



May 20, 2020
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg
(Conducted via Telecommunication Devices through Zoom Platform)

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historical Architectural Review Board Meeting to order at 7:45 PM on Wednesday, May 20, 2020. The meeting was conducted via telecommunication devices through Zoom platform due to the Pennsylvania Governor Wolf's COVID19 Pandemic Emergency Guidelines. A quorum of six (6) Board Members was present. Those in attendance were **Board Members:** Chair Gary Shaffer, Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Colleen Lingle and Gettysburg Building Code Official Clem Malot; Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation; and Karen Mesher, Planning Management Assistant; **Absent Board Member:** Jim McCabe. **Others in Attendance:** Gary and Patricia Stone, and Lorie McKee representing 248 Chambersburg Street; Shelley Knouse representing 28 Chambersburg Street-Fresh Boutique; Luis Quintana, Director of Projects for Complete Imaging Corp. representing 225 York Street-Sunoco Service Station / GUL Enterprises; Lisa Angstadt, representing 636 York Street; Jacob W. and Philip B. Schindel, representing 110 Chambersburg Street-The Ragged Edge Coffee House; Harry Tassou, representing 311 Carlisle Street; **Absent Applicant:** Eric Jarvinen of Jarvinen Associates and Susan Saum-Wicklein of L&SW Enterprises LLC, representing 20 Breckenridge Street.

Call Meeting to Order

Chairman Gary Shaffer called the meeting to order via Zoom at 7:45 PM (late start due to technical difficulties); and conducted a roll call of members in attendance. The following HARB members were present: Vice-Chair Phil Goble, Second Vice-Chair Peggy Gustafson, Joan Hodges, Colleen Lingle, and Building Code Official Clem Malot. Absent HARB Member: Jim McCabe.

Introductions and HARB Review Procedures

Mr. Shaffer introduced the Board members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He explained that only the Board members that were present at that meeting can vote on those minutes. He noted that the Board serves as a recommending body to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. He said that *"HARB is a design review board only; and that each project must meet all other Borough ordinances and building code requirements prior to final approval."* Borough Council will next meet on Monday, June 8, 2020.

Review of Agenda

Mr. Shaffer said that there was one correction to the May 20, 2020 HARB Meeting Agenda as presented: change “COA-20-0031” to “COA-20-0014” in Item A under New Business.

Review of Minutes

Mr. Goble made a **motion** to approve the meeting minutes from the February 19, 2020 HARB Meeting Minutes as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members: Joan Hodges and Jim McCabe). It was noted that both the March 18, 2020 and the April 15, 2020 HARB meetings were cancelled due to COVID19 Restrictions.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items on the meeting agenda.

New Business: Applications for Review

A. COA 20-00014, Major Project: 248 Chambersburg Street - Gary and Patricia Stone

Install vinyl siding on front wood façade (the sides of the structure were vinyl sided approximately 10 years prior negating the front façade to be left as wood from previous HARB approval); and wrap the wood windows and Cornish overhang with aluminum.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps and is shown as a two-story framed main unit with shingled roof, one-story side porch with slate or tin roof; and there is a two-story framed stable with a shingled roof and one-story framed porch with a shingled roof to the rear of the property.

Mr. Stone gave a brief presentation and answered board questions. He said that the structure receives a lot of diesel smoke damage and has blackened the siding, noting that it has been painted several times. He said that adding vinyl siding would increase the value of the property and make it easier to maintain. He said that 19 other properties in the Historic District were clad with vinyl siding or had windows wrapped. Mr. Shaffer noted that HARB had approved vinyl siding for the rear façade at this structure 12 years ago; but noted that front facades should be protected to preserve their integrity. Mr. Goble said that the *Secretary of the Interior Guideline* clearly states that facades visible from the public view-way can not be replaced with vinyl unless the wood can not be repaired. Mr. Stone indicated that he would still preserve the delicate design features above the transom, door, and porch posts. The Board discussed ways of cleaning the paint with the applicant.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 248 Chambersburg Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity with Victorian features; and had prior alterations to the side and rear facades. He said that there are twenty-six windows on this structure, and that only those located on the side and rear facades could be wrapped; and that the front façade should remain as is.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 248 Chambersburg Street as submitted but without any modifications to the front facade as stated in the application dated January 21, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members: Joan Hodges and Jim McCabe).

B. COA 20-00015, MAJOR PROJECT: 146 W. High Street – Dennis Herr

Relocate an offsite 6' x 8' shed to the rear of the property.

Mr. Shaffer noted that Agenda Item B was withdrawn, and will proceed to Agenda Item C. He said that HARB does not generally review signs, and the board should focus on the sign as presented in Item C. Enter HARB Member Joan Hodges to the Zoom Meeting.

C. COA 20-0020, MAJOR PROJECT: 28 Chambersburg Street, Fresh Boutique – Shelly Knouse

Request an exception to be made to “wall murals” in CH 19-107 #9 for the word “FRESH” to be painted directly on the painted brick above the window to the left of the entrance door. The text murals will be 29”x79”.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1902 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a three-story brick building with a slate tin roof, and a two-story rear porch and one-story front porch of frame construction and with a slate or tin roof; the second section is a brick two-story section with a shingled roof and two-story framed porch; and the third section is a one-story brick building with a shingled roof to include a one-story framed section with a shingled roof.

Ms. Shelley Knouse gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Ms. Knouse said that her brick building was already painted; and that during the course of rebranding her business from “Fresh Boutique” to “Fresh”, she wanted to paint on the brick her new business name over the front façade window in a style that would incorporate the painted style of the word “Fresh” from her previous sign. She said that the constant vibration over the past five years from passing truck traffic has loosened her sign from the building, and that she wanted to recapture the historic portrayal of businesses by painting directly on the façade. She said that she is looking to increase visibility with a larger sign, and to capture through rebranding an interest for both men’s and women’s merchandise. Ms. Knouse said that her proposed sign work would be done by local sign artist, Marty Mummert; and that she was seeking an exception to the ordinance; and that painting her business lettering would be both historic and business significant.

Mr. Shaffer noted that painting signs on the building is prohibited by Borough ordinance as stated in Section 19-107. *Signs Prohibited in All Zoning Districts*, Part 9. Mr. Shaffer said that exceptions can be made by HARB for wall murals and the recreation of documented historic signs. He further explained that the definition of a mural stated that a mural becomes a sign if it is related to the business activity occurring currently within the building; and that prohibition is in the ordinance itself. Ms. Gustafson suggested using a thinner, lighter sign substrate for her proposed sign that would capture the look of a mural. Mr. Goble said that HARB has no authority over signs, ability to grant a waiver, and would not make a recommendation to Borough Council against a current ordinance.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 28 Chambersburg Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The proposed work to paint a business sign directly on the painted brick front façade conflicts with the current Borough ordinance, Section 19-107, Part 9., and that the proposed variance should be reviewed by Borough Manager or his staff.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Manager adhere to the Borough Ordinance Section 19-107: *Signs Prohibited in All Zoning Districts*, Part 9 as stated in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg* for the proposed sign design application for 28 Chambersburg Street as presented in the application dated March 12, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member: Jim McCabe).

Ms. English will check the process needed to pursue a variance or an appeal to the current ordinance with the Borough Manager and will inform the applicant on how to proceed.

D. COA 20-0019, MAJOR PROJECT: 225 York Street, SUNOCO / GUL Enterprises – Luis Quintana

Reimage existing Blue Canopy to include new vinyl, horizon, and flag decals and (3) new internally illuminated channel letters

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1907 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story brick building with a slate tin roof and utilized as a Veterinarian Hospital. She said that the applicant is seeking to retrofit the existing main ID sign to include the new 'Official Fuel of NASCAR' faces; and to reimagine the existing blue canopy over the fuel pumps to include a new vinyl horizon and flag decals, and three new internally illuminated channel letters.

Mr. Luis Quintana, Director of Projects for Complete Imaging Corp., gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He said that SUNOCO is going through a corporate rebranding, and the proposed signage would reflect their current business model. He said that it is hard for drivers to see the main ID sign at the tri-intersection (York Street, Hanover Street, Liberty Street) where the service station / convenience store is located. He proposed placing the brand sign on the canopy for better visibility. He said that the main ID sign on the corner is 50sf and was proposing to add 40sf to the

current sign, which would be illuminated. Mr. Shaffer said that 50sf per street is allowable per the ordinance, but illuminated signage is not permissible. He is seeing an exception or variance for the additional 40sf.

Mr. Shaffer referred the Board to the ordinance (Section 19-109, *Specific Sign Requirements*, Part E, *Awnings, Canopies, and Marquis*, Nos. 3 and 4.) regarding this sign application review. The sign ordinance allows 50sf per street for 100sf total. The R-2 zoning prohibits internally lit letters on signs; and that the only thing permitted on the canopy is the business name or name of owner; and that all other language would be considered signage for the entire canopy. Mr. Quintana said that without the illumination, he would probably withdraw the application after conferring with the applicant.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that the Borough Manager adhere to the Borough Ordinance Section 19-109: *Specific Signs Requirements*, Part E. Awnings, Canopies, and Marquis, Nos. 3 and 4 as stated in the *Code of Ordinances Borough of Gettysburg* for the proposed sign design application for 225 York Street as presented in the application dated February 27, 2020. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, Ms. Hodges, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent member: Jim McCabe).

Mr. Quintana said that he would like to discuss his sign application with the Borough Manager, or at the direction of his staff on how to proceed.

E. COA 20-0031, CRITICAL PROJECT: 636 York Street – Lisa Angstadt

Add porch railing to existing concrete porch along the front and sides of the structure, with wood deck style being painted white wood.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1931 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two-story dwelling with a one-story front and side porch; and that the main house and both porches had slate roofs. She said that a single-story shingled outbuilding/shed is located to the rear of the property. She said that the applicant would like to add a white-painted wooden porch railing to her existing concrete porch to match her neighbor's porch; and that the highest side elevation is 22 inches.

Ms. Lisa Angstadt gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. She said that she would like to add a railing to the two sides and to the front of her porch; and that the drop-off on the one side is approximately 22 ½ inches, posing a hazard. She noted that this is a very simple wooden deck style railing.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Findings of Fact*. He said that the structure at 636 York Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District-1999 Extension, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District*. He said that this

permanent addition to a protected property is appropriate and is consistent with the Secretary of the Interiors Guidelines for additions to a property.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 636 York Street as submitted in the application dated May 7, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent members: Joan Hodges and Jim McCabe).

F. COA 20-0033, MAJOR PROJECT: 110 Chambersburg Street – Jacob W. and Philip B. Schindel

Renovation of existing cinderblock garage to the rear of the property into a commercial space with an exterior design similar to a carriage house with batten board exterior siding.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1912 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a three-story dwelling with a composition roof and has a two-story rear brick addition with a front single-story slate porch roof and side two-story frame porch with composition roof. She said that the applicant would like to construct a second floor to an existing garage and change the concrete block exterior to wood board and batten siding. He would like to install an asphalt shingle roof, a stone veneer base around the front, and add new windows and doors.

Mr. Jake Schindel and Mr. Phil Schindel gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. He is seeking concept design approval for his rear cinderblock garage that is viewable from Franklin Street, but not viewable from Washington Street. He would like to utilize the cinderblock base, add a second floor with Board and Batten siding, and add new windows and doors. The Board thought that this was a great conceptual idea and would be a great addition to Zerfing Alley. Mr. Schindel said that his carriage house design could be used for a future commercial space.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board reviewed the conceptual design in lieu of a completed Certificate of Appropriateness application for the proposed commercial space to the rear of 110 Chambersburg Street as submitted in the application dated May 7, 2020. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 6-to-0 (absent members: Joan Hodges and Jim McCabe).

Mr. Shaffer recused himself as Chair due to a fiduciary relationship with the applicant, whereby Vice-Chair Goble assumed the role as Chair.

G. COA 20-0035, MAJOR PROJECT: 311 Carlisle Street – Harry Tassou

Replace exterior wood stair with a new code compliant stair to include internal renovations of the existing three-unit apartment.

Ms. English gave background information and a brief project description as noted in her May 20, 2020 Meeting Agenda. She said that the property first appeared on the 1896 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps as a two and one half-story frame dwelling with a slate roof, and shingled porch roof. The

applicant would like to remove the existing non-compliant metal fire exit stairway to be replaced with a wooden code-compliant stairway.

Mr. Harry Tassou and Mr. Gary W. Shaffer, AIA of Shaffer Design Associates, P.C., gave a brief presentation and answered Board questions. Mr. Shaffer said that the applicant would like to use the proposed stairway as a main entrance to the second floor to include an intermediate landing at twelve feet. He said that the stairway is visible from the back of the property, but not visible from Carlisle or Stevens Street. He said that the landing would be a three to four feet wide minimal landing.

Second Vice-Chair Gustafson gave the Proposed Findings of Fact. She said that the structure at 311 Carlisle Street is located within the boundaries of the Gettysburg Historic District, and thus comes under the review right of this Board. It is a sensitive building as defined in the *Borough of Gettysburg Code of Ordinances / Gettysburg Historic District*, being over fifty years old. The building is a contributing structure to the *Gettysburg Battlefield National Register Historic District* and is of high architectural integrity. The proposed work to remove existing non-compliant metal fire stairway and replace it with a wood code compliant stairway with a middle landing that is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Guidelines.

Mr. Goble made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 311 Carlisle Street as submitted with the addition of a mid-level landing halfway up the stairs as stated in the application dated May 7, 2020. The motion was seconded by Ms. Hodges. A **Roll Call Vote** was taken with the following members voting **YAY**: Mr. Shaffer, Mr. Goble, Ms. Gustafson, Ms. Lingle, and Mr. Malot; and no members voting **NAY**. The motion carried 5-to-0 (absent members: Joan Hodges and Jim McCabe).

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair

H. COA 20-0036, CRITICAL PROJECT: 20 Breckenridge Street – L and SW Enterprises, LLC

Patch and repair north and east exterior walls located above and left of the front entrance door. The brick has crumbled and was removed and patched without permit review. The applicant intends to complete repair, seal, and paint the brick, and repair the lintel over the front door.

Ms. English noted that the applicants were not present for this meeting. She said that a Stop Work Order was issued by PMCA on May 13, 2020. Mr. Shaffer said that the wrong brick was used for the repair; and that HARB Administrative approval could be granted if the proper permits are secured. Mr. Malot added that the wrong mortar was also used and questioned if a PA licensed contractor was used for the project.

The Board did not review this application at this time due to the absence of the applicant.

Reports

A. Consent Agenda Requiring Board Administrative Approval Since Last Meeting:

- **COA 20-0022, 48-50 York Street – Blake Slaybaugh**

To install one gray 4" round Mulberry weatherproof box above the exterior door for egress lighting in the doorway entrance area. This will illuminate in the event of a power outage and is required for UCC code requirements.

- **COA 20-0021, 67 E. Middle Street – Carianne Rawlings**

Replace main roof on house in kind shingles. Rolled roof on back of house and metal roof on porch will not be replaced. Standalone garage roof will be replaced and trusses and supports replaced as needed. UCC BLD Permit required. All debris will be removed from site.

- **COA 20-0023, 240 Baltimore Street – Tessa G. Bardo**

Replace existing roof system and roof decking and underlayment as needed, install ice and water shields on eaves and valleys; install synthetic felt paper, install oversized edge metal and OC starter strips at eaves and rakes; install flashings to include skylights; install OC architectural shingles, OC Ventsure ridge vent, and OC Hip and Rindge Shingles over ventilation. All materials must be in-kind. NO new materials will be approved or must go through HARB review. UCC BLD Permit required.

- **COA-20-0010, 1 Baltimore Street – House of Bender, Charles Bender**

PENDING DOCS & REVIEW

Remove 30 feet of rusted damaged gutter to replace in kind 30 feet of gutter and downspout and repair fascia board to attach gutter and wrap in aluminum on the rear of the structure. Replace metal rusted bilko basement doors with in-kind metal bilko doors on side of building.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** for the Board to administratively approve the presented Certificates of Appropriateness (COAs) since the February 19, 2020 HARB Business Meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Gustafson and carried 6-to-0.

B. Report of Chair – Gary Shaffer

The Chair had no report.

B. Report of Staff – Debra English, Director of Historic and Environmental Preservation

- **2020 Historic Preservation Awards**

Ms. English asked the Board to continue to review and consider any potential COA projects completed in 2019 for the annual Historic Preservation Awards, and to email her with any recommendations.

Other Business

Ms. English asked the Board to track all trainings and webinars including attendance dates and certificates for CLG Training; and that members can still log-in for any emailed training opportunities.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

With no other business before the Board, Mr. Goble made the **motion** to adjourn, and it was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion passed 6-to-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:45 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher
Planning Management Assistant