



August 21, 2019
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, August 21, 2019. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum of seven (7) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Jim McCabe, and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Acting Zoning and Historic Preservation Officer Sharon Hamm, PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA Administrative Services Manager); and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Others in Attendance:** Steve and Pat Nevada, and Bernie Goulden of Schmuck Lumber Company, representing 154-160 E. Middle Street; Nancy Taylor, Property Owner, representing 221 South Washington Street; Jeanne Shriner, Property Owner, and Tim Redding of Reddwood Carpentry LLC, representing 205 Buford Avenue-Suzanne's Bridal & Formals; Jacqueline White, Property Owner and Dobbin House Tavern Owner, and Peter J. Martin, P.E. of PJ Martin Engineering, representing 688-690, 696-698, 700-702, 712 S. Washington Street; Frank C. Pizzuto, A.A.M.S of Edward Jones, representing 249 York Street; Bryan Coleman, Property Owner, representing 135 Buford Avenue; Mary Miner, Property Owner at 322 Gettys Street; and Jim Hale representing the *Gettysburg Times*.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. Mr. Shaffer noted that an overhead projector will be used if needed by Ms. Hamm and Applicants during the meeting to enhance the applicants' presentations. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, September 9, 2019.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer asked to remove Letter H. under *New Business: Applicants for Initial Review: COA-19-0079, 58 Chambersburg Street – Ernie Kranias, and Shaffer Design Associates PC* from tonight's meeting agenda, noting that the project will be presented at the September 18, 2019 HARB Meeting.

Mr. Malot made the **motion** to accept the revised August 21, 2019 Meeting agenda as amended. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

Review of Minutes

Ms. Gustafson made the **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the July 17, 2019 meeting as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

Mary Miner, Property Owner and Resident at 322 Gettys Street, addressed the three deteriorating structures on South Washington Street across from her neighborhood in Colt Park; and expressed concern regarding their continued deteriorating condition. She said that she favored their demolition and supports Ms. White's efforts to construct a new parking garage for the betterment of the community. She said that the lots are not suitable for houses as previously constructed. She urged the HARB Board to support this project and acknowledged the HARB demolition procedure. Mr. Shaffer said that the demolition would be reviewed carefully.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA-19-0059: 154-160 East Middle Street (RESUBMISSION) – Steven Nevada

CRITICAL PROJECT: Complete the installation of vinyl siding to the east and west sides of the building using the same dark gray vinyl siding previously used on the rear. The new vinyl siding profile will match the existing siding on the east and west sides of the building. Replace the windows as recommended by the contractor with ProVia Aspect double hung windows that match the size, pane, and grid patterns of the existing windows. Close off one window on the east side and one window on the west side that no longer serve as windows to the inside. Close off one attic window.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this is a resubmission from our July 17, 2019 meeting of a more complete application for a Critical Project to replace/complete the installation of vinyl siding on the east and west side of the building located at 154-160 East Middle Street; and to replace 23 windows and remove (cover over) four windows. She noted that the replacement of vinyl siding to the rear was previously approved. She said that substitute materials that imitate historic materials is permissible in some limited circumstances by the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* in Historic Districts after ruling out other replacement materials. She noted that the structure appeared on the Sanborne Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame duplex dwelling.

Pat and Steve Nevada gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Nevada said that the vinyl siding on the eastside of the structure, and the siding with Dutch board windows on the west-side are both in bad shape. He said that he would like to match the proposed siding in a dark gray color like that found on the rear of the building. He said that RG Miller of Hanover is the contractor. Mr. Nevada noted that 23 replacement windows will be ProVia Aspect double-hung white DLA Low "E" 1/2 screens with 2/2 sash White GBG grill contour in the same size and grid

patterns, restoring the structure to the original appearance. He proposed closing off a total of four windows with plywood and fiberglass insulation: one window on the east-side and one window on the west-side that no longer serve as windows to the inside; close off the attic window (presently in the furnace room), and close off one window in the back that is blocked by and inside shower and bath. The Board discussed the window replacement with the applicant and his contractor, Mr. Goulden from Robert G Miller, Inc. Mr. Nevada said that he intends to keep the window trim width. Mr. Goulden noted that the wood windows and the soffit with fascia are too rotten to be repaired and painted. He said that he would cover the old wood frames with Light Bronze aluminum replicating as close to the original material as possible, using a nailing fin with a j-channel that will surround the window to make it airtight. He said that he would install ProVia Sandstone color windows with half screens, DLA Low-E glass, sash lifts and a night latch with 2/2 divided light grills between the glass.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed project at 154-160 E. Middle street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old, as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed door and window installations on the side and rear façades would replace the materials that are not original to the structure in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 155-160 East Middle Street for the replacement of 24 windows, the covering of 4 windows, and for the installation of vinyl siding on the east and west facades as submitted in the application dated June 25, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot and carried 7-to-0.

B. COA-19-0078: 154 – 160 E. Middle Street – Steven Nevada

Installation of a 13' wide x 6'6" high Raynor Buildmark automatic garage door. Door will be a Colonial panel non-insulated door with low headroom torsion sprint track. The door will be sandstone in color.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this property at 154-160 E. Middle Street first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame barn garage on the alley. She said that an outbuilding is considered significant if the construction dates to the original property; and noted that this outbuilding does not but is older than 50 years old.

Pat and Steve Nevada gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Nevada said that he would like to install an automatic, sandstone color, 13' wide x 6'6" high Raynor Buildmark Colonial panel, non-insulated garage door with a low headroom torsion spring track and one interior slide lock to the existing rear garage exiting onto Zerfing Alley. He said that the garage door would not include glass and would be installed by Schmuck Lumber Company in the existing framed door opening with Sandstone colored overhead door stop around the perimeter for a proper seal from the elements.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project at 154-160 E. Middle Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public alley way, and located in the National Register of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the garage structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed garage door installation without glass and a Colonial panel motif to the rear of the property would replace the materials that are not original to the structure in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*.

Ms. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 155-160 East Middle Street for the installation of a garage door without alterations to the structure as submitted in the application dated July 28, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 7-to-0.

C. COA-19-0073: 221 S. Washington Street – Rich and Nancy Taylor

Install aluminum storm door at front entry. (Custom Larson Tradewinds Classic Full-View Almond Color Easy Hang Aluminum Storm Door with Low E glass, retractable screen and dual weather stripping.)

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this property at 221 S. Washington Street first appeared on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame dwelling. She said that the applicant is looking to install an aluminum storm door at her front entry. She said that wood storm frames are preferred because wood conducts heat more slowly and maintained wooden storms could last over 100 years. She said that storm doors should completely fill the existing opening, should match the shape of the door opening, and should be installed without damaging the original building fabric. She noted that storms with a natural aluminum finish should be avoided; and that they should be painted to match the window trim.

Nancy Taylor gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Taylor said that she would like to install a Custom Larson Tradewinds Classic Full-View Almond Color Easy Hang Aluminum Storm Door with Low E Glass retractable screen and dual weather stripping. She said that her front door receives eight hours of full sun and wind during the day, and that her existing door is beginning to show damage due to the elements. She said that the proposed storm door has high-performance glass, a retractable screen, a thick frame, and a key dead bolt for added security and weather resistance. She said that this door has a lifetime warranty; and that she chose the almond color to match her siding.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project at 221 S. Washington Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed almond color aluminum storm door installation, with glass and dual weather stripping on the front facade would

replace the materials that are not original to the structure in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*. He said that the proposed storm door is consistent with other approved storm doors located within the Historic District.

Ms. Hodges made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 221 S. Washington Street for the installation of a painted almond color aluminum storm door in the existing opening as presented in the application dated July 30, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 7-to-0.

D. COA-19-0067: 205 Buford Avenue – Jeanne Shriner

Change of roof type from metal to shingles. (Removal of existing metal roof and replacing with 19/32" OSB, applying layer of Weather guard roofing fabric and conjunction with 30#tar paper, and covered with GAF Timberline HD Shingles.)

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this property at 205 Buford Avenue first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame dwelling. She said that the applicant is looking to replace her existing metal roof with 19/32" OSB, applying layer of Weather guard roofing fabric, 30# tar paper, and GAF Timberline HD Shingles. She said that replacing roof materials with in-kind roof materials is preferred; but noted that most roof materials are available today, and that technology has made it possible to replace those materials with alternate matching materials when a hardship is demonstrated. Mr. Shaffer said that this Buford Avenue property is located within the Historic District through the 1999 Historic District Extension, and that the proposed project involves the original standing-seam metal roof material.

Jeanne Shriner, property owner, and Tim Redding of Reddwood Carpentry LLC gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Shriner said that her current tenant that runs Suzanne's Bridal and Formals, had damaged the existing metal roof in the attic storage area by punching holes with a metal clothes rack, opening the interior to the weather elements. She said that a shingled roof would be more durable than a metal roof. Mr. Redding said that there are metal holes throughout the current roof and that it has been coated at least three times. He said that it could not be repaired. He said that the oak lathe metal roof had reached the end of its lifespan, and that he was trying to minimize the replacement cost for his client. He noted that the current gutter system is degraded, and that there is significant rot on the front porch roof. He said that the roof replacement costs included materials for the upper and lower roofs, but not for the plywood lathe. Mr. Malot said that the proposed roof is not consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for roof replacement. Mr. McCabe said that a standard Timberline roof would change the appearance of the structure and would only last approximately 30 years. Mr. Shaffer said that a standing-seam roof is a strong look for a building; and would consider standing-seam on the south-side front roof portion, and shingle with plywood on the rear portion to contain costs. Ms. Shriner said that she would like the entire roof to be replaced with the same material and chose to replace her roof with standing-seam metal.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project at 205 Buford Avenue to replace a late 1800 to early 1900 historic metal roof would be a permanent change to a sensitive Victorian building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of*

Gettysburg Code of Ordinances under the *Gettysburg Historic District*, is visible from the public way, and located in the *Gettysburg Historic District*, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 205 Buford Avenue is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed asphalt shingle roof installation would replace the materials that are not original to the structure and not consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines*. He said that a standing-seam metal roof is preferred in the Historic District.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 205 S. Washington Street for the installation of a standing-seam metal roof consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for roof replacement in the Historic District instead of the shingle roof materials presented in the application dated July 17, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 7-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the remaining applications, whereby Mr. Goble assumed his role as Chair.

E. COA -19-0038: 688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street – Jacqueline White

Redefine determination dated 12/14/2011 of demolition with intent to re-build like structures to demolition with intent to build parking garage.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this properties at 688-690, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map as a two-story wood-frame dwelling. She said that the applicant, Jacqueline White, is looking to clarify the intent to replace three deteriorated residential dwellings with three in-kind dwellings that was granted conditional demolition approval by Gettysburg Council on December 12, 2019 (*see attached 2011 letter from Planning Director*) with the intent to build a new parking garage structure in place of those three buildings. She explained that demolition of any building in the Gettysburg Historic District requires a permit; and as stated in the *Gettysburg Design Guide*, "because all parts of a building contribute to the overall character of the building, demolition in part is rarely advisable. This type of demolition may be appropriate when the building element is deteriorated beyond repair, in danger of collapse, cannot be stabilized, and only after thorough documentation of the building. Removal of building elements is not acceptable if an appropriate replacement will not be constructed. If any building elements are removed, they should be recorded in photos prior to removal and should be stored for future use."

Ms. White, property owner, and Peter Martin, P.E. of PJ Martin Engineering, representing 688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Martin presented the Board with maps, renderings, and drawings of the area. He said that the Steinwehr Business Improvement District (BID) had a plan that identified the South Washington Street parcels which included these three structures as a possible shared parking area. This demolition would assist with additional parking improvements for the business district. He said that a zoning map change was pursued that would include parking as a permitted use by right. Ms. White said that the proposed design would be consistent with the current vernacular of Gettysburg Hospital, and the structures located on S. Washington Street. He said that the current alley would be

relocated to S. Washington Street, and would align with other long-range plans for the Borough. Ms. Hamm said that the 2011 letter from Mr. Dellett brought forth plans of what would be built in place of these three structures to avoid leaving open lots. Mr. Malot noted that these three structures are sufficient for a garage proposal to move forward, without including the demolition of the fourth structure; and that the design plan should be brought forth when considering the demolition of the original three structures as outlined in the 2011 letter. Mr. Martin said that the demolition of the fourth building, that was not originally included in 2011, would permit the necessary alley alignment needed for the proposed parking facility.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project to demolish the three residential dwellings at 688-690, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street would be a permanent change to sensitive buildings that are over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, are visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structures are contributing structures to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore, any demolition approval by Borough Council per the Historic District Ordinance is required for structures located in the Gettysburg Historic District. The proposed demolition would occur to three buildings that are of poor integrity and will not last much longer.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed demolition project at 688-690, 696-698, 700-702 S. Washington Street for the demolition of three structures over 50 years old as presented in the application dated July 30, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Staff recommends to Borough Council for all the properties addressed by COA-19-0038 at 688-691, 696-698, and 700-702 S. Washington Street, Gettysburg that:

- Based on the recommendations of HARB, a COA be granted for the demolition of the above referenced structures.
- The demolition permit be withheld until the structures are fully documented by photographs, video, drawings, and narrative provided to the Borough and reviewed by HARB.
- Design and location of the replacement structure shall be appropriate to the height, scale, and relations to the surrounding area.
- Before initiating any demolition, a detailed architectural design for the proposed replacement structure must be recommended by the HARB Board and approved by Borough Council.
- Before demolition of the three aforementioned structures commences, a bond shall be provided to the Borough in the amount to be stipulated by Borough Council to cover the cost of the designed replacement structure.

F. COA-19-0050: 712 S. Washington Street – Jacqueline White

Demolition of property with intent to build a parking garage.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that this property at 712 S. Washington Street was not up for review for demolition prior to this meeting and had first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map which indicated that the site was unoccupied at that time. She said that the applicant,

Jacqueline White, is looking to demolish this structure as part of a plan to build a new parking garage. She again stated that demolition of any building in the Gettysburg Historic District requires demolition approval per the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and the Historic District Ordinance; and requires a permit.

Ms. White, property owner, and Peter Martin, P.E. of PJ Martin Engineering, representing 712 S. Washington Street gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. White said that the current cinder block structure was formerly a dry-cleaning establishment that she had “dressed up” with board and batten siding to use as office space for her current business. She said that demolition of this structure would align with the proposed plans for a parking structure.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project to demolish an accessory structure at 712 S. Washington Street would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore, demolition approval by Borough Council is required for a structure located in the Gettysburg Historic District. The proposed demolition would occur to a building with little historic architectural value and will align with plans for proposed parking garage needed in that district.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed demolition project at 712 S. Washington Street for the demolition of a structure over 50 years old as presented in the application dated July 30, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Staff recommends to Borough Council for the property addressed by COA-19-0050 at 712 S. Washington Street, Gettysburg that:

- *Based on the recommendations of HARB, a COA be granted for the demolition of the above referenced structure.*
- *The demolition permit be withheld until the structure is fully documented by photographs, video, drawings, and narrative provided to the Borough and reviewed by HARB.*
- *Design and location of the replacement structure shall be appropriate to the height, scale, and relationship to the surrounding area;*
- *Before initiating any demolition, a detailed architectural design for the proposed replacement structure must be recommended by the HARB Board and approved by Borough Council.*
- *Before demolition of this structure commences, a bond shall be provided to the Borough in the amount to be stipulated by Borough Council to cover the cost of the designed replacement structure.*

G. COA 19-0076: 249 York Street – Frank Pizzuto, Edward Jones, and Shaffer Design Associates, PC

Remove bay windows with overhang and replace with aluminum windows; removing shutters; remove siding on bottom half and replace with stone.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She noted that the present building does not appear to be historic. She said

that this property at 249 York Street first appeared and was not occupied on the 1907 and 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps. She said that the applicant is looking to remove a bay window and replace with aluminum windows; remove the existing shutters; and remove the existing siding on the bottom half of the structure and replace it with stone. She said that the Gettysburg Design Guide states that “windows and doors are among the most prominent features of buildings in Gettysburg. Windows typically comprise about 20 to 30 percent of historic building surface area, and they act as both interior and exterior elements. Windows and doors receive consistently hard use, but they are so thoroughly integrated into the structure that complete replacement is rarely advisable. Repair and weatherization are more practical and economical than most property owners realize.”

Frank Pizutto, Property Owner, and Gary Shaffer, Architect, answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the current building was a gas station, auto repair shop, and insurance agency at one time, and that the bay window was added to the structure before 1999 when the parcel was added to the 1999 Historic District Extension. Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant’s intent is to make the building look less residential and more business-like; and that the Mr. Pizutto would replace the single-pane bay window with a 1/1 double-hung, energy efficient aluminum window in the existing opening. He said Mr. Pizzuto would also like to remove the existing shutters, clean and restore the current siding, add a new 12-inch PVC window header and PVC casing over current bay window opening, replace siding below existing windows with sage wood color stone wainscot and typical cast stone cap ledger.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 249 York Street is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed window installation and siding change would replace the materials that are not original to the structure and are consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines*. He said that the proposed changes are not historic but reflect a transitional traditional style.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 249 York Street for the installation new windows and stone wainscoting below the windows consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* for window / siding replacement in the Historic District as presented in the application dated July 22, 2019. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

I. COA-19-0077: 135 Buford Avenue – Bryan Coleman, and Shaffer Design Associates, PC

Convert a former mixed-use building (Group “B” & Group “R-2”) to two (2) transient (Group R-1) housing rental units. Significant interior and exterior renovations including: remove and replace all existing vinyl and aluminum siding with new vinyl siding; remove and replace existing windows with new windows of vinyl or extruded PVC construction; remove three (3) windows on side elevations, fill in openings, and conceal with new siding; remove two (2) pair of windows on east elevation and replace with single windows replicating size of other individual windows on the building; extensive revisions are shown on the rear (north) elevation which has no visibility from a public way.

Ms. Hamm gave background information and a brief building description as noted in her August 21, 2019 Meeting Agenda. She said that this property first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map. She said that the applicant is proposing several exterior alterations to the property at 135 Buford Avenue to all facades to include removal and replacement of existing vinyl, windows, porch railings, doors, and roof. She said that the applicant intends to retain and repair the existing front porch railing. Gettysburg Design Guide states that "in some limited circumstances substitute materials that imitate historic materials may be used if the appearance and properties of the historic materials can be matched closely and if no damage to the remaining historic fabric will result. However, substitute materials, including artificial sidings should be used only after all other options for replacement and repair have been ruled out."

Bryan Coleman, Property Owner, and Gary Shaffer, Architect, answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the current Victorian structure at 135 Buford Avenue needs significant work revealing several different sidings. He said that the proposed project would like to fix the myriad of siding materials and replace them with an appropriate homogenous material congruent with the historic nature of the structure. He said that the window replacement will also address the functionality of the building, using a 1/1 window like the one approved for use at 147 Buford Avenue. He said that the overall renovation would be historic in nature and address all egress issues that are currently non-compliant; but would discuss replacement options for the existing non-historic railing.

Mr. Goble presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact*. He said that the proposed critical project would be a permanent change to a sensitive building that is of high architectural integrity, is over 50 years old as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances* under the Gettysburg Historic District, is visible from the public way, and located in the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus is reviewable by this Board. He said that the structure at 135 Buford Avenue is a contributing structure to the *National Register of the Gettysburg Battlefield Historic District*; and therefore the proposed exterior renovations to include the installation of windows, siding, doors, and railings; and that all proposed replacement materials that are not original to the structure are consistent with the *Gettysburg Design Guide* and with the *Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines* for the front facades of buildings located within the Historic District.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed project at 135 Buford Avenue for the installation of new windows, siding, and doors consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Guidelines* in the Historic District but excluding the front façade railing and spindle system as presented in the application dated August 4, 2019. The motion was seconded by Mr. McCabe and carried 6-to-0 with one abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

The Board discussed their demolition review process of buildings located within the Historic District, and demolition by neglect; and keeping the 2011 determination letter referencing the 688-702 S. Washington Street projects and the relationship to the actual building permits in light of the change of the property owner's intent for new construction for the betterment of the community; and noting that the demolition requirements for 712 S. Washington Street were not addressed.

Reports

HARB Business Meeting

August 21, 2019

Page 10 of 12

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative COA Approvals Since Last Meeting:

a. COA-19-0068: 1 Baltimore Street – House of Bender, LLC (Owner), The Brick and Lime Company (Applicant)

CRITICAL PROJECT: Spot repoint areas of missing or cracked mortar on the north elevation directly below the rear chimney only (between the windows). Repoint the rear chimney down to the roof. Use only lime mortar to match existing mortar.

b. COA-19-0070: 230 W. Middle Street – Alam B. Roofing

CRITICAL PROJECT: Replace existing rubber roof system with TPO roof system; coat existing metal roof in existing grey colorway.

c. COA-19-0063: 39 Queen Street – Stephanie Baum

Addition of a new 31.5" X 60" sign 10" from the ground to be mounted onto existing sign poles. "Forever Love Rescue"

d. COA-19-0071: 39 E. Water Street – Edward Steinour

Remove and replace porch slab and re-point brick; repair rails and posts

e. COA-19-0072: 25 Steinwehr Avenue – Crossed Cannons Studio, LLC

Install 6-foot privacy pressure-treated wood fence along 64' left rear northern border of property; and a 4-foot pressure treated wood picket fence along 75' rear southern border; and install gate between building and southern fence on east side.

f. COA-19-0074: 51 E. Stevens Street – Nash Re

Installation of a 6' X 73' pressure-treated 1X6 dog ear privacy fence along Barbehenn Alley.

g. COA-19-0075: 64 E. Stevens Street – Patricia & Raymond Kane

Replace shingles on roof in-kind. Timberline Pewter Grey shingles, also painting the same color.

h. COA-19-0080: 101 W. Middle Street – Edward Jones (Mid-Atlantic Permitting)

Install one (1) wall mounted projecting blade style sign 18" X 24" (3 ft²)

Ms. Lingle made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the July 17, 2019 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble and carried 7-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer, AIA

- **HARB Training Opportunities**

Mr. Shaffer reminded the Board to keep track of any trainings that they may have attended, or videos viewed for Certified Local Government (CLG) credits.

C. Report of Staff – Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PMCA

Mr. Malot said that the Borough is currently involved in a search process for a new Planning Director.

Other Business

Ms. Lingle said that she has received public feedback regarding Historic buildings located within Gettysburg Historic District that need to be brought up to both code and historic standards. She did not feel that was in the purview of HARB.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Malot made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Ms. Hodges. The motion passed 7-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:40 PM.

Respectfully submitted,



Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant



Gettysburg
HISTORIC CROSSROADS

Borough of Gettysburg
Adams County, PA
59 E High Street
Gettysburg, PA 17325

Telephone (717) 334-1160
Fax (717) 334-7258
www.gettysburg-pa.gov

December 14, 2011

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Ms. Jacqueline White
Dobbin House
89 Steinwehr Avenue
Gettysburg, PA 17325

RE: Application for Certificate of Appropriateness
688-690 South Washington Street
696-698 South Washington Street
700-702 South Washington Street

Dear Ms. White:

At its meeting on Monday, December 12, 2011, the Borough of Gettysburg Council voted to approve and authorize the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the above-referenced property as set forth in the minutes of the November 16, 2011 meeting of the Borough Historical Architectural Review Board (the "Board") consistent with the findings and recommendations of the Board as set forth therein, specifically:

1. The applicant shall construct three replacement buildings to replace the three buildings being proposed for demolition on the subject properties.
2. The issuance of all required permits and completed construction of the three replacement buildings on the applicant's subject properties or adjacent properties shall take place concurrently with the construction of the parking lot on the subject properties.
3. Construction of the three replacement buildings for the three buildings being proposed for demolition shall be completed on or before two years from the date of demolition of the three buildings being proposed for demolition.
4. The design and location of the three replacement buildings shall reflect the original structures, including, but not limited to, height, scale and relationship to the existing streetscape.
5. Before initiating any demolition of the three buildings being proposed for demolition, a detailed architectural design of the three replacement buildings for the three buildings being proposed for demolition must be approved by the Board.

6. Before demolition of the three buildings being proposed for demolition commences, a bond shall be provided to the Borough in the amount needed to cover costs of the designed replacement buildings of the three buildings being proposed for demolition.

If you have any questions, please contact me at (717) 334-1160, extension 224.

Sincerely,



Scott Dellett, AICP
Borough Planning Director

CC: Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, Shaffer Design Associates (via electronic mail)
Ms. Florence A. Ford, Borough Manager
Mr. Harold J. Eastman, Esquire, Borough Solicitor
Ms. Merry V. Bush, Borough Planning Technician
File