simonton Reflections 5050 Series vinyl replacement windows in existing openings for functionality and energy efficiency.

Mr. Steinour, acting as agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that half of the storm windows on this structure are missing, and that the owner would like to replace all existing windows with energy-efficient, operable windows for his family and eliminate the need for storm windows. He said that many of the existing window frames are rotting, and that some are inoperable because they are painted shut. He said that he would consider using Azek composite material to repair the deteriorating wood frames and sills, and that he would scrape and repaint them. The Board discussed window rehabilitation with the applicant, and administrative approval. Mr. Steinour said that he would discuss rehabilitating the existing windows, and replace the existing storm windows with a color that would match the trim.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 39 E. Water Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with that is over 50 years old, is located in the public view way from East Water Street, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the one-over-one windows are not a strong design element, and said that the replacement of rear windows with vinyl windows have been approved previously by this Board. He suggested that the applicant withdraw this application as presented, and submit to the Board a revised application, and provide a window sample for Board review.

Mr. Steinour on behalf of the applicant / owner withdrew the application, and would resubmit at a later date.

C. COA-19-0005: 25 Chambersburg Street – John G. Kramb & Katherine M. Bigler/ Dan Baumgardner, Adams County Winery as Owner's Agent

CRITICAL PROJECT: Remove existing non-compliant wood stairs on rear elevation of a sensitive building, visible from the public way via Racehorse Alley; replace all for use by Adams County Winery - stairs, joists, and landing to be constructed from treated lumber, new ADA-compliant railings and handrails to be pre-fabricated vinyl system by Fairway Railing.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 25 Chambersburg Street which is over 50 years old and is visible from public way via Chambersburg Street. She said that the slope of the existing stairway does not meet code, and that the applicant would like to make the rear egress safe and more accessible for staff.

Dan Baumgardner from Adams County Winery, acting as agent for the property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that the compromised integrity of the rear stairs proved to be unsafe for staff carrying heavy product into the wine store. He said that the applicant would like to replace the current stairs, platform, and railing at the rear entrance to the

building; and that the stairs, joists, and framing will be replaced with treated lumber, while the hand railing will be vinyl. He said that the existing stairway presented a clear safety issue, and was not code compliant.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 25 Chambersburg Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from Race Horse Alley, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed alteration to the rear façade is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. He said that the proposed plans would provide safe rear egress for staff of the winery, and make the stairway code compliant.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 25 Chambersburg Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated January 22, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0.

D. COA-19-0007: 63 W. High Street – Brandon and Valerie Stone

CRITICAL PROJECT: Installation of an 8'-0" removable pre-fabricated aluminum wheelchair entry ramp at primary (south) façade of a sensitive building to allow access to first floor for future office space.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 63 W. High Street, known as the "Solomon Powers House", which is over 50 years old and is visible from public way via W. High Street. She said that the current building is residential on both floors, but the owner would like to change the use and occupancy to office space. She noted that the front entrance is the primary entrance, and was constrained to meet ADA requirements. She said that the applicant would like Board approval for the installation of a 8-foot Aluminum Wheelchair Entry Ramp to meet accessibility requirements by the American with Disabilities Act (ADA), and that based on the floorplan and layout of the first floor, the ramp must be attached to the front entrance of the house to provide access to the first floor offices. She said that this request is a continuation of previous COA-16-06, COA-16-19, and LU-16-0017 for the restoration and replacement of previously removed structural elements.

Brandon Stone, property owner, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Stone said that while he intends to leave the current ramp with ADA compliant slope and handrails permanently in place in front of the building, it is removable should the first floor ever revert back to residential use. He said that the ramp will be firmly affixed to the ground, and was previously installed when the final building inspection for other alterations involving the second floor failed due to the lack of ADA accessibility. He has since removed the ramp pending Certificate of Appropriateness review and will re-install it once all approvals are granted.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 63 W. High Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive Civil War structure that is over 50

years old, is located in the public view way from W. High Street, and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that accessible ramp to the entrance on the front façade is consistent with ADA guidelines.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the ADA accessible entry ramp at 63 W. High Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated December 26, 2018. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 6-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the first three applicants, whereby Vice-Chair Mr. Goble will assumed the role as Chair.

E. COA-19-0008: 45 W. High Street (Mercy House) – County of Adams/ RASE Project

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a sensitive building to include removal of rear porch on north elevation, not readily visible from the public way via West High Street, for construction of new ADA entry with elevator shaft clad in brick to match existing, concrete ramp with black metal railing, and concrete walkway; remove all existing wood windows (six-over-six and six-over-one), install custom-sized vinyl-clad replacement windows with similar divider configurations and profiles as historic windows in current openings.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 45 W. High Street – “The Mercy House” which is over 50 years old and is visible from public way via West High Street. She said that the proposed alterations to the structure demonstrate an adaptive reuse of a sensitive structure for the County of Adams RASE Project.

Marty Qually, Adams County Commissioner, and Joshua Bower, Architect for Crabtree, Rohrbaugh and Associates, gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Bowers said that the plans call for the current building interior to be updated to include administration / office space, meeting rooms and sleeping quarters to accommodate the Adams County rehabilitation program known as the RASE Project, a resident recovery community. He said that the design scope for the exterior includes the addition of a new elevator and ADA access ramp in powder coated black colorway at the rear of the building to replace the existing rear porch, and would involve window replacement. He said that the proposed elevator will be a small footprint addition to the rear of the building, and would be large enough to meet ADA requirements; and that the exterior cladding of the elevator enclosure will be of brick veneer, with the brick to match the existing brick as closely as possible. He said that the windows will be vinyl clad units and would match the profiles of the existing windows. Mr. Qually said that the County would like to add the installation of basement storm windows to the submitted application. Mrs. LaBarre noted that the existing slate roof would remain.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 45 W. High Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with good integrity that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from W. High Street and is in the Gettysburg Historic District; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a

contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed alteration design of a new ADA access ramp, elevator shaft, vinyl clad windows, and basement storm windows is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines*. He said that the proposed plans would provide administrative/ office space, meeting rooms, and sleeping quarters for a County rehabilitation program; and would demonstrate adaptive reuse of an existing historic structure.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 45 W. High Street as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated January 28, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

F. COA-19-0009: 147 Buford Avenue – Michael T. & Kimberly M. Coldsmith

CRITICAL PROJECT: Partial demolition of a sensitive building at rear only, not readily visible from the public way via Buford Avenue; oldest portion of house to remain, scope of work to include removal of severely deteriorated early 20th Century (pre-1912) 13' x 16' two-story frame addition and modern (c.1990s) treated wood staircase to prepare site for construction of new fully-compliant replacement addition.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Critical Project, with alterations to a sensitive building at 147 Buford Avenue which is over 50 years old and is not readily visible from public way via Buford Avenue. She said that the proposed alterations to the structure would only remove the severely deteriorated back portion of this early 20th Century (pre-1912) structure, and that the 13-foot by 16-foot two-story frame addition included a treated wood staircase c. 1990s that was located on the neighboring property.

Mike Coldsmith from Coldsmith Roofing and property owner gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that he plans to remove the rear addition under the flat roof area, and return the structure to its original footprint. He said that the building was unoccupied for several years, and was severely deteriorating. He indicated that the condition of the foundation was unclear at this time and could not be determined until the back addition was removed. He said that he intended to eliminate the rear stairway currently located on his neighbor's property.

Mr. Goble, HARB Vice-Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 147 Buford Avenue would be a permanent change to a sensitive building with poor integrity that is over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from Buford Avenue and is in the Gettysburg Historic District-1999 Extension; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is a contributing structure to the National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield District; and that the proposed rear demolition is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* and is reviewable by this Board

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed demolition at 147 Buford Avenue as submitted in the proposed materials and plans depicted in the application dated February 2, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 5-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as chair.

G. COA-19-0011: 250 Buford Avenue (Rarrick Orthodontics) --- Mark P. & Katherine M. Rarrick

CRITICAL PROJECT: Alterations to a non-sensitive building to include installation of an Beacon Roofing Supply, Inc. *Central Guard Panel-Loc Plus* multi-ribbed metal roof panel system in "Ocean" colorway over existing rubber roof, cover previously uncoated brick in white paint, and install wall sconce lighting fixtures.

Mrs. LaBarre gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her February 27, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a Major Project, with roof alterations to a non-sensitive building at 250 Buford Avenue, and is visible from public way via Buford Avenue. She said that the proposed alterations to the building circa 1981 is located in the Historic District-1999 Extension, and is currently an orthodontic practice. She said that the building at one time was used as a "Filling Station", and had not been severely altered over the years.

Dr. Mark Rarrick from Rarrick Orthodontics and property owner gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Dr. Rarrick said that his current roof is leaking, and that a new roof would correct that issue. He proposed a Central Guard Panel-LOC Plus multi-ribbed roof panel system in "Ocean Blue" colorway over the existing rubber roof. He said that he would also like to paint the existing uncoated pink brick in white paint to compliment the blue roof; and to install wall sconce lighting fixtures to be selected in the future. Mr. Shaffer said that the current building is representative of contemporary architectural style, and that the current brick reflects the style of that 1980 time period. Mr. Shaffer said that the 1999 Historic District extension came about due to the construction of Pizza Hut with its bold signature red roof located on Buford Avenue in the view way of the Lutheran Theological Seminary and the Gettysburg Battlefield. He said that the addition of this structure with a noticeable roof colorway located on the gateway to the Borough created a lot of discussion twenty years ago. He reminded the Board that the change in roof material would bring the roof colorway for this non-sensitive building located in this historic gateway under the Board's review. Mrs. LaBarre said that the current orthodontic practice reflects a good adaptive reuse of a building located in the Borough's Historic District, and is reflective of 1960s architectural style. Dr. Rarrick said that he would like to amend the submitted application to not paint the existing masonry brick, but sought input from the Board for a complimentary colorway for the proposed roof system.

Mr. Shaffer, HARB Chair, presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 250 Buford Avenue would be a permanent change to a non-sensitive building with good integrity that is not over 50 years old, and is located in the public view way from Buford Avenue, is in the Gettysburg Historic District-1999 Extension, and is a change of roof materials; therefore is reviewable by this Board. He said that the proposed alteration of a new metal roof panel system in "Ocean Blue" colorway represents a change in roof materials, and that the color is also reviewable by this Board. He said that the building is circa 1981 and is representative of that style significant to that time; and that the building is prominently located on a "gateway" avenue into the Borough requiring careful consideration by this Board to any significant changes opposed to the historic nature of that area. He said that there were no proposed alterations made to this structure since its adaptive reuse, and that the painting of the masonry could come under Board review.

Mr. Shaffer made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations at 250 Buford Avenue as submitted in the amended

application by the owner to include not painting the masonry brick, and for a new metal roof system consistent with the materials and plans depicted in the application dated February 13, 2019 in a neutral colorway to be determined by the Board pending submitted color samples. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0.

Reports

A. Administrative Approvals Since Last Meeting

- **COA-19-0006: 123 W. High Street – Gettysburg Strength and Conditioning**
CRITICAL PROJECT/REPLACEMENT-IN-KIND: Alterations to a sensitive building, not readily viewable from the public way via West High Street, for change of use from warehouse/garage to metalworking studio "Oak Mountain Armoury"; work to include removal of deteriorating metal roof awning over existing garage doors, replace with new continuous metal awning.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

Mr. Shaffer discussed with the Board the upcoming **2019 Historic District Awards** slated for the May 15, 2019 HARB Meeting. He asked the Board to review the list of eligible candidates from the spreadsheet provided by Mrs. LaBarre for next month's meeting, referencing the various selection category definitions from the *Manual of PA Historic Architectural Review Boards: Protection, Stabilization, Preservation, Rehabilitation, Restoration and New Construction*.

C. Report of Staff – Becky LaBarre, Director of Planning and Historic Preservation

Mrs. LaBarre reminded the Board about the following **2019 "SAVE THE DATE" HARB Happenings:**

- **Saturday May 4:** Historic Preservation Seminar presented by Adams County Library System and Gettysburg Borough Department of Planning Zoning and Historic Preservation at Gettysburg Branch, 140 Baltimore Street; eligible for CLG training hours
- **Wednesday May 15:** Annual Borough of Gettysburg Historic Preservation Awards will take place at the regularly scheduled HARB meeting, punch and dessert reception to follow.
- **June 19-21:** PA Statewide Conference on Heritage, Wilson College, Chambersburg

Other Business

There was no other businesses presented before the Board.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, the Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant